Meeting Summary

1. Welcome (Anuja Mendiratta, Facilitator). Anuja welcomed attendees to the first working meeting since the Plan was approved. She explained that the Steering Committee's focus will now move to designing and beginning the implementation phase, including learning how to center racial equity in Plan implementation.

2. Recap: Progress to Date (Brian Beveridge, WOEIP). Brian shared that after approving the Plan, Air District Board members are deeply invested in working on implementation. He added that the City of Oakland, the Oakland A's, and members of the greater community want to replicate the Steering Committee's successful community engagement process as a model for developing robust community benefit agreements.

3. Presentation: Roles, Responsibilities, and Evaluation Criteria for Plan Implementation (Brian Beveridge, WOEIP). Brian shared the co-leads' recommendations for how to structure roles and responsibilities during the implementation phase. He emphasized that the recommendations are simply a proposal that Steering Committee members will be able to shape. Brian described the recommended framework:
   a. Steering Committee. Continues on as the primary decision-making body; membership may change. Continues to represent residents and businesses of plan areas: street addresses in West Oakland. Meets on a quarterly rather than monthly basis.
      i. Additional members include agencies like the health department. Participation criteria: Does your agency have an active role working directly in this community?
      ii. Any other agencies that can play an active role in this plan; it makes sense for them to be at the steering committee level.
   b. Subcommittees. Will take deeper dives into specific strategies and make recommendations. Non steering committee members can be a part of this group so that broader stakeholders are able to formally participate and be part of the conversation. Will retain the co-chair structure for each subcommittee; to ensure the community voice is empowered throughout the entire process.
      i. May be issue or sector-based; that may change over time.
      ii. Suggested subcommittees: Land Use, Mobility, Enforcement, and Health.
      iii. The issues will cross over, this discussion will happen at the SC level.
      iv. Ad-hoc subcommittees. Need to have more youth engagement; the youth will inform this process.
c. Brian solicited direct feedback from Steering Committee members after they took time to discuss the proposal. He concluded by sharing that the co-leads are currently exploring funding options and alternatives. After the process is finalized, they will create a budget and secure resources/funding for the meeting logistics.

d. Equity will be at the center of this process. The goal is to protect community health by eliminating disparities for our residents in West Oakland.

e. **Comments + Suggestions from SC Members.** SC members raised many important issues, including the need to: (a) ensure adequate funding for research: subcommittees will have complicated questions, they will need assistance with resources; (b) have a note-taker for each meeting; (c) open subcommittee meetings to the public; (d) increase strategic outreach and engagement of young people who live in West Oakland, especially outreach in West Oakland schools; (e) streamline meeting schedules so interested people can attend more than one, e.g, multiple on one day, etc.

f. Members of the public also offered suggestions.

g. After discussion the Steering Committee voted to endorse the co-lead's proposal after it is refined to reflect their suggestions.

4. **Centering Equity in Implementing the Plan** (Darlene Flynn, City of Oakland Department of Race and Equity). Ms. Margaret Gordon, WOEIP introduced Ms. Flynn, stating that Darlene's presentation will help us address the racial disparities in West Oakland and find out possible creative solutions.

a. Darlene began by describing her background, role, and the City's Racial Equity Implementation Framework, a proactive tool to intentionally integrate equity into all of the City's work. The City of Oakland defines equity as “Just and fair inclusion.” An equitable society is one in which all can participate and prosper.

b. To describe equity, Darlene used an image depicting the difference between ‘equality’ and ‘equity.’ She explained: Here everyone has a box, so they're being treated equally. But equity is about outcomes. Some people still can't see over the fence, so being treated equally isn't good enough. The fence is metaphorically representative of institutions, structural barriers to access: someone decided to design the institution that way. We can't change our country’s racist history, but we do have control over institutional structures. If we have the intention, political bandwidth, we can change the structures and how resources are distributed.

c. Darlene emphasized equity work is a “blame-free zone;” it is about each of us taking responsibility to change unfair and unjust systems, learn to do critical race analysis, and start to question what we have been led to believe.

i. **Redlining:** Historical discriminatory process that steered African Americans into certain areas, prevented them from fair housing loans, and disinvested from their neighborhoods.

ii. **Impact today:** Black children are 10x more likely to be admitted to the ER for asthma (400 white children vs. 4K for black children).

iii. Need to replace common narratives about why disparities happen.

1. **Individualism** - winners vs. losers; personal merit or deficit: people get what they deserve. Backed with highly racialized assumptions

2. **Equity Frame** - the inequalities develop in the context of lack of access to opportunity;

   a. Government has a role in addressing structural barriers

   b. Replace community marginalization with agency

   c. Community involved solutions

   d. Skill building
The Department of Race and Equity ("DRE") uses three main strategies: (a) identify and eliminate the causes of racial disparities in City Government; (b) promote inclusion for all residents; (c) reduce race based disparities.

The DRE also uses the following change process.

  i. Prepare advocates and leadership to advocate for equity -- Building capacity and the will to focus on system change - change the perspective.
  ii. Build infrastructure and political will to support the change
  iii. Apply new skills/tools
  iv. Develop action plan focused on changes in policies, procedures, practices
  v. Measure progress and recognize accomplishments -- Measuring outcomes.

Have to disaggregate data so that you can measure the impacts on the basis of race.

Steering Committee members thanked Darlene for presenting a new way to look at their work, including health and greening. One SC member questioned the focus on race, suggesting that there are other marginalized classes. Darlene agreed, stating that there is more than one 'ism. But, while there is structural inequity across all indicators of disparity, race is on top in terms of the most inequitable impacts. This is about intersectionality. We pay attention to sexism, classism, but race always comes back into it. With intersectional work, it's not either/or.

5. **Wrap-up + Next steps** (Marybelle Tobias, Facilitator). Azibuike Akaba, BAAQMD reiterated that the co-leads will review all of the discussion feedback and return with a revised proposal for the next SC meeting. The next SC meeting date is TBD; co-leads suggested December 10, 2019.

   a. **December 5, 2019:** CARB Board meeting to consider West Oakland Community Action Plan and Control Measure for Ocean-Going Vessels at Berth (DeFremery Recreation Center, West Oakland)

6. **Adjourn.**