

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

**Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP)  
Community Steering Committee Meeting #37**

September 23, 2024

# Welcome

**Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead**

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**  
**CLEAN AIR**

# Agenda

TIME	TOPIC
5:30 PM	Welcome, Meeting Logistics, Agenda
5:35 PM	Approval of Meeting Minutes from August 26, 2024 (Action Item)
5:40 PM	CSC Leads Ongoing Updates
5:45 PM	Recap on Part One of Prioritization Exercise
5:55 pm	Overview of CSC Lead/Implementer Actions
6:05 PM	Guided Discussion Activity Overview
6:10 PM	CSC Discussion for CSC Lead Actions with Selection of Top Action
6:35 PM	Break
6:45 PM	Overview of Not Yet Started (i.e., specific start dates in 2024 or 2025) Actions
6:55 PM	Guided Discussion Activity Overview
7:00 PM	CSC Discussion for Not Yet Started (i.e., specific start dates in 2024 or 2025) Actions with Selection of Top Action
7:25 PM	Next Steps/Meeting Details
7:30 PM	Public Comment on Non-Agenda Item Matters and Meeting Close Out

# Tips for Participants for a Successful Hybrid Meeting

- **Raise your hand** to speak, physically or virtually.
- **Say your name before speaking** so that virtual participants know who is speaking.
- **Speak one at a time** – overlapping conversations are difficult for online participants to hear.
- **Mute microphone** unless speaking to minimize background noise.
- **Avoid side conversations** or other background noise.
- **Share video** if you are joining virtually so we can stay visually connected.
- **Technology happens** – please be flexible and patient.
- **Use the zoom chat or raised hand function** if unable to hear participants.

# Path To Clean Air Meeting Agreements

## Member expectations:

- **One mic, one voice:** If in person, raise your hand to speak. If on Zoom, use Raised Hand function under Reactions at the bottom of your screen.
- Be respectful and open to other points of view.
- Review all materials prior to the meeting.
- Take care of yourself (Stretch, drink water and breathe).
- ‘Popcorning’ or passing the mic method will be used to encourage participation amongst quieter CSC members.

## Meeting procedures:

- Begin each meeting by taking roll call to establish a quorum.
- Ask for public comment before taking any action.
- Any member can make a motion which then has to be seconded by another member.
- Co-Leads adjourn.

# Meeting Goals

<b>Goal 1</b>	Approve August 26, 2024 Meeting Minutes.
<b>Goal 2</b>	CSC members will receive a recap of Part One Prioritization Exercise.
<b>Goal 3</b>	CSC members will receive a presentation on the “Overview of CSC Lead/Implementer Actions” and “Overview of Not Yet Started (i.e., specific start dates in 2024 or 2025) Actions”.
<b>Goal 4</b>	CSC members will convene in a guided discussion and select the top action out of the 8 CSC Lead Implementer/Initiator actions.
<b>Goal 5</b>	CSC members will convene in a guided discussion and select the top action out of the 8 Not Yet Started (i.e., specific start dates in 2024 or 2025) actions.

# Where are We Today?

		2024									
Phase	Work Product	Mar	April	May	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec
 <b>SCOPE AND ORGANIZE</b> PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY	Steering Committee (CSC)										
	Leadership Committee										
	Subcommittees (Ad Hoc or Standing)										
 <b>COMMUNITY OUTREACH</b>	Community Education										
	Community Outreach										
	Community Engagement										
 <b>PLAN</b> REVIEW & ADOPT	Plan Adoption - CSC	☑									
	Plan Adoption - BAAQMD			☑							
	Plan Adoption - CARB						?				
	Translate Final Plan					☑					
 <b>IMPLEMENT</b> SHARED COMMITMENT TO ACTION	Pre-Implementation										
	Implementation Plan								☑		
	Implementation Activities										
	Annual Progress Report								☑		

☑ Major Milestone

# Approval of August 26, 2024 Meeting Minutes

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead



# Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead



# Public Comment

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead



# CSC Leads Ongoing Updates

Marisol Cantú, CSC Co-Lead



# Ongoing Updates from Leads

- Attendance Policy
  - Defining Unexcused or Excused Absences and will vote in October
- CSC Member Recruitment Plan
  - Volunteers to join Co-Leads to review applications, interview questions, share fliers, and begin recruitment
- One-to-One Meetings with Leads
  - Each Co-Lead will reach out to 5 CSC members to schedule 30-minute one-on-one chats to strengthen our relationships
- Thank you Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez



# Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead



# Public Comment

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead



# Recap on Part One of Prioritization Exercise

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY

PATH TO  
CLEAN AIR



# Recap of Part One Prioritization Exercise (Top 10)

## Started (In Progress) Actions

- On August 26th, the CSC prioritized the following top 10 “Started” actions for Year 1 of the Implementation Plan:
  - **C&I 4.5:** Metal Recycling (Sims, Pick ‘n Pull): Source Evaluation and Metals White Paper
  - **FR 5.1:** Implement Rule 6-5 Settlement Agreement
  - **FR 2.1:** BAAQMD + CSC work w/ City of Richmond to strengthen the ISO

# Recap of Part One Prioritization Exercise (Top 10 Cont.)

## Started (In Progress) Actions

- **FR 3.5:** BAAQMD expedite the Notice of Violations resolutions process in the fuel refining sector
- **C&I 4.4:** West Contra Costa County Landfill: Implement Rule 11-18 and Conduct Gap Analysis
- **FR 2.2:** BAAQMD coordinate with CSC to improve and expand communications about all flaring events and also for major incidents at both fuel-refining and non-fuel refining sources

# Recap of Part One Prioritization Exercise (Top 10 Cont.)

## Started (In Progress) Actions

- **C&I 1.1:** Dust White Paper (Identify Best Management Practices, evaluate Rule Development opportunities, and implement recommendations)
- **R 1.2:** Co-develop and implement an annual implementation plan
- **FR 4.1:** Amend Rule 11-18 to improve stringency, efficiency, transparency, and public engagement
- **H 2.5(A):** Reduce exposure to wood burning: Evaluate rule development opportunities. Initiate by the end of 2024.

# Recap of Part One Prioritization Exercise

## Additional actions to be included in Year One Implementation Plan

- **Started (In Progress)**
  - Remaining 12 “Started” actions that are already in motion (i.e., in progress)
- **Ongoing**
  - 15 actions that represent re-occurring work of the Air District and/or CARB
- **Reporting**
  - 13 actions that include requirements to provide periodic reporting (i.e., quarterly reports, annual report and status updates)

# Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead



# Public Comment

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead



# Overview of CSC Lead/Implementer Actions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# CSC Lead Implementer / Initiator

## 2 Actions: from Fuel Refining Strategy 1 (Move Towards a Just Transition)

<u>FR 1.1</u>	Educate the CSC and Air District on how Just Transition would apply to the Zero Emission Future and a managed phase-down of fossil fuels in the PTCA area. The CSC will establish a Just Transition Subcommittee (JTS) as part of PTCA Implementation by Q2 2024.
<u>FR 1.2</u>	Incorporate Just Transition Principles and Criteria in the prioritization and implementation of the PTCA Plan and explore incorporating these in governmental policy making and rulemaking.

# CSC Lead Implementer / Initiator (Cont.)

## 1 Action: from Health Strategy 3 (Promote Healthy Food Access)

### H 3.2

Ask Employment & Human Services Department (EHSD) to study the current state of CalFresh - California state's Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP) - enrollment within the CERP Community, and identify solutions to current barriers to enrollment.

# CSC Lead Implementer / Initiator (Cont.)

## 2 Actions: from Mobile Strategy 6 (Public Transit, Bike, and Pedestrian Infrastructure)

<u>Mobile 6.2</u>	Bike and Scooter Share Stations  Advocate for affordable bike and scooter-share stations and systems in the most impacted communities within the PTCA area to enhance access to essential services and opportunities.
<u>Mobile 6.4</u>	Funding Transit Operations. Advocate for additional state funding for public transit operations.

# CSC Lead Implementer / Initiator (Cont.)

## 2 Actions: from Resource PTCA Implementation Strategy 1

<u>R 1.3</u>	<p>The CSC will engage with Air District staff and the Board of Directors on the annual budget planning process, and any mid-year budget adjustment process, to ensure the voices of the PTCA CSC and community are heard. This will include recommendations to address ongoing resource needs to fully implement the PTCA Plan, new or evolving issues in the PTCA area, and as appropriate, overall support needs for the AB 617 program.</p>
<u>R 1.4</u>	<p>The CSC will engage with Air District staff and the Board of Directors on the development and implementation of the agency's Strategic Plan. The CSC will share PTCA implementation and PTCA community priorities and views to help inform the goals and objectives of the Strategic Plan, which is one of the agency's core planning documents that will direct how future resource commitments are prioritized and allocated.</p>

# CSC Lead Implementer / Initiator (Cont.)

## 1 Action: from Urban Greening Strategy 1

### U.G 1.2

#### Education and Funding Opportunities

CSC, supported by Air District staff, educates elected officials around the permanent funding and use of green infrastructure in reducing health disparities and improving bike/ped infrastructure throughout the PTCA area.

Create partnerships between local nurseries and the public to incentivize tree plantings.

Provide community education on the benefits of planting trees and vegetation.

Seek grants and programs that support tree plantings.

# Guided Discussion Activity Overview

Nina Garde, BAAQMD



# Guided Discussion Activity Overview

- **Goal for Breakout Activity**
  - Build consensus in your groups on the top CSC Lead Implementer/Initiator action.
  - Participate and actively listen to one another, share ideas, ask questions.
- **Instructions**
  - Split into 2 groups: 1 in person and 1 virtual
  - Review each action and subactions answering the guided discussion questions.
  - Once all 8 are reviewed, CSC members will align on the top action within their group.
  - Each group will share their top action.
    - If each group's action is different, all voting and non-voting CSC members will select (raised hands) which action should be implemented in year 1.

# CSC Discussion for CSC Lead Actions with Selection of Top Action

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

# CSC Lead Implementer/Initiator Guided Questions (25 min)

- **Guided Discussion Questions:**

- Which of the eight actions do you believe will have the greatest impact, and why?
- What type of impact would the action have? (Public health, decrease emissions, reduce exposure, increase community knowledge, empower the community, etc.)
- Which action(s) would you like to help implement through a subcommittee for implementation?

- **Once all 8 actions are reviewed, seek alignment on the top action:**

- Based on our discussion, which action should we implement in year 1?

# Break (10 minutes)

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

# Overview of Not Yet Started (i.e., specific start dates in 2024 or 2025) Actions

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Actions Not Yet Started that have a Specific Start Date in 2024 or 2025

## 1 Action: from C&I Strategy 3 (Reduce Exposure from Food Preparation)

C&I 3.1

Restaurants White Paper

Develop a Restaurants white paper that will consider any need for a PTCA inventory refinement (e.g., for emissions from charbroilers, cooking beef or other meats etc., evaluations of volumes cooked; impacts from wood-burning cooking), any unintended consequences from regulation (e.g., impacts on small businesses) and how best to engage with restaurants (especially small businesses).

Initiate by the end of 2024.



# Actions Not Yet Started that have a Specific Start Date in 2024 or 2025 (Cont.)

## 1 Action: from C&I Strategy 5 (Smaller Commercial and Industrial Sources)

<u>C&amp;I 5.2</u>	Conduct source evaluation for Autobody shops and produce White Paper. Initiate by end of 2024 and align with West Oakland strategy #71, focused on autobody and other coating operations.
--------------------	---

## 1 Action: from Fuel Refining Strategy 2 (Reduce Persistent Flaring and Improve Incident Response)

<u>FR 2.6</u>	Air District will initiate a rule development effort, further evaluating potential updates to flaring rules (Rule 12-11: Flare Monitoring at Refineries and Rule 12-12: Flares at Refineries), by the end of 2024. Rule development efforts will aim to incorporate health impacts analyses, enhance rule enforceability, and establish new and/or more stringent limits. Health and Safety Code requirements will be satisfied as well.
---------------	--

# Actions Not Yet Started that have a Specific Start Date in 2024 or 2025 (Cont.)

## 2 Actions: from Fuel Refining Strategy 3 (Hold Polluters Accountable)

<u>FR 3.8</u>	Air District will collaboratively develop, with the CSC, and pilot legal enforcement approaches for fuel refining facilities within one year of final approval of the PTCA Plan. Then this will be expanded to cover all PTCA sources.
<u>FR 3.9</u>	First, Air District will partner with the CSC to develop, within 1 year of PTCA Plan adoption, a Community Benefits Policy (CBP) that invests up to 100% of penalty monies from the fuel refining sector back into the PTCA area. Then, Air District will partner with the CSC to expand the Fuel Refining Community Benefits Policy (CBP) to cover the full PTCA area.



# Actions Not Yet Started that have a Specific Start Date in 2024 or 2025 (Cont.)

## 2 Actions: from Fuel Refining Strategy 5 (Reduce Exposure and Public Health Impacts from Toxics)

<u>FR 5.3</u>	Develop and implement health-based rules for PM, upon finalizing a methodology to account for health risk from PM. Evaluate with respect to fuel refining sources, non-fuel refining sources, and other significant sources. Initiate by the end of 2025.
<u>FR 5.5</u>	Initiate rule development for NOx emissions from combustion sources at petroleum refineries by the end of 2024.

# Actions Not Yet Started that have a Specific Start Date in 2024 or 2025 (Cont.)

## 1 Action: from Marine and Rail Strategy 4 (Reduce Cancer and Chronic Health Risk from Cargo Handling Equipment)

<p><u>M&amp;R 4.1</u></p>	<p>Regulate Emissions Reductions from Cargo Handling Equipment</p> <p><i>CARB:</i> Regulate Emissions Reductions via proposal and adoption of Amendments to CARB’s Mobile Cargo Handling Equipment Regulation, by 2025.</p> <p><i>Air District and/or CSC:</i> Participate in process for developing the regulation, to help ensure PTCA community needs are incorporated; Review amendments throughout development process and comment as needed; Air District staff, with the help of CSC members, review and comment on any other reports, as needed.</p>
---------------------------	--



# Guided Discussion Activity Overview

Nina Garde, BAAQMD



# Guided Discussion Activity Overview

- **Goal for Breakout Activity**

- Build consensus in your groups on the top action for the Not Yet Started (i.e., specific start dates in 2024 or 2025) actions.
- Participate and actively listen to one another, share ideas, ask questions.

- **Instructions**

- Split into 2 groups: 1 in person and 1 virtual
- Review each action and subactions answering the guided discussion questions.
- Once all 8 are reviewed, CSC members will align on the top action within their group.
- Each group will share their top action.
  - If each group's action is different, all voting and non-voting CSC members will select (raised hands) which action should be implemented for year 1.

# CSC Discussion for Not Yet Started Actions with Selection of Top Action

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Not Yet Started (i.e., specific start dates in 2024 or 2025) Actions Guided Questions (25 min)

- **Guided Discussion Questions:**
  - Which of the eight actions do you believe will have the greatest impact, and why?
  - What type of impact would the action have? (Public health, decrease emissions, reduce exposure, increase community knowledge, empower the community, etc.)
  - Which action(s) would you like to help implement through a subcommittee for implementation?
- **Once all 8 actions are reviewed, seek alignment on the top action:**
  - Using the Spectrum of Public Participation, which is the one action that we want to be empowered to implement? Why?
  - For all other 7 actions, align on how we want to participate using the spectrum.
  - Choose Inform, Consult, Involve.

# IAP2 Spectrum of Public Participation

IAP2's Spectrum of Public Participation was designed to assist with the selection of the level of participation that defines the public's role in any public participation process. The Spectrum is used internationally, and it is found in public participation plans around the world.

INCREASING IMPACT ON THE DECISION

	<b>INFORM</b>	<b>CONSULT</b>	<b>INVOLVE</b>	<b>COLLABORATE</b>	<b>EMPOWER</b>
<b>PUBLIC PARTICIPATION GOAL</b>	To provide the public with balanced and objective information to assist them in understanding the problem, alternatives, opportunities and/or solutions.	To obtain public feedback on analysis, alternatives and/or decisions.	To work directly with the public throughout the process to ensure that public concerns and aspirations are consistently understood and considered.	To partner with the public in each aspect of the decision including the development of alternatives and the identification of the preferred solution.	To place final decision making in the hands of the public.
<b>PROMISE TO THE PUBLIC</b>	We will keep you informed.	We will keep you informed, listen to and acknowledge concerns and aspirations, and provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision.	We will work with you to ensure that your concerns and aspirations are directly reflected in the alternatives developed and provide feedback on how public input influenced the decision.	We will look to you for advice and innovation in formulating solutions and incorporate your advice and recommendations into the decisions to the maximum extent possible.	We will implement what you decide.

© IAP2 International Federation 2018. All rights reserved. 20181112\_v1

Spectrum of public participation (IAP2, 2019): [https://www.cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/pillars/Spectrum\\_8.5x11\\_Print.pdf](https://www.cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/pillars/Spectrum_8.5x11_Print.pdf)

# Next Meeting Details

- **Monday, October 28th, 2024**
  - Time: 5:30 - 7:30 PM
  - On-site Location: Richmond HQE
    - 4114 Lakeside Dr., Richmond CA 94806
  - Online: Zoom (link provided in the coming weeks)

# Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters

Nancy Aguirre, CSC Co-Lead

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**  
**CLEAN AIR**