

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Thursday, February 13, 2014

Note: Audio and webcast recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>.

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Sam Altshuler called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Sam Altshuler, P.E.; Vice-Chairperson Liza Lutzker, M.P.H.; Secretary Jessica Range, LEED A.P.; and Members Benjamin Bolles, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., Stan Hayes, Kraig Kurucz, Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., Bruce Mast, Timothy O'Connor, J.D., and Laura E. Tam.

Absent: Members Ana M. Alvarez, D.P.P.D., Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Heather Forshey, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Kathryn Lyddan, J.D., Sara T L. Mayer, M.P.P., and Estes Al Phillips.

Also Present: None.

Opening Comments:

Chairperson Altshuler welcomed the Advisory Council (Council) and announced that the Council Secretary will compile and share the action items generated in Council meetings to assist with tracking their completion over time.

Secretary Range listed the outstanding action items from the January meeting as Council member feedback on the report writing guidelines provided by staff, delivery of the Council reports from 2009 – 10 to the Council, and an updated Air District organizational chart.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of the Minutes of the Council meeting of January 8, 2014

Council Comments:

Chairperson Altshuler revised the minutes at page 1, last paragraph, "Opening Comments (continued), to request the inclusion of a detailed list of the 2014 Goals.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action:

Member Bornstein made a motion to approve the minutes of January 8, 2014, as amended; Member Marshall seconded; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Bolles, Bornstein, Brazil, Cherry, Hayes, Lutzker, Marshall, O'Connor, and Range.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Mast and Tam.

ABSENT: Alvarez, Bramlett, Forshey, Holtzclaw, Kurucz, Lyddan, Mayer and Phillips.

RECOGNITION

2. Recognition of New Council Members

Chairperson Altshuler introduced newly appointed Members Laura E. Tam (*Conservation Organization*) and Bruce Mast (*Conservation Organization*) and welcomed them to the Council. Members Mast and Tam made introductory remarks.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None.

PRESENTATIONS

3. The Path Forward for the Energy Sector to Move Towards the 2050 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Goals

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Professor Mark Jacobson, Ph.D., and provided a brief description of his background.

A. Roadmaps for Transitioning California and the Other 49 States to Wind, Water and Solar Power for All Purposes

Professor Mark Jacobson, Ph.D.

Professor of Civil and Environmental Engineering

Director, Atmosphere/Energy Program

Senior Fellow, Woods Institute for the Environment, Precourt Institute for Energy
Stanford University

Prof. Jacobson gave a presentation entitled *Roadmaps for Transitioning California and the Other 49 States to Wind Water and Solar Power for All Purposes* (a copy of which is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>).

NOTED PRESENT: Member Kurucz was noted present at 9:28 a.m.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None.

B. California's Transition to a Low Carbon Economy: Infrastructure, Regulation, and Local Action

Dr. Jim Williams

Chief Scientist

Energy and Environmental Economics (E3)

Former Associate Professor, International Environmental Policy

Monterey Institute of International Studies

Ms. Roggenkamp introduced Jim Williams, Ph.D., and provided a brief description of his background.

Dr. Williams gave a presentation entitled *California's Transition to a Low Carbon Economy* (a copy of which is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>).

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None.

PANEL DISCUSSION

4. GHG and the Path Forward to Move Toward 2050 Goals

Council Comments:

The Council and speakers discussed the funding sources for the studies summarized in each presentation; the identity of critics of each presentation and the nature of the criticism received; the wind farm in Hawaii that has fallen into disrepair; the difference in the approach of the presentations; the scope of public health effects calculations; the impact of mining operations to obtain the materials necessary to develop the 100% sustainable energy model; the recommended role of the Air District and proposed Council recommendations to the Board of Directors

(Board); power generation, including current levels and sources, expected fall off in California sources over the next ten years, and the reliability of the current infrastructure to accommodate renewably-sourced replacements; what the speakers believe the Air District should do in the face of the ongoing submission of applications for permits to operate fossil-fuel burning operations in the Bay Area; the issue of and methods for valuing externalities; the scalability of wind-water-sun (WWS) and the accuracy of claims regarding WWS as a threat to grid stabilization; the accuracy of claims regarding the negative impact of the life-cycle costs of electric vehicles; the impact of various energy scenarios on water supplies; clarification of Dr. Williams's slide #17 and Prof. Jacobson's slide #33; the similarities and dissimilarities between funding programs for renewable energy in China and California's cap-and-trade system; the speakers' proposed recommendations for the Council to deliver to the Board; and the emissions footprint of hydroelectric facilities, by some measures, and the resulting exclusion of hydroelectric as a sustainable resource by some.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:

Taylor Hawke, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Council to suggest the development of a Bay Area plan by Prof. Jacobson, similar to that prepared for the State of California, and the implementation of the same by the Air District.

Lawrence Danos, 350 San Francisco and San Francisco 99% Coalition, addressed the Council to encourage ongoing efforts by the Air District to keep the Bay Area at the forefront of clean air technology and planning and to discourage the refinement of tar sands and hydrofracked-sourced materials in the Bay Area.

Natalie Shuttleworth addressed the Council in support of the findings of Prof. Jacobson's study and his proposed recommendations for the Council to deliver to the Board and to urge for an increase in residential incentivization programs by the Air District.

OTHER BUSINESS

5. Chairperson's Report:

Chairperson Altshuler thanked the Council members for their support and involvement, reminded them to complete the survey provided by staff, and requested that staff agendize the survey results for the next Council meeting.

Member Hayes distributed copies of the Report Feedback Template to increase the ease and efficiency of providing and gathering member input.

Chairperson Altshuler asked staff to arrange two open conference calls, one for the Council officers and one for the report drafting work group and that discussion of the 2009 – 2010 Council reports be agendized for discussion at the next Council meeting.

Secretary Range summarized the action items from today's meeting as Member survey completion, report input submitted to staff by Members no later than close of business on Tuesday, February 18, 2014, set up of two conference call lines by staff, and the agendaing of both the survey results and a discussion of the 2009 – 2010 Council reports.

6. Council Member Comments/Other Business:

Member Hayes referenced the publication, "California's Energy Future - The View to 2050," issued by the California Council on Science and Technology.

Chairperson Altshuler mentioned Laurie Wayburn, Pacific Forest Trust, for Council consideration as a possible future presenter on the topic of carbon sequestration as it relates to forestation planning.

7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Wednesday, March 12, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

8. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 12:23 p.m.

151 Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards