

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 771-6000

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Public Outreach Committee Meeting
9:30 a.m., Thursday, February 16, 2012

1. Call to Order – Roll Call

Chairperson Mark Ross called the meeting to order at 9:38 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson Mark Ross; Vice Chairperson Eric Mar; and Directors Susan Garner, Scott Haggerty, Carol Klatt, Nate Miley and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Director John Avalos.

Also Present: Chairperson John Gioia.

2. Public Comment Period: None.

3. 2011-2012 Winter Spare the Air Season Summary

Lisa Fasano, Director of Communications and Outreach Office, introduced Kristine Roselius, Supervising Public Information Officer, who gave the staff presentation regarding the Winter Spare the Air Campaign Update, including a campaign overview, detailed review of the District's use of advertising, media outreach, and social media, and finally, a look at the media coverage and compliance levels that resulted.

Ms. Roselius noted, regarding slide 3, Advertising, that the Air District's focus in advertising was on the health benefits of air quality management.

NOTED PRESENT: Directors Miley and Haggerty were noted present at 9:41 a.m. and Wagenknecht was noted present at 9:55 a.m.

Committee Comments/Discussion: Ms. Fasano introduced Barbara Coler, Air Quality Program Manager of Compliance & Enforcement Division, and Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, to field enforcement and forecast questions.

Committee Chairperson Ross asked about how many days the Air District successfully prevented exceedances by imposing Spare the Air Days. Mr. Stevenson recalled the history and current limitations of forecasting, opined about the general accuracy of the Air District's calls, and added

that there were three or four days that Spare the Air Days were not imposed but levels were in exceedance and one day when it was imposed but levels were not in exceedance. Committee Chairperson Ross followed up to ask how many days the program prevented exceedances. Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, and Ms. Fasano replied that it is very hard to answer that specifically but levels are declining so it is undeniable that air quality is improving and, in turn, the Air District is providing a public health benefit.

Director Wagenknecht asked how health cost savings were calculated. Mr. Stevenson and Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules & Research, answered that mortality calculations are a majority of the figure but also included are costs of emergency room visits and days reported sick to school and work for asthma-related issues and other air quality attributable conditions. Committee Chairperson Ross requested a breakdown in the medical costs figures for the Committee's review and eventual publication. Ms. Fasano, Committee Chairperson Ross, and Director Wagenknecht discussed the personal experiences of their acquaintances during the season, likening it to the news video clip about a mother and son dealing with air quality related health issues, with the Directors commenting that they found the video clip to be compelling. Ms. Fasano added that the public continues to misunderstand the difference between particulate matter and other air pollutants, the clarification of which is an important target for future campaigns. Committee Chairperson Ross and Ms. Roselius discussed a year-to-year medical costs comparison and San Francisco General Hospital's reporting a doubling of asthma treatment in the last year, and Committee Chairperson Ross requested a document quantifying the same in conclusion.

Chairperson Ross, Ms. Fasano and Ms. Roselius discussed the health statistics being reported from various members of the medical community and how best to obtain and compile them. Director Mar commended the involvement of Breathe California and discussed with Ms. Roselius the extent and details of the partnership on this topic. Committee Chairperson Ross and Ms. Fasano discussed the very real possibility that coronary issues may be an ailment attributable to air quality but that data is still emerging. Chairperson Gioia recommended cautious use of information suggesting a connection with coronary ailments until more data is available to substantiate those claims.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

4. Approval of Minutes of October 31, 2011

Committee Action: Director Haggerty made a motion to approve the Minutes of October 31, 2011; Director Wagenknecht seconded; carried unanimously without objection.

5. Overview of Bay Area Environmental Health Collaborative Retreat

Ms. Fasano gave the staff presentation regarding the Overview of Retreat with Bay Area Environmental Health Collaborative (BAEHC), including a summary of the objectives, participants, common goals and outcome.

Ms. Fasano noted, regarding slide 3, Participants, that the meeting began with a joint agenda detailing the parties' past issues in an effort to address grievances and advance the collaboration. Director Mar asked for examples of past issues expressed by the BAEHC to which Ms. Fasano and Ana Sandoval, Air Quality Program Manager of Communications and Outreach Office, replied that enforcement around the Bayview Hunters Point mitigation program and their disappointment and concerns about how they were ill informed of and disenfranchised from the Healthy Communities Summit.

Ms. Fasano added, regarding slide 4, Common Goals, that the parties discovered that the goals of each party were almost entirely commonly held goals.

Ms. Fasano clarified, regarding slide 5, Outcomes, that the regular meetings will be on a monthly basis at the outset but may be less frequent if one or both of the parties finds that schedule to be too rigorous. Ms. Fasano added that the joint working group on cumulative impacts/community exposure policy will initially focus on Bayview Hunters Point, including officials from other local agencies as appropriate. Director Mar and Committee Chairperson Ross volunteered to participate on the working group and Ms. Fasano replied that scheduling is in process.

Committee Comments/Questions: Director Mar commended the efforts and level of involvement of Air District staff and inquired as to whether the BAEHC participants acknowledged the same. Ms. Fasano and Ms. Roggenkamp replied that further work is necessary on the part of the Air District to relay to the coalition the commitment of the Air District to the efforts.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Garner was noted present at 10:15 a.m.

Committee Chairperson Ross asked what epiphanies resulted from meeting. Ms. Sandoval answered that the Air District needs to carefully gauge its ability to execute on promises before it extends them.

Ms. Roggenkamp noted that the BAEHC-suggested facilitator was an amenable partner for each party and this would to have a lasting effect on the collaborative.

Director Garner, in reference to slide 4, Common Goals, requested clarification regarding which goals were not common to the parties to which Ms. Fasano replied that it was eventually determined that all goals were commonly held.

Ms. Roggenkamp responded to Committee Chairperson Ross's inquiry regarding epiphanies by noting that the parties do not need to change their roles in order to successfully collaborate but instead to modify their individual behavior in the relationship so as to accommodate each party's respective role and once achieved, feels the collaborative will be a productive one.

Ms. Fasano responded to Committee Chairperson Ross's inquiry regarding epiphanies by suggesting that the BAEHC participants seem to feel that if Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO, or the members of the Board of Directors are not present, then discussions will be fruitless and that the collaborative is generally undervalued by the Air District. Ms. Fasano

went on to say that BAEHC participants seemed to desire the ability to instantly appeal staff decisions to Mr. Broadbent or the Board. Ms. Roggenkamp suggested that these feelings will likely self-correct as the relationship continues and builds.

Ms. Fasano added that BAEHC participants do not like to hear about the parties' divergent goals and Director Wagenknecht responded that the members of the Board of Directors often advocate on behalf of business interests in their role as elected officials and have to strike a balance in performing their roles as members of the Air District, a situation he hopes the BAEHC participants can come to appreciate. Ms. Fasano agreed, recalling the BAEHC stance that the Air District should deny many more permits outright and noting the BAEHC's fundamental disagreement with the Air District's stance on the matter. Committee Chairperson Ross noted the limitations of the Air District under law, regardless of intentions, and asked what the Board of Directors can do to convey this to which Ms. Fasano replied that it is crucial that the BAEHC see that Air District staff have the support of the Board and that one-on-one meetings between BAEHC participants and Board members would be a valuable way to demonstrate the same. Chairperson Gioia said it is helpful for Air District staff to extend to Board members the invitations to these events so that Directors may decide whether to attend. Ms. Fasano suggested that the Toxic Triangle meetings on Saturdays are considered critical to BAEHC and it is noted when the Air District is absent. Director Mar responded that BAEHC communication is generally narrow in scope and doesn't provide much in the way of advance notice, making his participation very difficult despite his desire otherwise, noting that he had never heard of the Toxic Triangle meetings before this. Director Garner expressed the importance of establishing an understanding regarding permits and asked how best to communicate the Air District's stance to which Ms. Fasano indicated that the next agenda item will address that question.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

6. Update on Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan Workshop Strategy

Ms. Fasano introduced Ms. Sandoval, who gave the staff presentation regarding the Public Engagement Policy and Guidance Plan Update, including background on the Policy and Plan, a current project overview, a look at the membership of and meeting schedule for the Stakeholder Advisory Task Force, the planned regional workshops and supplemental outreach efforts, and finally, a summary of the next steps.

Ms. Sandoval added, regarding slide 2, Background, that the Policy and Plan will also serve as a reference document for the public.

Ms. Sandoval noted, regarding slide 6, Supplemental Outreach, that those examples provided are not a comprehensive list of the outreach efforts planned by the Air District.

Committee Comments/Questions: Director Haggerty asked if the presentation detailed all District outreach for this Policy and Plan or only that being done towards the non-English speaking community to which Ms. Fasano answered that it is comprehensive. Director Haggerty

followed up by relaying that grassroots political organizations, such as Tea Party affiliated groups, have expressed a sense of exclusion from Air District outreach, not least of which is because many of the workshops are during work hours and the organizations' members are largely volunteers that are working during those times. Director Haggerty and Mss. Fasano, Roggenkamp and Sandoval discuss the current outreach efforts to local industry, the need for the Air District work to be more inclusive of small, non-regulated business community members, and the plan to contact the local Chamber of Commerce and similar organizations in a first step to advancing this change.

Director Garner asked if members of the Board of Directors are welcome at the regional workshops to which Ms. Fasano replied that they are welcome and invitations will be forthcoming as soon as the agenda is complete. Director Garner suggested the Cities Association Meeting in Santa Clara County as a broadcast point and discussed with Ms. Sandoval the timing and logistics of the same.

Chairperson Gioia and Committee Chairperson Ross clarified that members of the Board of Directors want to receive invitations to these events and others relating to other subject matter.

Committee Chairperson Ross asked about the existence and status of an email distribution list for Air District permittees. Ms. Sandoval responded that mailing addresses are on file but not all permittees have submitted email addresses. Committee Chairperson Ross suggested that the email distribution list be built out for future invitations and that when the videoconferencing protocol, currently in discussion before the Executive Committee, is updated and implemented, the two tools should prove to increase the visibility of Air District work and accessibility for the public.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: Committee Chairperson Ross approved the request from Ms. Roggenkamp to amend before the Board of Directors the augmentation of the Kearns & West contract.

7. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** Monday, March 15, 2012, at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:30 a.m.
8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:01 a.m.

151 Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards