

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109  
(415) 749-5000

**APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Retreat & Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, January 14, 2009

**CALL TO ORDER:** Chairperson Brazil called the meeting to order at 10:05 AM.

Roll Call: Jennifer Bard, Dr. Louise Bedsworth, Ken Blonski, Benjamin Bolles, Jeffrey Bramlett, Harold Brazil, Emily Drennen, Karen Licavoli Farnkopf, Stan Hayes, Dr. John Holtzclaw, Dr. Robert Huang, Kraig Kurucz, Rosanna Lerma, Dr. Jane Martin, Sarah Martin-Anderson, Kendal Oku, Neal Osborne, Jonathan Ruel, Virginia Smyly (10:15), Dr. Dorothy Vura-Weis.

Absent: Dr. Robert Bornstein

Oath of Office: Oath of Office given to Jennifer Bard, Benjamin Bolles, Stan Hayes, Rosanna Lerma, Jane Martin, Sarah Martin-Anderson, Neal Osborne, Jonathan Ruel, and Dorothy Vura-Weis; Term of Office: January 1, 2009 through December 31, 2010.

Welcome: New and returning members; introductions were made.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS:** There were no public comments.

**COUNCIL BUSINESS:**

Request for Approval of Minutes:

August 11, 2008 Air Quality Planning Committee Meeting  
October 8, 2008 Public Health Committee Meeting  
October 22, 2008 Technical Committee Meeting  
November 12, 2008 Advisory Council Executive Committee Meeting  
November 12, 2008 Advisory Council Regular Meeting

Mr. Blonski requested amendment to the August 11, 2008 minutes:

- Page 3, 1<sup>st</sup> paragraph: “Contra Costa County had significantly more less production.”

**Council Action:** Dr. Holtzclaw moved to approve Minutes of August 11, 2008 as amended, October 8, 2008, October 22, 2008, and November 12, 2008; seconded by Mr. Bramlett; carried unanimously without objection.

Select Advisory Council Secretary for 2009:

**Council Action:** Dr. Holtzclaw moved to approve Ken Blonski as Advisory Council Secretary for 2009; seconded by Dr. Bedsworth; carried unanimously without objection.

**DISCUSSION:**

**New Structure for Advisory Council Meetings:** In December 2008, the Board of Directors revised the Air District Administrative Code section regarding Advisory Council's role. Director of Technical Services Gary Kendall outlined proposed new agenda.

**Format:**

- Full Council will meet nine (9) times per year.
- Four (4) symposium/presentation meetings, each on a specific topic presented by expert in the field.
- Discussion meeting will follow each presentation meeting.
- At Discussion meetings, Council will produce written report on previously presented topic for Board of Directors; reports to include key points of presentation, emerging issues, and recommendations.
- All meetings are noticed public meetings with opportunities for public comment.
- Council will select Members to plan each topic for presentation meetings.
- At January retreat, Council will plan year's topics with the Executive Officer.
- Additional meetings require 2/3 vote by Council or Board of Directors.

**Schedule for 2009 Presentation and Discussion Meetings:**

- February 11, 2009, 9:00 AM, Air Quality & Public Health
- Speakers: Public Health Directors or their designees from (4) designated counties
- March 11, 2009, 10:00 AM, Related Discussion & Report
- April 8, 2009, 9:00 AM, Transportation Sector
- May 13, 2009, 10:00 AM, Related Discussion & Report
- July 8, 2009, 9:00 AM, Electricity & Commercial/Residential Energy Sector
- September 9, 2009, 10:00 AM, Related Discussion & Report
- October 14, 2009, 9:00 AM, Industry Sector
- November 2009, 10:00 AM, Related Discussion & Report
- (Specific date TBD due to the Veterans' Day Holiday)

**Presentation Topics:**

Communities At Risk Evaluation (CARE) Program. Alameda, Contra Costa, San Francisco, and Santa Clara Counties are identified as disproportionately impacted by toxic pollutants. California committed to reduce greenhouse gas emissions to 80% below 1990 levels by 2005. April, July and October presentations will address major sectors involved in reaching this goal.

**Member Responses to Kendall Presentation:**

Council discussed role of public participation in the topic meetings.

- Dr. Bedsworth: will Board of Directors' Chairperson attend future Advisory Council Meetings; Mr. Broadbent replied affirmatively.

- Dr. Huang: who will handle publicity for meetings? Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer Jean Roggenkamp responded that Air District's Communications & Outreach Division will coordinate outreach and publicity for all presentation meetings.
- Mr. Hayes: clarify Air District's specific goals for new meeting format. Answer: To enable Council to focus on issues closely related to the Air District's mission.
- Ms. Bard: Air Quality & Public Health meeting is an excellent occasion for public education and efforts should be made to take advantage of publicity opportunities at all presentations.
- Ms. Smyly: there are many community groups very active in public health and air quality issues who will have input.
- Mr. Broadbent: all meetings are noticed public meetings and time will be set aside for public comment. A time clock will be used to ensure all members of the public have equal time to comment.
- Dr. Bedsworth: care should be taken to incorporate into the final report all information received from invited experts and members of the public.

Council discussed logistics for producing a Report after each topic meeting.

- Mr. Hayes: suggested meeting leaders bring a proposed report to each discussion to guide Council discussion.
- Ms. Roggenkamp: minutes of the topic meetings will be available prior to the discussion meetings.
- Mr. Kendall: lessons learned at the first (4) presentation meetings will be incorporated into plans for subsequent meetings.
- Council Members: requested background information, updates on pertinent activities by the Air District, and proposed questions on each topic prior to each presentation.
- Ms. Licavoli-Farnkopf: it is the job of Advisory Council Members to use their expertise to synthesize information presented at each topic meeting and make recommendations useful to Air District staff and Board of Directors.
- Dr. Holtzclaw: confirmed that part of the Council's responsibility is to identify emerging issues.
- Mr. Broadbent: staff intends to prepare background information and suggest questions before each presentation meeting.
- Mr. Bunger, legal counsel: reminded Council Members that the Brown Act restricts meetings to properly noticed sessions with an agenda.

**Council Action:** Council agreed to the proposed meeting schedule and presentation topics. Council selected leaders for each meeting topic: Ms. Licavoli-Farnkopf, Dr. Martin, Ms. Martin-Anderson, and Dr. Vura-Weis for Air Quality & Public Health; Ms. Drennen, Dr. Holtzclaw and Stan Hayes for Transportation Sector; Mr. Bolles, Mr. Kurucz, and Ms. Lerma for Electricity & Commercial/Residential Energy Sector; and Mr. Bolles, Mr. Brazil, and Mr. Kurucz for Industry Sector. Council proposed Thursday, November 12, 2009 as the date for the Industry Sector Discussion Meeting, pending review of the Air District's calendar.

## **Air District Overview report given by Executive Officer/APCO Broadbent:**

### **Introduction:**

- Welcome to new and returning Council Members.
- New members encouraged to attend orientation January 15, 2009 at 10:00 a.m. to learn more about the Air District's activities.
- Emphasized Air District's committed to new symposium/presentation format.

### **Budgeting Issues:**

- Air District halfway through the current fiscal year; preparing a budget for the coming fiscal year.
- Like other public agencies, Air District will look for ways to streamline expenses during current uncertain economy.

### **Programming Structure:**

- Air District employs about 360 people to enforce its adopted regulations.
- Permitting program for approximately 10,000 stationary sources in the region.
- Planning program.
- An administrative function.
- A number of new initiatives launched in recent years.

### **Greenhouse Gases:**

- As part of its Climate Protection Program, updated greenhouse gas inventory recently published. Air District continues to work with local agencies to provide tools to implement climate protection programs.
- Currently reviewing the effectiveness of 53 local projects funded a few years ago to assist local cities and counties to develop climate inventory programs and climate action plans.
- Air District will host Climate Protection Summit in May 2009.
- California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) updated its guidelines to incorporate greenhouse gases.
- California Air Resources Board passed resolution stating its intent to work with Air District to implement recently adopted AB 32 Scoping Plan.
- Air District will leverage its existing permitting and enforcement programs to help achieve Scoping Plan targets.

### **Spare the Air:**

- To date, Air District called six Winter Spare the Air Alerts.
- Region exceeded the national 24-hour PM 2.5 standard on five days.
- EPA recently designated the region a non-attainment area for the PM 2.5 standard.
- Community At Risk Evaluation (CARE) Program continues to address public health risks in six communities identified as the areas of highest concern.

### **Green Ports Initiative:**

- Air District continues its discussions with the Port of Oakland to address its emissions.

### **Land Use:**

- Air District developing guidelines to assist local cities and counties to make land use decisions supporting healthy air quality for residents.
- Preparing multi-pollutant Plan for Bay Area. Plan to outline region's measures to meet state and federal air quality standards in a comprehensive manner by incorporating multiple pollutants. Plan in workshop phase; the next public workshop will be on January 28, 2009.

### **Responses/Comments to Broadbent Report**

- Responding to Ms. Bard: Mr. Broadbent described resolution adopted by Air District's Board of Directors, July 2008 recognizing communities in the Bay Area where residents are disproportionately at risk and impacted by air contaminants. A copy of the resolution will be provided to Council Members.
- Ms. Roggenkamp: Air District is working on language access policy for its programs and publications.
- Mr. Bunger: Air District continues to work with state to improve processes to develop tools to assess cumulative risk.

### **OTHER BUSINESS:**

#### Council Member Comments & Announcements:

- Ms. Drennen: San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Citizens' Advisory Council recently passed a resolution suggesting the Board of MTA pursue a carbon-based vehicle license fee.
- Mr. Bramlett: Available to answer any questions from new Council members.
- Dr. Vura-Weis: requested Council Discussion Meetings start at 9:00 AM instead of 10 AM Council agreed to change the meeting schedule, all meetings will begin at 9:00 AM.

Time and Place of Next Meeting: 9:00 AM, Wednesday, February 11, 2008  
939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109

Adjournment: Meeting adjourned at 12:25 p.m.

*Kristianna Ledesma*  
Executive Secretary