

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 749-5000

## APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Executive Committee  
9:00 a.m., Wednesday, March 12, 2008

- 1. Call to Order – Roll Call:** Chairperson Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D., called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m.

**Present:** Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D., Chairperson, Jeffery Bramlett, Harold Brazil, Emily Drennen, Janice Kim, M.D.

**Absent:** Kraig Kurucz.

**Also Present:** Sam Altshuler.

- 2. Public Comment Period:** There was none.
- 3. Approval of Minutes of March 12, 2008:** Mr. Brazil moved approval of the minutes as amended, second by Ms. Drennen, the minutes carried unanimously.
- 4. Standing Committee Chair Reports:**

Air Quality Planning Committee Meeting of February 7, 2008 – Emily Drennen, Chairperson. Ms. Drennen stated that in February there was a fantastic presentation from two individuals from the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC). The presenters were Ray Kon and Harold Brazil, as they both talked about the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). The brief outline for the calendar was that division policy strategies were to be adopted in mid March. In July MTC is scheduled to adopt a constrained financial investment plan, with the hope of adopting RTP in February 2009.

Some of the goals were to reduce Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) 10% from today, and a drop in particulate matter (PM). There was a call for projects on March 5, 2008 so this is where the projects were gathered throughout the region. Ms. Drennen further stated that Mr. Brazil spoke about Economy, Equity and Environment as its 3 goals of the RTP. The base case from ABAG is a 25% increase in population from 2006 to 2035; a 30% increase in VMT in the same period and a 50% increase in jobs in the same period and this is without doing any and this information was provided by ABAG.

Mr. Drennen further stated that there was an interesting analysis conducted in numbers of gallons of gas per day, per person regionally. At present, individual use

about one and one quarter gallons of gas per person and the target in 2035 is sixth tenths of a gallon. In addition, there were 3 investment scenarios that RTP is reviewing, essentially looking at 3 different scenarios. 1) invest the money through highways and getting more efficiency from the highways; 2) increase the number of HOT lanes and express buses, doubling bus time, speed; and 3) a regional rail/ferry solution. However, even the best 2 to be used are still 25% over the target for PM 2.5 and PM 10 by 120% over the target. This indicates that there is still some ways to go, even with the 3 different scenarios. In the end, it looks as if there will need to be an integrated strategy.

Hopefully, the Committee will look at congestion fees in other cities and areas and how they work in terms of reducing air quality and also how they are funding transit. The Committee hopes to provide some advice to the Air Quality Board regarding the policy implications of these congestion rules.

Ms. Drennen concluded her report to the Committee.

Chairperson Bedsworth informed the Committee that she spoke to Mr. Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO with regard to having a presentation to the entire Council on RTP, so that everyone is familiar with the process. Dr. Kim asked about the overall reduction of PM and it being tied to the Air District. Mr. Brazil responded that the emission inventories were generated for the 3 basic pollutants and the analysis that was conducted. The 3 were CO<sub>2</sub>, PM 2.5 and PM 10. There were 3 transportation system investment scenarios. These were crossed tapped with 3 policy changes, which included land use changes, and pricing strategies that were separate from whatever pricing that was going on with HOT lanes. Overall, there were 18 scenarios that were tested, which included the baseline scenarios. Once the emission inventories were generated, they were all on-road mobile source emission inventories, which included transit vehicles, as rail and ferry was not included.

Mr. Brazil stated that with land use changes there were changes in the travel characteristics, such as changes in speeds, changes in congestion and decreases in VMT. The investment in HOT lane, express bus one can see a shift in motor travels you can see a reduction in VMT. This is where you will see a change in the emission levels for the different pollutants. Mr. Brazil stated that there were some targets that were set by the Governors' Executive Order, therefore leaving the horizon year on the RTP as 2035 as this is the half way mark between 2020 and 2050 in the executive order. This is in attempt to get back to 1990 levels based on 2020 and then reach 80% below in 2050, so 40% below just the CO<sub>2</sub>, and continue to work with the Air District to establish 10% PM 2.5 and 40% on PM 10.

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer stated that the Air District is very pleased with the efforts that MTC is making and is quite challenging, but it also helps define the policy with transportation choices but with an air quality perspective, in addition to many other perspectives.

Dr. Bedsworth provided the report for the Technical Committee and stated that at the February 11, 2008 there was a discussion on PM inventory development and the PM 2.5 standards. In addition there was discussion on modeling and woodsmoke. The Committee reviewed the Air Resources Board (ARB) Methodology. Going forward Dr. Harley is anticipated to speak to the Committee on air quality and climate change, also Dr. Bornstein provided the Committee with ideas for upcoming speakers, to discuss the modeling issues. Try to consider issues together such as criteria pollutants, global warming as come up with control strategies and also look at things from a modeling standpoint. Chairperson Bedsworth concluded her report.

Dr. Kim provided the Committee with the Public Health Committee report of February 13, 2008. Dr. Kim stated that the Committee is working on the Asthma and Indoor Air Quality draft strategy which is being reviewed in the sub-committee. Dr. Kim continued that at present it has been approved by the sub-committee and is now working with the Air District to provide input. Dr. Kim stated that this item should be completed and presented to the full Advisory Council in May 2008. Dr. Kim continued stating that the Committee would like to also discuss receiving an update from Air District staff on Wood Burning Regulation that is being proposed, along with copies of the potential revisions. Dr. Kim continued that the Committee received an excellent presentation by Janet Glasgow, Compliance and Enforcement Manager on the Wood Burning devices.

Dr. Kim stated that at a future meeting the Air District staff would provide an update on the CARE program from the Air District's perspective in West Oakland. Dr. Kim concluded her report.

Chairperson Bedsworth requested that each Committee meeting, the entire Council be notified and not just the individual Committees.

Dr. Kim notified the Committee that she would no longer be able to continue her duties on the Advisory Council due to work demands.

- 5. Overview and Discussion of Advisory Council January 9, 2008 Retreat and Work Plans:** Chairperson Bedsworth led the Committee in a discussion of the January retreat and wanted to know the direction of the Chairs with their respective Committees.

Chairperson Bedsworth stated that the 3 areas of focus for the Planning Committee would be the regional gas fee, transportation modes and public education on how to increase transit use. Smart growth and how it relates to transportation. Ms. Drennen stated that it will be interesting to take the policy implications of congestion pricing and driving toll fees.

Chairperson Bedsworth stated that the Public Health Committee appears to have some good suggestions in terms of getting the Asthma Indoor Air Quality conditions going forward. Dr. Kim responded to Chairperson Bedsworth, that it is well

developed and the additional 2 main objectives are to follow the PM Wood Smoke, and the CARE project. The sub-committee feels that the Air District will receive a copy of the Health Risk Assessment (HRA) for West Oakland from ARB. Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer stated there Public Community Meeting, to be held March 19, 2008, and copies of the HRA would be released at the meeting.

Dr. Kim requested that the Public Health Committee to work closely with the Air District staff in their needs and advice they may need as this moves forward. Dr. Kim also has requested that Air District staff brief the Committee on the emissions inventory.

There was a lengthy discussion amongst the Committee pertaining to upcoming meetings and the various topics to be discussion in the future.

6. **Committee Member Comment/Other Business:** Mr. Bramlett is looking forward to receiving a copy of the HRA. Chairperson Bedsworth announced the A&WMA Conference is scheduled on June 24, 2008 through June 26, 2008, if individuals are interested in attending to contact Mary Goodley.
7. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** 9:00 a.m., May 14, 2008, Conference Room 716, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.
8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 9:50 a.m.

*/s/ Vanessa Johnson*  
Acting Clerk of the Board