

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105

DRAFT MINUTES

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community
Steering Committee

May 15, 2023, 5:30 P.M

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chair Alfredo Angulo-Castro called the meeting to order at 5:33 PM.

Present: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y’anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Roberta Feliciano, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Sandra Castañeda (non-voting), Michael Kent (non-voting)

Absent: Suzanne Coffee, Dr. Darlena David, Hakim Johnson (non-voting)

Also Present: Air District Staff, Joshua Abraham, Dan Alrick, Laura Cackette, Alona Davis, Veronica Eady, Samuel Garcia, Wendy Goodfriend, Kate Hoag, David Holstius, Eric Lara, Greg Nudd, Lily MacIver, Kelly Malinowski, Kevin Olp, Suma Peesapati, Marcia Raymond, Diana Ruiz, Raymond Salalila, Karissa White, and Elizabeth Yura; MIG staff, Bridget Brown, Maria Mayer, and Ramona McCabe; Interpreter Norma Herrera; Members of the Public Mona Abboud, Julia Longo, Daoud Ra, Nzuri Stafford, and Vanessa Zamora

2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

00:07:18

Co-Chair Burrell shared that there is an interest in moving meetings from the third to the fourth Monday of the month. The meeting time from 5:30 PM – 8:00 PM would remain. A poll regarding interest in changing to the fourth Monday will be sent to the CSC via email by mid-day on Tuesday, May 16. Committee members who do not receive it should contact the District to let them know.

Public Comments

None.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF APRIL 24, 2023

00:05:43

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the April 24, 2023, Meeting Minutes in a show-of-hands vote.

Committee Action

Co-Chair Angulo-Castro made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Aguirre, to approve the minutes of the April 24, 2023 meeting. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chairs Alfredo Rafael Angulo-Castro and Y'anad Burrell, Nancy Aguirre, Marisol Cantú, Lucia Castello, Roberta Feliciano, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: Sandra Castañeda, Michael Kent

ABSENT: Suzanne Coffee, Dr. Darlena David, Hakim Johnson (non-voting)

Public Comments

None.

4. AD HOC UPDATES

00:13:09

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public received updates on the active Ad Hoc working groups.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Omotoso reported that the Addressing Public Health and Reducing Exposure group has been meeting biweekly, usually on Wednesday evenings, although they will be changing the time and that change will be determined in the next week. They have been focusing on addressing the vulnerabilities of community members. They have developed six main strategies with action items. Most of their writing is done, and they are moving on to the initial review stage with lead implementors and stakeholders. CSC members were welcomed to join the review process as well.

Committee Member Cantú reported that the Fuel Refining, Support Facilities, Storage, and Distribution group is in the initial stages of strategy development. She noted that the refining

sector, represented by Chevron, is the largest polluter in the area, and this group is moving a little more slowly than the other groups. She shared that they would like help with writing strategies, attending meetings, reaching out to external stakeholders, and encouraged CSC members to join the group. They currently meet on Friday at 8 a.m., but they are willing to find a different meeting time.

Committee Member Severy reported that the Vehicles and Trucks, Streets and Freeways, and Logistics and Warehouses group is in the home stretch of completing their draft strategies. BAAQMD Staff Member Alison Kirk has submitted some of the group's draft strategies for review to the City of Richmond and the Contra Costa County Transportation Advisory Committee (TAC). Committee members do not have many opportunities to review the strategies currently, but will soon have an opportunity to review. The group usually meets on Mondays at 1 p.m.

Committee Member Swillinger reported that the Marine and Rail group is almost done with their work. She shared that their six strategies with multiple actions have passed stakeholder review, and they are now fine-tuning these strategies.

Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro reported that the Commercial and Industrial Sources Near Communities group is also almost done. They are finishing up the initial drafting of strategies around large industrial sources and refining them for stakeholder review. He shared that it would be very helpful to have someone who has not been involved to review the strategies.

Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro reported that the group working on cross-cutting Land Use strategies presented their draft strategies to the Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc and are currently refining them based on the feedback received. He shared that this strategy area also only has a single Committee member working on content and encouraged anyone interested in joining to reach out to him.

Committee Member Omotoso reported that the cross-cutting Promoting Urban Greening strategies group is still in its initial stages, but have some draft strategies and actions in place. He shared that one of their group members met with the City of Richmond to influence their strategic planning since the City received a Transformative Climate Communities Grant. Co-Chair Burrell asked if a meeting time has been set for this group. Committee Member Omotoso replied that they hope to set and announce a time by the end of the week.

Committee Member Aguirre reported that the cross-cutting Website strategies group met with the Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc to discuss how to improve the website for the complaint system application. She shared that there is an established Spare the Air app which has a system for reporting complaints, and will be meeting to discuss how to expand the use of the app. They meet on Tuesdays at 3 p.m.

Committee Member Swillinger reported that the cross-cutting Compliance and Enforcement group met for the first time last week and discussed initial strategies. They are projecting to meet on Fridays at noon; she encouraged CSC members to contact her if interested.

Committee Member Severy reported that the cross-cutting Community Engagement strategies group has received feedback from the Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc that they will incorporate in

their draft strategies actions. They are in the process of identifying resources for community engagement and will be sending a survey out to learn about available skills, resources, network connections, and ideas. He asked that respondents complete the survey by Friday, May 26th. The group meets on Wednesdays at 2:00 PM. He encouraged those who are interested in joining to contact him.

Committee Member Kilbreth described that the cross-cutting Legislative strategies group is working with a team in Sacramento to support current legislation and opportunities to strengthen regulation through developing new legislation. This group does not conduct regular meetings, but Committee members were encouraged to contact him if they are interested in working with the legislative group.

Committee Member Kilbreth shared that a new cross-cutting Underreported Dangers strategies group will be formed to improve the quality of data and analysis of pollutant sources that are underreported causing additional community and health risks. Work is currently underway to summarize what has been learned over the last two years, with the intention of considering strategies over the next year to improve the quality of data used to measure both the problem and progress made.

Committee Member Range provided an update on the work of the Governance Ad Hoc. Committee member applications have been disseminated among contacts, personal, and professional networks, and an email blast will also be sent out next week. They are tracking applications and have received one new application. Two local government representatives, Sandra Castañeda and Michael Kent, have been interviewed and approved for Committee membership. They have also reviewed comments received on the draft CSC Charter. She described their next steps, which include establishing a process to review new applications, developing an orientation packet for new CSC members, and increasing member recruitment.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. PRESENTATION: REVISED CHARTER REVIEW

00:28:28

The Committee and the public received a presentation with a review of the revised Path to Clean Air Charter for the new community-led CSC from Committee Member Marisol Cantú and BAAQMD staff member Diana Ruiz.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Kent requested clarification of the statement that CSC members “may submit agenda items within 10 days in advance of a meeting.” Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro and BAAQMD staff clarified that the intention was to indicate that agenda items must be submitted at least 10 days prior to a meeting to be included on that agenda. The charter language will be revised to make this clear.

Committee Member Feliciano asked for clarification about how to fulfill the minimum 8 hours a month requirement for government representatives and if it is a requirement or a recommendation. BAAQMD staff responded that it is a requirement but is not strictly defined. Staff further describe that government representatives are being asked to participate in the Ad Hocs, work groups, and discussions. Staff specified encouraged government representatives to assist in maintaining an open channel of communication with City Council and local City officials as the Committee moves into strategy review, engagement with targeted stakeholders and the public for effective implementation. Committee Member Cantú added that the CSC should have interview Committee Member Feliciano prior to joining so that there was more clarity about the commitment. They will schedule an interview with Committee Member Feliciano, and any other government representatives moving forward, to ensure that the commitment can be fulfilled. Co-Chair Burrell shared her perspective that adding eight hours to a full-time schedule is challenging given the number and frequency of meetings scheduled during weekdays, and suggested that the Committee rethink that requirement. Committee Member Cantú explained further that the requirement does not specifically bind government representatives to participate in 8 hours of meetings. It is intended to be similar to a liaison role where they can assist using their expertise, helping coordinate meetings with City officials, or arranging assistance from the City for implementation needs. The requirement was added in response to a previous lack of participation on the part of some government representatives participating on the Committee. Language will be added to the Charter to clarify what the committee consists of, including examples of how it can be fulfilled.

Public Comments

None.

6. PRESENTATION: SETTING PLAN GOALS TO TRACK PROGRESS

00:53:52

The Committee and the public received a presentation on setting Plan goals to track progress from BAAQMD Staff member Wendy Goodfriend.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Castello asked for the timeframe was for CSC members to offer their feedback on the Plan through a shared brainstorm document. BAAQMD staff clarified that receiving the CSC’s feedback by Tuesday, May 16, or Wednesday, May 17, will enable them to finish the document and staff will send it out as a Google document with instructions and contact information for questions. They request responses within two weeks of receipt.

Committee Member Range asked if CSC members will have the ability to reference the draft strategies to ensure that comments are made at the appropriate level with strategies distinguished from the more overarching goals. BAAQMD staff replied that since many strategies are still being drafted, the hope was to have a high-level brainstorm at this time and make more specific refinements later. Staff encouraged CSC members to let the District know if they needed more information for their comments. Staff shared that if it is not successful, they will wait until there are refined strategies with defined objectives to send them out for review.

Committee Member Kilbreth noted that a simple test for distinguishing a Plan-level goal from a strategy is that an idea for a goal suggests multiple applicable strategies. If an idea only relates to one specific area, it's a strategic-level goal. An example of a Plan-level goal would be improving engagement to create a better informed and more empowered community, covering the website, community engagement, fuel refining, etc.

Committee Member Cantú encouraged that CSC members should take this activity to heart and use it as a way to engage. She noted that it can strongly impact the work of the Ad Hoc work groups as well as the CERP itself. She shared that one of the things that makes the work of the Fuel Refining Ad Hoc more difficult is the lack of an overarching goal to lean into. She shared that there are no other AB 617 communities that have overarching goals established except West Oakland. She shared that this community can set precedents for every other city and community to hold the Air District and the industry responsible and really reduce pollution and shape health policy. Committee Member Omotoso added and expressed that this is an important exercise to contribute to the Plan. He stated that it allows the CSC to have a common theme that unites all the different strategies and communicate the focus of the work to the community and stakeholders. He shared that it is important to have overall goals which everyone can easily understand, then move on to refining the specific details and strategies.

Committee Member Aguirre encouraged Committee members to add their ideas, questions, and what applicable strategies and actions might be. She shared the importance of letting the Committee know what is important to help guide the work, informing understanding of what the community wants and what to fight for. She shared that the Committee can go through it together to integrate it and add detail.

Committee Co-Chair Burrell stated that the Committee members provided great feedback and questions. She reflected that all exercises of the Committee are important, with this brainstorming being pivotal to the work as it moves forward in its third year. She stated that it will help make the best use of the time that all have invested in contributing to the Committee.

Public Comments

None.

7. PTCA CERP CHAPTERS AND APPENDICES OVERVIEW AND CHAPTER REVIEW

01:16:58

The Committee and public received a presentation with an overview and chapter review of the PTCA CERP chapters and appendices by BAAQMD staff member Kelly Malinowski and Committee Member Sandhu. Comments were solicited on how the Committee wishes to review the chapters.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Aguirre asked to clarify whether what is being sought is big picture ideas or wordsmithing, or if it is some of both. BAAQMD staff clarified that a focus on big picture ideas is what is needed at this time, rather than copy editing. Examples of the edits being sought are ideas that need clarification, additional context, or need to be simplified. The District is investigating outside copy editing of the Plan so that the Committee can focus on larger ideas and content.

Committee Member Swillinger asked if it would be possible to create a summary of the strategies that could be presented to the CSC so that it can be clear and easy to understand. BAAQMD staff explained that they regularly maintain and update a spreadsheet of all the strategies with a tab for each writing team. They shared that it could be presented to the CSC. They suggested looking at the 2017 Clean Air Plan as an example and parsing the information so that it is easier to read.

Committee Member Range asked if a high-level summary can be made available to other community members to review. She also noted that reviewing everything at once can be daunting, and if there is flexibility to allow people to review the plan on their own time prior to the deadline. BAAQMD staff responded that they can consider that while they are figuring out the timeline. Staff would like to have an outline with a final format that the CSC can paste strategies into and can provide notice to the group that their portion is available for review. Staff prefaced that it would be necessary to manage the time frames carefully to avoid version control issues since District staff will internally review concurrently. Committee Member Range suggested that it would be helpful for the District to share the timeline prior to review so that members know where to prioritize their review. BAAQMD staff replied they will consider how to make it work.

Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro uplifted Committee Member Castañeda's suggestion in the chat, it would be efficient review chapters in teams. Committee Member Castañeda stated that this was based on the concern that reviewing the entire plan seems overwhelming and that focusing on a few chapters for careful review might be more efficient.

Committee Member Aguirre shared that it's important that BAAQMD staff, Board, and other non-Committee reviewers understand the nature of the comments of the Plan. They need to review the draft for clarity, ensure that legal details are correct, necessary agency requirements are met, and everything is covered, and ensure that the Committee's voice and intention is preserved. She asked whether it was possible for the Committee to review the draft first before it goes to staff. BAAQMD staff noted that there is a more definitive timeline for the review process laid out from now until September, when the Committee wants to begin the public engagement process. This timeline is being finalized, but the District can share the timeline. The plan is to focus on Chapter

7 first before going on to others which may require less detailed review. The goal is for the Committee to review all content first but needs to follow its internal review process. The process will start with the Board reviewing Chapter 7 then it goes to the Community Health and Justice Board Committee. Staff will send sections out for review by targeted stakeholders, external partners, and internal experts as content is being developed. Stakeholder review is to ensure factual correctness, identifying, and clearing up issues. Adjustments will be made when appropriate. The goal is to have a Plan that will be unanimously adopted by the entire adoption team.

Committee Member Aguirre uplifted Committee Member Castello's suggestion to put Chapter 7 forward first. She shared that CSC is asking for a lot from the District, insisting on excellence, and standing for environmental justice and action, so they should expect some pushback. She stated that she knows staff has is supportive of the CSC, but the Plan must be community-facing.

Committee Member Swillinger supported Committee Member Aguirre's comment. She related having a similar experience working on strategies with the Marine and Rail group. She shared that she had a concern about the Committee's voice being altered by stakeholders, so she was curious to learn what kind of feedback they would get from the BAAQMD Staff. She appreciated the process of working with Staff and felt confident of their ability to identify concerns prior to final review.

BAAQMD staff agreed that it is a good idea to prioritize Chapter 7 for review, and thanked Committee members for clarifying that the Staff will review first and ensure it is the Committee's Plan and remain so throughout the entire process to adoption.

Committee Member Range asked if it is a correct assumption that Committee review of Chapter 7 will take place in batches as each topic is completed. She expressed concern about ensuring that the delay on the part of the Fuel Refining group will not hold up the rest of the review. BAAQMD staff indicated that it may be difficult to release the topics individually, because they will be concurrently working on synergizing across the subchapters, but it should be possible to release them in small bunches of two or three.

Public Comments

None.

8. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE UPDATES

01:51:21

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.

Committee Comments

Committee Member Cantú shared that she and Committee Member Kilbreth will be presenting to the Richmond City Council on May 23rd regarding a resolution put on the agenda by Councilmember Jimenez that the City of Richmond make a proclamation that AB 617 is important,

a bold statement that will support environmental justice in the future. Committee Member Kilbreth encouraged Committee members to add the Council meeting to their schedule. They are not certain what time the subject is scheduled for, but he noted that resolutions are usually covered at the beginning of the meeting. The resolution is an effort for the City to be more involved and supportive of the Committee's work and move the process forward by being engaged and participating in important decisions.

Committee Member Castañeda suggested to Committee Member Cantú that they discuss getting a similar proclamation made in the City of San Pablo.

Committee Member Aguirre called out the effectiveness and eloquence with which Co-Chair Angulo-Castro spoke at the big oil resistance event last Friday, May 12.

Committee Member Kilbreth shared an item that he had hoped to add to the agenda, but was not able to put forward in time. He relayed that Assemblyperson Wicks attempted to pass a bill tripling fines on refineries for violations last year. This year she is putting the bill forward in a version that simply asks to triple all existing fines on refineries that violate existing air quality rules. The bill will go to the state assembly floor in two or three weeks, and if it passes will go on to the senate and then to the Governor for signature. They are currently taking letters of support from the community, which will become part of the package that all Assembly members will review before voting. He expressed that the Committee has an important role in supporting the bill, and that it will help increase visibility for the CSC as the first AB 617 committee that represents an oil refinery town, serving as a model for others. He has drafted a letter, which he proposed sending as from the CSC. If there isn't majority agreement, it could still be signed by CSC members as individuals. He expressed that the letter is time sensitive and should be sent within the next few days. Committee Member Swillinger expressed her appreciation of the letter and willingness to sign, suggesting that it be reviewed and voted on by the Committee tonight. Committee Co-Chair Burrell expressed concern that the diverse range of Committee members have time to review the letter and consider the potential individual impacts of signing. Committee Member Aguirre added her concern that some will be left out of the process since the document is not translated, and that Committee members may need additional background. BAAQMD staff noted that there is no issue with sharing the letter, but that it would not be appropriate to take an action that is not on the agenda and is unplanned, without allowing time for review. Committee Member Kilbreth suggested that he email the letter out to all Committee members and that they can reply to let him know if they agree to sign, and can be identified as members of the Richmond-San Pablo CSC. Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro agreed, suggesting that he add necessary context in the email. Committee Member Castello further recommended that he set a time deadline for responding, and added that she has read the letter and would sign it. Committee Member Kilbreth agreed to send the letter out first thing on Tuesday, May 16th, asking for responses by Thursday, May 18th so the letter can be sent on Friday the 19th. Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro noted that it will be best to do this kind of action through the agenda in future if possible, as such a letter will be more impactful if signed by the entire Committee. BAAQMD staff asked that Committee Member Kilbreth touch base with them prior to sending the letter to ensure everything is correct.

Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro announced that Communities for a Better Environment will be hosting a combined Toxic and Resilience Tour Friday, May 19th and Saturday, May 20. They will be touring multiple sites in Richmond and East Oakland to learn about toxics, climate resilience and community-based solutions. Lunch and transportation will be provided. He encouraged CSC members to contact him at alfredo@cbecal.org or their Youth Organizer Keala at Keala@cbecal.org if interested.

Public Comments

None.

9. PUBLIC COMMENTS ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Committee.

Public Comment

None.

10. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her activities, and provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

Committee Comments

None.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Monday, June 26, 2023, at 5:30 p.m., both in-person at a location to be determined and via Zoom Video Conferencing

Zoom Log In: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/84577542023>

12. ADJOURNMENT

The Committee meeting was adjourned by Committee Co-Chair Angulo-Castro at 7:55 pm.

MIG Consulting