

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Public Health Committee  
1:30 p.m., Wednesday, April 9, 2008

1. **Call to Order:** Chairperson Kim called the meeting to order at 1:37 p.m.

**Roll Call:** Janice Kim, M.D., Ph.D., Chairperson, Cassandra Adams, Jeffrey Bramlett and Brian Zamora.

**Absent:** Steven Kmucha, M.D., Karen Licavoli-Farnkopf, MPH, Linda Weiner

2. **Public Comment Period:** There were none.

3. **Approval of Minutes of February 13, 2008:** Mr. Zamora moved approval of the minutes, seconded by Mr. Bramlett, carried unanimously.

4. **Review and Discussion of Final Draft Strategy for Asthma as it Relates to Indoor Air Quality:**

Chair Kim stated that in 2005 the Committee was asked to provide additional guidance on indoor air quality and asthma, she discussed key references and reviews by the Institute of Medicine and said the matter is complex in which pollutants can get indoors. She presented a draft document entitled, "Strategy for Asthma as it Relates to Indoor Air Quality" and clarified some of the important indoor air sources, listed various programs such as the U.S. EPA Indoor Air Program and programs of the CARB.

Chair Kim stated it would be useful for a designated staff member at the Air District to participate in quarterly meetings of the California Inter-Agency Working Group.

**ACTION:** Ms. Adams moved approval to accept the Strategy for Asthma as it Relates to Indoor Air Quality, seconded by Mr. Zamora; carried unanimously.

Chair Kim suggested that the item be forwarded to the Advisory Council and also asked staff to determine the dates in 2004 and 2005 of when the previous recommendations were made and recorded. Mr. Hilken said staff can research the minutes and identify those dates.

5. **Overview of the Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) Program**

Henry Hilken stated that Planning staff had previously reported on the program, questions have been received regarding the health risk assessment conducted in West Oakland, and draft results show very high levels of risk from diesel particulate matter in West Oakland.

CARE Program Manager, Dr. Phil Martien, gave an overview of the program, stating that the CARE Programs focus is in communities where levels of PM are particularly high. The CARE Program looks at, not only where emissions and concentrations are high, but where sensitive populations are located in the Bay Area. Issues of dense urban development are addressed within the region and they suggest trade-offs between high density and high emissions, and preserving open space. The program is a 3-phased program and he discussed work completed to date in each phase. The Task Force has recommended including mitigation measures as the program is being developed. There are current vacancies on the Task Force and members discussed the body's composition and the need for an additional health professional.

Dr. Martien presented an emission inventory for the Bay Area region to year 2005, pie charts by pollutant and source category, individual pollutants and those broken down by source category, chronic non-cancer toxicity weighted emissions, Acrolein pollutant sources and their concentration levels. He discussed the different cancer outcomes resulting from various pollutants, maps of the emission inventory, information on demographics, and modeling in Phase II on concentrations of diesel particles.

Regarding next steps, Dr. Martien reported active participation in the West Oakland Health Risk Assessment, work on regional and sub-regional modeling, work on a truck survey and enhanced measurements in West Oakland, and said they have started to collaborate more with local health departments to present information and to hear some of their concerns.

Dr. Martien provided an update on the health risk assessment, stating that Air District staff is working with the CARB, the Port of Oakland, and Union Pacific Railroad Yard. The HRA focuses on diesel particles. It looks at cancer and other health impacts of the Bay region as a whole and the study considered 3 source regions; Part I-Maritime part of Oakland—265 tpy; Part II – Union Pacific Rail Yard-11 tpy, and Part III – Other West Oakland-568 tpy.

Mr. Zamora questioned and confirmed the report included all sources in the Bay and out past the Golden Gate, but did not include outside areas due to prevailing winds impacting the West Oakland area.

Dr. Martien presented key findings of the HRA as follows:

- The West Oakland community is exposed to diesel PM concentrations that are almost three times the estimated background diesel PM concentrations in the BAAQMD.
- The estimated lifetime potential cancer risk for residents of West Oakland from exposure to diesel PM emissions is about 1,200 excess cancers per million.
- Port operations 200 excess cancers per million
- UP Rail Yard 40 excess cancers per million
- Non-Port and non-UP sources about 950 excess cancers per million

Another key finding is that the on-road heavy-duty trucks result in the largest contribution to the overall potential cancer risks, followed by ships, harbor craft,

locomotives, and cargo handling equipment and source categories were presented for Part I/Port, Part II/UP, Part III/All Other, and Combined source impacts.

Chair Kim said there is a significant cancer impact in Part III, and she questioned how much was related to freeway versus local truck traffic. Dr. Martien said they feel they have good representation of the trucks on the freeway; they are using the MTC Travel Network which represents major roadways but not minor streets and agreed it could be under-estimated. Once a detailed survey of where the trucks are traveling on the local streets, they may find it does not affect the assessment significantly. Source destination studies could be useful and they will try and differentiate between those trucks with containers involved with the Port and those that do not.

Dr. Martien presented a map of contours of risk from the Port of Oakland to the Bay Area region as a whole, discussed diesel PM emissions and non-cancer impacts.

Dr. Martien presented state regulations adopted and those which are planned to reduce risk, but noted remaining risk levels are still high at over 200 in a million, he presented the current projected risk levels and projections in 2010, 2015 and 2020, with CARB regulations and growth and said by 2015, assuming new regulations are adopted, there will be an 80% reduction in the population weighted risk and by 2020.

The Air District has been very involved in the health risk assessment, is committed to staying involved to track reductions in diesel emissions and risk in West Oakland. The Air District co-chairs and participates in the Port of Oakland's Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan Task Force and they will update and refine emissions estimates, will conduct an enhanced measurement study, and adding monitoring stations in the West Oakland area to track progress of overall particulate reductions.

Dr. Martien described the CARE Mitigation Action Plan, which focuses on risk reduction activities where most needed, have identified six impacted communities (Concord, East Oakland/San Leandro, Eastern San Francisco, Richmond, San Jose and West Oakland) where they are working with grant funds, outreach efforts, act as liaison with local health departments and work on developing land use guidance which will help cities and counties assess health impacts to new development projects from existing sources. The Plan will also look at all five Ports and developing emission inventories and he further discussed total projected grant funding in 2008 which amounts to \$87 million.

Mr. Zamora questioned whether there is an assessment of health impacts to existing people from existing sources. Dr. Martien said the land use guidance will focus on new development, but West Oakland is considering a buffer zone between industrial areas and residential areas, but the problem is that those buffer zones already include residential areas. It may be that they could address what types of mitigation measures are effective and whether they can be applied to existing situations. Also, using grant funding will be helpful as well as CARB regulations.

Mr. Bramlett applauded staff for their work, scope, accuracy and detail of the information.

Mr. Zamora referred to slide 3; Land Use Guidelines, and said it would be very important to work with the West Oakland community and Health Department and overlay those high risk populations such as schools and long term care facilities. He said long-term care facilities were never designed to have air conditioning and this would be a good example of a mitigation measure.

Chair Kim questioned whether funds would be available for those types of mitigations, said CARB has earmarked a tremendous amount of funds for certain categories and questioned the specifications for those programs in dealing with at-risk populations. She discussed an article of a study done in the American Journal Respiratory Critical Care Medicine Journal; a portable air filter was put into a residential senior home, the senior's heart rate variability was monitored, they did a trial with and without HVAC and were able to show that with the air filter on, there was a reduction in particulate matter and also a reduction in heart rate variability.

Mr. Hilken introduced Virginia Lau, Advanced Project Advisor in the Planning Division and in the CARE program.

Chair Kim also congratulated the Air District on its commitment to the project, said she attended the West Oakland Community meeting several weeks ago and commended the District on its work, as well as the Ports who discussed their commitment and work.

Mr. Hilken said they would like to increase representation on the CARE Task Force from the health field in general and asked members to pass on suggestions and potential candidates.

Ms. Adams confirmed that people other than health officials could be forwarded onto staff, as well. Dr. Kim and Mr. Zamora suggested working with the local County Health Departments to also seek potential candidates. The Committee further discussed resources on the CARE website and potential interested candidates from the state health level as a resource.

## **6. Committee Member Comments/Other Business**

Mr. Bramlet thanked Dr. Kim for her work on the project as well as District staff.

Mr. Zamora suggested agendaizing wood smoke on the next agenda and Mr. Hilken noted there were meetings scheduled in April and if not posted already, it will be very soon.

## **7. Time and place of next meeting: 1:30p.m., Wednesday, June 4, 2008, Room 716, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.**

**8. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 2:58 p.m.

*/s/ Lisa Harper*  
Clerk of the Boards