

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105

## **DRAFT MINUTES**

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee

October 28, 2024, 5:30 P.M

### **1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chair Nancy Aguirre called the meeting to order at 5:31 pm.

Present: Co-Chair Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Co-Chair Nancy Aguirre, Co-Chair Marisol Cantó, Y'anad Burrell, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Franklin Ungo, BK White (non-voting), Sandra Castandea (non-voting),

Absent: Luna Angulo-Castro, Hakim Johnson (non-voting)

Also Present: Air District Staff, Allison Kirk, Brian Moore, Dan Alrick, Diana Ruiz, Grace Leung, Laura Cackette, Karissa White, Nervana Fadle, Nina Garde, Robert Cabe, Roman Berenshteyn, Samuel Garcia, Suma Peesapati, Viet Tran; Christopher Lovette; MIG staff, Joey Nielsen, Ramona McCabe; Interpreter Marina

### **2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE**

#### Public Comments

None.

### **3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF June 24, 2024**

00:07:40

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the September 23, 2024, Meeting Minutes with a roll-call vote.

#### Committee Comments

None

Staff Comments

None

Committee Action

Co-Chair Dr. Omotoso made a motion, seconded by Committee Member Suzanne Coffee, to approve the minutes of the September 23, 2024, meeting. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

**AYES:** Co-Chair Nancy Aguirre, Co-Chair Marisol Cantú, Co-Chair Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Jessica Range, Dave Severy

**NOES:** None.

**ABSTAIN:** Y'anad Burrell, Simren Sandhu, Heidi Swillinger, Franklin Ungo

**ABSENT:** Luna Angulo-Castro

Public Comments

None.

4. **CSC LEADS ONGOING UPDATES**

00:10:01

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public received an update from Co-Lead Marisol Cantú. A special thank you was also given to Committee Member Lucia Castello who stepped down from the committee. Committee Member Dave Severy also provided an update on the Letter of Support he has been working on.

Committee Comment

Committee member Y'anad Burrell asked about the accessibility and affordability of the scooters in the neighborhood mentioned in the Letter and she asked how many people would hopefully benefit.

Committee member Dave Severy provided an overview of the sites selected and the transportation needs assessment that was conducted to connect with the community.

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth asked for further clarification on the letter, who would be signing it, and when it would be signed.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre asked Jeff to follow up with Dave over email with any further questions to move the agenda along.

Public Comment

None.

5. **CHARTER AMENDMENTS REGARDING ATTENDANCE POLICY, AND  
STANDING COMMITTEES AND AD HOCS**

00:21:19

The Committee received an overview of the proposed charter amendments regarding attendance policy, standing committees, and Ad Hocs from Co-chair Nancy Aguirre.

Committee Comment

Committee member Y'anad Burrell asked about the wording for the standing committee definition and who would determine the committees.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre responded by letting Y'anad know that the CSC would determine the standing committees and Ad Hocs based on the length of the action the committee or Ad Hoc would be responding to. Short term items with an end date would spur an Ad Hoc, while longer term items would require a standing committee.

Committee member Heidi Swillinger requested that the co-leads consider a provision for people who may need an extended leave of absence in the attendance policy.

Committee member Jessica Range asked for clarification on the attendance policy 4.4.2 CSC Membership Engagement. She asked if there was meant to be a distinction between a member who misses "more than 2" stated in 4.4.2 compared to 6.3 where it states "less than 3 excused absences"

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso responded to Jessica letting her know the difference in 4.4.2 was so that the co-leads could be proactive in reaching out to a committee member who misses 2 meetings.

Committee member Jessica Range proposed a wording change to clear up any confusion for 4.4.2. The wording proposed would change 4.4.2 from "...who misses more than 2 monthly steering..." to "...who misses 2 or more monthly steering..."

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso agreed with the proposed change and Co-chair Nancy Aguirre directed the committee to note the change.

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth asked for clarification about how the Air District has the capacity to support 2 committees. He asked if the committee could have as many committees as they saw fit even if the Air District could only support 2 committees.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre confirmed that the CSC could have as many committees as they wanted, but that the Air District would only be able to support 2 of those committees at one time.

Public Comment

None.

Committee Action

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth made a motion, seconded by Co-chair Dr. Omotoso, to vote to adopt the charter amendments to add the new attendance policy in section 14 and revisions to sections 4.4.2(g) and 6.3(c), define standing committees and ad hocs in section 7.4, and replace

subcommittee and committee with “standing committee” in sections 4.4, 4.4.1(c), 4.4.2(e), 5.2, 5.4, 6.2(a)(b), 6.3(f), 7.4, and 9. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

**AYES:** Co-Chair Nancy Aguirre, Co-Chair Marisol Cantó, Co-Chair Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Y’anad Burrell, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Franklin Ungo

**NOES:** None.

**ABSTAIN:** None.

**ABSENT:** Luna Angulo-Castro

## 6. **CHARTER: STANDING COMMITTEE AND AD HOC STRUCTURE OVERVIEW**

00:37:33

The Committee and the public received an overview of the standing committee and ad hoc structure.

### Committee Comments

Committee member Y’anad Burrell asked if the committee could review the exercise from the August meeting where the committee prioritized actions. She asked to review this prioritization exercise because the committee prioritized 5 actions, but the Air District would only be able to support with 2 committees at a time. She mentioned that the committee would need the support of the Air District staff for facilitation and other roles.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre let Y’anad know that the co-leads have been discussing that topic and it would be a topic for discussion at the next meeting.

Air District Staff Laura Cackette also mentioned that specific actions identified in the prioritization exercise would be reviewed later in the meeting.

Air District Staff Diana Ruiz also let Y’anad know that the implementation plan includes more information related to the prioritization actions.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre let the committee know that they will be covering the topic being discussed later in the meeting.

Committee member Jessica Range asked if the definitions and overview of the structure would be included in a separate document or if it would be included in the revised charter.

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso let Jessica know that each standing committee or ad hoc would be covered in a separate document.

Committee member Jessica Range asked that future committees would be outlined in a separate document that was easily accessible for the CSC. She also asked about the details for how each member of the CSC would be able to participate in a committee if there were only a limited number going on at one time. She expressed concern that CSC members were required to

participate in a standing committee or ad hoc, when there may only be a limited number of committees at one time and if there was a limit on the number of CSC members who could participate in a committee. She asked if there were any other ways that CSC members would be able to fulfil their duties.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre let Jessica know that the co-leads have discussed how CSC members could participate in the committees outside of just committee meetings, such as supporting with documents outside of normal meeting hours.

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso also addressed the fact that ad hocs have a limited timeline so there could be multiple committees that occur throughout the year, providing multiple opportunities for CSC members to participate in some capacity.

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth asked about recruitment and if it would be possible to recruit potential CSC members to ad hoc committee members as a way to expose them to the steering committee without requiring them to fully join the CSC

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso let Jeff know that anyone who joins a committee would likely have to be a member of the CSC.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre reaffirmed Dr. Omotoso's belief, but also let Jeff know that CSC meetings are open to the public and that would be a good place for a prospective member to get exposure to the CSC.

Air District Staff Marcia let the CSC know that it is ultimately up to them to decide, and it could be a point for more discussion.

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth expressed interest in discussing the topic more to recruit more members to the CSC.

#### Public Comments

None.

#### Committee Action

None; receive and file.

### **7. BREAKOUT ACTIVITY: RECRUITMENT AD HOC PLAN OF ACTION PROPOSAL**

0:56:03

The Committee received an overview of the breakout activity process, then proceeded to break out for a discussion on the recruitment ad hoc plan of action.

#### Committee Comments

Committee member BK White asked for clarification on the terminology of "trade unions" mentioned in the proposal and mentioned that it should be "labor unions" or just "unions".

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre let BK know that is was language pulled from the charter.

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso agreed that the terminology should be “labor union” or “union” not “trade”.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre reviewed the language of the Charter and confirmed that the language should be changed.

#### Public Comments

None.

#### Committee Action

Committee member Dave Severy made a motion, seconded by committee member Suzanne Coffee, to vote to recommend the CSC approve the Recruitment Ad Hoc Plan of Action Proposal and create the Recruitment Ad Hoc. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

**AYES:** Co-Chair Nancy Aguirre, Co-Chair Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Y’anaad Burrell, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Franklin Ungo

**NOES:** None.

**ABSTAIN:** Co-Chair Marisol Cantó

**ABSENT:** Luna Angulo-Castro

### 8. **YEAR ONE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN OVERVIEW**

01:18:55

The Committee and the public received an overview of the Year One Implementation Plan from Air District Staff Laura Cackette.

#### Committee Comment

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth asked why there were so few actions to collaborate on.

Air District Staff Laura Cackette informed the committee that collaboration was such an in-depth commitment. She reviewed the spectrum slide to detail the in-depth partnership and expressed that the involve category would still cover many of the actions the CSC wanted to undertake.

Committee member Y’anaad Burrell asked about 5.1, the settlement agreement, and if it would also fall under the community benefits section.

Air District Staff Laura Cackette let the CSC know that the Community Air Quality fund from Chevron involved specific things such as partnering with a Community Based Organization.

Committee member Y’anaad Burrell asked if the \$20 million was separate from the in-progress actions.

Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend let Y’anaad know that there were 2 sources of money, one from the penalty money and then the \$20 million from the air quality fund, but that money would need to be used once projects are identified.

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth brought up that the community engagement process that Chevron needed to undertake did not involve the CSC, and there was some confusion on who the “community” Chevron identified was.

Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend recommended that the co-leads take up this discussion in their next meeting because the Air District is not engaged or involved.

Committee member Heidi Swillinger asked about the settlement money that went to Richmond and the communications that were set up with community members.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre expressed that the co-leads would need to get a handle on the engagement process in a separate meeting.

Committee Member Y’anad Burrell asked if there was a time constraint to vote on this action item during the October meeting. She said if the CSC was on a time constraint, if it would be possible to make amendments or changes in the future.

Air District Staff Laura Cackette let Y’anad know that there would be opportunities to make changes in the future and this item was intended as a roadmap.

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso let the CSC know that the committee would be able to make smaller and minor changes, but that they wouldn’t be able to drop actions or make more significant changes.

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth said that he felt the implementation plan was not complete and not ready to be voted on. He stated that he wouldn’t know what committee to join to accomplish different work and there weren’t committees created for each action item.

Air District Staff Laura Cackette informed the committee that this was the first implementation plan that has been written and asked the committee if everything needed to be in writing in the plan in order to move forward or if the committee was ok with adding upon the implementation plan and using it as more of a living document.

Committee member Jeffrey Kilbreth expressed support for having a fully built out and robust implementation plan instead of continually adding to it.

Committee member Jessica Range asked for clarification regarding the just transition and community benefits action and if that would be covered in one standing committee. She expressed concern that the Air District would only be able to support 2 committees at a time and there were already 2 committees identified in the implementation plan.

Co-chair Nancy Aguirre confirmed that there would be 2 standing committees without an end date and there would be the recruitment committee ad hoc that would end on or before March.

Air District Staff Wendy Goodfriend informed the CSC that the sub committees would not be the only way the CSC would implement the plan. She mentioned that the PTCA influenced the Air District’s strategic plan and there are going to be a lot of actions being undertaken by the Air District to implement the actions of their strategic plan. She also reiterated that the roadmap is not a fixed plan and the CSC would be able to engage in numerous activities outside of the monthly CSC meetings.

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso followed up by letting the committee know that this implementation plan covered work to be completed in year one and that it was a flexible document that could be changed as the CSC sees fit. He mentioned that it would be important to avoid adding too many

details that would prevent the committee from doing the work and keeping the implementation plan high level would allow for flexibility to shift certain actions.

Committee member Dave Severy mentioned that the implementation plan covered more of the “what” and not necessarily the “how” and that allowed for the CSC to remain nimble in its actions.

#### Public Comment

None.

#### Committee Action

Co-chair Dr. Omotoso made a motion, seconded by committee member Heidi Swillinger, to vote to approve the Year One Implementation Plan. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

**AYES:** Co-Chair Nancy Aguirre, Co-Chair Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Y’anad Burrell, Suzanne Coffee, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jessica Range, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Franklin Ungo

**NOES:** Jeffrey Kilbreth

**ABSTAIN:** None.

**ABSENT:** Co-Chair Marisol Cantú, Luna Angulo-Castro

### 9. **COMMUNITY GATHERING SURVEY RESULTS, PTCA CSC DECEMBER MEETING, AND NEXT STEPS**

01:53:00

There will be no November CSC meeting.

The December CSC meeting will be hybrid on December 9, 2024, at 5:30pm. The on-site location will be 4114 Lakeside Dr, Richmond CA 94806 and a zoom link will be provided to the public and on the BAAQMD website for those who wish to join virtually.

### 10. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

01:53:57

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting will have two minutes each to address the Committee.

#### Public Comment

None.



11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting was adjourned by Co-Chair Nancy Aguirre at 7:40 pm.

Minutes prepared by MIG, Inc., Consultants