



BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT

## ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

WEDNESDAY  
OCTOBER 8, 2014  
9:00 A.M.

7<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR BOARD ROOM  
939 ELLIS STREET  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109

### AGENDA

#### CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments**  
**Roll Call**

**Sam Altshuler, Chairperson**  
**Clerk**

*The Chairperson shall call the meeting to order and make opening comments. The Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Advisory Council members.*

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

*Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, the public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's purview. Speakers are limited to three minutes each.*

3. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING ON SEPTEMBER 10, 2014**

*The Advisory Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of September 10, 2014.*

#### DISCUSSION

4. **Discussion of Draft Report on the Advisory Council's Meeting on September 10, 2014**

*The Advisory Council will discuss the draft report on the September 10<sup>th</sup> meeting on "California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 Green House Gas Goals" with Air District staff.*

## **PRESENTATION**

### **5. Energy Storage and Smart Grid Technologies and Their Relationship to the 2050 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Goals**

*A speaker from the Electric Power Research Institute will present materials on Energy Storage and Smart Grid Technologies.*

#### **Energy Storage and Smart Grid Technologies and Their Relationship to 2050 GHG Goals**

Haresh Kamath

Program Manager, Energy Storage

Electric Power Research Institute (EPRI)

Palo Alto, California

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

### **6. Future Topics for the Current Advisory Council**

*Council members and staff will discuss future topics to be covered by the current Advisory Council.*

### **7. Chairperson's Report**

*The Chairperson will provide the Council a report of recent and upcoming activities.*

### **8. Council Member Comments/Other Business**

*Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information or ask questions about subsequent meetings.*

### **9. Time and Place of Next Meeting**

*November 12, 2014 at 9:00 a.m. at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109.*

### **10. Adjournment**

*The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chairperson.*

#### **CLERK OF THE BOARDS**

**939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109**

**sgallagher@baaqmd.gov**

**(415) 749-5073**

**FAX: (415) 928-8560**

**BAAQMD homepage:**

**[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)**

#### Contact:

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the "Members of the Advisory Council" and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Council meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Council at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.

- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk's Office should be given in a timely manner, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109  
FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-5016 or (415) 749-4941**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:  
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS**

**OCTOBER 2014**

<b><u>TYPE OF MEETING</u></b>	<b><u>DAY</u></b>	<b><u>DATE</u></b>	<b><u>TIME</u></b>	<b><u>ROOM</u></b>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> <b>- CANCELLED</b>	Wednesday	1	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets Quarterly at the Call of the Chair)</i>	Wednesday	1	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 2<sup>nd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	8	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	15	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	20	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	22	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	23	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Thursday	30	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

**NOVEMBER 2014**

<b><u>TYPE OF MEETING</u></b>	<b><u>DAY</u></b>	<b><u>DATE</u></b>	<b><u>TIME</u></b>	<b><u>ROOM</u></b>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	5	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 2<sup>nd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	12	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	17	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Nominating Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Wednesday	19	9:30 a.m.	Room 716
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	19	9:45 a.m.	Board Room

## NOVEMBER 2014

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> – <i>(Meets 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday every other Month)</i>	Thursday	20	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Monday	24	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	26	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO MONDAY, NOVEMBER 24, 2014 DUE TO THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY	Thursday	27	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
---	----------	----	-----------	------------

SG – 10/02/14 (2:15 p.m.)

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Sam Altshuler and Members  
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer

Date: September 26, 2014

Re: Approval of the Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting on September 10, 2014

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the regular meeting of the Advisory Council on September 10, 2014.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of Advisory Council meeting on September 10, 2014.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sean Gallagher  
Reviewed by: Maricela Martinez

Attachment: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of September 10, 2014

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Meeting of September 10, 2014

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109  
(415) 749-5073

**DRAFT MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, September 10, 2014

*Note: Audio and video recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>.*

**CALL TO ORDER:** Chairperson Sam Altshuler called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m.

**Roll Call:**

Present: Chairperson Sam Altshuler, P.E.; Vice-Chairperson Liza Lutzker, M.P.H.; Secretary Jessica Range, LEED A.P.; and Members Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., Stan Hayes, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Frank Imhof, Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., Bruce Mast, Timothy O'Connor, Esq., and Laura E. Tam.

Absent: Members Ana M. Alvarez, D.P.P.D., Benjamin Bolles, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Heather Forshey, Kraig Kurucz, SaraT L. Mayer, M.P.P., and Estes Al Phillips (resigned).

Also Present: None.

**Opening Comments:**

The Advisory Council (Council) discussed the composition of the work group that will prepare the draft Council report on the upcoming presentation and discussion.

**PRESENTATION**

**1. California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Goals (Out of Order Agenda Item #2)**

Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, introduced Professor Daniel M. Kammen, Ph.D., and provided a brief description of his background.

## **California's Energy Future**

Professor Daniel M. Kammen, Ph.D.

Class of 1935 Distinguished Professor of Energy, University of California, Berkeley

Professor in the Energy and Resources Group, Energy and Resources Group

Professor of Public Policy, Goldman School of Public Policy

Founding Director, Renewable and Appropriate Energy Laboratory

NOTED PRESENT: Member Brazil was noted present at 9:10 a.m. and Member O'Connor was noted present at 9:11 a.m.

Prof. Kammen gave a presentation entitled *Energy and Climate Opportunities for the Bay Area* (a copy of which is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Advisory-Council/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx>).

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **2. California's Energy Future and the Move Towards the 2050 GHG Goals**

Council Comments:

The Council, Prof. Kammen and staff discussed the source of funding for Prof. Kammen's research; how to implement the type of comprehensive planning necessary to address climate issues while respecting local control; the proper role and focus of community planning; a reconciliation of the conclusions drawn in presentations by Professor Mark Jacobson, Ph.D., for wind, water and solar only, and that of Jane C.S. Long, Ph.D., for all available options; whether Prof. Kammen's models include the costs of externalities such as water and public health; the source of the map data as consumption based, not monitoring of actual emissions; whether and how Prof. Kammen's team is working with Dr. Jim Williams, Energy + Environmental Economics, and the State on the SWITCH model; the Air District's role in larger-scale efforts; the cost-effectiveness and advisability of electrification retrofitting of existing buildings; the stability of the existing grid with the implementation of distributed generation and its two-way transmission capability; possible government policies that would support Prof. Kammen's models if implemented, such as Denmark's siting review practice; the importance of including all of the metrics of value to the Air District in its permit reviews and similar practices; the advisability of requiring carbon analysis by businesses who submit applications to the Air District for projects of a certain size; the idea that carbon accounting for all activities is of greater value than divestment, to eventually be followed by accountings of various natural resources as well as health-impact modeling; the importance of developing strategies that go beyond Assembly Bill 32 while also being pro-business; the need for policies that completely transform the prevailing view of social and environmental justice; the basis for the conclusion regarding \$40 per ton of carbon emissions, as shown in slide 6, *Energy System Modeling Efforts in the*

*Renewable and Appropriate Energy Laboratory, UC Berkeley*; the fact that energy demand response was not included in the modeling because of a current lack of cost data; the need for net metering and two-way transmission; the need for integration of stationary and mobile energy demand; whether the models take into account increasing global temperatures; the viability of hydrogen as a green energy source and storage medium; and the advisability of the Air District developing a consumption-based carbon footprint data set.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action: None; receive and file.

**CONSENT CALENDAR (ITEM 3) (Agenda Item #1)**

**3. Approval of the Minutes of the July 9, 2014 Council Meeting:**

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Council Action:

Member Holtzclaw made a motion, seconded by Member Marshall, to approve Consent Calendar Item 3; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Altshuler, Brazil, Cherry, Hayes, Holtzclaw, Imhof, Lutzker, Marshall, Mast, Range and Tam.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: O'Connor.

ABSENT: Alvarez, Bolles, Bornstein, Bramlett, Forshey, Mayer, Kurucz and Phillips.

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:** No requests received.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

**4. Council Member Comments/Other Business:**

The Council and staff discussed the low ozone levels in the Bay Area during Labor Day weekend and the recent trend of weather patterns in the early and late summer that contribute to air quality exceedences; an update on the Kinder Morgan lawsuit involving the Air District; report writing logistics; the impact of the Napa earthquake; whether additional speakers and reports are anticipated this calendar year; plans for the Council's year-end presentation to the Board of Directors (Board); the unfortunate absence of input from local communities, particularly those deemed disadvantaged, in the material being used to generate the Council reports and year-end

presentation to the Board; an update on Senate Bill (SB) 1415; and tentative plans for meetings, presentations and reports from January through June 2015.

**5. Report of the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer:**

Mr. Stevenson, Brian Bunger, District Counsel, and the Council discussed the lack of information available regarding Governor Brown's stance on SB 1415.

**6. Time and Place of Next Meeting:**

Wednesday, October 8, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

**7. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:53 a.m.

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Sam Altshuler and Members  
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer

Date: September 26, 2014

Re: Discussion of Draft Report on the Advisory Council's Meeting on September 10,  
2014

---

The draft report of the September 10, 2014, Advisory Council Meeting on *The Path Forward for the Energy Sector to Move Towards the 2050 Greenhouse Gas Goals* will be discussed with Air District staff, and the Council will finalize the recommendations at its meeting on November 12, 2014.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sean Gallagher  
Reviewed by: Maricela Martinez