

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Technical Committee
9:30 a.m., Monday, August 4, 2008

- 1. Call to Order – Roll Call.** Chairperson, Kraig Kurucz called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m.

Present: Sam Altshuler, P.E., Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Fred Glueck, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Chairperson.

Absent: Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D.

- 2. Public Comment Period.** There were no public comments.

- 3. Approval of Minutes of June 9, 2008:**

Dr. Holtzclaw made a motion to approve the minutes. The Committee submitted minor edits to the minutes, discussed the need for speakers to provide a summary of their comments, and suggested that future minutes be summarized to a minimum of 3-4 pages.

Chairperson Kurucz commented that Dr. Duffy did not review the minutes and suggested he be forwarded the draft minutes to edit, for staff to make editorial amendments and resubmit the minutes for approval at the next Technical Committee meeting in October.

- 4. Committee Member Comments/Other Business:**

Mr. Glueck questioned whether or not the Air District could, over the next few months, monitor the differences in air quality due to changes in China during the Olympics and how it affects background here. Gary Kendall, Director of Technical Services, stated that the Air District performs air monitoring and the data are archived and available for such analysis. The Committee then briefly discussed tracking, whether or not background is affected, wind direction and blips up or down which may be caused by meteorology or emissions.

Chairperson Kurucz reported that for the Committee's next meeting, Dr. Schneider has been contacted and is interested in providing a presentation to the Committee. He stated that Board of Directors' Vice Chair Torliatt had expressed interest in Dr. Schneider's presentation. Chair Kurucz asked whether a joint meeting would be possible.

After brief discussion, there was general agreement by the Committee that staff would discuss scheduling of the presentation with Chair Hill for the October 15th Board of Directors meeting, Chairperson Kurucz would contact and confirm Dr. Schneider's availability for October 15th (with an alternate date of October 20, 2008), and that the presentation focus on the Bay Area, what are the upcoming impacts, and what could the Air District do in taking a leadership role in adaptation and mitigation.

5. Discussion of Implications of Climate Change; Synergies and Conflicts of Climate Change on Bay Area Air Quality: *The Committee discussed the implications of climate change; synergies and conflicts of climate change on Bay Area air quality.*

Mr. Altshuler communicated that he believed there was a conflict between controlling wood smoke and using renewable energy, was surprised the Rule came down hard on perceived cleaner stoves and not as hard on fireplaces and the lack of the argument made for renewable energy. Ms. Roggenkamp, Deputy APCO, explained that this was addressed in the environmental document for the new Rule.

Chairperson Kurucz referred to the format of a recommendation of the Technical Committee and discussed with members recommended actions and important points to identify as “whereas” clauses.

Dr. Bornstein asked staff to identify the last Air District document which would state the position of the Board of Directors and the Air District having to do with climate change in air quality. Ms. Roggenkamp responded that this topic was discussed by the Board at their January Retreat; climate protection is one of the key initiatives of the Air District and since that time the fee schedule for greenhouse gases had been adopted. Staff has also discussed with the Climate Protection Committee about preparing a Work Program for climate protection, which she said was in the planning stages.

Dr. Bornstein recommended that the Air District’s modeling efforts be state-of-the-art and all-encompassing in order to model ozone, PM, climate change and CARE with an integrated set of models, and that the District ensure their modeling group has the tools to carry out this kind of modeling. Ms. Roggenkamp reported that the Air District recently embarked upon a multi-pollutant plan, and she agreed it is important to think about multiple pollutants at the same time and what this means for PM, toxics or greenhouse gases. She said staff held one public workshop to discuss this idea, there was support from those in attendance, and she suggested this as an appropriate avenue. Staff is looking at how to analyze different kinds of control measures, look at benefits and potential conflicts among pollutants which is in concert with what the Committee is suggesting.

Dr. Bornstein reiterated the need to study the local impacts, local observations and conduct modeling to know past conditions, project future conditions, and how to adapt and mitigate.

Chairperson Kurucz suggested the Committee discuss and synthesize the next item in order to develop a recommendation to the Advisory Council.

6. Discussion of Presentations made to the Advisory Council Technical Committee:

1. *Update on PM Inventory Development, Modeling and Data Analysis (presented on February 11, 2008 by Mr. Saffet Tanrikulu and Mr. David Fairley);*
2. *Consequences of Changes in Temperature, Inflow Boundary Conditions, and Local Emissions, on Air Quality in Central California (presented on April 7, 2008 by Professor Rob Harley);*
3. *Past and Future Temperature World-Wide, in California, and the Bay Area (presented on June 9, 2008 by Dr. Philip B. Duffy).*

Chairperson Kurucz pointed out the importance of formulating a good summary of the presentations and suggested beginning with “whereas” clauses, which would then lead to recommendations. He suggested one of the actions to recommend be modeling; both multi-pollutant and a regional version of the global models.

Dr. Bornstein said the original global models diverged and people did not believe them until they were able to simulate what happened in the last hundred years. Then they started to believe simulations out for another hundred years. He said if the Committee is recommending some sort of regional modeling, a component of this should be able to reproduce what has happened over the last 40 years and then look at projections out for the next 40 years in a changing climate.

He suggested that an ad-hoc committee be considered, comprised of experts from Livermore Laboratories, Stanford University or other research institutes to meet and form a pool of knowledge on climate change and its impact on the local area. Ms. Roggenkamp noted that there has been some consideration among staff about holding a one-day symposia to discuss potential conflicts as we think about all pollutants at once and representatives of this sort would be invited. She agreed that possibly one of the recommendations out of the symposia could be for representatives to continue to meet.

The Committee discussed at length the following phrases as input to the resolution:

WHEREAS, problem/solution of climate change and regional pollution are inter-related;

WHEREAS, EPA modeling is now becoming multi-scale and multi-pollutant;

WHEREAS, implications of renewable energy involve concentration, energy, conservation, and health;

WHEREAS, climate change can overwhelm and cause unintended consequences and trade-offs (e.g. aerosols and climate, fires, coastal cooling, snowfall, flooding);

WHEREAS, regional reactions to global climate change are varied;

WHEREAS, land use planning strategies impact local climate change;

WHEREAS, Bay Area has unique concentration of analytical capabilities, experts and innovators;

WHEREAS, prediction models need validation on past changes;

WHEREAS, Bay Area has existing observational networks;

WHEREAS, the Bay Area has served as a model in air quality strategies;

THEREFORE, the Technical Committee recommends that the Air District include climate change issues in the Air District’s multi-pollutant, multi-scale air quality management planning process, including:

- Continuing to apply and validate the best available multi-scale and multi-pollutant models to local linked air-quality and climate change issues.

Dr. Bornstein also suggested the clauses reference the individual person who gave the Committee the information/ideas.

Mr. Altshuler recommended that the Air District consider the position of a Climate Protection Officer, similar to the newly approved Public Health Officer, in order to raise the status of the Committee's position. Ms. Roggenkamp reported that employee, Ana Sandoval has been promoted to Senior Policy Advisor in the Executive Office and one of her roles will be working on climate protection issues in a policy-oriented manner and how the Air District works with outside organizations. She also stressed that Planning Division staff currently focus on climate protection, and part of the concept over time is that this be integrated throughout the Air District.

Dr. Bornstein suggested that observations be used to understand what the local climate changes are and that this be a separate recommendation. Chairperson Kurucz stated that this needed to be made in context and not used as a reason to avoid action on a local basis.

In closing, Chair Kurucz expressed thanks to Committee members and agreed to work with two other members of the Committee to wordsmith the draft resolution and bring it back to the full Committee for finalization and submission to the Advisory Council.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting: At the call of the Chair.

8. Adjournment. 11:54 a.m.

/s/ Lisa Harper
Clerk of the Boards