



BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
CLIMATE PROTECTION COMMITTEE  
COMMITTEE MEMBERS

**BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT**

JOHN AVALOS - CHAIR  
SUSAN ADAMS  
JOHN GIOIA  
JAN PEPPER  
SHIRLEE ZANE

ASH KALRA - VICE CHAIR  
TERESA BARRETT  
SCOTT HAGGERTY  
MARK ROSS

**MONDAY  
DECEMBER 1, 2014  
9:30 A.M.**

**7<sup>th</sup> FLOOR BOARD ROOM  
939 ELLIS STREET  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109**

**AGENDA**

**1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

*The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members.*

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

*(Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items Pursuant to Government Code § 54954.3) Members of the public are afforded the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for regular meetings are posted at Air District headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA, at least 72 hours in advance of a regular meeting. At the beginning of the regular meeting agenda, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Committee's subject matter jurisdiction. Speakers will be limited to three (3) minutes each.*

**3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 29, 2014**

**Staff/Phone (415) 749-**

**Clerk of the Boards/5073**

*The Committee will consider approving the attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of September 29, 2014.*

**4. MARIN CARBON PROJECT**

**J. Roggenkamp/4646**  
[jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov)

*The Committee will receive a briefing on the Marin Carbon Project.*

**5. LOCAL CLIMATE ACTION PLANS**

**J. Roggenkamp/4646**  
[jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov)

*The Committee will receive a briefing on local climate action plans in the Bay Area.*

6. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS/ OTHER BUSINESS**

*Any member of the Board, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)*

7. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

*Thursday, January 15, 2015, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.*

8. **ADJOURNMENT**

*The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.*

**CONTACT THE CLERK OF THE BOARDS**  
**[SGALLAGHER@BAAQMD.GOV](mailto:SGALLAGHER@BAAQMD.GOV)**

**(415) 749-5073**  
**FAX: (415) 928-8560**  
**939 ELLIS STREET, SF, CA 94109**  
**BAAQMD homepage:**  
**[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)**

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities (notification to the Executive Office should be given at least three working days prior to the date of the meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly).

Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**  
**939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109**  
**FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-5016 or (415) 749-4941**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:**  
**MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS**

**NOVEMBER 2014**

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	24	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets Quarterly at the call of the Chair)</i>	Monday	24	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	26	9:30 a.m.	Board Room

**DECEMBER 2014**

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> – <i>(Meets 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday every other Month)</i>	Monday	1	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	3	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	15	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Personnel Committee</b> <i>(Meets At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Monday	15	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	17	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	18	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	24	9:30 a.m.	Board Room

# JANUARY 2015

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	7	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Advisory Council Special Meeting/Retreat</b> <i>(Meets on the 2<sup>nd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	14	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> – <i>(Meets 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday every other Month)</i>	Thursday	15	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	19	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Special Meeting/Retreat</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	21	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	22	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	28	9:30 a.m.	Board Room

HL – 11/20/14 (3:10 p.m.)

P/Library/Forms/Calendar/Calendar/Moncal

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**  
Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members  
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer

Date: November 17, 2014

Re: Approval of the Minutes of September 29, 2014

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve attached draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of September 29, 2014.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Climate Protection Committee meeting of September 29, 2014.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sean Gallagher  
Reviewed by: Maricela Martinez

Attachment: Draft Minutes of the Climate Protection Meeting of September 29, 2014

Draft Minutes – Climate Protection Committee Meeting of September 29, 2014

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, California 94109  
(415) 749-5073

**DRAFT MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Climate Protection Committee Meeting  
Monday, September 29, 2014

**1. Call to Order – Roll Call**

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson John Avalos called the meeting to order at 9:41 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson John Avalos; and Directors Susan Adams, Teresa Barrett, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, Jan Pepper and Mark Ross.

Absent: Vice-Chairperson Ash Kalra and Director Shirlee Zane.

Also Present: Board of Directors (Board) Chairperson Nate Miley.

**2. Public Comment Period:**

Larry Danos, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to recognize the past air quality improvements under the watch of the Air District and expressed concern about new emissions being discovered through advancements in monitoring technology and changes expected in the petroleum refining industry.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Ross was noted present at 9:43 a.m.

Floyd Earl Smith, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to request the webcasting of future meetings; the inclusion of greenhouse gases (GHG) and GHG-impacts in the permitting process; and to provide advance notice of an upcoming clean solutions conference in which the Committee will soon be formally invited.

Harry Chomsky, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to request Air District involvement as a partner agency in California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) reviews by Bay Area cities and counties.

The Committee and staff discussed the current Air District role of providing assistance and guidance, when requested, and the different relationship between SCAQMD and the local governments in its region.

Timothy Donaghy, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to request outreach to cities and counties in the Bay Area regarding the Air District's ability to be a partner agency in the CEQA

review process and to suggest the lowering of CEQA emissions thresholds to somewhere in the range of 1,000 to 5,000 tons per year.

Marilyn Bardet, Benicians for a Safe and Healthy Community, addressed the Committee to suggest that if GHG are not a part of the CEQA process then industry will not concern themselves with lowering those emissions and to report that the City of Benicia is working to support and advance sustainability projects but any improvements are dwarfed by the major polluters in the area who have no interest in nor requirement to make similar efforts.

Director Gioia noted that California is on track to meet its 2020 state-wide goals.

Ms. Bardet responded that the disconnect between residents' efforts and those of major polluters will remain a critical issue as dirtier crudes are imported to the Bay Area refineries.

### **3. Approval of Minutes of July 17, 2014**

Committee Comments: None.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Committee Action:

Director Adams made a motion, seconded by Director Ross, to approve the Minutes of July 17, 2014; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Adams, Avalos, Barrett, Gioia, Pepper and Ross.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Haggerty, Kalra and Zane.

### **4. Regional Climate Protection Strategy Update**

Henry Hilken, Director of Planning, Rules and Research, introduced Abby Young, Principal Environmental Planner of Planning, Rules and Research, who gave the staff presentation *Regional Climate Protection Strategy Update (RCPS)*, including strategy overview and contents; sector-based gap analysis; an overview of the sectors involved; gap analysis methodology; policy analysis underway at local, regional, state and federal levels; a sample gap analysis; challenges and observations; path forward for gap analysis; and next steps for the RCPS.

The Committee and staff discussed, at slide 3, *RCPS Contents*, the form and accessibility of the data set.

NOTED PRESENT: Board Chairperson Miley and Director Haggerty were noted present at 10:09 a.m.

Ms. Young continued the presentation.

The Committee and staff discussed at slide 8, *Sample Gap Analysis*, the accuracy of the projections and forecasted trends.

Ms. Young concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed possibilities for enhancing public enthusiasm about the impact of the data; reformulating the approach to public workshops to garner greater participation by the community and local governments; cap-and-trade revenue that may be available to fund some components of the strategy and the Air District's potential role to facilitate funding of various local programs that support the strategy; outreach targets; Bay Area locales that are engaged in the strategy and whether the program will be limited to those areas deemed impacted communities; the inadequacy of solutions that focus solely on demand and the need to educate the public about the impacts of unmitigated consumption and a serious understanding of the economic consequences of climate change; encouraging public workshops to educate local governments about climate action plan commonalities and creative solutions; the legislative framework post-2020; the lack of standardized baseline inventories and measurements; the importance of finding ways to support and compliment state programs with Air District programs rather than undercut or conflict with them; and the challenges of sharing emission inventories and of creating a comprehensive baseline.

Public Comments:

Ms. Bardet addressed the Committee to invite them to an upcoming presentation in Benicia and to identify commutes through the Tri-Valley Region as major GHG source for the Bay Area, in addition to the lifestyle choices, such as international travel, by the same population.

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to express his support for consumption-based emissions inventories, as was done recently by the City and County of San Francisco; to note that emissions in China surpassed the U.S. but a consumption-based inventory shows otherwise; to suggest that climate action plans should be reviewed qualitatively and not included in any presumptions about achieving 2020 state-wide goals; and to suggest GHGs should be included in the permitting process to facilitate urgently needed change.

Charles Davidson, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Committee to suggest the Bay Area refinery projects currently underway will increase GHG emissions drastically and to suggest the Air District include GHGs in the permitting process and offer to partner with local agencies in CEQA reviews.

The Committee and staff discussed the current permitting process relative to GHGs.

Mr. Donaghy addressed the Committee to request that any Air District material relative to Bay Area climate change efforts be made publicly available.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.



**5. Climate Readiness Institute (CRI)**

Mr. Hilken introduced Bruce Riordan, Climate Strategist, Joint Policy Committee/CRI, who gave the presentation *How the CRI Can Help BAAQMD [Bay Area Air Quality Management District]*, including an overview of the CRI; its current status; potential joint projects with the Air District; and next steps.

The Committee and Mr. Riordan discussed, at slide 5, *Potential CRI Projects with BAAQMD*, whether the CRI focus is primarily on GHG reductions or climate adaptation.

Mr. Riordan concluded the presentation.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and Mr. Riordan discussed which local governments are currently in working groups and the future outreach plan; private sector partners are largely associations at this time; including an economic market facet; expansion of projects beyond the hard sciences; whether fundraising is a selective process; the inclusion of Stanford and Berkeley law schools in an attempt to avoid future legal obstructions; the tendency among public agencies to be risk averse and focused on no greater than 15-year timelines; eagerness to move past studies to action; the importance of making these topics and issues approachable for the general public and to create an emphasis on public health and outreach; and the importance of innovations by small business and the possibility of connecting with those resources through local chambers of commerce.

Public Comments:

Mr. Smith addressed the Committee regarding the turnout at the People's Climate March on Sunday, September 21, 2014 in Oakland; to thank Director Haggerty for his recent comments relative to fracking operations in Alameda County; to suggest the Air District is playing the role of the frontrunner in California much as California plays that role for the United States; and to express his appreciation for the presentations today.

Committee Action: None; receive and file.

**6. Committee Members' Comments/Other Business:** None.

**7. Time and Place of Next Meeting:**

Tentatively Monday, November 17, 2014, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at 9:30 a.m.

**8. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:37 a.m.

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

## Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members  
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 20, 2014

Re: Marin Carbon Project

**RECOMMENDED ACTION**

None; receive and file.

**BACKGROUND**

The Marin Carbon Project (MCP) was established in 2006 for the purpose of demonstrating the potential of carbon sequestration on range and agricultural lands. MCP is a consortium of agricultural producers and institutions in Marin County, university researchers, county and federal agencies and non-profit organizations.

Through photosynthesis, plants remove carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) from the atmosphere and transfer it through their root system to the soil. Undisturbed soil can sequester this CO<sub>2</sub> indefinitely. However, agricultural practices such as tilling and grazing disturb the soil and can result in the release of CO<sub>2</sub> back into the atmosphere. In 2006, MCP launched an intensive research effort to determine if the application of compost on grazed range lands could increase the land's carbon-sequestering ability.

**DISCUSSION**

In October 2013, MCP initiated a demonstration project working with three farms in West Marin to apply compost over a total of 100 acres. A one-time, one-half inch application of manure-based compost was added to the top of the rangeland soil. In January 2014, Air District staff visited one of these demonstration farms, the Straus Dairy Farm, to learn more about the MCP methodology and observe the demonstration project first-hand.

Through its work with the MCP, University of California researchers have determined that a single application of a one-half inch layer of compost on grazed rangelands can significantly increase plant growth, water retention in the soil, and soil carbon sequestration.

MCP's work has resulted in the development of a protocol for greenhouse gas (GHG) reduction, the *Methodology for Compost Additions to Grazed Grasslands* (Protocol). This Protocol has been adopted by the American Carbon Registry and has been submitted to the California Air

Resources Board (CARB) for consideration for use under CARB's Cap and Trade program. Air District staff is currently leading a review of the Protocol by the CAPCOA Engineering Managers, for potential approval by the CAPCOA Board for use by CAPCOA's Greenhouse Gas Reduction Exchange.

Air District staff anticipates that the MCP Protocol will help stimulate innovative GHG reduction projects and thus serve an important role in the Regional Climate Protection Strategy. Dr. Jeff Creque, rangeland ecologist and co-founder of the Marin Carbon Project, will present a briefing on the Project to the Committee.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Abby Young  
Reviewed by: Henry Hilken

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

## Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Avalos and Members  
of the Climate Protection Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 20, 2014

Re: Local Climate Action Plans

**RECOMMENDED ACTION**

None; receive and file.

**BACKGROUND**

Local governments in the Bay Area have been developing local climate action plans (CAPs) since the mid-1990's. The early plans were largely visionary in nature, with few mandatory measures or implementation strategies. Assistance to local governments in developing climate action plans and implementing greenhouse gas (GHG) reduction strategies has been a cornerstone of the Air District's Climate Protection Program since its inception in 2005.

In 2007, as part of its Climate Protection Grant Program, the Air District awarded 19 grants to local governments to develop stand-alone climate action plans or to integrate local climate action planning into their general plans. In 2007-2008, the Air District worked with ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability to convene county-by-county training sessions for local government staff on how to conduct community-wide greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions inventories. In 2010, the Air District released updated CEQA Guidelines that addressed GHG emissions in development projects and land use plans, and associated guidance for developing local climate action plans. Since 2010, Air District staff has worked closely with local government staff to provide technical tools and guidance, facilitate information-sharing on best practices and innovative approaches, provide feedback and review of draft climate action plans, and respond to on-demand requests for information and guidance. Today, 57 jurisdictions have adopted local climate action plans.

On November 6, 2013, the Air District Board of Directors unanimously adopted Resolution 2013-11, *Resolution Adopting a Greenhouse Gas Reduction Goal and Commitment to Develop a Regional Climate Protection Strategy*. This resolution set a goal of reducing Bay Area-wide greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions 80% below 1990 levels by 2050. The resolution also called on Air District staff to develop a Regional Climate Protection Strategy as part of the 2015 Clean Air Plan.

## DISCUSSION

In developing the Regional Climate Protection Strategy, Air District staff is currently assessing GHG emissions and trends in the nine different economic sectors included in the State Scoping Plan. As part of this analysis, Air District staff is assessing the potential impacts to Bay Area GHG emissions of key federal, state, regional and local policies in each sector. In order to assess the potential impact of local policies, Air District staff has surveyed over 50 adopted climate action plans in the Bay Area and catalogued over 1,000 GHG reduction measures. Air District staff anticipates this information being integral to the development of the Regional Climate Protection Strategy.

Air District staff will present an overview of this assessment of local CAPs, including a look at typical measures, innovative approaches, and the aggregated impact of all these local plans.

## BUDGET CONSIDERATION / FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Abby Young  
Reviewed by: Henry Hilken