

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Wednesday, November 12, 2014

Note: An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>.

1. CALL TO ORDER:

Chairperson Sam Altshuler called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Sam Altshuler, P.E.; Vice-Chairperson Liza Lutzker, M.P.H.; Secretary Jessica Range, LEED A.P.; and Members Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., Heather Forshey, Stan Hayes, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Bruce Mast and Laura E. Tam.

Absent: Members Ana M. Alvarez, D.P.P.D., Benjamin Bolles, Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P. (resigned), Frank Imhof, Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., SaraT L. Mayer, M.P.P., Timothy O'Connor, Esq., and Estes Al Phillips (resigned).

Also Present: None.

Opening Comments:

The Clerk made an announcement regarding careful use of microphones during public meetings.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS:

Floyd Earl Smith, East Bay Community Action Program/350 Bay Area, addressed the Advisory Council (Council) in gratitude for the webcasting of select Council meetings and the sharing of the presentations; to issue an informal invitation to an upcoming conference in May/June 2015; to note highlights from the presentation of Daniel M. Kammen, Ph.D.; and to request the webcasting of all public meetings.

NOTED PRESENT: Member Mast was noted present at 9:09 a.m.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL MEETING ON OCTOBER 8, 2014

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action:

Member Bornstein made a motion, seconded by Member Holtzclaw, to approve the minutes of the Council meeting on October 8, 2014; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Bornstein, Brazil, Cherry, Forshey, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Kurucz, Lutzker, Mast, Range and Tam.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Alvarez, Bolles, Bramlett, Imhof, Marshall, Mayer, O'Connor and Phillips.

1. Opening Comments (continued):

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, addressed the Council regarding the term expirations of various Council members and potential reappointments and to announce the appointment of Saffet Tanrikulu, Research and Modeling Manager of the Planning, Rules and Research Division, as the successor Council Liaison to Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services.

The Council and staff discussed the timing of the Council's annual presentation to the Board of Directors (Board).

DISCUSSION

4. Discussion of Draft Report on the Council's Meeting on September 10, 2014

Council Comments:

The Council deliberated upon proposed revisions to the draft report on the Council meeting on September 10, 2014.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action:

Member Holtzclaw made a motion, seconded by Member Hayes, to approve the draft report on the Council meeting on September 10, 2014, as amended at today's meeting and subject to

grammatical changes by Member Bornstein; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Bornstein, Brazil, Cherry, Forshey, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Kurucz, Lutzker, Mast, Range and Tam.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Alvarez, Bolles, Bramlett, Imhof, Marshall, Mayer, O'Connor and Phillips.

OTHER BUSINESS

5. Selection of Slate of Officers for 2015 (Out of Order Agenda Item 9)

Council Comments: The Council discussed a Slate of Officers for 2015.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action:

Member Hayes made a motion, seconded by Member Lutzker, to appoint Member Lutzker as Chairperson, Member Range as Vice-Chairperson and Member Cherry as Secretary; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Bornstein, Brazil, Cherry, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Kurucz, Lutzker, Mast, Range and Tam.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: Forshey.
ABSENT: Alvarez, Bolles, Bramlett, Imhof, Marshall, Mayer, O'Connor and Phillips.

6. Future Topics for the Current Council (Out of Order Agenda Item 10)

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed potential future topics and invited the submission of suggestions for further discussion at the next Council meeting.

Public Comments:

Mr. Smith addressed the Council regarding the lack of public access to the list of potential topics; the importance of making this decision deliberately; the need for stakeholder input in advance of a decision being made; to suggest carbon tax as an additional topic; and to suggest an expanded geographic area for the "Wind Energy Potential in Northern California" topic.

Council Comments (continued):

The Council and staff discussed the meeting schedule and its compatibility with the potential topics and participated in an anonymous written ballot to determine the most preferred future topics.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

7. Discussion of Senate Bill (SB) 1415

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), addressed the Council in gratitude for their efforts; to summarize the Council role over the years and the provisions of SB 1415, as analyzed and considered for implementation by staff and the Board; and to suggest that further updates will be delivered to the Council as matters progress.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the current transition plan; the weighting of technical expertise versus geographical representation and politics during the recruitment process for the future Council; the maximum number of members in the future Council; Council representation at the Board retreat in January 2015; how the future Council member qualifications will be developed into eligibility criteria; the form of the future Council's relationship with the Board and staff; the need for Council encouragement from the Board and staff until June 2015; the recommendation to develop an enhanced relationship between the Board and future Council; possible Board and staff survey of the strengths and weaknesses of the current Council; what problem the Council is working to resolve through this line of discussion; the potential growth of the Board as the Bay Area population increases; the multitude of subjects being brought to the Air District at this time; the value of strong, scientific input for the Board, staff and public and hope that the future Council can provide it; increased public awareness of Air District activities as a positive development; the troubled history of the Council and improvements in recent history; consideration of Council input in the creation of a Council transition plan and creation of the future Council; an update on the formation of an Air District community council and community engagement efforts generally; and the Air District invitation to four Council members to attend the Air & Waste Management Association's 108th Annual Conference & Exhibition on June 22-25, 2015 in Raleigh, North Carolina.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

8. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO

Mr. Broadbent summarized Air District rule-making and refinery-related staff work expected through year end; announced that changes to the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment guidelines that will impact Air District operations are expected to be issued soon; announced the beginning of the Spare the Air winter season and potential changes to the wood

smoke rule; explained the genesis behind and expectations for the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association's upcoming conference, My Air Quality: Using Sensors to Know What's in Your Air on Wednesday, November 19 in Northern California and on Friday, November 21, 2014 in Southern California.

Public Comments:

Mr. Smith addressed the Council in gratitude for Mr. Broadbent's comments about the importance of public involvement; to re-characterize comments made about refinery crude stocks and facility modernization projects; and to suggest the Council has a strong role in deciding how refinery operations will proceed.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed potential changes to the wood smoke rule and recruitment updates regarding the Health and Science Officer and Community Engagement Manager at the Air District.

The Council recessed at 11:06 a.m.

The Council resumed at 11:16 a.m.

6. Future Topics for the Current Council (Out of Order Agenda Item 10 Continued)

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the results of the anonymous written ballot to determine the most preferred future topics.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: The Council directed staff to agendize future topics, in descending order of popularity, based on speaker availability.

DISCUSSION (CONTINUED)

9. Discussion of Draft Report on the Council's Meeting on October 8, 2014 (Agenda Item 5)

Council Comments:

The Council deliberated upon proposed revisions to the draft report on the Council meeting on October 8, 2014.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

10. Discussion of Council Presentation to the Board (Agenda Item 6)

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the Council presentation to the Board; potential schedules for future Council meetings, reports and presentations; the request for a review or evaluation of the Council by the Board and staff before June 2015; the need and potential topics for a Council retreat, as opposed to a regular meeting, in January 2015; the approach to and timing of the Council presentation to the Board; and possible public outreach by the Council regarding the substance of the final report before presenting to the Board.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

OTHER BUSINESS

11. Chairperson's Report: None.

12. Council Member Comments/Other Business:

Member Hayes thanked Chairperson Altshuler for his service as Chairperson and Mr. Stevenson for his service as Council Liaison.

13. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Wednesday, January 14, 2015, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

14. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 12:20 p.m.

15/ Sean Gallagher

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards