

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 749-5073

Videoconference Location:  
Santa Rosa Junior College  
Doyle Library Room 4243  
1501 Mendocino Avenue  
Santa Rosa, CA 95401

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Climate Protection Committee Meeting  
Monday, December 9, 2013

### **1. Call to Order – Roll Call**

Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:39 a.m.

Present: Chairperson John Avalos; and Directors Susan Adams, Scott Haggerty, Jan Pepper, Mark Ross and Shirlee Zane (via videoconference).

Absent: Committee Vice-Chairperson David Hudson; and Directors Teresa Barrett and John Gioia.

Also Present: Board of Directors Vice-Chairperson Nate Miley.

### **2. Public Comment Period: None.**

### **3. Approval of Minutes of October 23, 2013**

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action:

Director Ross made a motion, seconded by Director Adams, to approve the Minutes of October 23, 2013; and the motion carried unanimously.

### **4. Regional Climate Protection Work Program**

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, who gave the staff presentation Regional Climate Protection

Work Program, including background, work program revisions, summaries of stakeholder meeting and input, Air District resource needs and next steps.

The Committee and staff discussed, regarding slide 6, *Air District Resource Needs*, fee recovery eligibility.

Mr. Hilken concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the noteworthiness of the Air District response on this item; the identity of and notification process to stakeholders; the amount of time needed for further outreach; the state of the current draft work program and future revisions of the same after initial adoption; information relative to the delta between staff needs and the Air District's current fee authority; the explicit inclusion of Community Choice Aggregations (CCAs) as a key component to the development of renewable energy in the future; the feasibility of bringing in local agencies that have climate action plans in the works for project collaboration with the Air District; a carbon tax on all applicable permittees as a way to simultaneously generate funds and to disincentivize greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions; the suggestion for future work on cumulative impacts; a suggestion that a gas tax change may be due; the likely timeline for Board adoption of the work program; and the importance of moving as quickly as possible while taking the time needed to execute a robust public participation phase

Mr. Broadbent suggested adoption in the first quarter of 2014 and an initial Board discussion at the January retreat.

Public Comments:

Jeff Dorian, 350 Bay Area, delivered to the Committee correspondence from Floyd Earl Smith attaching a revised draft work program.

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area/350 San Francisco, addressed the Committee to commend the discussion regarding CCAs and a carbon tax, to note the invitation to oil industry to the public workshop that they chose not to attend, to express support for the correspondence delivered by Mr. Dorian on behalf of Mr. Smith, to commend the establishment of interim goals in the work program, and to suggest that the integration of the work program and permit review process is critical to the program's success.

Stephanie Harvey, Communities for a Better Environment/Sunflower Alliance, addressed the Committee to encourage forward thinking, incentive-based support for businesses and a focus on the creation of clean-energy jobs.

Charles Davidson addressed the Committee regarding current refinery production and emissions and the potential impacts of the proposed energy projects by the same.

Jim Wilson addressed the Committee regarding the impropriety of allowing industry to pollute the air that is partially cleaned by residents' respiratory systems at the expense of good health and to suggest that a carbon tax may be more popular than presumed.

Committee Comments (continued):

The Committee and staff discussed the utilization of social media; the implementation of a carbon tax to fund more proactive projects by the Air District; that a carbon tax is mostly a change in name and appearance only from those fees already imposed; and whether the item would return to the Committee before going to the Board for approval

Committee Action: None; informational only.

**5. California Air Pollution Control Officers Association (CAPCOA) GHG Reduction Exchange (Rx)**

Mr. Broadbent introduced the topic and David Vintze, Air Quality Planning Manager of Planning, Rules and Research, gave the staff presentation CAPCOA GHG Rx, including background, motivation, key components, an explanation of how the exchange operates and current status.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the ability of someone to game the system to simultaneously benefit from this program and the State's cap-and-trade system; the user friendliness of the permit application process; the Air District process for verification of permit application data; the eligibility of the Marin Carbon Project; why the decision was made to establish another program rather than enhance the State's cap-and-trade system; experiences relative to other programs that allowed out-of-state and out-of-country participants; when reportable activity is likely to occur under the program; the motivation for enrollment in this program and whether credits from other regions are allowed; the desirability of the exchange credits remaining within individual air district regions; about the timing of the outreach on the program; and about the Air District website linkage.

Mr. Broadbent said the Committee will receive an update in the first quarter of 2014.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

**6. Committee Members' Comments:** None.

**7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:**

Thursday, January 16, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 10:55 a.m.

*151 Sean Gallagher*

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards