

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Climate Protection Committee Meeting  
Monday, December 1, 2014

### **1. Call to Order – Roll Call**

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:36 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson John Avalos; and Directors Susan Adams, Teresa Barrett, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty and Mark Ross.

Absent: Vice-Chairperson Ash Kalra; and Directors Jan Pepper and Shirlee Zane.

Also Present: Board of Directors (Board) Chairperson Nate Miley.

### **2. Public Comment Period:**

Floyd Earl Smith, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to express concern at the pace of work on the climate action strategy and to request project prioritization and a shift to longer-term strategic planning by the Air District.

NOTED PRESENT: Board Chairperson Miley and Director Haggerty were noted present at 9:38 a.m.

Sara Greenwald, 350 San Francisco, addressed the Committee to request a reconciliation of the varying numbers being discussed relative to refinery emissions under Assembly Bill (AB) 32; and to request that Air District permits be required for all sources that emit at least 5,000 tons of greenhouse gases (GHG) per year, maximum emissions limit be imposed for all sources, toxics be included in the permit and limits, and the initiation of a no-net increase plan with hard emissions caps and requirements for the implementation of best alternative technologies.

### **3. Approval of Minutes of September 29, 2014**

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action:

Director Adams made a motion, seconded by Director Haggerty, to approve the Minutes of September 29, 2014; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Adams, Avalos, Barrett, Gioia, Haggerty, Miley and Ross.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Kalra, Pepper and Zane.

**4. Marin Carbon Project**

Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, introduced Jeff Creque, Carbon Cycle Institute, who gave the presentation *The Marin Carbon Project, Carbon Farming: Increasing Carbon Capture on California's Working Lands*, including above-ground production increases and carbon levels in soil since compost application in 2008; models for carbon increase persistence; offsets achieved through diverting organic materials from anaerobic storage and disposal to aerobic composting and land application; GHG mitigation potential statewide; California rangelands carbon sequestration potential; increases in soil moisture; material illustrating the concept of moderating climate change with soil carbon management and carbon farm planning and implementation; draft Corda Ranch carbon farm plan; quantification of carbon farm impacts; carbon capture synergies; and estimated biomass carbon of farm riparian buffers and silvopasture.

At slide 12, *Marin Carbon Project Draft Carbon Farm Plan Corda Ranch*, the Committee and Mr. Creque discussed the number and location of currently active and anticipated project sites.

Mr. Creque concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee, Mr. Creque and staff discussed who owns the land used in the project, how the sites were selected and how the project can be expanded; the involvement of the Marin Resource Conservation District and Sonoma-Marine Cattlemen's Association, Inc.; the site selection criteria; the source of the compost and what, if any, water runoff issues arose; the importance of sharing this presentation; the inclusion of these sequestrations in the Marin CAP; the economic benefits of these activities for landowners; future plans for statewide project expansion; how many resource conservation districts exist in California, how they were established and are funded; the next step for expanding the project beyond rangelands; the existence of the necessary materials onsite at many agricultural operations; additional details about the hydration benefits of the process; precedents for the process prior to this project; a request to staff to invite the Board to tour an involved facility; and related advancements in science.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

## 5. Local Clean Action Plan (CAP)

Mr. Hilken introduced Abby Young, Principal Environmental Planner of the Planning, Rules and Research Division, who gave the presentation *Local CAPs*, including background on the Air District and CAPs; regional climate protection strategy considerations; a summary of Bay Area cities with adopted CAPs; current targets; GHG reductions, both measured in tons and by sector; common and particularly innovative GHG reduction measures; examples of voluntary versus mandatory measures; implementation strategies; CAPs as related to cap-and-trade; and next steps.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 5, *Targets*, how many plans were developed through Air District funding; the funding amounts for grants; whether an active CAP grant program exists and the history of the climate grant program; the possibility of some funding for these plans from sustainable communities strategies resources directly, not through Air District programs; and the prime motivators for local governments to create and implement local CAPs.

The Committee and staff discussed slide 4, *Bay Area CAPs*, including whether those cities and counties that do not have local CAPs in place are in progress, ignoring the need or otherwise; whether money is an issue for those that have not completed a plan and whether another round of grants would make a difference; Contra Costa County's situation of having a nearly complete, but unapproved, plan that remains in need of funding in order to be completed; whether conversations are occurring with and between local governments to craft plans that will have some level of data compatibility; and whether the Air District is compiling data and details from the local plans.

Ms. Young continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 9, *GHG Reduction Measures*, how some local CAPs have strong language but no plan on how to achieve those goals or to implement programs that will.

Ms. Young concluded the presentation.

### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the importance of reviewing the impediments to implementation and preparing a cost-benefit analysis; the possibility of a future conference to review progress and needs; the desire to help educate local communities' planning and funding departments to ease their access to cap-and-trade revenue; the usefulness of highlighting the co-benefits of these efforts; the importance of Air District assistance to local communities with identifying cost-effective and easier measures; the value of local CAPs that make explicit what is being achieved or trying to be achieved; whether another round of plan updates are expected or being pushed by outside forces; whether the Air District has a role in setting standards or issuing guidance for local goal-setting and the measure development process; how the plans fit together regionally; Air District staffing for this effort; and the importance of increased Air District staffing relative to climate protection planning.

Public Comments:

Mark Roest, Bay Area 350.org / Seawave Battery, Inc. / Silicon Valley Clean Cities Coalition, provided the Committee with written material “BAAQMD Climate Protection Committee, 350 Bay Area’s GHG Rule Development Proposals, December 1, 2014” and read from the same.

Charles Davidson, 350 Bay Area / Sunflower Alliance, addressed the Committee regarding an opportunity to work in partnership with state agencies on solar photovoltaic installations; to urge the Air District to identify gaps between AB 32 and other related measures for opportunities to achieve additional reductions; to request the inclusion of provisions in the permitting process that cap GHG emissions and require sources to achieve mandated GHG reduction targets; and in support of a partnership with the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) on bus fleet conversions to clean energy alternatives.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

**6. Committee Members’ Comments/Other Business:**

Committee Chairperson Avalos asked staff to agendize updates on the work done relative to the 10-Point Climate Action Work Program, specifically item 6, Initiate Rule Development; increased Air District staffing level relative to climate protection projects; and opportunities to harness the synergy of efforts by MTC and other regional agencies to attain regional goals. Director Haggerty suggested a meeting of the Joint Policy Committee to discuss the same.

Committee Chairperson Avalos asked staff to work with Jeremy Pollock in his office on future draft Committee agendas.

**7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:**

Thursday, January 15, 2015, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

**8. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:29 a.m.

*15/ Sean Gallagher*

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards