

RICHMOND - NORTH
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

**Community Emission Reduction Plan (CERP)
Community Steering Committee Meeting #32**

February 26, 2024

Welcome

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair

RICHMOND - NORTH
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**
CLEAN AIR

Agenda

TIME	TOPIC
5:30 PM	Welcome, Meeting Logistics, Agenda
5:45 PM	Meeting Minutes from December 4 th , 2023, CSC Meeting
5:55 PM	Rule 6-5 Agreements
6:20 PM	Governance Ad Hoc
6:25 PM	Community Engagement and Outreach Standing Committee
6:30 PM	Fuel Refining Ad Hoc Request for CSC Letter
6:45 PM	Review Revised PTCA CSC Charter + Vote
7:15 PM	Report Out on Public Comment
7:45 PM	Recommended Changes to Draft PTCA Plan + Vote
7:55 PM	Next Steps and Meeting Close <ul style="list-style-type: none">● Next CSC Meeting <input type="checkbox"/> March 25th, 2024

Path To Clean Air Meeting Format






Member expectations:

- Be respectful and open to other points of view
- Review all materials prior to the meeting
- Use the raise hand feature in zoom
- Speak only when Co-Chairs and/or facilitator calls on you during discussions and public comment

Meeting procedures:

- Begin each meeting by taking roll call to establish a quorum
- Ask for public comment before taking any action
- Any member can make a motion which then has to be seconded by another member
- Co-chairs adjourn

Where are We Today?

Phase		Work Product		2023							2024		
		Q1	Q2	Jul	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	Q1	Q2		
 SCOPE AND ORGANIZE PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY	Steering Committee (CSC)	»»»											
	Plan Process												
	Vision and Principles												
	Plan Boundary												
 ASSESS THE CHALLENGES	Community Description												
	Technical Assessment												
 PLAN OUR SOLUTIONS	Key Issues												
	Strategies								☑				
	Goals & Target		🚩			☑							
 COMMUNITY OUTREACH	Community Education						🚩		☑				
	Community Engagement						🚩		☑				
	Community Feedback									🚩	☑		
 PLAN REVIEW & ADOPT	Draft Plan Complete								☑				
	Draft Plan Translated									☑			
	Plan Adoption - CSC											☑	
	Plan Adoption - BAAQMD												☑
	Plan Adoption - CARB												

 INTRODUCTION TO THE STEERING COMMITTEE
  DECISION MADE

Approval of December 4, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Alfredo Angulo, CSC Co-Chair



Public Comment

Alfredo Angulo, CSC Co-Chair



Governance Ad Hoc Updates

Jessica Range, CSC Member



Governance Ad Hoc Updates

Completed Tasks:

- On December 7, 2023, Air District staff sent a survey to all CSC members to review recommended changes to the Charter
- Gov Ad Hoc reviewed survey comments on suggested changes to the Charter
- Gov Ad Hoc incorporated most comments into revised Charter language
- Governance Ad Hoc conferred with all commenters and sought agreement on proposed revisions
- On February 09, 2024, the Gov Ad Hoc sent CSC members the revised Charter

Next steps:

- Once Charter is approved, leadership nomination process will begin

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair



Public Comment

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair



Community Engagement and Outreach Standing Committee

Dave Severy, CSC Member

RICHMOND - NORTH
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**
CLEAN AIR

Standing Committee Updates

Update on Committee Meetings

- 12/18/2023: Contra Costa County Equity Committee (Marisol Cantú, Dr. Omotoso and Air District staff)
- 12/19/2023: Richmond City Council (Marisol Cantú, BK White and Air District staff)
- 01/08/2024: Richmond Neighborhood Coordinating Council (Suzanne Coffee)
- 01/16/2024: City of San Pablo 01/16/2024 (Sandra Castañeda, Dave Severy, Air District staff)
- 01/22/2024: USW Local 5 Executive Board (Dave Severy, Air District staff)

Standing Committee Updates (Cont.)

Upcoming Meetings

- 02/15/2024: Communities for a Better Environment (Nancy Aguirre)
- 03/05/2024: North Richmond Municipal Advisory Council (Dave Severy, Suzanne Coffee, Dr Omotoso)

Outreach List Update

- Last call to update the [tracking sheet](#) to capture: who you plan on talking to you, meeting secured, dates, and outcomes of meeting/conversation. List to be finalized to be referenced in Appendix H: Outreach & Community Engagement of the PTCA Plan.

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Alfredo Angulo, CSC Co-Chair



Public Comment

Alfredo Angulo, CSC Co-Chair



Fuel Refining Ad Hoc: CSC Letter in Response to Chevron's Comments (Action Item)

Marisol Cantú



Request for Action

Recommend the CSC directs the Fuel Refining Ad Hoc send a letter to Chevron in response to submitted public comments

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair



Public Comment

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair



Vote on Response to Comment Letter

Action Item

- The CSC will vote to direct the Fuel Refining Ad Hoc send a letter to Chevron in response to submitted public comments.

Review and Approve Revised PTCA Charter (Action Item)

Jessica Range, CSC Member



Sections of Revised Path to Clean Air Charter Provided by CSC Members

1. Steering Committee Activities
2. Steering Committee Objectives
3. Membership
4. **CSC Leadership**
5. **CSC Membership Roles and Responsibilities**
6. **Participation Principles**
7. Standard Steering Committee Meeting Procedures
8. Amendments
9. Accessibility
10. Accommodation
11. Dissemination of Materials
12. Website
13. Compensation

Overview of Roles and Responsibilities

- CSC Leadership: Charter revisions moves away from Co-Chairs to having three Leads
- Committee and Ad Hoc Members: Charter revisions formalize the role of ad hoc and committee members as “facilitators” with specific duties

CSC Comments from Review of Revised PTCA Charter

Summary of Survey Response:

- Nomination process
- Hours commitment for Leads, Facilitators, and CSC members
- Expectations for a lead to respond to a CSC member email
- More specificity and transparency regarding committees and ad hocs
- Clarification on the expectations for industry representatives
- Other changes that fell outside the scope of these Charter revisions and the Governance Ad Hoc proposes to be addressed in a future charter update

CSC Leadership

Section 4.3 Election of Leadership

Additional detail was added to address when there are fewer than three lead nominations

Revised language:

If there are fewer than three CSC Lead nominees, a Governance Ad hoc will **reassess the leadership structure and present solutions to be voted on by CSC members.** The nominees must be confirmed by a majority vote of the CSC.

Section 4.4 Meeting Participation and Facilitation

Language edited to better reflect the volunteer nature of this role

Revised language:

Leads will create a **process for regularly assessing participation** and accountability **and providing** feedback to Leads, Facilitators, and CSC members

CSC Leadership (Cont.)

Section 4.4.2(b) CSC Membership Engagement

Increased the turnaround time for email correspondence from 48 to 72 hours

Revised language:

Respond to CSC members **within 72 hours** with an email that provides **specific follow-up actions**

4.4.3 Other Leadership Duties

The original Charter did not specify hours, revised to include hours

Revised language:

Leads are expected to commit to **8-10 additional hours of service per month**. This will be reevaluated as needed

CSC Leadership (Cont.)

4.4.3 (b)

Formalized the Charter review and amendment process

Revised Language:

b. Lead charter development and amendments through an annual or bi-annual review process.

Roles and Responsibilities

Section 5.2 Committee and Ad Hoc Facilitators

Clarifies the expectations of committee members and ad hoc facilitators

Revised language:

...[committee and ad hoc facilitators] will present a plan of action to the Leads and Air District staff that identifies the purpose, goals, and key strategies of their committee or ad hoc. This plan will then be discussed and voted on by the CSC. Facilitators will collaborate with the Leads and Air District staff to resolve issues and assess progress toward CERP implementation. Specific duties include co-developing committee or ad hoc agendas, facilitating meetings, making regular progress reports to leads, recruiting members and creating pathways for them to move the work of the CSC. Facilitators are expected to commit to 4-6 hours of service per month.

Roles and Responsibilities (Cont.)

Section 5.4 Industry Representative Members

Clarifies the role and expectations of industry representatives

Revised language:

The CSC will actively seek two non-voting members who represent local businesses, local trade unions and/or industrial companies in Richmond, San Pablo, and North Richmond. At monthly CSC, subcommittee, and ad hoc meetings, these members are expected to present **relevant public-facing** information on **their respective** industry plans, policies, and programs that could impact the CERP implementation. As industry liaisons, they are expected to serve on at least one committee, ad hoc, or potential working group annually to ensure the success of the plan.

Participation Principles

Section 6.3(a) Play an active role by:

No mention of hours of service from CSC members

Revised language:

a. Serving at least 3-5 compensated hours per month

Members Who Informed the Revisions of the Charter

Thank you to the following CSC members who participated in the Charter revision process by providing sharp comments and insights:

- Y'Anad Burrell
- Lucia Castello
- Suzanne Coffee
- Jeff Kilbreth
- Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Alfredo Angulo, CSC Co-Chair



Public Comment

Alfredo Angulo, CSC Co-Chair



Vote to Approve Path to Clean Air Charter

Action Item

- The CSC will vote to approve the revised Path to Clean Air Charter.

Report Out on Public Comment

Wendy Goodfriend, BAAQMD



Public Comment Background

- The public comment period opened on December 13, 2023 and concluded on January 19, 2024
- The comment period was announced via the project website, Air District E-blasts, social media posts, and at the public workshop
- CSC members promoted the public comment period through their networks and during presentations at various public meetings and venues
- Public comments were submitted in writing via email (no snail mail received)

Overview of Commenters

- A total of 48 public comments were received, covering 223 specific topics
- The commenters included:
 - 38 individuals
 - Six physicians/nurses
 - Two community-based organizations (Communities for a Better Environment and Sunflower Alliance)
 - One industry (Chevron)
 - One local jurisdiction (City of Richmond City Council)

Process to Summarize and Respond

- Each comment was reviewed by an Air District staff member who worked with Problems to Solutions Ad Hoc strategy writing teams and/or Ad Hoc committees (Technical Assistance and Community Description)
- A brief response was developed for each comment
- Comments were grouped into four themes:
 - Strategies and Actions
 - Implementation
 - Health and Education
 - Technical Basis

Example Comment and Response

- Example **Fuel Refining and Flaring** comments:
 - Expressed appreciation for updating flaring regulations.
 - Requested more definitive goals and action timelines.
 - Asked for stronger flaring incident response strategies and accountability.
- Example **Fuel Refining and Flaring** response
 - Please see Fuel Refining strategy 2, the objective is to reduce flaring events to the lowest levels possible (in terms of frequency and emissions), including during emergencies/upset, via more consistent and competent operations, with an ultimate goal of zero routine or planned flaring.

Example Comment and Response (cont.)

- Example **Health & Education** comments:
 - There is a need to educate the community about air pollution and its health impacts on the body.
 - Many personal accounts of health issues from living in the study area (i.e., childhood and adult asthma, respiratory issues, etc..)
- Example **Health & Education** response:
 - Please see Health strategy 2.1 which includes increasing access to home retrofit programs, Health strategy 2.2 which includes supporting transition to electric appliances and Health strategy 2.3 which calls for improving rental standards to include indoor air filtration.

Public Comment and Response Materials

Materials shared with the CSC and made available on the Air District website in advance of today's meeting include:

- A summary of comments and responses by theme
- A list of all commenters (name/affiliation)
- A spreadsheet of each comment with a brief response
- A compilation of all comment received (with individual commenter's email, address, phone numbers redacted)

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair



Public Comment

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair



Recommended Changes to Draft PTCA Plan (Action Item)

Wendy Goodfriend, BAAQMD



Presentation Outline

- Recommended changes to the Draft PTCA Plan
- Completion and approval of Draft Final PTCA Plan
- Critical questions to discuss
 - What is the significance of the CSC vote to approve?
 - What is the role of the CSC after the vote to approve?
- Steering Committee Questions and Discussion
- Public Comment
- **Action:** Direct Air District staff to make non-substantive changes to the Draft PTCA Plan

Recommended Changes to Draft PTCA Plan

- Per the “Path to Clean Air Strategy Review Process Guidance” a **substantive change** is defined as:
 - *Significant modifications that change the meaning, intent, or direction of a strategy or action; identifies new action implementation leads; modifies the timeline for implementation or impact; adds new findings or factual information.*
- All recommended changes to the draft plan are **non-substantive**
- These **non-substantive** changes have come from:
 - Public comments
 - Air District staff further review
 - Implementation partner input

Recommended Changes to Draft PTCA Plan (cont.)

Examples of recommended non-substantive changes:

- Correct grammar, typos, formatting
- Add a permitted stationary sources map to Chapter 5
- Adhere to USW Local 5 request
 - Revise the following text in Fuel Refining Action 3.3: *union health and safety representatives and operators*
- Correct the corporate entity name of New NGC: *Gold Bond Building Products*
- Acknowledge CARB authored Chapter 7: Key Issues and Strategies

Completion and Approval of Draft Final PTCA Plan

- As directed by the CSC, Air District staff will make non-substantive changes to the Draft PTCA Plan
- The updated plan - referred to as the **Draft Final PTCA Plan** - will be posted to the PTCA webpages no later than March 19th
- The March 25th CSC meeting will include an **action item to approve** the Draft Final PTCA Plan, including:
 - Brief staff presentation and review of the process to develop the plan
 - CSC members can share their reflections
 - The public will be able to make comments
 - The CSC will discuss and vote on approval of the Draft Final PTCA Plan

What is the Significance of the CSC Vote to Approve?

- Confirms approval to move the Draft Final PTCA Plan to the Air District's Community Health and Justice (CEHJ) Committee for consideration
 - CEHJ will hold a public meeting to consider recommending adoption of the Draft Final PTCA Plan to the Air District Board of Directors (planning for April in the PTCA area, day and time TBC)
- The Board of Directors will then hold a public hearing to consider adoption of the Draft Final PTCA Plan, which will then be Final PTCA Plan (planning for May, day and time TBC)
- Once adopted by the Board of Directors, the Air District will transmit the Final PTCA Plan to CARB for consideration

What is the Role of the CSC After the Vote to Approve?

- Continue to engage with one another and actively participate in core CSC functions, roles and responsibilities
- Promote the CEHJ and Board of Directors meetings through your networks and to your community
- Attend the CEHJ and Board of Directors meetings and provide spoken and/or written public comment
- Volunteer to be one of two or three CSC spokespersons to present with Air District staff at the CEHJ and Board of Directors meetings

Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Alfredo Angulo, CSC Co-Chair



Public Comment

Alfredo Angulo, CSC Co-Chair



Request for Action

Recommend the CSC votes to direct Air District staff to make non-substantive changes to the Draft PTCA Plan including but not limited to:

- Correct grammar, typos, formatting
- Add a permitted stationary sources map to Chapter 5
- Revise the following text in Fuel Refining Action 3.3: *union health and safety representatives and operators*
- Correct the corporate entity name of New NGC: *Gold Bond Building Products*
- Acknowledge CARB authored Chapter 7: Key Issues and Strategies

Vote on Recommended Changes to Draft PTCA Plan

Action Item

- Recommend the CSC votes to direct Air District staff to make non-substantive changes to the Draft PTCA Plan.

Standing Environmental Justice Updates

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair

RICHMOND - NORTH
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**
CLEAN AIR

Next Meeting Details

- March 25, 2024, from 5:30PM-8:00PM
 - Agenda TBD

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters

Y'Anad Burrell, CSC Co-Chair

