

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Mobile Source Committee Meeting  
Thursday, April 23, 2015

### **1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL**

Chairperson Scott Haggerty called the meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

Present: Chairperson Scott Haggerty; Vice-Chairperson Jan Pepper; and Directors John Avalos, Tom Bates, David Hudson, Nate Miley and Karen Mitchoff.

Absent: Directors David J. Canepa and Roger Kim (on behalf of Edwin Lee).

Also Present: None.

Director Mitchoff led the pledge of allegiance.

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS:** No requests received.

### **3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 26, 2015**

Mobile Source Committee (Committee) Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

#### Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Mitchoff, to approve the Minutes of February 26, 2015; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Haggerty, Hudson, Miley and Mitchoff.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Bates, Canepa, Kim, and Pepper.

#### **4. PROJECTS AND CONTRACTS WITH PROPOSED GRANT AWARDS OVER \$100,000**

Damian Breen, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Michael Neward, Administrative Analyst in the Strategic Incentives Division, who gave the staff presentation *Projects and Contracts with Proposed Awards over \$100,000*, including brief overviews of the Carl Moyer and Mobile Source Incentive Fund (MSIF) programs; a summary of Carl Moyer Program (CMP) Year 16; detailings of the CMP and MSIF funds awarded as of April 6, 2015; CMP and MSIF funds awarded since 2009; Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) Bay Area hydrogen re-fueling stations; TFCA funds awarded by project category and by county as of April 6, 2015; and recommendations.

##### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed how best to enhance Air District outreach to wine growers and other agricultural interests, specifically in the Livermore area.

##### Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Avalos, to recommend the Board of Directors (Board):

1. Approve CMP and TFCA projects with proposed grant awards over \$100,000;
2. Authorize \$790,500 in additional TFCA revenues to be allocated to alternative fuel infrastructure projects; and
3. Authorize the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO) to enter into agreements for the recommended projects.

##### Committee Comments (continued):

NOTED PRESENT: Director Bates was noted present at 9:52 a.m.

Director Mitchoff asked that future versions of staff recommendation #1 be more specific.

##### Public Comments:

Dan Leavitt, San Joaquin Regional Rail Commission, addressed the Committee in support of the staff recommendation and the program in general.

##### Committee Action (continued):

The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Bates, Haggerty, Hudson, Miley and Mitchoff.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Canepa, Kim, and Pepper.

## 5. FISCAL YEAR ENDING (FYE) 2016 TFCA FUNDING ALLOCATIONS

Mr. Breen introduced the topic and Karen Schkolnick, Air Quality Program Manager in the Strategic Incentives Division, who gave the staff presentation *FYE 2016 TFCA Funding Allocations*, including proposed allocation of new TFCA revenue in FYE 2016; proposed FYE 2016 TFCA Expenditure Plan, including trip reduction and bicycle facilities for public agencies, clean air vehicles, Spare the Air, enhanced mobile source enforcement / commuter benefits, and vehicle buy back; an overview of cost-effectiveness limits for Air District sponsored programs; and recommendations.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Pepper was noted present at 9:57 a.m.

### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the reasoning behind and popularity of the bicycle racks and electronic bicycle lockers program categories.

### Public Comments:

Mr. Leavitt addressed the Committee in support of the staff recommendations and to express gratitude for staff efforts.

Steve McClain, Santa Clara Valley Transit Authority (VTA), addressed the Committee regarding the history of VTA's success with TFCA support; to report increased ridership; and in support of the staff recommendations on both this and the preceding agenda item 4, Projects and Contracts with Proposed Grant Awards Over \$100,000.

### Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Bates, to recommend the Board:

1. Allocate \$13.77 million in new TFCA revenue to the programs listed in Table 1 of the Committee staff report;
2. Authorize the proposed cost-effectiveness limits for the Air District sponsored programs listed in Table 2 of the Committee staff report;
3. Authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into funding agreements and contracts up to \$100,000 for projects and programs listed in Table 1 of the Committee staff report; and

4. Authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to execute all contracts necessary to accept, appropriate, and expend Congestion Mitigation Air Quality funding awarded by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC).

Committee Comments (continued):

The Committee and staff discussed battery storage.

Committee Action (continued):

The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Bates, Haggerty, Hudson, Miley, Mitchoff and Pepper.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Canepa and Kim.

**6. FYE 2016 TFCA COUNTY PROGRAM MANAGER (CPM) EXPENDITURE PLANS AND REQUEST FOR A WAIVER FROM SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY (SCTA)**

Mr. Breen introduced Linda Hui, Administrative Analyst in the Strategic Incentives Division, who gave the staff presentation *FYE 2016 TFCA CPM Expenditure Plans*, including background; the expenditure plans submitted by each of the nine congestion management agencies; one request for a policy waiver; and recommendations.

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Pepper, to recommend the Board:

1. Approve the allocation of FYE 2016 TFCA CPM Funds listed in Table 1 of the Committee staff report;
2. Authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to enter into funding agreements with the CPMs for the total funds to be programmed in FYE 2016, as listed in Table 1 of the Committee staff report; and
3. Approve policy waivers to allow SCTA to use FYE 2015 TFCA CPM Funds for an arterial management project.

The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Bates, Haggerty, Hudson, Miley, Mitchoff and Pepper.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Canepa and Kim.

## **7. BAY AREA BIKE SHARE UPDATE**

Mr. Breen introduced the topic and Patrick Wenzinger, Administrative Analyst in the Strategic Incentives Division, who gave the joint staff/MTC presentation *Bay Area Bike Share Update* through slide 6, *Number of Trips by Membership Type & by City, 8/29/13 – 3/31/15*, including background; pilot project; and system results in terms of trips by community area and number of trips by membership type and by city from August 29, 2013 through March 31, 2015.

Mr. Wenzinger introduced Alix Bockelman, Deputy Executive Director, MTC, who gave the presentation through slide 18, *Approval Process*, including plans for expansion in 2014; bike share industry evolution; Motivate International, Inc.'s (Motivate) proposal, including system properties, schedule, performance requirements, sponsorship/revenue, and additional buy-in; low income and limited English proficiency plans; sole source justification; MTC Administration Committee feedback; implementation steps if approved; and MTC approval process.

Mr. Wenzinger gave the remainder of the presentation, including next steps and recommendation.

### Committee Comments:

The Committee, staff and Ms. Bockelman discussed the large number of transit agencies operating in the Bay Area and how best to transition the bike share program in a way that encourages the continuance and expansion of a single system; concerns about fairness relative to the difference in facilities expenses for those included in the pilot program and those who were not; whether contract provisions will exist that will compel Motivate to do business with cities interested in participating in the program; cost analysis for participating cities with varying levels of involvement in the pilot; concerns regarding the lack of a competitive bid, fairness of participation given the assumed financial interest of Motivate, program interoperability and integration, the sole course contract, and the investment by the City and County of San Francisco in the pilot program; implications for the program if the recommendation is not approved today; understandable operator limitations given the differences in ridership numbers presented; the importance of market penetration where the culture is supportive and the likelihood of expansion as its popularity increases; the total amount expended on the pilot; suggestion to designate funds to ease or enhance participation by suburban areas in light of transportation funds largely being directed towards large urban areas; the viability of extending the pilot an additional year with the goal of incentivizing participation by non-large urban areas; the value added by allowing MTC to regionalize the program instead of perpetuating the pilot under Air District leadership; the viability of bringing the item back with provisions providing for greater financial fairness for areas that did not participate in the pilot; and complications relative to federal financial support.

Public Comments:

Dani Simons, Motivate, addressed the Committee to provide information on company operations and recent history and the qualifications of the leadership team and to suggest the program potential for the Bay Area is great.

Tyler Frisbee, San Francisco Bicycle Coalition, addressed the Committee in support of the bike share program and the staff recommendation.

Committee Comments (continued):

The Committee and staff discussed the lack of committee support for the staff recommendation as driven by a concern about the inclusion of various locales and not a lack of support for the program.

Committee Action:

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Bates, to recommend the Board authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to execute agreements and take the necessary actions to close out the Regional Bay Area Bikeshare pilot project and to transition project assets in accordance with Caltrans' requirements and for MTC to allocate \$4.5 million to supplement public funding contributions for system buy-in that would be available to emerging agencies that are not included in the system expansion proposed by Motivate International, Inc.

Committee Comments (continued):

The Committee discussed how best to coordinate with MTC relative to the staff recommendation for a supplemental allocation.

Committee Action (continued):

Director Hudson made an amended motion, seconded by Director Bates, to recommend the Board authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to execute agreements and take the necessary actions to close out the Regional Bay Area Bikeshare pilot project and to transition project assets in accordance with Caltrans' requirements and to direct MTC to allocate \$4.5 million to supplement public funding contributions for system buy-in that would be available to emerging agencies that are not included in the system expansion proposed by Motivate International, Inc.

Committee Comments (continued):

The Committee, staff and Ms. Bockelman further discussed how best to coordinate with MTC relative to the staff recommendation for a supplemental allocation.

Committee Action (continued):

Director Hudson made an amended motion, seconded by Director Bates, to recommend the Board authorize the Executive Officer/APCO to execute agreements and take the necessary actions to close out the Regional Bay Area Bikeshare pilot project and to transition project assets in accordance with Caltrans' requirements and to request that MTC allocate \$4.5 million to supplement public funding contributions for system buy-in that would be available to emerging agencies that are not included in the system expansion proposed by Motivate International, Inc. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Avalos, Bates, Haggerty, Hudson, Miley, Mitchoff and Pepper.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Canepa and Kim.

Committee Comments (continued):

The Committee and staff discussed the emergence of Concord as an interested participant and the resulting inadequacy of the \$4.5 million proposal and the Committee direction to staff to agendize the bike share program update before the Board as an item separate from the Committee report.

**8. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS:** None.

**9. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Thursday, May 28, 2015, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

**10. ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting adjourned at 11:15 a.m.

*151 Sean Gallagher*  
Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards