

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5000

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
9:30 a.m., Wednesday, January 9, 2008

Call To Order

Opening Comment: Chairperson Bedsworth called the meeting to order at 9:50 a.m.

Roll Call: Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D., Chairperson, Cassandra Adams, (9:58 a.m.), Sam Altshuler, Harold Brazil, Ken Blonski, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D. (9:51), Jeffrey Bramlett, Irvin Dawid, Fred Glueck, William Hanna, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Janice Kim, M.D., Kraig Kurucz, Karen Licavoli-Farnkopf, M.P.H, Kendal Oku, Linda Weiner, and Brian Zamora.

Absent: Emily Drennen, MPA, Robert T.P. Huang, Ph.D., and Steven T. Kmucha, M.D.

Dr. Bedsworth asked members present to introduce themselves to the Council's newest member, Mr. Oku.

Commendation/Proclamation – *The Advisory Council presented a plaque to outgoing Advisory Council Chairperson, Fred Glueck for his outstanding service on the Council this past year. The Council also congratulated incoming Chairperson, Dr. Bedsworth on the recent birth of her baby boy, Wiley.*

Public Comment Period: There were none.

Ms. Adams arrived at 9:58 a.m.

Consent Calendar (1 Item)

1. Approval of Minutes of November 14, 2007: Mr. Bramlett moved approval of minutes, Mr. Altshuler seconded the motion to approve with minor edits; the motion carried unanimously.

Committee Reports and Recommendations

2. Report of the Executive Committee Meeting of December 4, 2007

Mr. Glueck provided a report on the discussion of format, agenda and list of topics for the retreat. Mr. Glueck received suggestions on where the committee should be directing their attention and efforts. Priorities received from the Advisory Council and Jack Broadbent were identified as follows:

- a) Greenhouse Gases,
- b) CARE Program, and associated Public Health issues
- c) Taking a holistic approach towards Education, Public Health with regard to regulations, policies, and procedures, and
- d) Consideration of hiring a full-time Public Health Officer.

This set of recommendations was made to the Executive Committee of the Board of Directors on December 17, 2007.

3. Report of the Public Health Committee Meeting of December 12, 2007

Mr. Bramlett reported briefly that there had been discussion on grouping issues and how to prioritize, and a discussion of indoor air quality/asthma strategy.

Retreat Format

4. Discussion with Air District Management on Key Issues Facing the District and Proposed Assignments to the Council:

Ms. Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, spoke on behalf of Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer.

Ms. Roggenkamp stated she had nothing to add to the work of the Advisory Council on the topics for the next year; management is comfortable with the areas the Advisory Council has chosen.

Dr. Bedsworth elaborated on the issue of identifying topics.

Dr Bedsworth noted two lists of topics, one from the end of last year solicited from Advisory Council Members, and another list identified by Jack Broadbent, resulting from the December 4th Executive Committee Meeting, both of which mapped one another closely, and yielded the following topics:

- Climate Protection
- CARE
- PM Control
- Wood Smoke
- Spare the Air
- Asthma
- Indoor Air Quality
- Other (broader) items

The two items emphasized by the Council were Climate Protection and CARE. Dr. Bedsworth questioned how to resolve conflicts between greenhouse gas emission reductions and criteria pollution reductions; e.g., carbon monoxide limit on stationary sources - if that was made less stringent, it would allow these sources to operate more efficiently and reduce greenhouse gas emissions. How does the District evaluate those types of trade-off issues?

Regarding the CARE Program, how does the District respond proactively, and not reactively, in the communities that are identified (by Air Resources Board and the CARE Program) as being burdened? (Example: Risk Assessment for West Oakland by the Air Resources Board.)

Regarding Spare the Air Program, Jack Broadbent spoke once regarding the need to shift from an episodic program to a long-term, individual behavioral concept. A need for constructive comments was emphasized at that time.

Dr. Bedsworth distributed a table with topics from Jack Broadbent and from Council members, and a potential committee to handle each topic.

Analysis of Conflicts topic could be a priority for the Technical Committee. Transportation issues could be a priority for the Planning Committee. Also, Land Use and Smart Growth, and Gasoline Fee and what the District could do with monies generated from it. Public Health Committee: how does the District start to deal with information coming out of the CARE Program and related programs?

Dr. Bedsworth asked that, during the individual committee sessions and coming back together as a group, Council members concentrate on how to make the Council as efficient and effective as possible; with the lists in mind, to prioritize topics by committee, and identify products coming out of that process, i.e. recommendations for actions, protocols for recommendations, timelines for specific recommendations, or items to explore to determine if a recommendation is called for or not. Identify items of overlap among committees and discuss value of revisiting specific topics in next full Council meeting. Also get a list of committee meeting dates and times.

Discussion ensued with question and answer session.

Breakout Session began at 10:32 a.m.; meeting to be reconvened at 11:45 am.

5. Convene to Working Lunch for Meetings and Discussion Sessions of the Public Health Committee, Air Quality Planning Committee and Technical Committee

The Council participated in a working lunch/Standing Committee format in which each Committee separately met to discuss and give priority to the study topics discussed by the Executive Committee, District staff and the Council members. The Committees also established a meeting schedule for the year.

6. Reconvene to Full Council Format for Follow-up on Committee Discussion Sessions

Meeting reconvened at 12:12 p.m. to Full Council Format for Follow-up on Committee Discussion Sessions

The Advisory Council reconvened to receive the reports of the Standing Committees on their study topic priorities and meeting schedule, and to conduct any further round table discussion concerning them. Mr. Brazil, Vice-Chairperson reopened the meeting.

Air Quality Planning Committee – Dr. Holtzclaw presented

Fred Glueck presented a challenge on how Committee members conceptualize and contextualize what they do, activities associated with global warming and gas emissions, and how to help educate and convince the public of which global warming and emissions reduction programs need to be implemented.

Three areas that will comprise the Planning Committee's agenda:

- a) Regional Gasoline Fee – implementation strategies, monies use, illuminate the cost/benefit connection; recommendations by late summer.
- b) Transportation Modes – increasing transit use, reducing single-occupancy VMT, increasing non-vehicular modes, and looking at regional transit funding – overlap with previous item, public education related to global warming, transportation efficiency, coordination with MTC's planning process; recommendations by late fall.
- c) Smart Growth – relating it to transportation modes, walking and bicycling, transit use, VMT reductions.

Dr. Holtzclaw stated one of the most important things is the need to conceptualize how to impact the public discussion to move in the direction of reducing global warming gas emissions.

Ms. Weiner asked, with regard to congestion pricing, if an exception for populations that need a car had been considered. Dr. Holtzclaw and Mr. Dawid responded that in terms of specifics of application of congestion pricing, they had not considered that.

Mr. Glueck gave an overview of the committee's objectives: to look at the proposals' effectiveness. Is there synergy between the plans, and overall timeframes? To identify whether synergies exist between the way plans are being proposed and developed. To get the public buy-in, and to get their approval and participation in these plans.

Mr. Blonski acting as Committee Chairperson, in Emily Drennen's absence, emphasized the importance of having specific outcomes in the form of recommendations to the Advisory Council this coming year. **Meetings to be held the first Thursday of every other month, at 9:00 am**, changed from Wednesday. Dr. Bedsworth asked if areas for future full Council discussion, or overlap were identified, about speakers, etc. Mr. Blonski suggested a follow-up with answers to those questions and mentioned an MTC representative for a speaker.

Technical Committee – Mr. Kurucz presented

- Will produce Implications of Climate Change, synergies and conflicts of Climate Change and Criteria Pollutants
- Implications of Fuel Choice
- Multi-pollutant, Multiple-Scale Models (Integrated Multi-Pollutant Management)

Meetings 1st Mondays at 9:30, or second Mondays as an alternate, every other month.

Speaker list:

- Mike Lehman from UC Davis – Implications of Climate Change on Particulate Matter
- EPA – Single Multi-Pollutant Models, Multiple-Scale
- Livermore – Regional Climate Change Impacts
- Rob Harley – Effects of Climate Change on Ozone Strategy

Mr. Kurucz summarized: outcomes – to report the synthesis of speakers, i.e., implications of climate change on Bay Area Air Quality Program, rather than specific recommendations.

Public Health Committee – Dr. Kim presented

- Finalize Indoor Air Quality and Asthma recommendation; input from staff in March, and by May present to the full Advisory Council for approval
- PM Control and Wood Smoke
- Work with Air District on the CARE Program, with input from other stakeholders
 - Bay Area Environmental Health Coalition
 - Local Health Officers – West Oakland
 - Ports – West Oakland

Use the Risk Assessment as a case study model for future local community impact endeavors, and find out from District what local communities are doing about the initiatives and policies it presents.

The Committee **will meet on the second Wednesday of the even months** that the Advisory Council is not meeting at **1:30 pm, except for June 4th**.

Dr. Bedsworth asked if there are topics of overlap to bring to the full Council. Dr. Bornstein mentioned the EPA on current modeling, S. T. Rau will speak in San Francisco in May, and perhaps he would be able to address the directions in research in air quality at the EPA.

The Planning Committee did not touch on Goods Movement, but may have overlap with Public Health Committee’s West Oakland issues and Green Ports initiative. Ms. Roggenkamp commented that the invitation to Dr. Iton might interest the full Advisory Council.

Ms. Kim and Ms. Roggenkamp felt that waiting for reports from the Air Resources Board or CARE before hearing Dr. Iton’s and others’ presentations would not be necessary.

Dr. Bedsworth noted that there would not be much overlap.

Questions – Mr. Dawid asked about the Wood Smoke Ordinance. Dr. Kim responded that the committee wanted to hear what public comments there were. It is a priority for the next meeting. Dr. Kim asked about the second round of workshops, would the District provide proposed revision. Ms. Roggenkamp replied it would announce any potential changes to the draft regulation, reporting out to the full council in March.

Kelly Wee, Director of Compliance and Enforcement, responded regarding the Wood Smoke Rule development, PM 2.5 should be treated as a regional pollutant.

Gary Kendall spoke about the 5 forecast zones for Particulate Matter for the Bay Area. These are the same zones used for ozone forecasts.

OTHER BUSINESS

10. Committee Member Comments/Other Business: Dr. Bedsworth reminded the Council of the Ethics Training requirement.

Mr. Dawid asked about three million dollars in Climate Protection grants. This is for Climate Protection as opposed to Air Quality: is this competing with Air Quality or is it a new fund? District Counsel Brian Bunger responded that it is not ongoing funds, and is not competing with anything. Mr. Dawid remarked that Marc Jacobson produced a landmark study showing how CO₂ is a public health issue.

11. Time and Place of Next Meeting: 10:00 a.m., Wednesday, March 12, 2008, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

12. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 1:00 p.m.

/s/Jean Marie Mink
Jean Marie Mink
Temporary Executive Secretary