

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 771-6000

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Public Outreach Committee Meeting
9:30 a.m., Thursday, July 19, 2012

1. Call to Order – Roll Call

Chairperson Mark Ross called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

Present: Chairperson Mark Ross; Vice Chairperson Eric Mar; and Directors John Avalos, Scott Haggerty, Carol Klatt and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Directors Susan Garner and Nate Miley.

Also Present: None.

2. Public Comment Period:

Marie Harrison, Greenaction, addressed the Committee regarding Bayview-Hunters Point, specifically the lackluster response from the Air District to construction-related air quality violations and the inadequate air quality monitoring requirements. Chairperson Ross directed the matter to Compliance & Enforcement staff. Director Avalos asked Ms. Harrison if she had talked directly with Air District staff about overages. Ms. Harrison said yes. Director Avalos asked about the response. Ms. Harrison said staff explained that an overage does not constitute a violation. Ms. Harrison asked what constitutes a violation if not an overage. Director Avalos offered to meet with Ms. Harrison separately.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 9:38 a.m.

3. Approval of Minutes of March 15, 2012, and May 31, 2012

Committee Action: Director Wagenknecht made a motion to approve the Minutes of March 15, 2012, and May 31, 2012; Director Haggerty seconded; carried unanimously without objection.

4. Website Maintenance and Minor Upgrades Contract Approval

Lisa Fasano, Director of Communications & Outreach, introduced Kristine Roselius, Air Quality Program Manager of Communications & Outreach, who gave a staff presentation Contract for Website Maintenance & Minor Upgrades, including background on maintenance, upgrades and the existing contract, and staff recommendation.

Ms. Roselius added, regarding slide 3, Background, that the upgrade of data presentation to increase functionality, part of the Gate 1 Migration, will result in raw air quality data being reconfigured in such a way as to provide greater public accessibility and understanding.

Committee Comments:

Director Wagenknecht asked if there was a bidding process for the contract. Ms. Fasano said the contract is ongoing from years prior for general day-to-day maintenance. Director Avalos asked if this is a new contract or an amendment to an existing one. Ms. Roselius said it is a new contract to replace the current, short-term one. Ms. Fasano said the existing contract has an odd term that does not follow the fiscal year so the contract presented today has a term that will put it in line with future fiscal years.

Director Haggerty asked why the contract is for only eight months. Ms. Fasano said to get through to the end of the fiscal year and get in the same cycle as the rest of the contracts. Director Haggerty asked if the merged facility at 390 Main Street will create in-house information technology capabilities that will negate the need for these services. Ms. Fasano guessed that even the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) has some outsourced information technology work despite having in-house information technology staff. Director Haggerty asked that Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, answer this question after the meeting's conclusion and address the need to analyze all opportunities for savings through merging efforts. Chairperson Ross agreed with Director Haggerty and asked if there would be servers located in the new building. Brian Bunger, District Counsel, said the server system being discussed is not offsite, only separate from the Air District's usual web services because of what it handles.

Chairperson Ross asked how the request for proposals process started in terms of compliance with bidding rules and guidelines. Ms. Fasano said this process is following the current guidelines, the Cylogy contract is necessary to the continued functionality of the Air District website and the work under contract cannot be spontaneously transferred without a loss of functionality. Chairperson Ross said that makes sense but sometimes the protocols do not make sense and asked that the contract timeline and protocol to be reviewed for compliance before the item goes to the Board for approval. Director Wagenknecht expressed his support for today's contract renewal but said he would appreciate having the answers to today's questions when it is revisited. Ms. Fasano agreed.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action:

Director Wagenknecht made a motion, seconded by Director Haggerty and carried unanimously without objection to recommend the Board of Directors authorize the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO) to execute an eight-month contract with Cylogy, Inc., not to exceed \$87,000 for website maintenance and minor upgrades.

5. Update on the 2012 Great Race for Clean Air Kickoff

Ms. Fasano gave the staff presentation Great Race for Clean Air, including an overview, review of the past success rate, timeline for this year's Great Race and staff suggestions for Board member involvement.

Ms. Fasano added, regarding slide 3, Great Race Success, that the lower numbers in 2011 are attributed to technical issues that have since been addressed.

Committee Comments:

Director Wagenknecht asked if the varying programs throughout the Bay Area will be coordinated by the Air District. Stephanie Anderson, Executive Director, Community Focus, said the participants run their individual programs but coordination with the Air District definitely occurs.

Chairperson Ross asked what awards are given. Ms. Anderson said there are prizes for individuals and companies; companies win bragging rights and trophies; individuals win personal electronic devices but these are under review to make sure they are keeping people engaged.

Director Avalos said the impact was measurable in past years and noted that 2010 was stronger than 2011. Ms. Fasano attributed the difference to the level of participation stemming from diminished website functionality in 2011. Director Avalos asked if companies with already high rates of alternative commutes are at a disadvantage. Ms. Fasano said no but companies must go through the process of registering for the event.

Chairperson Ross asked if pounds of emissions are calculated using vehicle miles travelled (VMT). Ms. Anderson said the calculations are made through the 511.org ride match system and are based on data entered by individual users. Chairperson Ross said the VMT information is useful and suggested it be shared with the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) and MTC in light of the planning work being done relative to Senate Bill 375 and suggested the telecommuting community seems undercounted. Ms. Anderson said that staff partnered with MTC and provided background information on the website transition and functionality from 2010 to the present.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Mar was noted present at 9:57 a.m.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

6. Update on Collaboration with the Bay Area Environmental Health Collaborative (BAEHC)

Ms. Fasano introduced Ms. Sandoval who gave the staff presentation Bay Area Environmental Health Collaborative Activities Update, including background and reviews of the interagency walk-through of the Hunters View Redevelopment Project, Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) Task Force Meeting Methodology Presentation, and BAEHC meetings.

Ms. Sandoval added, regarding slide 4, Interagency Walk-Through, that navigating the public agencies involved in a task is not an easy thing for staff or the public and suggested convening a meeting of the public agencies involved in the tour to clarify roles and responsibilities and identify potential solutions, tentatively scheduled for early August, followed by a meeting with members of the public. Ms. Sandoval noted the pictures from left to right, are of a gas-powered weed whacker, a wetted down street and the first frame in a video of the recent group tour. Ms. Sandoval played said video.

Director Haggerty asked, regarding slide 6, Methodology Presentation, what is in the far northeast of the map excerpted from a University of California, Berkeley presentation by Rachel Morello-Frosch. Ms. Fasano said Antioch. Director Haggerty asked what happened to the big red streak going down Interstate 580 as it heads to Interstate 5 and whether the Air District can overlay its own data. Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules & Research, responded that Professor Morello-Frosch's methodology is different than that of the Air District and staff are aware of Director Haggerty's concern relative to this area. Director Haggerty said it has become more concerning because now the Air District does not even acknowledge there are air impacts in the area. Mr. Hilken clarified that it was not the intent of staff, in showing this slide, to deny air impacts in the area but to instead illustrate an example of Dr. Morello-Frosch's presentation and to highlight the overlap in the existing CARE communities; explained that Professor Morello-Frosch suggested moving past methodologies to focus on mitigation actions; and clarified that the Air District will be updating its methodologies to include particulate matter and ozone in its CARE communities assessment, which has proven difficult in the past because there is a geographic disconnect for some sources located outside the Air District's jurisdiction which create significant ozone concentrations impacting these communities. Director Haggerty said he understands the interplay between concentrations on Interstates 880 and 580 and suggested that presenting Dr. Morello-Frosch's slide leaves the Air District's stance open to misinterpretation. Mr. Hilken said yes, staff will be more cautious about labeling maps in the future, and the revised method will be brought back before the proper committee. Director Haggerty said this is not about him trying to get money into the tri-valley area but to instead point out a problem in the community that needs to be pinpointed and addressed. Mr. Hilken said staff will bring back proposed mapping to the Committee. Ms. Fasano said this map was included because of a BAEHC request that the Air District host Dr. Morello-Frosch's presentation and staff's desire to show a representative slide. Director Haggerty said he understands the context but he will continue to bring up the matter until it is resolved. Mr. Hilken said the revised method will be further improved by the use of 2010 census data instead of 2000 census data.

Director Mar asked for more information from staff about Professor Morello-Frosch's method, said to be used by environmental groups in the Los Angeles area, and that high resolution maps be forwarded to him, and noted that he is specifically in search of those red areas that show up which are not currently in CARE communities and those CARE communities that do not show up as red areas. Mr. Hilken volunteered to forward the information and said he would reach out to his counterparts at the South Coast Air Quality Management District. Director Mar said he is sensitive to Director Haggerty's suggestion regarding the importance of taking into account cumulative impacts and said this is just one more way to look at vulnerable communities so as to assist the Air District in considering how best to focus its energy. Ms. Fasano noted the goal of today's presentation was to show a variety of methods as overview. Director Wagenknecht asked

the reason this was requested by BAEHC as opposed to the methodology used by the Air District. Ms. Sandoval said frequent conversations with BAEHC representatives lead her to understand that Dr. Morello-Frosch's presentation uses a specific way of defining "vulnerable community" and that methodology incorporates race, which differs from the Air District's and is the source of the request that staff look to this data.

Director Haggerty said that the District, in its role as a public health agency, should not consider race and instead focus on whether air is polluted in a region.

Ms. Sandoval concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

Director Haggerty asked if there is a clear understanding of the impact from airports. Mr. Hilken said there was when modeling for CARE but the bottom line is that airports, as polluters, are dwarfed by roadway diesel emissions. Director Haggerty asked if staff can prepare a brief that compares airports with various sources for the next meeting of the Mobile Source Committee. Mr. Hilken said yes.

Chairperson Ross asked if most of the emissions from airports are acrolein. Mr. Hilken said yes and that acrolein does not have the chronic, long-term cancer effects that diesel exhaust does but that it has more acute impacts. Director Haggerty asked if airport size is indicative. Mr. Hilken said it is primarily volume but that military jet aircraft are dirtier than some commercial fleets so that also has an impact. Mr. Bunger said the Air District is currently doing some U.S. Environmental Protection Agency-mandated monitoring around the general aviation fields. Chairperson Ross asked if acrolein or diesel is worse when considered pound-for-pound. Mr. Hilken said that Brian Bateman, Health and Science Officer, should respond but diesel is much worse than acrolein. Mr. Bunger said acrolein is an eye and mucus membrane irritant. Chairperson Ross asked if acrolein induces asthma. The Committee and staff discussed. Mr. Bunger said acrolein is part of the CARE work. Chairperson Ross said the CARE work is how he learned about acrolein and asked if it is included in Professor Morello-Frosch's presentation. Mr. Hilken said he did not know.

Director Mar thanked the public for their participation in the tour, asked that future tours be shortened to the greatest extent possible, expressed his hope that staff from the local agencies will respond to the public's calls for assistance, said it is helpful to know about nearby developments and the cumulative effects that may result, noted the importance of the methodology used and the taking into account of numerous variables, such as income, ethnicity and general health, and suggested the vulnerability of populations varies and information relative to vulnerabilities is valuable.

Public Comments:

Ms. Harrison commended Director Haggerty's comments but noted that while it should not matter where you live nor what one's income, the truth is that it does. Ms. Harrison then addressed the Committee regarding the importance of moving past the debate on methodology to instead address the air quality, as the health of the public is threatened.

Director Haggerty noted the speaker mentioned Tracy and said a look at emissions levels at Interstates 880, 580 and 5 shows that all need to be addressed, but for the income variable related to Interstate 580, and there remains a need to acknowledge the problem along Interstate 580.

