



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

**ADVISORY COUNCIL
RETREAT
AND
MEETING OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH COMMITTEE
MEETING OF THE AIR QUALITY PLANNING COMMITTEE
MEETING OF THE TECHNICAL COMMITTEE**

**WEDNESDAY
JANUARY 9, 2008
9:30 A.M.**

**SEVENTH FLOOR BOARD ROOM
939 ELLIS STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CA. 94109**

AGENDA

CALL TO ORDER

Opening Comments
Roll Call

Louise Bedsworth, Ph. D., Chairperson
Clerk

COMMENDATION/PROCLAMATION

Recognition of Outgoing Chairperson Fred Glueck

Louise Bedsworth, Chairperson

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3. The public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council meetings and Committee meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's or Committee's purview. Speakers are limited to five minutes each.

CONSENT CALENDAR (ITEM 1)

1. Approval of Minutes of November 14, 2007

COMMITTEE REPORTS

2. Report of the Executive Committee Meeting of December 4, 2007 Fred Glueck
3. Report of the Public Health Committee Meeting of December 12, 2007 Jeffrey Bramlett

RETREAT FORMAT

4. Round Table Discussion with Air District Management on Key Issues Facing the District and Proposed Assignments to the Council
5. Convene to Working Lunch for Meetings and Discussion Sessions of the Public Health Committee, Air Quality Planning Committee and Technical Committee

The Council will participate in a working lunch/Standing Committee format in which each Committee will separately meet to discuss and give priority to the study topics discussed by the Executive Committee, District staff and the Council members. The Committees will also establish a meeting schedule for the year.

6. Reconvene to Full Council Format for Follow-up on Committee Discussion Sessions

The Advisory Council will reconvene to receive the reports of the Standing Committees on their study topic priorities and meeting schedule, and to conduct any further round table discussion concerning them.

OTHER BUSINESS

7. Council Member Comments/Other Business

Council or staff members on their own initiative, or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on their own activities, provide a reference to staff about factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda.

8. Time and Place of Next Meeting

10:00 a.m., Wednesday, March 12, 2008, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109.

9. Adjournment

FG:mag

CONTACT MARY ANN GOODLEY - 939 ELLIS STREET SF, CA 94109

(415) 749-5127
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Executive Office should be given in a timely manner, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5000

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
10:00 a.m., Wednesday, November 14, 2007

CALL TO ORDER

Opening Comment: Chairperson Glueck called the meeting to order at 10:10 a.m.

Roll Call: Present: Fred Glueck, Chairperson, Cassandra Adams, (10:17 a.m.), Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D. Ken Blonski, Jeffrey Bramlett, Sam Altshuler, Harold Brazil, Irvin Dawid, Emily Drennen, MPA, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Janice Kim, M.D, Kraig Kurucz, Linda Weiner, and Karen Licavoli-Farnkopf, M.P.H. Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., William Hanna, Robert T.P. Huang, Ph.D., and Brian Zamora.

Absent: Steven Kmucha, M.D., and Ed Proctor.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD: There was none.

CONSENT CALENDAR:

1. Approval of Minutes of September 12, 2007: Dr. Holtzclaw moved approval of the minutes, Mr. Dawid seconded the motion with minor edits; the minutes carried unanimously.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

2. Technical Committee Meeting of October 1, 2007: Mr. Altshuler reported that staff invited Dr. Marc Fischer to present on issues of Greenhouse Gas. Mr. Altshuler stated that he had observed that methane is on the increase and asked staff research the issue. Dr. Fischer presented in more detail research on methane trends. The observation is that methane has increased in the planning area. Dr. Fischer also spoke about N₂O and other GHGs. He also noted that CO₂ is the predominant GHG including others that have some potency factors that call for more evaluation. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for December 10, 2007.

3. Air Quality Planning Committee Meeting of October 10, 2007: Mr. Blonski reported that three excellent speakers presented before the Committee on Congestion Pricing as the strategy for a market based approach for transportation; David Burch, Principal Environmental Planner, Air District, gave an overview of approaches being undertaken by the Air District. Jean Hart, Executive Director, of the I-680/Sunol Carpool Lane; explained the project in the Sunol area and gave an update on hotline. Elizabeth Bent, Senior Transportation Planner, San Francisco County Transportation Authority also presented on mobility access and a pricing study for downtown San Francisco as well as the Doyle Drive value pricing program.

Emily Drennen, drafted a proposed resolution regarding development of a policy by the Air District relating to Congestion Pricing that will be presented to the Council in January. Also a preliminary draft was distributed to Committee members. The next Committee meeting is scheduled for December 12, 2007

- 4. Public Health Committee Meeting of October 10, 2007:** Mr. Bramlett reported that the Committee worked on Indoor Air Quality and Asthma and reviewed a first draft of its recommendation to the Council. The Committee was scheduled to have Dr. Tony Iton of the Public Health Officers Association of Alameda present to the Committee but Dr. Iton cancelled. The Committee pulled together past presentations related to Indoor Air Quality and Asthma dated from April 18, 2005 to present which include those of Peggy Jenkins, CARB Indoor Exposure Assessment Section Research Division, Jed Waldman, Barbra Sparks, Dr. Sawyer and some from the Air District staff. Ms. Weiner provided the Committee Asthma Coalition contact information. The Committee will review the draft document by its December 12, 2007 meeting and present a copy for staff preview. Dr. Janice Kim also gave a presentation to Committee on the "Health Effects of Traffic Exposure." The points that Dr. Kim addressed included: a) Traffic related pollution and some of the mechanism in toxicity; b) East Bay Children's Respiratory Health Study - an example; c) Other Studies on Health Effects of Living near Busy Roads; d) On- Road exposures; and e) Information for policy makers. The Committee's next meeting is December 12, 2007 at 1:30 p.m.

Ms. Weiner commented that the American Lung Association is working with the Air District on Regulation 6: Rule 2: Wood Burning Devices and there are about 40 speakers lined up for the next workshop. She added that there has been some backlash and encourage members to attend and testify at the workshop.

- 5. Executive Committee meeting of November 14, 2007:** Mr. Harold Brazil reported on the Board Executive Committee meeting he attended for Chairperson Glueck. Mr. Brazil stated that the Board welcomed the Advisory Council restructuring but expressed concern with regards to additional work by Air District staff.

Chairperson Glueck announced that for Council members who have submitted their application for reappointments there will be no interviews. Mr. Glueck noted to Council members whose terms are expiring, the Personnel Committee will forward its recommendation to the full Board at its December 5, 2007 meeting. However, two vacant seats will be interviewed for.

Chairperson Mark Ross, thanked the Council members for their attendance and hard work over the past year. Chairperson, Ross gave a brief summary of the reappointment of incumbent Council members and appointment for the two vacant seats. Chairperson Ross also informed the Council that the recommendation for retaining the incumbents will be forwarded to the Board of Directors at its December 5, 2007 meeting. Chairperson, Ross noted that the focus should be the same; he urged the Council to continue being more innovative in bringing solution to air quality. Chairperson Glueck thanked Chairperson, Ross for his time and speech to the Council.

Chairperson Glueck announced next year's slate of officers as recommended by the Executive Committee for approval; Dr. Louise Bedsworth, Chair, Mr. Harold Brazil, Vice-Chair, and Mr. Bramlett, Secretary. Mr. Kurucz moved the motion for approval, seconded by Dr. Holtzclaw. The motion carried unanimously. Chairperson Glueck also mentioned that in the next month or so, Dr. Bedsworth will be identifying her committee chairs as well.

Dr. Kim commented on the wood smoke workshop in Oakland and congratulated Air District staff for their presentation and stated that the staff handled the comment session very professionally. Dr. Kim suggested that there should be email address, wood smoke comments mailbox on the website; thus that such comments can be compiled, from fax numbers or regular addresses so the public can have various ways of contacting and commenting on the proposed regulation. Dr. Kim also suggested that households be exempt if they are able to demonstrate that wood burning device is their only source of heat.

AIR DISTRICT OVERVIEW

8. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO: Mr. Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer, spoke on the following issues:

- Wood smoke is an important initiative on the way at the Air District; the proposed Regulation 6: Rule 3: Wood Burning Devices, is geared towards dealing with elevated levels of particulate matter (PM) during winter when wood smoke is on the rise with about 30% to 40% in locations in the Bay Area. Also EPA recently lowered the ambient air quality standard for PM based on that epidemiological information which indicates that we see health effects at lower levels. Mr. Broadbent further stated that violation of ambient air quality standards is in large part due to increased wood burning which is a significant health threat. Mr. Broadbent informed the Council that the proposal is a package of different elements with emphasis on curtailment of wood burning on those nights that a Spare the Air Tonight Advisory is called. The draft rule might be presented to the Board of Directors by the second quarter of 2008. The Air District will evaluate how to enforce this rule and how to implement the incentive package. With this effort being an outreach as well as a regulatory one, we need to create awareness of the consequences of burning to the public; restriction on burning activities occur about 20 to 30 days in a year with potential levels of elevated PM. Mr. Broadbent also mentioned other areas in the state that have adopted similar rules; Sacramento and the San Joaquin Valley. Mr. Broadbent stated that the District will be working closely with the Advisory Council to assist in the implementation effort as the proposal goes before the governing Board next year.
- Green Ports rule; based on the CARE program, there are some areas, including West Oakland and Richmond that are still impacted by a variety of different sources that include Port activities, thus it is important to continue to move forward with a regulatory effort of the Ports to file plans identifying emission reductions overtime. The Air District has been working with the Port of Oakland on its maritime air quality improvement plan; although this has been a slow process, it seems very promising because the community is very engaged. The State of California is looking at a number of regulatory processes at this time but we feel that the Air District's role is ensuring the public that those reductions are taking place and public health is being addressed in an expedited manner.
- It is necessary to reconnect with the Advisory Council with regards to the CARE program. There is a great deal of work in progress relative to modeling efforts, and the Air District is working with the State on the State's health risk assessment through the CARE program. It is important to work with the Council as the Council moves forward topics of concern for 2008.
- The Air Districts ozone plan is in progress. There are a host of rule makings on the way although not a large effort but we have a responsibility to look at all feasible control measures in relation to ROC and NOX emissions and implementing PM schedule with regulatory rule making agenda in progress.

- The Enforcement and the Engineering Divisions; two big parts of the Air District continue to deal with different community issues which center around individual facilities and individual community concerns.
- Two key points to mention; administratively and financially, the Air District is functioning very well. It is important for the Council to know this stands because as the Air District continues on these initiatives, it is very important to understand the resource and the financial structure the organization has as it embarks on the issues of wood smoke and other efforts.
- Lastly we hope to get the Board to control PM from charbroilers. Though this may sound controversial, it has taken many resources on the part of the Air District to get the proposal before the Board of Directors.
- Mr. Broadbent added with regard to the Climate Protection program, the Air District has developed a curriculum for 4th and 5th graders, there is a grant program made available to cities, counties and other organizations. There are proposals being evaluated with recommendations to be brought before the Climate Protection Committee at its December meeting. Mr. Broadbent notified the Council that from the staff standpoint, the Air District find itself perplexed by the ARB position on its implementation of AB32. The Air District has advocated to ARB that the Air District have a role collecting GHG emissions information from local stationary since the Air District already regulates extensively these sources which include power plants, chemical facilities, and refineries. These are facilities that the Air District has documented comments for and inspected regularly; it does not seem right for the Air District not to collect CO₂ and methane emissions information from those facilities and report such to the state. Air District Board Chairperson has met with the ARB Chair and indicated this information directly. The state's response is that the program should not be done at the local level because the state is looking at elevating the program to an international level. The Air District emphasized to the state the need for a local air district's position to seeing reductions take place, verified and enforced.

Dr. Bornstein requested that information for A&WMA attendance be disseminated early so that Council and staff members who want to present papers would have ample time to get such together.

- 6. Discussion of Study Topics Referred by Staff and the Board and Potential Assignment to Standing Committees:** Agenda item number six and seven which were combined. Chairperson Glueck opened the discussion by stating that the Executive Committee discussed how to coordinate Council members suggested topics with the recommended topics from the Air District to help develop a more directed goal for 2008. Chairperson Glueck also stated that there is a carry over of major subject matter that staff had directed to the Council and they include; a) Climate Protection; b) CARE Program; c) Particulate Matter and Wood Smoke Control Strategies; d) Spare the Air Today/Tonight Mitigation Measure; e) Asthma and Indoor Air Quality. Chairperson Glueck stated that he recommends that Council allow the Executive Committee to categorize council members suggested topics to align with the Air District's recommended topics. Mr. Glueck also added that these categorized topics will be assigned to committees at the January 2008 retreat so the committees will be more effective in designing their program for the upcoming year.

Dr. Bedsworth added that the Executive Committee's goal would be to get the Committees focused. Dr. Bedsworth stated that she seeks to work more closely with the Committee Chairpersons in 2008; to lay out an agenda for each committee; thus the committees are interacting where they need to and use the full council when necessary.

The Council agreed unanimously on the Executive Committee recommendation to categorize members suggested topics in alignment with the Air District's topics listed above.

Mr. Blonski suggested an Executive Committee meeting prior to January retreat. Mr. Glueck agreed and directed staff to poll and set a date for the meeting.

The issue of a consensus on restructuring and renaming the committees was raised and it was agreed to be discussed on the January 9, 2008 retreat meeting.

Mr. Kurucz requested staff comment for clarification on issues concerning emission reduction and criteria air pollutant. Ms. Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, responded that according to Mr. Jack Broadbent, APCO, ozone strategy, rule making to implement the strategy, PM implementation schedule to meet the state standard and PM control is still criteria air pollutant that the Air District is working on to reduce emissions of wood burning and other PM sources. The Air District is looking at updating its ozone strategy in the next year; a potential issue that the Advisory Council can investigate.

OTHER BUSINESS

- 9. Report of the Chair:** Chairperson, Glueck stated that he looks forward to the next year's Executive Committee and Chairpersons working effectively; he reiterates the effort of the successors to do a great job with topics and information to be discussed. Mr. Glueck also stated that it is noteworthy that the Air District welcomes Advisory Council input and will continue to request the Council's input on issues like wood smoke.

Dr. Holtzclaw thanked the present Executive Committee for the work they have done in trying to analyze the progress of the Council to make the Council more effective.

- 10. Committee Member Comments/Other Business:** None

- 11. Time and Place of Next Meeting:** 10:00 a.m., Wednesday, January 9, 2008, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

- 12. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:45 a.m.

Chioma Dimude
Acting Executive Secretary