

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
Alameda County Transportation Commission Office
1111 Broadway
Oakland, CA 94607
(415) 749-5073

Board of Directors Special Meeting/Retreat
Wednesday, January 15, 2014

APPROVED MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER: Outgoing Chairperson Ash Kalra called the meeting to order at 9:56 a.m.

ROLL CALL:

Present: Chairperson Nate Miley; Vice-Chairperson Carole Groom; Secretary Eric Mar; and Directors Susan Adams, John Avalos, Teresa Barrett, Tom Bates, Cindy Chavez, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, David Hudson, Ash Kalra, Roger Kim (on behalf of Edwin Lee), Liz Kniss, Jan Pepper, Mary Piepho, Mark Ross, Jim Spering and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Directors Carol L. Klatt, Tim Sbranti (resigned) and Shirlee Zane.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Outgoing Chairperson Kalra led the Pledge of Allegiance.

OPENING COMMENTS: None.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS:

Gary Latshaw, Sierra Club, submitted written material and addressed the Board of Directors (Board) to encourage efforts to convert the Bay Area infrastructure to a renewable energy model.

Taylor Hawke, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board in gratitude for its climate work in 2013 and to request the inclusion of greenhouse gases (GHG) in the permitting program, District support of programs that implement sustainable energy alternatives in order to meet climate resolution targets, and to encourage the development of an aggressive climate action plan.

Aaron Reaven, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board in gratitude for the adoption of the climate resolution, said the Bay Area refineries intend to receive and process petroleum stocks from fracking and tar sands operations, and to request the inclusion of GHG in the permitting program and aligning it with the climate action plan.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 10:06 a.m.

Floyd Earl Smith, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board regarding the Air District's success at addressing historically identified pollutants, to express gratitude for the adoption of the climate resolution, to commend the opportunity for public involvement in the development of the climate

work program, and to request the inclusion of GHG in the permitting program and to impose maximum emission limits for the largest facilities in the Bay Area.

COMMENDATIONS/PROCLAMATIONS/AWARDS:

Chairperson-Elect Miley and Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), each recognized Outgoing Chairperson Kalra in turn for his outstanding leadership as Chair of the Board of Directors in 2013.

Outgoing Chairperson Kalra commended staff for the work of the Air District in 2013 and thanked the Board, public and staff for their involvement and efforts.

Outgoing Chairperson Kalra passed the gavel to Chairperson-Elect Miley.

CONSENT CALENDAR (ITEMS 1 – 5)

- 1. Minutes of the Board of Directors Regular Meeting of December 18, 2013;**
- 2. Board Communications Received from December 18, 2013 through January 14, 2014;**
- 3. Air District Personnel on Out-of-State Business Travel;**
- 4. Notice of Violations Issued and Settlements in Excess of \$10,000 in December 2013; and**
- 5. Consider Authorizing Contract Amendments for the My Air Online Program.**

Board Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action:

Director Piepho made a motion to approve Consent Calendar Items 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5; Director Kniss seconded; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Adams, Avalos, Barrett, Bates, Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Hudson, Kalra, Kim, Kniss, Mar, Miley, Pepper, Piepho, Ross, Spering and Wagenknecht.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Klatt, Sbranti and Zane.

COMMITTEE REPORTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- 6. Report of the Personnel Committee (PC) Meeting of January 13, 2014**
Committee Chairperson Wagenknecht

The PC met on Monday, January 13, 2014, and approved the minutes of December 2, 2013.

The PC received the Advisory Council (AC) Interview summary material for the two vacant conservation organization category seats, conducted interviews of applicants, and recommends Board approval of the appointment to the Air District's AC of Bruce Mast (Build It Green) to the conservation organization category seat, for the remainder of a term expiring December 31, 2014, and Laura Tam (SPUR) to the conservation organization category seat, for the remainder of a term expiring December 31, 2015. The PC also recommends Board approval of incumbent reappointment of AC Member Jeffrey Bramlett for the remainder of a term expiring December 31, 2015.

The next meeting of the PC is at the call of the Chair.

Board Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action:

Director Wagenknecht made a motion to approve the recommendations of the PC; Director Adams seconded; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Adams, Avalos, Barrett, Bates, Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Hudson, Kalra, Kim, Kniss, Mar, Miley, Pepper, Piepho, Ross, Spering and Wagenknecht.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Klatt, Sbranti and Zane.

BOARD OF DIRECTORS RETREAT

7. Opening Comments

Chairperson Miley thanked the Alameda County Transportation Commission for the use of the facility for today's meeting and welcomed those present.

Board Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

8. State of the Air District

Mr. Broadbent addressed the Board regarding the State of the Air District.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the recent weather patterns, the spate of national air quality standard violations that resulted, and the reason for the varied identifiers used for “Site Name” in the staff report on agenda item #4.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

9. Air Quality Summary

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy APCO (DAPCO), gave the staff presentation *Air Quality Summary*, including ozone exceedance, air toxics, and fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) trends over the years; an update on the 2013/2014 Winter Spare the Air Season; a comparison of PM_{2.5} levels in 2007 and 2013; Bay Area GHG emissions trends from 1990 to 2050; the key elements of the Air District climate protection resolution; and an update on the Clean Air Plan.

Mr. Broadbent noted a recent public health study by Professor Robert A. Harley, University of California Berkeley, regarding the improvements particulate matter levels in the Bay Area.

The Board and staff discussed transposing public health information over future graphs like that found on slide #10, *PM_{2.5} Exceedance Trends 2000 to Present*; the number of Spare the Air Alerts since November 1, the air quality levels each of those days, and their relationship to the federal standards; incentives for low-income constituents to transition away from wood-fueled heating systems; the Spare the Air Alert seasonal messages to limit driving and prohibit wood burning; the need to educate and inform the public about the origin and impact of the federal standards which drive the Spare the Air Alerts; the recent history and politics of the lowered U.S. Environmental Protection Agency standard; whether it is possible to extend Spare the Air Alerts beyond February of each year; the forecasting capabilities of the Air District; the necessity for changes in individual behavior and the inclusion of that message in Air District outreach; and current air quality levels and the contributing sources by percentage.

Mr. Broadbent continued the staff presentation.

The Board and staff discussed the effects of transport between the San Joaquin Valley (Valley) and Bay Area, the contributing sources in the Valley and program funds available to each air district for addressing the issue, the value of including medical information regarding the health impacts of air quality in Spare the Air Alerts, the contributions of various subsets of motor vehicles, the length of time particulate matter (PM) remains in the human body, and the likelihood of rule-making work on this topic in 2015.

Ms. Roggenkamp continued the staff presentation.

The Board and staff discussed the development of interim GHG emission targets and the calculation of per capita levels to better inform future regional reduction targets.

Ms. Roggenkamp concluded the staff presentation.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the climate work ahead and the critical need for continued enhancement of the Spare the Air Program messaging.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

10. Administrative and Financial Overview

Jeff McKay, DAPCO, gave the staff presentation *Administrative & Financial Overview*, including summaries of the recent financial history, topics for Fiscal Year Ending 2015 budget discussions, personnel costs, purchase of 375 Beale Street, and yearly costs.

The Board and staff discussed the state of and forecast for labor contract negotiations with Air District staff; a strategic staffing plan; exploration of a hybrid retirement plan option; position-specific explanations for vacant positions that remain funded in future budgets; the effect of the global economic downturn on staff levels and vacancies; and the consideration of the staff diversity in terms gender, ethnicity, language and cultural competency when implementing the strategic staffing plan.

Mr. McKay concluded the staff presentation.

Board Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

11. Update on 375 Beale Street

Mr. Broadbent introduced Jack Colbourn, Director of Administrative Services, who gave the staff presentation *375 Beale Street Regional Agency Headquarters Status Report*, including current activities, overviews of the interagency shared services delivery assessment and furniture procurement request for proposals process, the construction schedule and next steps.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the inclusion of Americans with Disabilities Act considerations and good ergonomic practice during the planning process and that an update on the sale of 939 Ellis Street will be part of the closed session discussion at the next Board meeting.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

12. Production System and Website Project Update

Mr. Broadbent introduced Damian Breen, DAPCO, who introduced Jaime Williams, Information Technology Officer, who jointly gave the staff presentation *Production System & Website Project Update*, including My Air Online program status and 2014 plan.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed ways to provide easier and more direct access to public meeting agendas and related materials, the navigational challenges of the current website, the desire to include an improved search engine in the new website and the central role of the website in all outreach efforts.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

13. Key Policy Initiatives

Mr. Broadbent gave the staff presentation *Key Policy Initiatives*, including a proposed modernization of the AC and summaries the Bay Area Commuter Benefits Program, draft climate action work program and the petroleum refinery emissions tracking rule.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the unique quality of the petroleum refinery emissions tracking rule; the nature of the U.S. Chemical Safety Board work relating to petroleum refineries; the possibility of convening Board meetings with more comprehensive discussions of single, large topics that allow greater opportunities for stakeholder input than the traditional meeting model; the robust public involvement in the development of the climate change resolution and Public Participation Plan; the positive direction the petroleum refinery emissions tracking rule will take the Air District; the ability of petroleum refineries to afford operational changes that will improve air quality; the importance of informing stakeholders of the benefits that will accompany the costs of complying with the climate action work program; where the authority lies for adjusting the limitations of stakeholder input in public meetings; the robust and comprehensive staff work on proposed rules in general; and the nature of stakeholder outreach regarding the draft climate work program.

Public Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

14. Upcoming Committee Assignments and Goals

Chairperson Miley announced the upcoming committee assignments, explained his approach in making the assignments, and delivered the written roster to the Board.

Board Comments: None.

Public Comments:

Mr. Smith addressed the Board regarding the changing job of the Air District, the Air District's success at addressing historically identified pollutants, the emissions outside the Bay Area overwhelm the Air District's successes, and the importance of Air District work as a model for the rest of the world.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS:

Martin Mackerel, Pittsburg Defense Council, addressed the Board regarding the importance of taking into consideration the petroleum stocks going into Bay Area refineries, the health and safety impacts on the surrounding communities during transport and processing, and to request changes in the permit application process to require disclosure of the same.

OTHER BUSINESS (OUT OF ORDER)

15. Chairperson's Report (Out of Order):

Chairperson Miley thanked staff and encouraged an open door approach to the work of the Air District but said he will remain mindful of the limits of the Air District mission, jurisdictional authority and resources.

Chairperson Miley asked that staff reports be delivered to the Executive Committee regarding Air District procurement policies, affirmative action plan, and a regulations and rules summary.

Chairperson Miley encouraged fair and reasonable approaches to situations, despite the differences between those involved, and suggested the dialogue that results will yield solutions.

Chairperson Miley thanked the former chairpersons in attendance.

BOARD MEMBERS' COMMENTS:

Director Bates introduced Arthur Agnos, Former Mayor, City and County of San Francisco, as a guest of the Board at today's meeting.

OTHER BUSINESS (CONTINUED)

16. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO:

Chairperson Miley announced the cancellation of the Board of Directors Regular Meeting on February 5, 2014.

17. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Wednesday, February 19, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:45 a.m.

18. **Adjournment:** The Board meeting adjourned at 12:27 p.m.

/S/ Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards