



May 21, 2004

Jack Broadbent, Air Control Officer  
Brenda Cabral, Permit Engineer  
Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco CA 94109

Re: Comment for Literacy for Environmental Justice (LEJ) on the Air District proposal to renew the five year Title V permit to the PG&E Hunter's Point Power Plant (Facility #A0024)

Dear Mr. Broadbent and Ms. Cabral:

It is the clear responsibility of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District to deny the Title V permit renewal for the Hunter's Point Power Plant owned by PG&E. It is your obligation to the citizens of this region to base decision-making on the principles of environmental justice. In recent months the BAAQMD has made strides to acknowledge environmental justice as a concern and to include public participation as a meaningful part of the permit renewal process. We see these developments as encouraging acts, worthy of endorsement from community members. Granting the Title V permit to the Hunter's Point Power Plant will be seen by regional environmental organizations as sign of clear contradiction to these recent efforts. We strongly suggest that you take the courageous stand to deny this permit based on the many valid reasons presented to you by community members and organizations.

All acknowledge the community most severely effected by the emissions of this power plant as one suffering from an enduring legacy of environmental injustice. Several members of the BAAQMD Board of Directors and key staff witnessed the close proximity of residential areas to the power plant during the EJAQ San Francisco toxic tour of MiddlePoint Road in January. The smokestacks are level with the windows of homes in that neighborhood. Life threatening health effects associated with emissions from the vast array of industrial sites in Bayview Hunter's Point is well documented and undeniable. These factors confirm that this community is subject to protections outlined in Title VI. Under U.S. EPA's regulation implementing Title VI, recipients of EPA financial assistance, such as the BAAQMD, are required to implement their programs and activities in a non-discriminatory manner. Renewing the Title V permit, in light of the history of environmental injustice and disproportionate air quality related health problems in Hunter's Point, would continue discriminatory effects of air permitting in the area.

Denial of the Title V permit is justifiable because the extent of disrepair to this facility. A review of the frequent breakdowns the Hunter's Point Power Plant, repairs and subsequent start-ups and shutdowns will convey the extent of the public nuisance endured by the local community. Although it is known that some of the most harmful emissions spew from power plants during start-ups and shutdowns, the BAAQMD does

not monitor nor does it generally consider air pollution problems resulting from these procedures, because of exemptions. Thus, the community suffers from a constant barrage of unregulated health threatening emissions, year round, with complicit silence from the BAAQMD.

The unanimous voice of the community adamantly called for the denial of the Title V permit for the Hunter's Point facility on May 4<sup>th</sup> 2004. It operates as the largest stationary source of criteria air pollutants in the Bayview Hunter's Point community according to the CARB. In the community's ongoing and momentum building struggle for environmental justice, realizing the swift closure of this power plant is a key goal. The BAAQMD should be walking in stride with the community to achieve this goal, and can significantly aid the effort with the denial of the Title V permit renewal for the PG&E Hunter's Point Power Plant.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'DL', with a large, stylized flourish at the end.

Dana Lanza, Executive Director