

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105

MINUTES

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee

July 24, 2023, 5:30 P.M

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chair Alfredo Angulo-Castro called the meeting to order at 5:35 PM.

Present: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y’Anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Dr. Darlena David, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Roberta Feliciano (non-voting), Michael Kent (non-voting), and BK White (non-voting)

Absent: Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Jessica Range, and Hakim Johnson (non-voting)

Also Present: Air District Staff Joshua Abraham, Dan Alrick, Laura C. Cackette, Victor Douglas, Veronica Eady, Samuel Garcia, Wendy Goodfriend, Kelly Malinowski, Phil Martien, Kevin Olp, Suma Peesapati, Marcia Raymond, Diana Ruiz, Raymond Salalila, Karissa White, Barry Young, and Elizabeth Yura; Critical Impact Consulting Staff Ratha Lai; MIG Staff Bridget Brown and Maria Mayer; Interpreter Norma Herrera; Members of the Public Estefanny Casas, Eric Lara, Liana Solis, and Lily Wu.

2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

00:03:33

Co-Chair Burrell described the meeting format and procedures.

Public Comments

None.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JUNE 26, 2023

00:05:18

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the June 26, 2023, Meeting Minutes in a show-of-hands vote.

Committee Action

Committee Member Heidi Swillinger made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Suzanne Coffee, to approve the minutes of the June 26, 2023 meeting. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y’Anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Dr. Darlena David, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Roberta Feliciano (non-voting), Michael Kent (non-voting), BK White (non-voting)

ABSENT: Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, and Jessica Range

Public Comments

None.

4. AD HOC UPDATES

00:08:54

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public received updates on the active ad hoc working groups.

Committee Comments

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro reported that the Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc review teams have been identified, and requested a status update from each team lead regarding whether their team has met and begun the review process.

Committee Member Swillinger reported that the Marine and Rail group have scheduled their team orientation meeting for the coming Thursday, July 27.

Committee Member Dr. Omotoso reported that the Mobile Sources group are in the process of individually reviewing different sections of the strategies and plan to meet again in about two weeks to combine their reviews.

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro reported that the Commercial and Industrial group had their orientation meeting earlier today and have scheduled another meeting for next week.

Committee Member Aguirre reported that the Public Health group met today and have confirmed their next meeting for Monday, July 31. She shared that they are excited that Michael Kent is on the team and that he has a colleague who can assist them in navigating the Public Health strategies and solidifying the accompanying actions.

Committee Member Severy reported that the Land Use and Urban Greening group will hold their orientation meeting on the evening of Wednesday, July 25, and that he is planning to do his review of the document later this week. He noted that the group is on pace to finish their review by August 14th.

BAAQMD staff member Diana Ruiz provided an update on the Governance Ad Hoc including an overview of the current status of the Committee membership application and selection process. She noted that the Governance Ad Hoc is requesting CSC member volunteers to join the interview panel.

Co-Chair Burrell asked whether a one-page snapshot of current Committee members with information including their industry, interests, city of residence, ethnicity, etc. is available. Committee Member Cantú replied that all current members' applications were entered in a database and that this information is available on a single spreadsheet to be shared with any CSC member. Co-Chair Burrell requested that this spreadsheet be sent to all Committee Members, and also shared that she is interested in joining the interview panel.

Committee Member Castello asked what was meant by the reference to contacting selected applicants prior to the meeting at which they'll be put forward as member to approve to "confirm their continued interest." BAAQMD staff explained that since some time has elapsed since applications were originally received, they'll be contacted to ensure they're still interested before moving ahead.

Committee Member Cantú encouraged all CSC members to join interviews as a great way to meet new potential members and engage with the community. She noted that the Governance Ad Hoc has striven to make this a painless and streamlined process, and that it's a great opportunity for other CSC members to provide support.

Co-Chair Burrell asked if anyone was interested in volunteering to join the interview panel. Committee Members Dr. Omotoso, Simren, and Ruano Hernandez volunteered.

Public Comments

None.

5. REVISED VISION AND PRINCIPLES

00:24:00

The Committee and the public received a presentation on revisions to the Vision and Principles of the PTCA Steering Committee from BAAQMD staff member Diana Ruiz.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Ruano Hernandez shared appreciation for these revisions, and commended and thanked those who did this work and BAAQMD staff for the presentation.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Action

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Omotoso, to accept revisions to the Vision and Principles of the PTCA Steering Committee. The motion was carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y'Anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Dr. Darlena David, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, and Heidi Swillinger

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Roberta Feliciano (non-voting), Michael Kent (non-voting), BK White (non-voting)

ABSENT: Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, and Jessica Range

Public Comments

None.

6. CERP GOALS UPDATE

00:33:23

The Committee and the public received a presentation on the CERP Goals Update from Co-Chair Angulo-Castro.

Committee Comments

Co-Chair Burrell asked how often the Goal-Setting Team that CSC members are being asked to join will meet. Co-Chair Angulo-Castro responded that at their first meeting earlier in the day, they

set their next meeting for Monday, July 30 from 10-11:30. They have not yet established a schedule for the remaining meetings but there will likely be one or two more meetings at most, continuing to take place on Mondays.

Public Comments

None.

7. PRESENTATION ON COMMUNICATIONS AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT PLAN

00:37:45

The Committee and public received a presentation on the PTCA CERP communications and community engagement plan and toolkit from Ratha Lai, Critical Impact Consulting.

Committee Comments

Co-Chair Burrell shared that the presentation was great overall, noting that communications and engagement materials may differ when reaching out to different groups, and that it would be helpful to receive an explanation of why this is and see examples of what resonates with particular communities. She also noted the need for CSC members to learn more about the importance of trusted messengers in relaying these communications, who they might be, and how that trust might be gained and maintained if trusted messengers don't already exist for a particular group. Ratha Lai responded that the ability to customize materials is important, and that work would likely be scoped out by the Committee in a specialized community engagement Ad Hoc.

Committee Member Dr. David noted that although data on emissions is included in the materials shown, additional health data on, for example, rates of particular health conditions, seems to be missing. Ratha Lai responded by sharing a post from the social media section of the engagement toolkit with data on asthma rates, as well as an introductory factsheet that includes basic health data. He noted that more health-specific factsheets would be helpful. Committee Member Dr. David asked if he had any health data for children. Ratha Lai responded that he did not, but that the information may be found. Committee Member Dr. David noted that it would be helpful to have information on the rates of particular conditions such as asthma, cancer, heart problems, etc. including comparisons with rates in other locations.

Committee Member Aguirre thanked Ratha for his information, and reminded the group that what he has created for the group are intended as templates. She agreed with Dr. David that the health data she describes is important, noting that CSC members can add the results of their research to customize materials based on the audience or desired subject matter. She noted that having demographic information on Committee members, along with the audience map, will help determine who has cultural, linguistic, or other knowledge to best serve as a trusted messenger to any given community, and partner up to ensure inclusiveness, translation as needed, and that information being presented is what's important to the community. This is one of the ways the materials that Ratha has developed can be further customized and augmented. She shared that she

would appreciate Committee Member Severy's co-leadership in the community engagement process and requested his help with noting anything that's missing.

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro agreed on the importance of understanding that the work Ratha has done is a solid framework for CSC members to build on and dive deeper into. He urged Committee members to consider and possibly share how they might use this toolkit.

Committee Member Cantú shared that Ratha has done incredible work. She noted that the engagement materials shown seemed to be formatted as flyers, and wondered whether formatting and accessibility standards could be provided for various social media platforms so the materials could be adapted. She agreed that language accessibility is an important part of engagement with the community, asking how and what portion of the materials will be translated, and whether the plan includes criteria for prioritizing what is or is not translated. She asked whether this work would be a part of MIG's scope. BAAQMD staff responded that the next step will be to convene a more permanent community engagement subcommittee, with the initial charge of conducting a thorough review to ensure everything is clear, concise, and accurate, and that CSC members agree everything needed is included and all desired messages are represented. Once that is complete, the engagement group will consult with the broader CSC to determine priorities for translation. These materials will be used on an ongoing basis, so all will eventually be translated. It's key to ensure that materials are finalized prior to translation to avoid unnecessary repetition of work.

Committee Member Castello shared that she enjoyed the presentation and is excited to use the toolkit, which is very supportive. She recounted a recent conversation with colleagues about signage that provides data about the health threats of poor air quality, which is very impactful but doesn't include any follow-up on what to do about it. She recommended that as the Committee further develops and begins using the materials, they ensure that information on how to get involved in positive action is incorporated.

Committee Member Aguirre asked, in reference to Committee Member Cantú's question about social media posts, that Ratha show the parameters, templates, and examples he has developed. Ratha did so, explaining that the examples are provided in sets that include each of the social media platforms. It's up to the Committee members to determine how to use them, noting that it's most important to post regularly and frequently.

Committee Member Severy thanked Ratha for all of his work and his presentation. He shared his opinion that the materials contain a very clear framework around values, problems, and solutions, with clear calls to action. He noted that there is a lot of content included, and that the first step is to help CSC members become comfortable with it, paring down, adapting, and customizing the content to serve their needs, keeping the shared values and aligned principles in mind. Ratha agreed that this was a very short presentation. He recommended that Committee members follow his usual method of spending time familiarizing themselves with the materials, discussing the audience map and possible approaches, and practicing using them. He shared that he included a checklist for using the toolkit that will help in preparing to use it. He noted that there is also considerable potential to create more personalized materials.

BAAQMD staff recognized Committee Members Aguirre and Severy and Co-Chair Burrell, who contributed a lot of hard work to the development of the plan. They initially joined the Community Engagement Ad Hoc to oversee Ratha's work, going on to create the community engagement survey that all CSC members responded to, develop strategies, revise Ratha's original outline, and co-develop the materials. Ratha shared his thanks as well, noting that it was a positive experience to work with them.

Olp went on to request an action to be voted on by the Committee – approving an increase in pay to Ratha for 44 hours / \$6,600 worth of work between May 1 and July 28, 2023, which was additional to his original agreement.

Committee Member Cantú shared her concern with voting to provide “back pay” for additional work outside Ratha's original scope that was not approved by the Committee prior to being completed. Committee Member Severy explained that it was apparent at least one month ago that Ratha's work would exceed the number of hours originally contracted, and that the possibility of voting at this action at the June CSC meeting had been discussed. BAAQMD staff explained it had been brought to their attention that those 44 hours were necessary to meet the deliverables in his contract. His contract was originally set to expire at the end of the year, but it was decided to end it effective July 28, so that staff could compile an assets list to allow review of all materials, and further edits and additions could be done in-house. Ratha had failed to account for time needed to meet with CSC members and make changes based on their review and feedback, and he had volunteered to complete the work without being paid extra. Committee Members Aguirre and Severy requested, however, that an action be taken to add an extension onto his existing contract and pay him for the work. The paperwork to do so will not be started until the Committee votes to approve moving forward.

Committee Member Cantú responded that she understood, but expressed her wish that this had been communicated to the CSC in May so that the extension of scope and hours could be approved collectively in advance. Now, if the Committee does not approve of this requested action, Ratha will not be paid for work he has already completed. This is concerning because it's important for the Committee to ensure it's clear that contractors are paid equitably. BAAQMD staff shared that the underestimation of time needed occurred on the part of all parties involved. They agreed that this is important, and that the Committee can discuss this in an ad hoc group to learn from this experience and set up a process to course-correct moving forward.

Committee Member Aguirre shared that she agrees with Committee Member Cantú that something was missed on all sides, there are clearly many lessons to learn, and that the situation should have been handled differently. She agreed with BAAQMD staff's point that a procedure must be developed by contractors, the CSC, and Air District staff working together to ensure equitable contracting in the future.

Committee Action

Co-Chair Heidi Swillinger made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Castello, to approve the increase in pay to Ratha Lai. The motion was carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y’Anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Lucia Castello, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, and Heidi Swillinger

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Marisol Cantú, Dr. Darlena David, Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Roberta Feliciano (non-voting), Michael Kent (non-voting), BK White (non-voting)

ABSENT: Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, and Jessica Range

Public Comments

None.

8. COMMUNITY OUTREACH AND ENGAGEMENT

01:39:10

The Committee and public received a presentation from Committee Member Severy on the work of the Community Engagement Ad Hoc, including the results of the Community Outreach Survey completed by CSC members, and the formation of the Community Outreach and Engagement Standing Committee.

Committee Comments

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro asked when the standing committee will begin actively meeting. Committee Member Severy responded that the ad hoc group has been meeting weekly on Wednesdays at 2 p.m., with most of their work to date consisting of directing Ratha and managing his contract. He invited CSC members to join their next meeting on Wednesday, July 26. He explained that there may be a lull while internal review of strategies is completed, but they intend to launch the review phase, which will include getting public input, soon. BAAQMD staff shared that the group’s first action once members are identified is to circulate a survey to identify a standing meeting time that works for all.

Co-Chair Burrell and Committee Members Coffee and Cantú volunteered to join the standing committee, although Committee Member Cantú specified that she can’t begin until September.

Public Comments

None.

9. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE UPDATES

01:52:27

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.

Committee Comments

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro shared that Contra Costa County Health Services is currently reviewing Chevron's root cause analysis report on the 2021 San Pablo Bay oil spill, along with a report from a third party assessing the accuracy of Chevron's report. The County recently provided a presentation of their findings and is taking public comment until August 28th. He encouraged CSC members to review the findings and comment, taking advantage of the opportunity to scrutinize the report and put some pressure on the County to ensure that the responsible parties are held accountable.

Committee Member Aguirre shared that she sits on that committee and would appreciate CSC members' support in reviewing that report. Getting Chevron's support for the third party to review their report, and the lawyers to confirm what they are allowed to review, was a very lengthy process and fresh eyes would be appreciated. She thanked Co-Chair Angulo-Castro for bringing it up, and will forward the review email she received to all Committee members.

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro shared that he sent an email out last week about openings on the County's Hazardous Materials Commission, and invited Committee Member Kent to provide more detail. Committee Member Kent shared that he is the staff person assigned to the Commission, which is an advisory board to the County Board of Supervisors. It has 14 members, each with an alternate, consisting of representatives from environmental groups, environmental justice communities, labor, businesses, cities, the League of Women Voters, environmental engineering, and the general public. Two seats are currently open: a general public seat alternate and an environmental organization seat alternate. They are taking applications until August 31st. Commission interviews and recommendations to the Board of Supervisors will follow, with the Board of Supervisors ultimately deciding which applicants to appoint. A flyer seeking applicants has been distributed and he can be called with questions. He also urged those who have questions regarding Chevron's root cause analysis to contact him as well.

Committee Member Kent also urged CSC members to attend the Thursday, July 27 meeting of the Hazardous Materials Commission, from 4:00-6:00 p.m. It will feature a presentation requested by Maureen Brennan, the Commission's environmental justice representative from Crockett. Liam Cain, a student at Drexel University in Pennsylvania, will present on his senior capstone project which examines air pollution coming from the Benecia refinery and developing a methodology for understanding its cumulative impacts. This could be relevant to the Committee's work on the CERP. The agenda has been provided to Kevin Olp and Lily Wu, and he asked that it be passed on to CSC members. The meeting can be attended either on Zoom or in person in Martinez.

Committee Member White asked Committee Member Kent if he could explain a little more about Chevron's root cause analysis. Kent responded that he isn't the person to interpret that study, but can direct Committee members to the right person to answer any questions.

Committee Member Ruano Hernandez reported on the July 20th meeting of the BAAQMD Community Advisory Council, composed of 14-16 members from Bay Area counties, on which he holds the youth-at-large seat. They discussed the compliance and enforcement update; reviewed the air quality complaint data, program review, system overview and investigation process, which overlaps with the work of the Fuel Refining group; and heard an update from Air Pollution Control Officer Dr. Phil Fine on the Air District Strategic Plan. At their next meeting in October, he will be giving an update which will include what's happening within the Environmental Justice Internal Policy Ad Hoc.

Public Comments

None.

10. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

02:01:58

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Committee.

Public Comment

None.

11. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her activities, and provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

Committee Comment

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro shared that Phil Martien is retiring after 33 years with the Air District, and thanked him for all his work. Martien shared that it has been a pleasure and an honor to work with and see the evolution and progress of the Committee.

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro recognized Committee Member Castañeda's assistance with her presentation to the San Pablo City Council which led to their approval of a resolution to support AB 617 and the work of the CSC. Committee Member Castañeda responded by thanking Co-Chair Angulo-Castro and Committee Members Cantú and Kilbreth for their support on the presentation and crafting the resolution.

Public Comments

None.

12. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Monday, August 28, 2023, at 5:30 p.m., via Zoom Video Conferencing. Agenda TBD

Zoom Log In: TBD

13. ADJOURNMENT

The Committee meeting was adjourned by Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro at 7:40 pm.

MIG Consulting