

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
393 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA California 94104  
(415) 749-5000

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
10:00 a.m., Wednesday May 9, 2007

**CALL TO ORDER**

Opening Comments: Chairperson Glueck called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.

Roll Call: Present: Fred Glueck, Chair, Cassandra Adams, Sam Altshuler, Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D., Ken Blonski, Jeffrey Bramlett, Harold Brazil, Irvin Dawid, Emily Drennen, MPH, William Hanna, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D, Janice Kim, MD., Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Karen Licavoli-Farnkopf, MPH, and Linda Weiner.

Absent: Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Steven Kmucha, MD., Robert T.P. Huang, Ph.D., Ed Proctor, and Brian Zamora.

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:** There were three speakers for agenda item number 4.

Duane Godson  
Bay View Hunters Point Community Advocates  
1201 Mendell Street  
San Francisco, CA, 94124

Karen Cohn  
SFDHP & BAEHC  
1390 Market Street, # 230  
San Francisco, CA 94103

Antonio Diaz  
PODER/BAEHC  
474 Valerie Street  
San Francisco, CA 94603

**CONSENT CALENDAR:**

- 1. Approval of Minutes of March 14, 2007:** Mr. Blonski moved approval of the minutes, carried unanimously

## **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

2. **Air Quality Planning Committee of April 11, 2007:** Mr. Blonski reported on the collection of \$55.00 to offset the carbon footprint activities of its members. The money was sent to carbonfund.org. Mr. Blonski also reported that Ted Droettboom from the Association of Bay Area Governments' (ABAG) spoke to the Committee on Focus Growth versus Smart Growth. This views the trend in the recent high real estate market with the region growing at 1% per year; estimated an 60% increase in miles traveled by the year 2020; even with a slower growth and more infill, there will be about a 45% increase. This growth increase will have a significant impact. Dr. Holtzclaw also made a presentation on the Smart Growth Impact on Climate Change Emissions. Dr. Holtzclaw compared four different neighborhood sprawls versus urban areas. Mr. Blonski stated that Emily Drennen will direct the meeting of June 13, 2007 and the focus will be Regional Transit Funding; using the Muni study to see what are the impacts of the concept of free transit.
3. **Technical Committee Meeting of April 16, 2007:** Mr. Altshuler reported that the Committee did two basic things. 1) The Committee created a table comparing the South Coast Air District's MATES program with the Air Districts CARE program; 2) Dr. Bart Ostro Chief, Air Pollution Epidemiology Unit, Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) gave elaborate comparison of health effects from exposure to PM. Dr. Ostro gave a description of PM and other pollutants as they relates to chronic long term health effects versus the acute short term health effect. The CARE program studied long term exposure but not the short term health effect issues that are associated more with the criteria air pollutants.

Jean Roggenkamp thanked the Advisory Council for its move towards offsetting its carbon footprint and stated that the Air District is looking into its activities and will be offsetting its footprint as well.

**Public Health Committee of April 11, 2007:** Mr. Bramlett announced that the Committee did not have a quorum thus the meeting was cancelled. The Committee will continue its discussion on Indoor Air Quality (IAQ), and Asthma at the next meeting of June 13, 2007, at 1:30 p.m.

## **Air District Overview**

5. **Report of the Executive Officer/APCO:** Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy APCO, reported on the following:
  1. The Air District Budget focus; updating of the cost recovery study to determine if there were disparities in funds collected to implement programs. Some disparities were found thus the staff prepared recommendation for some permit fee increases to the Board of Directors. The first public hearing is scheduled for May 16, 2007 with the final hearing on June 6, 2007.

2. The summer time Spare the Air campaign will start June 1, 2007. The media and transit will help in disseminating the information. The program has expanded from 26 transit operators to 32 operators this year.
3. Staff will present to the Board at the next Board meeting of May 16, 2007 a new regulation on commercial charboilers. This regulation will affect control measures for PM (Particulate Matter) implementation schedule to help meet the PM standards.
4. Staff presented to the Board; issues about initiating rule making activities to reduce emissions from the major ports in the region. Emphasis on emission reduction originated from the information in the CARE program study. The Board created an Ad Hoc Committee on port emissions to look into emission reductions.
5. Dr. Manuel Pastors' report has been presented to; the staff, the Board Executive Committee, the CARE task force and today to the Advisory Council members.

Dr Holtzclaw commented on the fee structure to industries stating that some new industries are being heavily subsidized; showing that the cost of reviewing them and setting standards are much more than the fees to such companies, for instance the refinery industry. Now the fees are being increased to 15% a year state limit thus reducing the deficit. Dr. Holtzclaw also congratulated staff on its efforts.

Mr. Dawid inquired if the ozone season has begun. He also expressed his appreciation on the poll taken on the previous mandatory no burn days, which produced a favorable result. Mr. Dawid also asked for an update. Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy APCO, briefly explained that the District has to go through developing a regulation, expanded outreach for potential incentives and partnering with other companies.

Mr. Altshuler asked whether the Air District staff looked into whether there were any impacts on ozone to any air quality stations, resulting from the spillage of 8,600 gallons of gasoline consumed in the air might have caused or use it as a test point for model. Ms. Roggenkamp responded that there was not any way to attribute increases in any monitors specifically due to the time of the event and the District has looked into ways of doing monitoring of the event that could be useful. Mr. Altshuler also inquired if it is appropriate to incorporate Spare the Air materials with the PG&E's time and day metering program that starts in May since both programs seem to promote closely related issues. Ms. Roggenkamp responded that the issue could be looked into in the future.

Ms. Weiner asked about the time frame when the Port regulation process will come into effect. Ms. Roggenkamp stated that it is a new source that the District is regulating and the implementation will take some time because new and existing stakeholders might be interested in the regulatory process. A draft might be out later this year and adoption; early 2008.

**4. Presentation by Dr. Manuel Pastor:** *Dr. Manuel Pastor of the University of California Santa Cruz made a presentation he co-authored entitled “Still Toxic After All These Years – Air Quality and Environmental Justice in the San Francisco Bay Area.”*

Dr. Pastor discussed the following issues:

- Motivation of the Study.
- Cumulative impact and community exposure to toxics.
- The findings and assembling the data for the project.
- Toxic Release Inventory (TRI) facilities relative to neighborhood demographics and how the TRI proximity is determined.
- Population by Race/ethnicity (2000) and Proximity to a TRI facility with Air Releases (2003) in the 9-county Bay Area.
- The disparity pattern is a result of land use perspective, income, and regional politics
- Ambient air toxics, which come from a diverse array of sources and can create “hot spots.”
- Estimating cancer and respiratory risks with ambient air toxics exposures. Assessing the risk to see if there is a pattern.

The Council members asked questions for clarification on several aspects of the report.

Ms. Weiner asked how the Air District will use this report to reduce multiple sources of air pollution in low income communities. In response, Ms. Roggenkamp stated that the staff plans to share the results of the CARE program findings with cities and counties when the data format is accurate enough. Considering linguistic isolations, Ms. Roggenkamp clarified that the Air District does have translations of documents provided to the public that can be expanded upon.

Dr. Holtzclaw asked if Dr. Pastor has any changes that could be made to land use general plans and zoning, with regards to unintended potential impact. Dr. Pastor responded that it will be important to look at communities that have crossed a certain threshold in terms of cumulative exposure or social vulnerability and use that to regulate what new facility will be built or zoned as the case may be. Also to create buffers between particular land uses and land fills considering high cost real estate.

In response to Mr. Dawid’s question of which poses more hazard, Dr. Pastor stated that mobile source and diesel pose more risk. On land use issues concerning conflict between smart growth incentives versus health incentives for which a UC Davis professor in Roseville found that interior roads pose more risks as do the freeways, Dr. Pastor added that problems arising from the infill should be anticipated for solutions because increased infill will lead to episodic incidence that becomes sustained.

Ms Drennen questioned the policy recommendations regarding mobile sources given the Air District's jurisdiction. Dr. Pastor stated that it has to do with leadership role and added that the Air Districts are moving forward. Dr. Pastor cited as an example, the city of Los Angeles where the Mayor, Antonio Villaraigosa, passed legislation over air quality forcing the ports to clean up and practice Smart Growth to reduce environmental inequity.

Ms. Roggenkamp added that the Air Quality Planning Committee recently had a presentation on mobile sources and the Air District's role. She also added that the Air District, through incentive programs targets the two communities that are mostly impacted by air pollution. The Air District does not have regulatory authority over engines but do have incentive programs that can help replace old engines with new ones. Also, the Air District is extending its regulatory authority to the Ports as stationary sources of air pollution.

Ms. Weiner stated that construction equipment is a major source of diesel PM and there is a hearing with the California Air Resources Board (CARB) on May 24, 2007 to pass a regulation on construction equipment. She also added that on the issue of idling, individuals are testifying to the ARB on the importance of putting enforcement in the early action measures of AB32 since diesel emissions are a major contributor to global warming and a bill in the state senate making enforcement stronger for CARB.

Dr. Kim asked if the Advisory Council can request points of clarification on the comments made by the public speakers.

Brian Bunger, District Counsel stated that there can be questions for point of clarification but not to engage in dialogue with the public speakers.

Duane Godson made additional comments on Dr. Pastor's presentation.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

### **6. Report of Advisory Council Chair:**

Chairperson Glueck thanked the Council for the carbonfund.org donation.

### **7. Council Member Comments/Other Business:**

Chairperson Glueck noted that each Committee Chair will be requesting funds from members at its June meetings for a presentational gift for Mr. Peter Hess, Deputy APCO who will retire in July.

Chairperson Glueck stated that Executive Committee members discussed the technical aspect of Dr. Pastor's presentation will be reviewed by the Technical Committee and Air Quality Planning Committee will discuss recommendations that might be relevant to the issues relative to the Advisory Council. Also, the Public Health Committee will discuss the report at its meeting as well. The three Advisory

Council standing committees will work in collaboration on independent efforts and make comments to the Advisory Council.

Mr. Dawid expressed his strong concern for the District staff, Advisory Council, and Board of Directors take serious the issues of land use.

- 8. Time and Place of Next Meeting:** 10:00 a.m., Wednesday, July 11, 2007, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.
- 9. Adjournment:** The meeting was adjourned at 11:58 a.m.

Chioma Dimude  
Acting Executive Secretary