

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Mobile Source Committee Meeting  
Thursday, February 27, 2014

### **1. Call to Order – Roll Call**

Director Tom Bates called the meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson Scott Haggerty; and Directors John Avalos, Tom Bates, David Hudson, Roger Kim (on behalf of Edwin Lee), and Liz Kniss.

Absent: Vice-Chairperson Mary Piepho; and Directors Carole Groom and Carol Klatt.

Also Present: Board of Directors (Board) Chairperson Nate Miley.

**2. Public Comment Period:** There were no requests for public comment.

### **3. Approval of Minutes of January 23, 2014**

Mobile Source Committee (Committee) Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion to approve the Minutes of January 23, 2014; Director Avalos seconded; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Bates, Hudson, Kim and Kniss.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Groom, Haggerty, Klatt, Miley and Piepho.

### **4. Air District Grant Programs Overview (Out of Order Agenda Item #5)**

Damian Breen, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer (DAPCO), introduced Anthony Fournier, Acting Director of Strategic Incentives, who gave the staff presentation *Air District Grant Programs Overview*, including background; summaries of 2013 allocations from the California

Goods Movement Bond (I-Bond), Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) Regional Fund, Mobile Source Incentive Fund, the Carl Moyer Program, and the total from all these funds; summaries of 2013 expenditures by county and of 2013 highlights; emissions reductions achieved; 2014 projections and proposed TFCA allocations; and upcoming activities.

NOTED PRESENT: Committee Chairperson Haggerty and Board Chairperson Miley were noted present at 9:48 a.m.

Mr. Breen added, regarding slide #13, *2014 Proposed TFCA Allocations: \$19M*, an update on the status of work on Plan Bay Area and Air District collaboration with the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) on the electric vehicle readiness program and bike share pilot.

Mr. Fournier concluded the presentation.

#### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the bike share pilot, including management of the long-term program; collaboration between the Air District and MTC and they with local governments; funding opportunities for local governments; a methodology for program expansion throughout the Bay Area which balances regional growth and the provision of adequate opportunities for interested locales; growth timeline; recommended approach for smaller cities in the Bay Area; and a possible timeline for the availability of seed funding.

Director Kniss asked staff to deliver an informational update to cities covering the items discussed.

The Committee and staff discussed MTC's role in administering the electric vehicle readiness program and bike share pilot; level of business interest in sponsorship or support of the bike share program; integration of the Clipper Card with the bike share program; and the status of the Smoking Vehicle program pending the comprehensive update in May 2014.

Committee Chairperson Haggerty asked staff to match the colors in the presentation pie charts for future meetings and to show funding changes year-over-year, such as increased or decreased funding and altogether defunded items.

The Committee and staff discussed the difference in funding between 2013 and 2014; in what instances local governments will need to seek additional funding for the bike share program; the need for a consistent funding formula; the status of I-Bond funding in 2014; and the state of the Vehicle Buy-Back program and its allocations.

Committee Chairperson Haggerty asked staff to report back on a proposed bike share program funding formula at the next Committee meeting and to provide a breakdown of the seven categories captured in slide #13, *2014 Proposed TFCA Allocations: \$19M*, including why the funding level was requested, program success to date, whether the project is new, what does the Air District hope to achieve through the project, and so on with an eye to increasing opportunities for understanding and involvement by the Board.

Director Bates asked staff to provide information regarding the year-over-year differences in funding for each project, the sources of those funds, discretionary spending options, and longer-term budget projections.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

**5. Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2014 TFCA Regional Fund Shuttle and Rideshare Projects (Agenda Item #4)**

Mr. Fournier introduced Avra Goldman, Environmental Planner of Strategic Incentives, who gave the staff presentation *FYE 2014 TFCA Regional Fund Shuttle and Rideshare Projects*, including background, policies and evaluation criteria, project evaluation results, projects recommended for award, projects recommended for reduced award, projects not recommended for award, summaries of awards by type and county, and recommendations.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the impact of the Community Air Risk Evaluation program on the prioritization of project awards; total funds available; the possible expansion of rideshare programs to supplement public transit capacity; MTC's funding commitment; the identity of rideshare partners; whether state legislation would aid growth of rideshare programs; local government efforts relative to rideshare programs; integration of rideshare programs with the Bay Area Commuter Benefits Program; the Air District's identity as a public health agency justifying a renewed focus on areas of non-attainment for clean air standards; the reasoning behind the staff recommendation to fully fund the Broadway Shuttle in Oakland; the development of new criteria to steer the operation of the program without political considerations or exemptions; the possible shift of administrative work to local congestion management agencies (CMA); how the Altamont Corridor Express and Bay Fair BART Shuttle projects were evaluated by Air District staff; the need for prioritization of interregional transit system connections; and the impact of private shuttle ridership on numbers used in project evaluations.

Committee Chairperson Haggerty asked staff to agendize a discussion of rideshare for the next meeting of the Committee.

Public Comments:

Lori Reese Brown, City of Richmond, addressed the Committee neutrally regarding the proposed reduced funding award for the Commuter Shuttle in Richmond and to object to staff's characterization of the project as providing duplicative service.

The Committee and Ms. Brown discussed who owns the Commuter Shuttle and if the local CMA is providing any funding.

Committee Comments (continued):

The Committee and staff discussed whether the Policies and Evaluation Criteria need to be revisited again; whether the Air District should shift the program's goal to that of launching private employer/business district shuttles; the effectiveness of reducing emissions through the current approach; the effect of priority development areas on the cost-effectiveness evaluations; the need for full transit connectivity to attract riders; and the need to make the program work properly.

Committee Chairperson Haggerty asked staff to agendize an in-depth review of the Policies and Evaluation Criteria with an eye to changing the process in a significant way, such as rerouting funds to local CMAs for distribution.

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), said staff will call a retreat to discuss this item in full with advance notice to all interested parties.

Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Kniss, to recommend the Board:

1. Approve awards for the TFCA Shuttle, Ridesharing and Vanpool projects listed in Attachment A to the staff report except for project # 14R12, Altamont Corridor Express Routes 53 and 54, which staff is directed to perform additional review and to return at the next Committee meeting with the results of that review for consideration; and
2. Authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into agreements for the recommended TFCA projects in Attachment A to the staff report in the amount of \$3,732,038.

The Committee and staff discussed the proposed Committee action by the motion now pending.

Director Hudson made an amended motion, seconded by Director Kniss, to recommend the Board:

1. Approve awards for the TFCA Shuttle, Ridesharing and Vanpool projects listed in Attachment A to the staff report; and
2. Authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into agreements for the recommended TFCA projects in Attachment A to the staff report in the amount of \$3,732,038.

Public Comments (continued):

Ms. Brown addressed the Committee to request an opportunity to submit supplemental information in support of the Commuter Shuttle in Richmond.

The amended motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES:           Avalos, Bates, Haggerty, Hudson, Kim, Kniss and Miley.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Groom, Klatt and Piepho.

The Committee requested that staff provide additional review for project # 14R12, Altamont Corridor Express Routes 53 and 54, and to return at the next committee meeting with the results of that review for consideration.

## **6. On-Road Truck Replacement Funding**

Mr. Breen and Tina McRee, Environmental Planner of Strategic Incentives, jointly gave a brief summary of the staff presentation *On-road Truck Replacement Funding*, including an overview of on-road truck regulation, summaries of the Goods Movement Program Year 4 funding cycle and projects, next steps and recommendations.

### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the types of trucks and funding available; the trucks that will be eligible in the future; the number of eligible trucks currently in operation and of those being funded for replacement; and how the trucks are selected for replacement funding.

Public Comments: None.

### Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Kniss, to recommend the Board:

1. Approve changes to the FYE 2014 TFCA Regional Fund Policies to include on-road truck replacement projects as an eligible project type;
2. Allocate \$5 million in TFCA Regional Funds for eligible projects submitted as part of the Year 4 Goods Movement Program; and
3. Authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into contracts for eligible projects.

The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bates, Haggerty, Hudson, Kim, Kniss and Miley.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Avalos, Groom, Klatt and Piepho.

**7. Committee Member Comments:**

The Committee and staff discussed the source, effective date and applicability of the new legislative requirement for roll call votes on all action items.

**8. Time and Place of Next Meeting:**

Thursday, April 24, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

**9. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:10 a.m.

*151 Sean Gallagher*

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards