

### BOARD OF DIRECTORS CLIMATE PROTECTION COMMITTEE COMMITTEE MEMBERS

JOHN AVALOS - CHAIR SUSAN ADAMS JOHN GIOIA JAN PEPPER SHIRLEE ZANE

ASH KALRA - VICE CHAIR TERESA BARRETT SCOTT HAGGERTY MARK ROSS

MONDAY SEPTEMBER 29, 2014 9:30 A.M. 7<sup>th</sup> FLOOR BOARD ROOM 939 ELLIS STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109

### **AGENDA**

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.

#### 2. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

(Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items Pursuant to Government Code § 54954.3) Members of the public are afforded the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for regular meetings are posted at Air District headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA, at least 72 hours in advance of a regular meeting. At the beginning of the regular meeting agenda, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Committee's subject matter jurisdiction. Speakers will be limited to three (3) minutes each.

#### 3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF JULY 17, 2014

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Committee will consider approving the attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of July 17, 2014.

#### 4. REGIONAL CLIMATE PROTECTION STRATEGY UPDATE

J. Roggenkamp/4646 jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive an update on the Regional Climate Protection Strategy planning process.

#### 5. CLIMATE READINESS INSTITUTE

J. Roggenkamp/4646

jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will receive a briefing on the Climate Readiness Institute and how it may support Air District climate protection activities.

#### 6. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS

Any member of the Board, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

#### 7. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Thursday, November 20, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

#### 8. ADJOURNMENT

The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.

#### CONTACT THE CLERK OF THE BOARDS

(415) 749-5073 FAX: (415) 928-8560 939 ELLIS STREET, SF, CA 94109 BAAQMD homepage: www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities (notification to the Executive Office should be given at least three working days prior to the date of the meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

# BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-5016 or (415) 749-4941

# EXECUTIVE OFFICE: MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

## **SEPTEMBER 2014**

TYPE OF MEETING	<u>DAY</u>	<b>DATE</b>	<b>TIME</b>	ROOM
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> (Meets on the 4 <sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	24	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)	Thursday	25	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee – (Meets 3 <sup>rd</sup> Thursday every other Month)	Monday	29	9:30 a.m.	Board Room

# **OCTOBER 2014**

TYPE OF MEETING	<u>DAY</u>	<b>DATE</b>	<u>TIME</u>	ROOM
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 <sup>st</sup> & 3 <sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	1	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee (Meets Quarterly at the Call of the Chair)	Wednesday	1	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
Advisory Council Regular Meeting (Meets on the 2 <sup>nd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	8	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> (Meets on the 1 <sup>st</sup> & 3 <sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	15	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> (Meets on the 3 <sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)	Monday	20	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

# OCTOBER 2014

TYPE OF MEETING	<u>DAY</u>	<b>DATE</b>	<b>TIME</b>	<b>ROOM</b>
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> (Meets on the 4 <sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	22	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> (Meets on the 4 <sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)	Thursday	23	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee</b> (At the Call of the Chair)	Thursday	30	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

# **NOVEMBER 2014**

TYPE OF MEETING	<b>DAY</b>	<b>DATE</b>	TIME	ROOM
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> (Meets on the 1 <sup>st</sup> & 3 <sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	5	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Advisory Council Regular Meeting (Meets on the 2 <sup>nd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	12	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> (Meets on the 3 <sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)	Monday	17	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Nominating Committee</b> (At the Call of the Chair)	Wednesday	19	9:30 a.m.	<b>Room 716</b>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> (Meets on the 1 <sup>st</sup> & 3 <sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	19	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee – (Meets 3 <sup>rd</sup> Thursday every other Month)	Thursday	20	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> (Meets on the 4 <sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)	Monday	24	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> (Meets on the 4 <sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	26	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 <sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month) - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO MONDAY, NOVEMBER 24, 2014 DUE TO THANKSGIVING HOLIDAY	Thursday	27	9:30 a.m.	Board Room

#### BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members

of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent

Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer

Date: September 18, 2014

Re: Climate Protection Committee Draft Meeting Minutes

#### **RECOMMENDED ACTION**

Approve attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of July 17, 2014.

#### DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of July 17, 2014.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: <u>Sean Gallagher</u> Reviewed by: <u>Maricela Martinez</u>

Attachment: Draft Minutes of the Climate Protection Meeting of July 17, 2014

Bay Area Air Quality Management District 939 Ellis Street San Francisco, California 94109 (415) 749-5073

#### **DRAFT MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee Meeting Thursday, July 17, 2014

#### 1. Call to Order – Roll Call

Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:36 a.m.

Present: Chairperson John Avalos; and Directors Susan Adams, Teresa Barrett, John

Gioia, Scott Haggerty, Jan Pepper and Mark Ross.

Absent: Vice-Chairperson Ash Kalra; and Director Shirlee Zane.

Also Present: None.

#### 2. Public Comment Period:

NOTED PRESENT: Director Pepper was noted present at 9:38 a.m.

Martin MacKerel addressed the Climate Protection Committee (Committee) regarding the Air Quality Leadership Proposal to commend the progress made and note the need for a greater focus on public health and sustainability through the implementation of a predictable emissions reduction schedule.

Aaron Reaven, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding his disappointment at the Board of Directors (Board) meeting on June 4, 2014, in relation to the staff recommendation to phase-in the greenhouse gas (GHG) fee increase and to object to the form of the rule-making public process.

The Committee and staff discussed the history of the rule-making process and the form of public meetings.

Floyd Earl Smith, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee regarding the desire to hear industry's suggestion regarding a phase-in of the GHG fee increase earlier in the rule-making process so the public would have an opportunity to respond at a public workshop; to note the delivery of the Air Quality Leadership Plan and Path to Reduce GHG Emissions to the Committee members directly late yesterday; and to provide a summary of each document.

#### 3. Approval of Minutes of March 20, 2014

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

#### Committee Action:

Director Gioia made a motion, seconded by Director Adams, to approve the Minutes of March 20, 2014; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Adams, Avalos, Barrett, Gioia, Pepper and Ross.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Haggerty, Kalra and Zane.

#### 4. State and Federal Climate Policy Update

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, who gave the staff presentation *Update on Key Federal and State Climate Policies*, including the President's climate action plan; U.S. Environmental Protection Agency power plant standards; scoping plan update; cap and trade revenue; and next steps.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 9:52 a.m.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 7, *Scoping Plan Update, Key Scoping Plan Policies*, the number of utility companies in the Bay Area and the renewable portfolio progress by Pacific Gas & Electric.

Mr. Hilken continued the presentation.

Director Gioia provided, at slide 8, *Scoping Plan Update*, *Adopted by California Air Resources Board (ARB) May 22, 2014*, an update on discussions at the ARB regarding mid-term targets and the role of the ARB and State Legislature in their implementation.

Mr. Hilken concluded the presentation.

#### **Committee Comments:**

The Committee and staff discussed Assembly Bill (AB) 69 (Perea) and whether the Air District should take a position on the bill which seeks to remove transportation fuels from the cap and trade program; the inadequate treatment of carbon sequestration; how mining operations will be treated under reduction programs; CalEnviroScreen information received and needed; the suggestion that the broader economic impacts of proposed reductions be included in materials prepared by Air District staff; California Environmental Protection Agency concerns stemming from the use of CalEnviroScreen as the screening tool; how federal standards compare to and interact with State standards in terms of the actual impact for the Bay Area; energy demand and

use reductions as an under-realized component of meeting various reduction targets; and the importance of the Air District promoting technical innovation.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

#### 5. Regional Climate Protection Work Program Update

Ms. Roggenkamp introduced Abby Young, Principal Environmental Planner, who gave the staff presentation, *Regional Climate Protection Work Program (Work Program) Update*, including the Air District climate protection resolution, regional planning process and Work Program; policy approaches; assistance to local governments; details of the technical program; and next steps.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 10, Assist Local Governments, Support & Enhance Local Action, vehicle miles travelled data compilation and uses; the timeline for the launch of the climate change and public health initiative; and an electric vehicle readiness update.

Ms. Young continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 12, *Technical Program*, how a consumption-based inventory might be generated, organized and utilized.

Ms. Young concluded the presentation.

#### Public Comments:

Janice Blumenkrantz, League of Women Voters Bay Area, distributed material to and addressed the Committee to read the same in support of the Work Program.

Floyd Earl Smith, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee in support of the Work Program; requested that all fee proposals that result in six-figure budgetary considerations be shared at a public meeting and decided upon at a subsequent public meeting; and to urge the use of unifying, not dividing, dialogue.

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee in support of the Work Program; to suggest a reduction in GHG emissions through reductions in demand brought about by requiring that rooftop solar photovoltaic systems with battery storage as a component of all new construction; and to advocate for Air District opposition to AB 2145 (Bradford) as well as a potential amendment proposing to limit community choice aggregates (CCA).

The Committee and staff discussed Air District lobbying activities relative to AB 2145 (Bradford).

Marilyn Bardet, Benicians for a Safe and Healthy Community, addressed the Committee in support of the Work Program; to note the importance of the Air District's work and the value of

Draft Minutes – Climate Protection Committee Meeting of July 17, 2014

350 Bay Area's proposal; and explained the difficult experience public interest groups have engaging in the draft environmental impact report process.

#### **Committee Comments:**

The Committee and staff discussed the need for a presentation relative to AB 2145 (Bradford); the incorporation of 350 Bay Area's suggestions in the Work Program; and staff's need to obtain the material referenced as being delivered by 350 Bay Area to the Committee members directly.

Director Gioia requested a presentation to the Board by Richard Corey, Executive Officer, ARB, regarding the details of issues related to climate change and information about the use of cap and trade revenue.

Director Adams requested a staff presentation regarding the Marin Carbon Sequestration project at the next Committee meeting.

The Committee and staff discussed the amount of work left to be done relative to the fracking debate in California and the pending resolution in Alameda County to ban the practice altogether.

Chairperson Avalos requested a staff presentation regarding micro-scale energy grids and the work of the Climate Resources Institute at a future Committee meeting. Director Gioia suggested the presentation include a portion regarding CCA.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

**6. Committee Members' Comments:** None.

#### 7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:

Thursday, September 18, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

**8. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:35 a.m.

Sean Gallagher Clerk of the Boards

#### BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members

of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent

Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 18, 2014

Re: Regional Climate Protection Strategy Update

#### RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

#### **BACKGROUND**

On November 6, 2013, the Air District Board of Directors unanimously adopted Resolution 2013-11, Resolution Adopting a Greenhouse Gas Reduction Goal and Commitment to Develop a Regional Climate Protection Strategy. This resolution set a goal of reducing Bay Area-wide greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions 80% below 1990 levels by 2050. The resolution also called on Air District staff to develop a Regional Climate Protection Strategy (RCPS) as part of the 2015 Clean Air Plan. One important step in developing the RCPS is conducting a "gap analysis" to identify opportunities for the Air District to implement actions in each economic sector in order to make progress toward meeting the Air District's 2050 GHG reduction goal.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Air District staff will present on the sector-based gap analysis, including the sectors included, the analysis methodology, and progress made to date. While the sector-based gap analysis is still in process, staff will describe preliminary findings, challenges and observations.

#### BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT

Resources to prepare the RCPS are included in the Fiscal Year End 2015 budget.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: <u>Abby Young</u> Reviewed by: <u>Henry Hilken</u>

AGENDA: 5

#### BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members

of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent

Executive Officer/APCO

Date: September 18, 2014

Re: Climate Readiness Institute

#### RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

#### BACKGROUND

The Climate Readiness Institute (CRI) is a collaborative effort among researchers at the University of California (UC) campuses in Berkeley and Davis, Stanford University, and Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory. Founded in early 2014 at UC Berkeley, CRI is dedicated to providing scientific research to support local and regional policy makers in responding to climate change impacts and the need to reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions.

#### DISCUSSION

On February 11, 2014, CRI launched its activities with a summit attended by over 100 academics, public sector and non-governmental practitioners, and industry representatives. The goal of the summit was to begin defining how CRI could use its scientific and research expertise to support strategies to address critical impacts of climate change and to reduce GHG emissions from sources in the Bay Area. Since the summit, CRI has established working groups to address various aspects of climate change adaptation and GHG mitigation. Air District staff participates in the GHG Reduction Working Group.

CRI's approach is to use research capabilities and resources at the founding institutions to provide background studies, technical data and other types of academic support to facilitate the policy-making that is necessary to develop and implement effective solutions to reducing GHG emissions and adapting to climate change impacts. CRI is looking to the Air District's 10-Point Climate Action Work Program and Regional Climate Protection Strategy (in development as part of the 2015 Clean Air Plan) as a starting point for identifying near-term priorities. Bruce Riordan, founding member of CRI, will provide an update on CRI and its near-term work program.

## BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Abby Young
Reviewed by: Henry Hilken