Chairperson Ross asked what the methodology of the Air District is in terms of expanding the number of CARE communities. Mr. Hilken said the technical work of updating the current criteria and looking at new criteria, such as including ozone in the tri-valley area, is underway now and staff will make a proposal on an updated method in early fall; the Executive Officer/APCO can work on which committees are the best to work with and report to; and committed to bringing back information to the Committee that looks at emissions along Interstate 580. Chairperson Ross said that this Committee is surely not the committee to be drawing lines but updates would be helpful. Director Haggerty suggested the problem is so bad along Interstate 580 that when he recently travelled through Chicago O'Hare International Airport to Pittsburg he experienced respiratory relief until he returned home to the Bay Area.

Director Haggerty said the difference, from his perspective, is one of access to healthcare and for community members that disproportionately lack healthcare the air quality issue becomes a major problem. Director Haggerty suggested the ideal approach is to address the air quality issue and then separately address the provision of medical assistance to some of those communities in need. Director Avalos agreed with Director Haggerty, said additional factors further compound the impact for some communities, added that race does have an important role to play and the disparities are stark, and said there needs to be a response from local agencies that corresponds to the various issues. Director Haggerty agreed with Director Avalos but suggested there is only so much that can be done by the Air District, proposed a greater dialogue between the Air District and the public health, and perhaps social services, agencies of the nine counties within its jurisdiction so as to stop piecemeal efforts in lieu of a holistic approach on a huge scale. Director Avalos agreed that the Air District is part of a larger effort. Director Haggerty said we have to get everyone to the table because of the limitations of the Air District. Ms. Fasano recalled her discussion with San Francisco County public health officials regarding the significant health impacts from mold, suggested collaboration is a way to get at those issues since the subject matter is outside of the jurisdiction of the Air District, and mentioned the goal of decreased transportation as a component of the Great Race for Clean Air that should have a positive impact on various communities. Director Mar said Rajiv Bhatia, Director of Occupational and Environmental Health, San Francisco Department of Public Health, City and County of San Francisco, was part of the BAEHC discussion and said the cumulative impacts approach is one, not the only, useful tool for the Air District make determinations about CARE communities.

Chairperson Ross requested staff updates on the interagency public health collaboration described by Director Haggerty and for information on how the members of the Board can assist. Director Haggerty suggested that social services also be included. Chairperson Ross asked staff to determine how Director Haggerty's suggested can be fashioned and asked for direction on how the Directors can facilitate the collaboration. Director Haggerty suggested Air District staff meet with social services and public health agencies to start a dialogue about how to lay out a framework for working together and then report back to the Committee. Chairperson Ross agreed. Ms. Sandoval said a follow up meeting with the other public agencies is scheduled. Director Haggerty said all nine of the region's counties and all of the public health and social

services agencies need to formulate a plan that works throughout the Bay Area. Chairperson Ross said this will require the involvement of the Executive Officer/APCO and Ms. Fasano suggested this was part of the framework for the Blueprint for Healthy Communities that was under consideration last year. Chairperson Ross said that we will take the matter up again. Director Haggerty asked for a discussion regarding the provision of support to community-based organizations working for the elimination of air toxins in areas of poverty either as the sole topic of discussion or as part of the larger conversation.

Director Klatt noted Director Haggerty's mention of airports and the effect of San Francisco International Airport on her community and agreed that the Air District needs to take a look at airports. Director Ross agreed.

Director Haggerty asked if staff addressed the recent negative press received by the Spare the Air campaign. Ms. Fasano said the newspaper article in the San Francisco Chronicle had a headline with a somewhat negative spin but the article itself was positive. Director Haggerty said the television coverage on Channel 7 was not so good. Ms. Fasano said the television reports that picked up the story stuck to the headline but that the Air District is pleased with the initial story. Director Haggerty asked if the Air District is addressing the television piece. Ms. Fasano said no. Chairperson Ross said the Air District generally does a follow up poll regarding the efficacy of outreach efforts and asked if that would be an appropriate forum for reviewing the press received. Director Haggerty said it was the first negative coverage he had seen and it upset him. Director Ross attributed it to media spin. Ms. Fasano agreed that it was not well reported when it made its way to television.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

7. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** At the Call of the Chair.
8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 10:53 a.m.

/s/ Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards