

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Retreat & Regular Meeting
Wednesday, January 8, 2014

Note: An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>.

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Sam Altshuler called the meeting to order at 9: 02 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Sam Altshuler, P.E.; Vice-Chairperson Liza Lutzker, M.P.H.; and Members Ana M. Alvarez, D.P.P.D., Benjamin Bolles, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., LEED A.P., Heather Forshey, Stan Hayes, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., SaraT L. Mayer, M.P.P., Timothy O'Connor, J.D., and Estes Al Phillips.

Absent: Secretary Jessica Range, LEED A.P.; and Members Jennifer Bard, Gary Lucks, J.D., C.P.E.A., and Kathryn Lyddan, J.D.

Also Present: None.

Opening Comments: Chairperson Altshuler welcomed the Advisory Council (Council).

NOTED PRESENT: Member Bornstein was noted present at 9:04 a.m.

Introduction of New Advisory Council Member:

Chairperson Altshuler introduced newly appointed Member SaraT L. Mayer, M.P.P. (*Public Health Agency*) and welcomed her to the Council. Member Mayer made introductory remarks.

Oath of Office: Member Mayer took the oath of office.

Opening Comments (continued):

Chairperson Altshuler gave the presentation *2014 Goals*, including the relationship between the Board of Directors (Board), Council and staff, as well as the goals of striving to provide high value reports to the Board, to complement and compliment staff, and to engage its own Council members in challenging, meaningful and motivating work.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD: None.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of the Minutes of the Council meeting of November 13, 2013

Brian Bunger, District Counsel, gave an update on the Brown Act as it relates to votes taken by the Council.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action:

Member Holtzclaw made a motion to approve the minutes of November 13, 2013; Member Phillips seconded; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Alvarez, Bolles, Bornstein, Bramlett, Brazil, Cherry, Forshey, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Kurucz, Lutzker, Marshall, O'Connor and Phillips.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Mayer.

ABSENT: Bard, Lucks, Lyddan and Range.

RECOGNITION

2. Recognition of Outgoing Advisory Council Members

Chairperson Altshuler recognized departing Members Jenny Bard and Gary Lucks and former Member Murray Wood, all in abstentia, for their service on the Council.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None.

3. Recognition of Outgoing Advisory Council Chairperson

Chairperson Altshuler recognized outgoing Chairperson Bornstein for his dedicated leadership and service to air quality in the Bay Area.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None.

RETREAT

4. Review and Discussion of 2013

Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, introduced the topic.

Member Bornstein shared his experience as Chairperson, commended Mr. Stevenson for his work in support of the Council and gave the presentation *Black Carbon (BC): Adverse Impacts on Global Climate and Local Health*, as excerpted from the Council presentation to the Board on December 18, 2013, including the executive summary, 2013, 2012 and 2011 recommendations, and future areas of investigation.

Council Comments:

The Council discussed the availability of the webcast of the Board meeting on December 18, 2013 on the Air District website and the presenters' shared experience preparing for the Board presentation.

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer (DAPCO), thanked the Council for its work in 2013, the presentation to the Board and for the presenters' flexibility in the scheduling of the presentation to the Board.

Member Hayes complimented the presenters on their presentation to the Board.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD (CONTINUED):

Carolyn Norr addressed the Council to advocate for addressing climate change in more than incremental ways and for the denial of future oil refinery permits.

The Council and Mr. Bunger discussed how best to process and respond to public comments and written correspondence to the Council generally and whether the Air District is taking steps to engage the issue of changing crude oil stocks at Bay Area refineries.

5. Discussion of 2014

Member Bornstein shared his experience attending the Board's Climate Protection Committee (CPC) meeting when it took up the climate protection work program and summarized the results of the exit interviews with former Member Wood and departing Members Bard and Lucks.

Council Comments:

Chairperson Altshuler noted the commonalities in the work of the CPC and Council.

The Council and staff discussed ways to enhance the feedback opportunities for Council members and the perceived utility of the work done, new member orientation material, the recruitment process for the three vacant seats, two Conservation Organization and one Agriculture.

Mr. Stevenson delivered the Council Report Writing Guidelines, including information on the preparation of reports, the composition of the working groups, and the process for and timing of comments on draft reports.

Mr. Stevenson delivered the staff report *Discussion of 2014, Attachment A, Proposal for 2014 Advisory Council Meetings* and announced the rescheduling of the February Council meeting to Thursday, February 13, 2014, due to an Air District holiday on Wednesday, February 12, 2014.

The Council and staff discussed potential speakers for 2014, target end times for Council meetings, increased Council input on the selection of future topics, greater balance of speaker backgrounds over the course of a year, the scope of the February 2014 topic and its proper treatment, and the possibility of utilizing alternative mediums for the delivery of information to the Council.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None.

PRESENTATION

6. Air District Activities Regarding Climate Protection Focusing on the Energy Future of the Bay Area

Mr. Stevenson introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, who gave the staff presentation *Regional Climate Protection Strategy Resolution and 10-Point Work Program*, including background, key elements of the resolution, the regional goal and planning process, draft work program elements, Council role, Board and staff process, and next steps.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the challenges of urban and suburban planning efforts, the meaning of community choice aggregation and Property Assessed Clean Energy programs, the Council's role in the draft work program, the identity of the perceived stakeholders, and the Council's role during the upcoming year.

Public Comments:

Paul Kangas, Solar One, addressed the Council to propose the implementation of a feed-in tariff to encourage the development of clean energy.

Stephanie Flaniken addressed the Council regarding her support of its climate work and her concern that dialogue may take the place of meaningful action.

Charles Davidson, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Council regarding the disproportionate amount of greenhouse gas emissions in Contra Costa County and proposed changes in refinery operations.

Council Action: None.

AIR DISTRICT OVERVIEW

7. Report of the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer:

Ms. Roggenkamp announced Damian Breen as the newly appointed third DAPCO, gave an update on the Air District's move to 375 Beale Street, provided a summary of work updating the Clean Air Plan to include the regional climate strategy, and gave overviews of the regulatory agenda for 2014 and the Winter Fine Particulate Matter Season.

The Council and staff discussed the correlation between wood smoke and secondhand smoke in terms of public understanding, the regulation of refineries, potential effects of current weather patterns on the Clean Air Plan update, and the capability of near roadway monitoring to monitor traffic volumes.

Chair Altshuler asked that a copy of the Air District staff organizational chart be distributed to the Council when the update is complete.

OTHER BUSINESS

8. Chairperson's Report:

Chairperson Altshuler accepted Members Cherry, Hayes, Marshall (as editor) and O'Connor as volunteers on the report drafting work group for February's meeting.

Chairperson Altshuler noted the significant personal investments in the Council by its members and urged to group to remain respectful of those investments.

9. Council Member Comments/Other Business:

The Council discussed their interest in organizing a year-end casual Council gathering.

10. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Thursday, February 13, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters,
939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

11. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 12:04 p.m.

151 Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards