

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 771-6000

**APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Executive Committee Meeting  
Monday, October 22, 2012

**1. Call to Order – Roll Call**

Chairperson John Gioia called the meeting to order at 9:40 a.m.

Present: Chairperson John Gioia; Secretary Nate Miley; and Directors John Avalos, Tom Bates, Carole Groom, Scott Haggerty, Mark Ross and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Vice Chairperson Ash Kalra.

Also Present: None.

**2. Public Comment Period: None.**

**3. Quarterly Reports of the Hearing Board: January – March 2012 and April – June 2012**

Hearing Board Chairperson Thomas M. Dailey, M.D., presented the quarterly reports of the Air District Hearing Board for January through March and April through June of 2012.

Committee Comments:

Chairperson Gioia asked about records of settlements and the imposition of fines, which Brian Bunger, District Counsel, answered.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

**4. Report of the Advisory Council: January – October 2012**

Advisory Council Chairperson Stan Hayes presented the Report of the Advisory Council: January – October 2012, including background on the constitution and mission of the Council and a summary of recent meetings.

NOTED PRESENT: Directors Haggerty and Miley were noted present at 9:46 a.m., thereby establishing a quorum.

Committee Comments:

Director Bates asked for preliminary findings. Advisory Council Chairperson Hayes said a heightened sense of urgency to respond to ultra-fine particulate matter when he initially perceived it as a matter for future action.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Wagenknecht was noted present at 9:52 a.m.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

**5. Approval of the Minutes of March 19, 2012, and July 11, 2012**

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: Director Haggerty made individual motions to approve the Minutes of March 19, 2012, and July 11, 2012; Director Bates seconded each; and both motions were carried unanimously without objection.

**6. Particulate Matter (PM) Planning**

Mr. Broadbent made introductory comments regarding the item and introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules & Research. Mr. Hilken introduced David Burch, Principal Environmental Planner of Planning, Rules & Research, who gave the staff presentation PM Planning, including an overview of PM and its health effects; an analysis of the sources, control measures and trends in PM within the Bay Area; a review of the air quality planning requirements of the California Air Resources Board and U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and the Air District's plans for compliance with the national standard for PM; a review of the New Source Review Rule Amendments as they apply to PM; and next steps.

Chairperson Gioia asked, regarding slide 4, PM Health Effects, what age group is most represented in the "estimated 1,000 to 2,000 premature deaths per year in the Bay Area." Mr. Burch said thirty-plus.

Mr. Burch continued the presentation.

Chairperson Gioia asked, regarding slide 6, Sources of Fine PM, for an example of a Domestic source. Mr. Burch said gas heating and other indoor natural gas combustion.

Director Groom asked where the monitors were located. Mr. Burch said the four installed to date are in Santa Rosa, San Pablo, Livermore and Redwood City.

Director Bates asked, regarding slide 6, Sources of Fine PM, questions about cigarette smoke, which Mr. Burch and Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, answered. Director Bates asked if the Air District has authority to regulate cigarette smoke indoors. Mr. Burcher said no.

Chairperson Gioia, Director Bates, Mr. Burch and Ms. Roggenkamp discussed slide 6, Sources of Fine PM, which shows sources of exposure in the outdoor environment, including those that permeate from indoor environments. Ms. Roggenkamp added that research is pointing towards indoor exposure being intense and staff is doing its best to highlight this whenever possible.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Ross was noted present at 10:09 a.m.

Director Bates asked questions about how the Air District can get involved in indoor air quality. Mr. Burch pointed to the PM Report, a section of which speaks to this topic.

Director Wagenknecht asked if the Air District is or will conduct studies relative to indoor air quality. Mr. Burcher stated that it is an active area of research. Ms. Roggenkamp clarified that the Advisory Council is looking at the topic.

Director Bates said it would be ideal to have the information available when people go through the building permit process and asked if that occurs now. Ms. Roggenkamp said the recommendations of the Advisory Council will speak to that as will the staff PM presentation to the Board in November.

Director Ross suggested that public outreach material relative to wood burning be expanded to include indoor fine PM information.

Director Haggerty suggested a great deal of public outreach. Director Groom suggested the outreach be done community-by-community. Chairperson Gioia suggested it be presented as more educational in nature. Director Haggerty suggested the material not be provided when a sale is completed but instead as a public education piece. Director Ross said there is precedent for a requirement. Ms. Roggenkamp noted the interest in the topic and said it will be brought back to the Public Outreach Committee. Chairperson Gioia agreed but asked that PM planning outreach material include information relative to indoor air quality.

Director Haggerty asked if any studies have been done comparing the indoor air quality of new commercial buildings to that of old buildings. Ms. Roggenkamp said staff can look into that.

Mr. Burch concluded the presentation.

#### Committee Comments:

Director Ross suggested Air District staff research a dollar figure for dealing with the health effects described. Mr. Burch said that was done as part of the Clean Air Plan. Director Ross agreed and suggested something more revised and attuned to this issue.

Director Bates asked if it is possible to prepare the previously discussed informational handout. Ms. Roggenkamp said yes and it will be brought to the Public Outreach Committee.

Mr. Broadbent said that however controversial the wood smoke rule may be, there is a clear decrease in ambient levels, and staff would like to bring an item to the Board after the end of the season that reveals to the public the success of the program.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

## **7. Senate Bill (SB) 1339 – Commute Benefits Legislation**

Ms. Roggenkamp introduced Thomas Addison, Senior Advanced Projects Advisor, who gave the staff presentation Senate Bill (SB) 1339 – Commute Benefits Legislation, including overviews of the provisions of the bill and staff plans regarding outreach and implementation.

Committee Comments:

Chairperson Gioia asked how the Air District and Metropolitan Transportation Commission staffs will proceed jointly. Mr. Addison, Chairperson Gioia and Ms. Roggenkamp discussed what collaboration has occurred to date and how the two agencies will proceed with developing a jointly adopted ordinance.

Chairperson Gioia and Mr. Addison discussed the tax ramifications of option 2. Damian Breen, Director of Strategic Incentives, said the subsidy is tax exempt for an employee up to \$240 per month. Mr. Addison summarized the first option as a benefit to employers and employees and the second option as a benefit to employees but not employers. Ms. Roggenkamp said the ordinance will provide options to employers.

Director Miley asked if Air District staff will be meeting with larger employers and if the legislation will apply to public sector employers. Ms. Roggenkamp responded that there will be an intensive outreach program. Mr. Addison said it does apply to the public sector and it is critical that Air District staff hear from employers early in the process in order to determine what is implementable.

Director Bates asked questions about option 3, which Mr. Addison answered.

Director Bates asked if the Emery Go Round would qualify those companies which contribute to the collective cost of the shuttle service. Mr. Broadbent said there is a lot of work yet to be done and it is a four-year pilot program.

Director Miley called upon his fellow Directors to take the initiative back to their respective organizations as employers, not governing bodies. Director Ross agreed and questioned the tax benefit for public sector employers. Mr. Addison clarified that if no payroll tax is paid by an employer there will not be a tax savings for the employer.

Public Comments: None.

Committee Action: None; informational only.

8. **Committee Member Comments/Other Business:** None.
9. **Time and Place of Next Committee Meeting:** Monday, November 19, 2012, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:30 a.m.
10. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:02 a.m.

*151 Sean Gallagher*

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards