



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING

WEDNESDAY
MAY 14, 2014
9:00 A.M.

7TH FLOOR BOARD ROOM
939 ELLIS STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109

AGENDA

CALL TO ORDER

Opening Comments
Roll Call

Sam Altshuler, Chairperson
Clerk

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of Minutes of the April 9, 2014 Advisory Council Meeting.

RECOGNITION

2. Recognition of New Advisory Council Member

Sam Altshuler, Chairperson

PRESENTATION

3. **California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Goals**

Speakers from the Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory and California Energy Commission will present materials on California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 Goals.

A. California's Energy Future

Jane C.S. Long, Ph.D.

Contributing Scientist

Environmental Defense Fund

Former Principal Associate Director at Large and Associate Director for Energy and Environment

Fellow, Center for Global Strategic Research

Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

B. Reducing GHG Emissions through Energy and Innovation

Emilio Camacho, Esq.

Advisor to California Energy Commissioner Hochschild

Former Attorney with the Office of the Legislative Counsel

PANEL DISCUSSION

4. California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Goals

The speakers will convene as a panel for a discussion with the Advisory Council and Air District staff on GHG and the 2050 Goals – California's Energy Future and the Path Forward

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3. The public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's purview.

OTHER BUSINESS

5. Chairperson's Report

Sam Altshuler, Chairperson

6. Council Member Comments/Other Business

Council Members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

7. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO

8. Time and Place of Next Meeting

Wednesday, June 11, 2014, at 9:00 a.m., at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

9. Adjournment

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Council Chair.

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk's Office should be given in a timely manner, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109
FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-5016 or (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

MAY 2014

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Advisory Council Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 2nd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	14	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee <i>(Meets 3rd Thursday of every other month)</i> CANCELLED	Thursday	15	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month) – CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO MAY 7, 2014</i>	Monday	19	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee <i>(Meets Quarterly at the Call of the Chair) – CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO MAY 1, 2014</i>	Monday	19	10:30 a.m.	Board Room
Special Board of Directors Meeting -Budget Hearing <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Wednesday	21	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	21	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	22	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	28	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	28	10:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room

JUNE 2014

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	4	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Advisory Council Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 2nd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	11	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	16	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	18	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	25	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	26	9:30 a.m.	Board Room

JULY 2014

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	2	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Advisory Council Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 2nd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	9	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	16	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee – <i>(Meets 3rd Thursday every other Month)</i>	Thursday	17	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	21	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	23	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	Board Room

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Sam Altshuler and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer

Date: April 14, 2014

Re: Approval of Minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting on April 9, 2014

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Advisory Council on April 9, 2014.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Advisory Council on April 9, 2014.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sean Gallagher
Reviewed by: Rex Sanders

Attachment

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Wednesday, April 9, 2014

Note: An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>.

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Sam Altshuler called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Sam Altshuler, P.E.; Vice-Chairperson Liza Lutzker, M.P.H.; Secretary Jessica Range, LEED A.P.; and Members Ana M. Alvarez, D.P.P.D., Benjamin Bolles, Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., Heather Forshey, Stan Hayes, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., Sara T. L. Mayer, M.P.P., Timothy O'Connor, Esq., and Estes Al Phillips.

Absent: Members Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Frank Imhof, Kraig Kurucz, Bruce Mast and Laura E. Tam.

Also Present: None.

Opening Comments:

Chairperson Altshuler gave opening comments regarding the meeting agenda and outstanding action items, including review of outstanding questions for past presenters, staff and the Advisory Council (Council); an update on planning for the 2014 Annual Air & Waste Management Association Conference; the delivery of an organization chart from staff; year-end event planning; and the future review of Council reports in 2009 and 2010.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD: There were no requests for public comment.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of the Minutes of the March 13, 2014 Council Meeting

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: There were no requests for public comment.

Council Action:

Member Marshall made a motion to approve the minutes of March 13, 2014; Member Alvarez seconded; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Alvarez, Bramlett, Cherry, Forshey, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Lutzker, Marshall, Mayer and Phillips.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Brazil and Range.

ABSENT: Bolles, Bornstein, Imhof, Kurucz, Mast, O'Connor and Tam.

DISCUSSION

2. Discussion and Finalization of Draft Report on the Council's February 13, 2014 Meeting

Council Comments:

The Council and staff deliberated upon proposed revisions to the draft report on the Advisory Council meeting on February 23, 2014.

NOTED PRESENT: Member Bolles was noted present at 9:35 a.m.

Public Comments:

David McCoard, Sierra Club, addressed the Council in support of the preliminary draft recommendation #1.

Council Action:

The Council requested the matter be agendaized for further discussion in the future.

PRESENTATION

3. Air District Staff Present Information on Programs and Activities Involving Climate Protection

Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, introduced Brian Bateman, Health and Science Officer, who gave the staff presentation *Overview of Energy Issues*, including world energy consumption and related carbon dioxide (CO₂) emissions by fuel type; worldwide delivered energy consumption by sector and fuel; growth in energy use in China and other developing countries; current U.S. energy consumption and projections by sector and fuel type; U.S. consumption, production and importation of petroleum and other liquid fuels; U.S. crude oil

production; trends and projections in U.S. crude oil supplies and quality; crude oil issues; crude slate and refinery CO₂ emissions; U.S. natural gas production; U.S. per capita energy use and energy-related CO₂ emissions; California energy consumption, sources and per capita use in 2011; California crude oil production; key California measures for reducing CO₂ emissions from energy use; Bay Area energy-related greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in 2011; Bay Area energy production and power plants; new Bay Area power plants; and summary.

NOTED PRESENT: Member O'Connor was noted present at 10:27 a.m.

The Council and staff discussed, at slide 26, *Bay Area Power Plants*, why geothermal was not included in the table.

Mr. Bateman concluded the presentation.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed whether back-up generators and rooftop photovoltaic were included in the percentages provided on slide 26, *Bay Area Power Plants*; refinery emissions and crude slates in terms of changes in sulfur content, District permitting considerations and possible public health and safety concerns; an explanation of the component parts of "Oil Refining 19%" on slide 24, *Bay Area Energy-Related GHG Emissions 2012 – CO₂e*; the makeup of synthetic crude oil; the composition of tar sands crude if and when it arrives in California for refining; clarification of the effect of changes in crude oil slate and sulfur content on slide 15, *Crude Slate and Refinery CO₂ Emissions*; the opportunity for local change with global impact in the realm of energy use as opposed to reduced emissions; whether future staff presentations will provide more information on Air District programs and activities involving climate protection; whether studies are available about the environmental and societal implications of emerging U.S. crude oil production methods; the backup generator report from staff, including numbers and uses, and the viability of alternative fuel sources; backup generator requirements dictated by law; whether and how CO₂ and GHG are considered, tracked and reported out by the Air District; and whether Pacific Gas & Electric is utilizing flow batteries in its backup energy storage program.

Public Comments: There were no requests for public comment.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

OTHER BUSINESS

4. Council Member Comments/Other Business:

The Council discussed the related activities each member is involved in outside of their roles on the Council.

The Council and staff discussed the impressions of the report writing work group and staff regarding the report writing process and the identity of speakers expected to present in May.

5. Report of the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO):

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy APCO, Brian Bunger, District Counsel, and Mr. Stevenson jointly presented an update on and discussed with the Council Senate Bill 1415 (Hill).

6. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Wednesday, May 14, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

7. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 12:10 p.m.

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards

Bay Area Air Quality Management District

Advisory Council Meeting



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Goals

Date: Wednesday, May 14, 2014

Place: BAAQMD
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109

Time: 9:00am – 12:00pm

Presentations include:

California's Energy Future

Jane C.S. Long, Ph.D.

Contributing Scientist

Environmental Defense Fund

Former Principal Associate Director at Large and Director of Energy and Environment

Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

Reducing GHG Emissions through Energy and Innovation

Emilio Camacho, Esq.

Advisor to California Energy Commissioner Hochschild

Former Attorney with the Office of the Legislative Counsel

For directions, transit, and parking information visit <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Hours-and-Directions.aspx>

This meeting will also be webcast. A link will be posted on the Air District home page (<http://www.baaqmg.gov>) on the day of the meeting

For more information, please contact Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services at (415) 749-4695 or estevenson@baaqmd.gov.