



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

BOARD OF DIRECTORS
PATH TO CLEAN AIR COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN COMMUNITY
STEERING COMMITTEE

COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBERS

ALFREDO ANGULO	HENRY CLARK	MICHELLE GOMEZ
AMANDA BOOTH	JEFFREY L KILBRETH	GARCIA
DANIELLA ZACKY	JESSICA RANGE	NANCY AGUIRRE
DARLENA DAVID	JIM HOLLAND	OMONIYI OMOTOSO
DARLENE RIOS DRAPKIN	KEVIN RUANO	PATRICIA A. DANIELS
DAVE SEVERY	HERNANDEZ	PHILLIP MITCHELL
ERIKA RAMIREZ	LIZBETH IBARRA	ROBERTA FELICIANO
FABIOLA REYES	LIZETTE BERNAL	SIMREN SANDHU
FRANCISCO AVILA	LUCIA CASTELLO	SUZANNE COFFEE
HAKIM JOHNSON	LUZ GOMEZ	VERNON WHITMORE
HEIDI V SWILLINGER	MARISOL CANTÚ	Y'ANAD BURRELL
	MICAELA ZARAGOZA-SOTO	

THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED UNDER PROCEDURES AUTHORIZED BY ASSEMBLY BILL 361 (RIVAS 2021) ALLOWING REMOTE MEETINGS. THIS MEETING WILL BE ACCESSIBLE VIA WEBCAST, TELECONFERENCE, AND ZOOM. A ZOOM PANELIST LINK WILL BE SENT SEPARATELY TO COMMITTEE OR BOARD MEMBERS

- **THE PUBLIC MAY OBSERVE THIS MEETING THROUGH THE WEBCAST BY CLICKING THE LINK AVAILABLE ON THE AIR DISTRICT’S AGENDA WEBPAGE AT**

<https://www.baaqmd.gov/community-health/community-health-protection-program/richmond-area-community-health-protection-program>

- **THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA ZOOM AT THE FOLLOWING LINK OR BY PHONE**

<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/82855052082>

(669) 900-6833 or (408) 638-0968

WEBINAR ID: 828 5505 2082

- **THOSE PARTICIPATING BY PHONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENT CAN USE THE “RAISE HAND” FEATURE BY DIALING “*9”. IN ORDER TO RECEIVE THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE**

- **VERSIÓN EN ESPAÑOL DEL WEBINAR**

PATH TO CLEAN AIR COMMUNITY EMISSIONS REDUCTION PLAN COMMUNITY STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING AGENDA

MONDAY, APRIL 25, 2022

5:30 PM

1. **Call to Order - Roll Call**
2. **Public Meeting Procedure**

The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.

This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas at the time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain errors and omissions and are not certified for their content or form.

***Public Comment on Agenda Items:** The public may comment on each item on the agenda as the item is taken up. Members of the public who wish to speak on matters on the agenda for the meeting, will have two minutes each to address the Committee. No speaker who has already spoken on that item will be entitled to speak to that item again.*

CONSENT CALENDAR (Item 3)

3. Approval of the Minutes of March 21, 2022

The Committee will consider approving the draft minutes of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee meeting of March 21, 2022.

REGULAR AGENDA (Items 4 - 7)

4. Ad Hoc Updates

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will receive updates on the active Ad Hoc working groups.

5. Health Presentation: Air Pollution and Health Risks

Air District staff and community health experts will provide a health focused presentation on the connection between air pollution exposure and health endpoints.

6. Next Steps for Strategy Development

Air District staff will present next steps for Strategy Development, following next month's Technical Assessment presentation.

7. Environmental Justice Updates

The Path to Clean Air Steering Committee and the public will share and receive Environmental Justice updates.

OTHER BUSINESS

8. Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3

Members of the public who wish to speak on matters not on the agenda for the meeting, will have two minutes each to address the Committee.

9. Committee Member Comments

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

10. Time and Place of Next Meeting

Monday, May 16, 2022, at 5:30 p.m., via webcast, teleconference, or Zoom, pursuant to procedures in accordance with Assembly Bill 361 (Rivas 2021).

11. Adjournment

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

KARISSA WHITE, STAFF SPECIALIST
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
kwhite@baaqmd.gov

(415) 516-8662
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the Air District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Suma Peesapati, at (415) 749-4967 or by email at speesapati@baaqmd.gov.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:

MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

APRIL 2022

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Monday	18	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	20	9:00 a.m.	1 st Floor, Board Room (In person option available) <u>and</u> REMOTE pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Administration Committee	Wednesday	20	11:00 a.m.	1 st Floor, Board Room (In person option available) <u>and</u> REMOTE pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Path to Clean Air Community Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee	Monday	25	5:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Budget and Finance Committee	Wednesday	27	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Thursday	28	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361

MAY 2022

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Special Meeting Budget Hearing	Wednesday	4	8:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Board Room (In person option available) <u>and REMOTE</u> pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	4	9:00 a.m.	1 st Floor, Board Room (In person option available) <u>and REMOTE</u> pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Community Equity, Health and Justice Committee	Thursday	5	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Legislative Committee	Monday	9	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Technology Implementation Office (TIO) Steering Committee	Friday	13	1:00 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Monday	16	9:00 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Path to Clean Air Community Emissions Reduction Plan Steering Committee	Monday	16	5:30 p.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Meeting	Wednesday	18	9:00 a.m.	1 st Floor, Board Room (In person option available) <u>and REMOTE</u> pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Administration Committee	Wednesday	18	11:00 a.m.	1 st Floor, Board Room (In person option available) <u>and REMOTE</u> pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Budget and Finance Committee	Wednesday	25	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361
Board of Directors Mobile Source and Climate Impacts Committee	Thursday	26	9:30 a.m.	Webcast only pursuant to Assembly Bill 361

JB 4/11/2022 – 1:58 P.M.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Members of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee

From: Veronica Eady
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Date: April 25, 2022

Re: Approval of the Minutes of March 21, 2022

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee meeting of March 21, 2022.

BACKGROUND

None.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee meeting of March 21, 2022.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Veronica Eady
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Prepared by: Karissa White

Reviewed by: Veronica Eady

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Draft Minutes of the Path to Clean Air CERP Committee Meeting of March 21, 2022

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105

DRAFT MINUTES

Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee
March 21, 2022, 5:30 P.M

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

The Richmond – No. Richmond – San Pablo Community Emissions Reduction Plan Community Steering Committee (CSC or Committee) Co-Chairs Y’Anad Burrell and Alfredo Rafael Angulo called the meeting to order at 5:32 pm.

Present: Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo, Co-Chair Y’Anad Burrell; and Members Nancy Aguirre, Francisco Avila, Amanda Booth, Marisol Cantú, Suzanne Coffee, Patricia A. Daniels, Roberta Feliciano, Luz Gomez, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Erika Ramirez, Jessica Range, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Vernon Whitmore, Micaela Zaragoza-Soto, Hakim Johnson (non-voting)

Absent: Members Lucia Castello, Dr. Henry Clark, Dr. Darlena David, Darlene Rios Drapkin, Phillip Mitchel, Jim Holland (non-voting),

Also Present: Air District Staff Alexander Crockett, Anna Lee, Dan Alrick, Eric Lara, Greg Nudd, Jerry Bovee, Karrisa White, Kate Hoag, Kelly Malinowski, Kevin Olp, Kristen Law, Laura Cackette, Linda Duca, Luis Espino, Marcia Raymond, Ranyee Chiang, Vanessa Johnson, Veronica Eady, Victor Douglas, Wendy Goodfriend, Ying Yu, Damian Breen, MIG staff, Ana Padilla, and Yesenia Perez; Interpreter Norma Herrera; Members of the Public Joshua Abraham, Julia Luongo, Lily Wu, Scott Andrews, Oscar Garcia, Samuel Garcia, Ed Giacometti, and Song Bai

2. PUBLIC MEETING PROCEDURE

Public Comments

None.

3. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 28, 2022**

The Committee reviewed the meeting agenda and approved the February 28, 2022, Meeting Minutes with edits in a roll call vote.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Comments

Nancy Aguirre; Edit the minutes to include a more detailed synopsis of the comments in the minutes.

Committee Action

Nancy Aguirre made a motion, seconded by Kevin Ruano Hernandez, to **approve** the minutes of February 28, 2022, with the edit of including the comments of the public. The motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Co-Chair Alfredo Rafael Angulo, Co-Chair Y’Anad Burrell; and Members Nancy Aguirre, Francisco Avila, Amanda Booth, Marisol Cantú, Suzanne Coffee, Patricia A. Daniels, Roberta Feliciano, Luz Gomez, Michelle Gomez Garcia, Lizbeth Ibarra, Jeffrey Kilbreth, Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso, Erika Ramirez, Jessica Range, Kevin Ruano Hernandez, Simren Sandhu, Dave Severy, Heidi Swillinger, Vernon Whitmore, Micaela Zaragoza-Soto

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None

ABSENT: Members Lucia Castello, Dr. Henry Clark, Dr. Darlena David, Darlene Rios Drapkin, Phillip Mitchel, Dave Severy

4. **TECHNICAL ASSESSMENT (TA): RESULTS (PART I: REFINERY OPERATIONS)**

The Committee received the first presentation in a multi-part series to share and discuss insights from technical assessment work

Public Comments

Oscar Garcia; Monitoring outreach team. “So just wanted to thank Staff for presenting this data and also just wanted to make a pitch for the air monitoring data that's being collected. I'm also equally excited for this air toxic data I believe it's the first time the air district has done one of these things, and it's exciting that we're having this data. Collection here in Richmond, because this live data is really indicative of what we're all breathing, and so is the other monitoring data that's being collected as part of this process. So just wanted to remind you that the actual monitoring data, is what's representative of what we're breathing, and while the emissions inventory and other data is helpful you know I just want to just gently remind you that what we're what folks are actually

dealing with is what's being recorded in these air monitoring sensors. And so and so I just wanted to remind you of that. And then also want to encourage you to look at the quarterly updates that are put by the monitoring outreach team. I believe Dan is working on one for to compile data and start, including the air toxic data. So please take a look and definitely provide feedback to the monitoring air team, either directly or if I, Kevin number one, because we definitely want those to be easily readable and digestible to the community. So. thank you all and have a good evening.”

Committee Comments

Kevin Ruano Hernandez requested clarification on what is the red dotted line - National Ambient Air Quality Standard for 24-hour average PM 2.5. Asked where the air district monitoring sites enrichment are.

Marisol Cantú requested that the information and data be more understandable and accessible for community members (breaking down data by the categories of pollutants, known sources, etc.). Asked for an update on the list of pollutant sources presentation.

Hakim Johnson supported the request to make the information more accessible to the public. Asked what does “PM 2.5 is not health protective” mean and what does it mean for setting it lower. Hakim Johnson, Asked how the committee going to factor in strategies for the larger pollutant monitoring by August if there a focus on PM 2.5.

Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez asked what the health impacts of hydrogen cyanide and the formaldehyde. Asked where the comparison and the exposures are impacts. Asked what the impacts of the distribution centers and transportation.

Marisol Cantú requested that a presentation and discussion regarding the appendix of pollutants to health effects and impacts be agendized for a steering committee meeting.

Nancy Aguirre supported the request for a presentation and discussion regarding the appendix. Asked if Dr.Omotoso can share his expertise on the health impacts.

Dr. Omoniyi Omotoso shared that he practices in a study area but deals with short-term effects in terms of asthma exacerbations. Described that it is beneficial to see what is locally contributing as opposed to regionally for chronic issues because it helps in understanding where the biggest impacts for this plan.

Micaela Zaragoza-Soto asked for a clarification of the score in one of the columns (Cancer Score, Cancer rate according to diesel particulate matter?), one column seems to be emissions by mass.

Jeffrey L. Kilbreth was supportive of committee members asking questions regarding the content. Requested specialists for asthma and chronic respiratory health conditions that can advise the committee and agendize a discussion regarding the health impact with reference to the pollutants.

Luz Gomez supported the request for specialists for asthma and chronic respiratory health conditions. Will ask around the Contra Costa Health Department for potential in house experts.

Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez; Asked if rule 6-5 is included in the criteria pollutants.

Jeffrey L. Kilbreth clarified that the monitoring data is a way of getting a second angle on PM but it doesn't measure all the tax. Request clarification why certain tax only certain tax is monitored and tested. Wants the committee to focus and prioritize on what they can monitor and tax.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

5. **COMPLIANCE & ENFORCEMENT DIVISION PRESENTATION OF FINDINGS FROM 2019-2021**

The Committee received a presentation on the overview of the Compliance & Enforcement activity types and a summary of findings from data analyses and field observations from 2019 - 2021.

Public Comments

None.

Committee Comments

Marisol Cantú stated there was a flare on March 21st. Asked what the Air District's process is in evaluating the early alert system for flares.

Hakim Johnson asked for clarification of what concern the air district has with the strike and the refinery operation. Asked if it relates to flaring or health impact. Requested that the Air District be specific in statements relating to concerns and risks.

Marisol Cantú stated and described importance of emphasizing the community's health, concern, and voice as a resident and community representative. Stated that the industry had not been acting in good faith or prioritizing community health. Advocated that the community's health and voice be prioritized and discontinue the legacy of pollution in the community.

Nancy Aguirre supported the statements regarding described importance of emphasizing the community's health, concern, and voice as well as understanding health impacts. Stated that it is appropriate to discuss the strike and requested that it be part of the conversation. Requested further discussion regarding engagement and the information being shared. Asked what is considered as compliant (self-reporting or independent reporting.).

Jeffrey L Kilbreth supported concerns regarding the strike, keeping refinery operations safe, and being on alert. Requested an additional presentation about how to understand the risks with underreporting flaring. Asked what emissions are coming from the flaring, whether there's any

chance that there are missing amounts of pollution, who's responsible for knowing and reporting flaring.

Francisco Avila reminded and affirmed that each Steering committee member is entitled to their own opinion and a vote. Moving forward he stated that the committee should not be sidetracked by a lobbying discussion that overshadows the topics and dialogue.

Y'Anad Burrell reminded the group that the diversity of the group is what moves the committee forward. She emphasized how questions and comment procedure had been occurring and how Committee member Johnson's question was not answered. Co-Chair Burrell also highlighted that the language around what the BAAQMD is concerned about and how it was presented is troubling.

Hakim Johnson thanked the committee for the space to discuss points of view. He asked for clarity on Equality complaint summary, if out of the 1200 complaints that were received over the past three years, are only 19% valid and what is that Intel?

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting conversing any matter or take action to direct staff to a place of matter of business on a future agenda (Gov't Code 54954.2)

Public Comments

None.

Committee Comments

Marisol Cantú announced that on 3/22 at 6:30pm, Richmond City Council Workers and Community Members will be calling local government entities to put pressure on Chevron to prioritize community and worker health. She invited the steering committee members to call in and voice their perspectives and expertise. She reminded the committee that there are 500 workers on strike.

Kevin G. Ruano Hernandez supported that all committee members are allowed to their own opinions for the dialogue and encouraged productive dialogue.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

7. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Public Comments

None.

Committee Comments

Nancy Aguirre asked if the future meetings will be in person or over Zoom. Thanked the committee for their respectfulness and shared her appreciation for the committee.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

8. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, April 25, 2022, Zoom Video Conferencing, at 5:30 p.m.

Zoom Log In: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/82855052082>

Meeting ID: 828 5505 2082

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Committee meeting was moved to be adjourned by Francisco Avila and seconded by Heidi Swillinger at 8:41 PM.

MIG Consulting

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Members of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee

From: Veronica Eady
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Date: April 25, 2022

Re: Health Presentation: Air Pollution and Health Risks

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Building on the March 2022 Path to Clean Air Steering Committee Meeting Technical Assessment presentation, staff from the Air District and the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, and public health experts will give a health presentation on emissions to exposure to health effects and outdoor environmental exposure to asthma in children.

DISCUSSION

Air District staff and community health experts will present and facilitate a dialogue with Steering Committee members on their health presentation about the questions and concerns about the connections between air pollution and public health.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Veronica Eady
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Prepared by: Karissa White

Reviewed by: Veronica Eady

ATTACHMENTS:

None

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Members of the Path to Clean Air Steering Committee

From: Veronica Eady
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Date: April 25, 2022

Re: Next Steps for Strategy Development

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Following an overview of Air District strategies in February, and the first Technical Assessment presentation in March, Air District staff will present and seek feedback on next steps for pivoting to Strategy Development following next month's second Technical Assessment presentation.

DISCUSSION

Air District staff will present and seek feedback from Steering Committee members on next steps for Strategy Development.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Veronica Eady
Senior Deputy Executive Officer of Policy & Equity

Prepared by: Karissa White

Reviewed by: Veronica Eady

ATTACHMENTS:

None