

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Thursday, May 21, 2015

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

Present: Chairperson John Avalos; Vice-Chairperson Jan Pepper; and Directors Teresa Barrett, David J. Canepa, Katie Rice and Mark Ross.

Absent: Directors John Gioia, Scott Haggerty and Shirlee Zane.

Also Present: None.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS:

NOTED PRESENT: Director Ross was noted present at 9:42 a.m.

Steven Nadel, Sunflower Alliance (SA), addressed the Climate Protection Committee (Committee) in support of a modification to proposed rule 12-16 to include toxic air contaminants and greenhouse gases (GHGs).

Robert Gould, M.D., Physicians for Social Responsibility addressed the Committee in support of establishing strong GHG targets and caps, decreased wood burning with no exemptions and establishing a wood smoke incentives program for the installation of electrical systems with priority given to low-income families.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Pepper was noted present at 9:46 a.m.

Jane Vosburg, 350 Sonoma County, addressed the Committee in support of transitioning Bay Area power plants to renewable fuel sources.

Bill Vosburg, 350 Sonoma County, addressed the Committee in support of accelerated action to mitigate GHG emissions through the establishment of emissions caps on stationary sources.

Julie Winiarski, Stop Syar Expansion, addressed the Committee in opposition to continued operations at the Syar Industries, Inc., facility in Napa and the inclusion of GHG exemptions in proposed rules and in support of imposing GHG caps and transitioning to renewable energy sources.

Chairperson Avalos asked staff to meet with Ms. Winiarski relative to the quarry comments and report back on the outcome.

Roger Lin, Communities for a Better Environment (CBE), addressed the Committee in support of GHG emissions caps; to ask why the Air District does not seem to want lower emissions; and to request CBE's proposed resolution be agendaized for consideration by the Stationary Source Committee (SSC) on May 27, 2015 and the Board of Directors (Board) on June 3, 2015.

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, submitted written material *Proposed Amendments to Regulation 6, Rule 3: Wood-Burning Devices* and addressed the Committee to suggest that the Air District's climate protection program has achieved very little; to summarize his interaction with Air District staff during the last eighteen months; to demand the imposition of enforceable GHG limits in the proposed rules currently in development, the establishment of a wood smoke incentives program that encourages only non-combustion heat sources, and the amendment of Air District permitting rules this year to prevent further GHG increases; and in support of integrating GHG limits in all present and future rulemaking, enhanced permitting of clean and sustainable energy uses, and directing staff to agendaize CBE's proposed resolution before the SSC on May 27, 2015.

Marie Walcheck, California Nurses Association, addressed the Committee to suggest that inaction by political leaders is harming public health and in support of the proposed resolution from CBE.

Tom Griffith, Bay Area Refinery Corridor Coalition (BARCC) / Martinez Environmental Group, addressed the Committee regarding the local and global impacts of emissions from the refinery corridor and in support of enforceable caps on GHGs and other pollutants, the imposition of requirements to reduce emissions, a moratorium on the approval of GHG-emitting projects, and to rescind or commit to not renewing Kinder Morgan's permits.

Greg Karras, CBE, submitted written material *A Resolution Recommending District Board Action to Prevent Increased Air and Climate Pollution Emissions from Bay Area Petroleum Refineries and Uncontrolled GHG Co-pollutants (49 examples)* and addressed the Committee to suggest that Air District inaction on lowering emissions is allowing an increase in air pollution; to summarize the recent presentation by California Air Resources Board staff to the Board; and in support of adopting regulations for the currently uncontrolled GHG co-pollutants at the Board meeting on June 3, 2015.

Director Pepper and Mr. Karras discussed whether other air districts currently regulate the pollutants he characterized as uncontrolled GHG co-pollutants.

Sandra Booth, Stop Syar Expansion, addressed the Committee to report a fugitive dust complaint relative to the Syar Industries, Inc., facility in Napa and to request assistance with asphalt plant regulations.

Taylor Hawke, Bay Climate Action Plan (BayCAP), addressed the Committee regarding the lack of recognition of the urgency of the climate change situation and to request action.

Pennie Opal Plant, Idle No More Bay Area California, addressed the Committee by reading an environmental statement by President Barack Obama and to urge the Committee and staff to protect the local and global communities from industrial pollution.

Rachel Hinds addressed the Committee to suggest the topics being discussed should not be decided by political motivations and in support of immediate action to limit GHGs and transition to 100% renewable energy.

Ratha Lai, Sierra Club, addressed the Committee in support of expanding Spare the Air to refinery operations; to request leadership on climate change; and to echo the comments of Mr. Karras relative to CBE's proposed resolution.

Ken Jones, 350 Marin, addressed the Committee to encourage research of the economic leakage concept; to suggest a number of forms of leakage are occurring relative to this issue; and in support of strong action on climate change.

Patti Wesselberg, Families for Clean Air, addressed the Committee in opposition to wood smoke incentives for retrofits to any wood- or gas-burning systems instead of electric.

Jim Wilson, Defenders of East Napa Watersheds, addressed the Committee to report the lack of, and request assistance with implementing, a climate action plan in Napa; to express continued support for the avoidance of deforestation in light of trees being an effective mitigation tool; to suggest California land use policies have been found to contribute to GHG emissions rather than offset or decrease them; and to encourage Board action on climate change.

Mark Roest, 350 Bay Area / BayCAP / Seawave Battery, addressed the Committee to request support for green industry so as to enable the region's transition to renewable energy and to provide information regarding the growth of alternative energy.

Janet Johnson, Richmond Progressive Alliance, addressed the Committee in support of the comments made before her, the inclusion of firm limits on GHGs and toxic criteria pollutants in proposed rule 12-16, a moratorium on permits for refinery projects during the rulemaking process and leadership.

Henry Norr addressed the Committee to note the Committee's 10-year existence and a lack of any GHG limit and to inquire why that is the case, what is being done and what is preventing action.

Charles Davidson, SA, addressed the Committee to opine that the available details on current refinery projects suggest an increase in emissions.

Nancy Reiser, Crockett-Rodeo United to Defend the Environment / BARCC, addressed the Committee to opine that Air District staff is approving permit applications that will result in emissions increases so significant that the Air District will be unable to measure the levels and in support of establishing emissions limits.

Paul Kangas submitted written material *BAAQMD* and addressed the Committee to read the same in support of requiring residential rooftop solar panels and the passage of a solar payment policy like that implemented in Germany.

Brian Foster addressed the Committee in opposition to tar sands oil and gas fracking operations; to suggest the current drought in California was caused by methane emissions; to opine that solar and wind are the only viable energy alternatives; and to echo the comments of Mr. Kangas.

Quanah Parker Brightman, United Native Americans, addressed the Committee to provide background on his organization; to cite Governor Jerry Brown's executive action on GHG emissions by 2030; and in support of limits on GHGs, refinery emissions and fracking wells.

Chairperson Avalos reported that real action on climate change has occurred during the last three years and while he shares the public's frustration relative to the pace, real action is happening, and requested a staff update on the same.

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, announced the successful appointment of the manager and the initiation of a staff recruitment for the newly created climate action team. Mr. Broadbent then gave a staff presentation, *GHG Included in Permit Review*.

Chairperson Avalos and Mr. Broadbent discussed the nature of the proposed resolution from CBE and the agendaing of a revised version for the SSC on May 27, 2015 and the change in pace that is expected relative to the climate action plan once the climate action team is fully staffed.

Chairperson Avalos asked for an update and a revised resolution at the next meeting of the Committee.

Committee Comments:

The Committee members discussed the appreciation for public involvement and the environmental commitment of the committee members; support for the continued growth of the climate action team; and recognition of the existence of limited resources in the face of a huge issue.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF MARCH 19, 2015

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action:

Director Ross made a motion, seconded by Director Rice, to approve the minutes of March 19, 2015; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Barrett, Canepa, Pepper, Rice and Ross.
NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Gioia, Haggerty and Zane.

4. AIR DISTRICT ACTIVITIES TO ASSESS AND REDUCE METHANE EMISSIONS

Chairperson Avalos postponed the staff presentation for this agenda item in the interest of time.

Public Comments:

Mr. Karras addressed the Committee to report that methane is an ozone precursor and to ask for clarification regarding the staff plan and recommendation regarding the proposed resolution.

5. PROPERTY ASSESSED CLEAN ENERGY (PACE) PROGRAMS

Henry Hilken, Director of the Planning and Climate Protection Division, introduced Cisco DeVries, Chief Executive Officer, Renewable Funding, who gave the presentation *PACE Programs*, including an overview of how PACE programs work; the status of participation in PACE programs in the Bay Area and results to date; potential for PACE programs to reduce greenhouse gas emissions from the buildings sector in the Bay Area; and potential role for the Air District in facilitating participation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee, staff and Mr. DeVries discussed the possibility of financing energy storage and retrofits of energy storage through PACE; the status of Santa Clara County and its cities relative to their participation in PACE; the list of approved PACE projects; qualifying water project types; the Home Energy Renovation Opportunity (HERO) program and its relationship to PACE and CaliforniaFIRST; the status of Marin Clean Energy; if data on how much GHG could be cut by energy efficiency measures is available for the Bay Area; other barriers for those who may be interested in the program; the status of the program in San Francisco and its proposed community choice aggregation program; the amount in State reserve guaranteeing the PACE program; and the City of Daly City's participation in the HERO program.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

6. Committee Members' Comments/Other Business: None.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting

On a date to be determined in June 2015 at the request of Chairperson Avalos, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:44 a.m.

151 Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards