

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Monday, September 29, 2014

1. Call to Order – Roll Call

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:41 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson John Avalos; and Directors Susan Adams, Teresa Barrett, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, Jan Pepper and Mark Ross.

Absent: Vice-Chairperson Ash Kalra and Director Shirlee Zane.

Also Present: Board of Directors (Board) Chairperson Nate Miley.

2. Public Comment Period:

Larry Danos, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to recognize the past air quality improvements under the watch of the Air District and expressed concern about new emissions being discovered through advancements in monitoring technology and changes expected in the petroleum refining industry.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Ross was noted present at 9:43 a.m.

Floyd Earl Smith, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to request the webcasting of future meetings; the inclusion of greenhouse gases (GHG) and GHG-impacts in the permitting process; and to provide advance notice of an upcoming clean solutions conference in which the Committee will soon be formally invited.

Harry Chomsky, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to request Air District involvement as a partner agency in California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) reviews by Bay Area cities and counties.

The Committee and staff discussed the current Air District role of providing assistance and guidance, when requested, and the different relationship between SCAQMD and the local governments in its region.

Timothy Donaghy, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to request outreach to cities and counties in the Bay Area regarding the Air District's ability to be a partner agency in the CEQA

review process and to suggest the lowering of CEQA emissions thresholds to somewhere in the range of 1,000 to 5,000 tons per year.

Marilyn Bardet, Benicians for a Safe and Healthy Community, addressed the Committee to suggest that if GHG are not a part of the CEQA process then industry will not concern themselves with lowering those emissions and to report that the City of Benicia is working to support and advance sustainability projects but any improvements are dwarfed by the major polluters in the area who have no interest in nor requirement to make similar efforts.

Director Gioia noted that California is on track to meet its 2020 state-wide goals.

Ms. Bardet responded that the disconnect between residents' efforts and those of major polluters will remain a critical issue as dirtier crudes are imported to the Bay Area refineries.

3. Approval of Minutes of July 17, 2014

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action:

Director Adams made a motion, seconded by Director Ross, to approve the Minutes of July 17, 2014; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Adams, Avalos, Barrett, Gioia, Pepper and Ross.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Haggerty, Kalra and Zane.

4. Regional Climate Protection Strategy Update

Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, introduced Abby Young, Principal Environmental Planner of Planning, Rules and Research, who gave the staff presentation *Regional Climate Protection Strategy Update (RCPS)*, including strategy overview and contents; sector-based gap analysis; an overview of the sectors involved; gap analysis methodology; policy analysis underway at local, regional, state and federal levels; a sample gap analysis; challenges and observations; path forward for gap analysis; and next steps for the RCPS.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 3, *RCPS Contents*, the form and accessibility of the data set.

NOTED PRESENT: Board Chairperson Miley and Director Haggerty were noted present at 10:09 a.m.

Ms. Young continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed at slide 8, *Sample Gap Analysis*, the accuracy of the projections and forecasted trends.

Ms. Young concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed possibilities for enhancing public enthusiasm about the impact of the data; reformulating the approach to public workshops to garner greater participation by the community and local governments; cap-and-trade revenue that may be available to fund some components of the strategy and the Air District's potential role to facilitate funding of various local programs that support the strategy; outreach targets; Bay Area locales that are engaged in the strategy and whether the program will be limited to those areas deemed impacted communities; the inadequacy of solutions that focus solely on demand and the need to educate the public about the impacts of unmitigated consumption and a serious understanding of the economic consequences of climate change; encouraging public workshops to educate local governments about climate action plan commonalities and creative solutions; the legislative framework post-2020; the lack of standardized baseline inventories and measurements; the importance of finding ways to support and compliment state programs with Air District programs rather than undercut or conflict with them; and the challenges of sharing emission inventories and of creating a comprehensive baseline.

Public Comments:

Ms. Bardet addressed the Committee to invite them to an upcoming presentation in Benicia and to identify commutes through the Tri-Valley Region as major GHG source for the Bay Area, in addition to the lifestyle choices, such as international travel, by the same population.

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to express his support for consumption-based emissions inventories, as was done recently by the City and County of San Francisco; to note that emissions in China surpassed the U.S. but a consumption-based inventory shows otherwise; to suggest that climate action plans should be reviewed qualitatively and not included in any presumptions about achieving 2020 state-wide goals; and to suggest GHGs should be included in the permitting process to facilitate urgently needed change.

Charles Davidson, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to suggest the Bay Area refinery projects currently underway will increase GHG emissions drastically and to suggest the Air District include GHGs in the permitting process and offer to partner with local agencies in CEQA reviews.

The Committee and staff discussed the current permitting process relative to GHGs.

Mr. Donaghy addressed the Committee to request that any Air District material relative to Bay Area climate change efforts be made publicly available.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

5. Climate Readiness Institute (CRI)

Mr. Hilken introduced Bruce Riordan, Climate Strategist, Joint Policy Committee/CRI, who gave the presentation *How the CRI Can Help BAAQMD [Bay Area Air Quality Management District]*, including an overview of the CRI; its current status; potential joint projects with the Air District; and next steps.

The Committee and Mr. Riordan discussed, at slide 5, *Potential CRI Projects with BAAQMD*, whether the CRI focus is primarily on GHG reductions or climate adaptation.

Mr. Riordan concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and Mr. Riordan discussed which local governments are currently in working groups and the future outreach plan; private sector partners are largely associations at this time; including an economic market facet; expansion of projects beyond the hard sciences; whether fundraising is a selective process; the inclusion of Stanford and Berkeley law schools in an attempt to avoid future legal obstructions; the tendency among public agencies to be risk averse and focused on no greater than 15-year timelines; eagerness to move past studies to action; the importance of making these topics and issues approachable for the general public and to create an emphasis on public health and outreach; and the importance of innovations by small business and the possibility of connecting with those resources through local chambers of commerce.

Public Comments:

Mr. Smith addressed the Committee regarding the turnout at the People's Climate March on Sunday, September 21, 2014 in Oakland; to thank Director Haggerty for his recent comments relative to fracking operations in Alameda County; to suggest the Air District is playing the role of the frontrunner in California much as California plays that role for the United States; and to express his appreciation for the presentations today.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

6. Committee Members' Comments/Other Business: None.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Tentatively Monday, November 17, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

8. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 11:37 a.m.

IS/ Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards