

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5073

Board of Directors Regular Meeting
Wednesday, December 16, 2015

APPROVED MINUTES

Note: Audio and video recordings of the meeting are available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/board-of-directors/resolutionsagendasminutes>.

1. **CALL TO ORDER:** Chairperson Carole Groom called the meeting to order at 9:49 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Chairperson Carole Groom; Vice-Chairperson Eric Mar; Secretary Liz Kniss; and Directors John Avalos, Teresa Barrett, Tom Bates, David J. Canepa, Cindy Chavez, John Gioia, Scott Haggerty, David Hudson, Margaret Fujioka, Roger Kim (on behalf of Edwin Lee), Nate Miley, Karen Mitchoff, Jan Pepper, Katie Rice, Mark Ross, Rod Sinks, Jim Spering, Brad Wagenknecht and Shirlee Zane.

Absent: Director Rod Sinks.

Pledge of Allegiance: Chairperson Groom led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Opening Comments: Chairperson Groom acknowledged the large amount of public speakers and described the process and planned flow for the meeting.

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS:**

Greg Karas, Communities for a Better Environment (CBE), addressed the Board of Directors (Board) regarding concerns over dirty crude slates being brought to refineries in the Bay Area; public health; environmental justice; and climate change.

Ken Jones, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board regarding Rule 12, Regulation 16 (12-16); rising greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions; need for local government actions to reduce emissions; and problems with cap-and-trade.

Peter Anderson, First Presbyterian Church in San Anselmo, addressed the Board to request they do the 'right' thing and support actions to prevent climate change.

Director Gioia commented that U.S. President, Barack Obama has indicated that he will use all of his powers – including his veto – to defend his plan to fight climate change and the crude oil export ban amidst threats from congress.

Rev. Earl Koteen, Sunflower Alliance, addressed the Board regarding refinery workers; creating quality jobs that add to the health and safety of the community; and asking for adequate regulation.

Don Cuffel, Valero, addressed the Board regarding permit conditions at the refineries; existing limits; and the strong enforcement of existing permits.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Pepper was noted present at 10:05am.

Jeff Kilbreth, Richmond Planning Commission, addressed the Board with regards to the approval of 12-16; the importance of getting the limits issue resolved; and the need for appropriate reporting and adjusting schedule as needed.

Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board with regards to guarding the public health; prioritizing the proposal by CBE; approving 12-16; capping emissions; and reducing GHGs as soon as possible.

Eileen Schatz addressed the Board regarding health of children; refinery emissions; passing refinery-wide caps; protection of the air and the public health.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Kniss was noted present at 10:14am.

Rand Wrohel, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board regarding improving public health; setting caps on emissions at refineries; and attaining reductions.

NOTED PRESENT: Vice-Chair Eric Mar was noted present at 10:16am.

David McCoard, Sierra Club, addressed the Board regarding 12-16; concerns about increased emissions due to varying crude slates; refinery-wide caps and installing deadlines for these limits.

Louise Chegwiddden, NorCal Climate Mobilization, addressed the Board regarding breathing concerns due to poor air quality; health damages caused by air pollution; effects of climate change; Conference of Parties (COP) 21; revising and approving 12-16 as requested by CBE; and enforcing strict emissions limits.

Steven Nadal, Sunflower Alliance, addressed the Board requesting emissions reductions be achieved including GHGs and particulate matter emissions.

Marilyn Bardet, Benicians for a Safe and Healthy Community / Good Neighbor Steering Committee, addressed the Board regarding the COP 21; getting GHGs under control globally and locally; the effects of emissions; recent emissions from the Chevron refinery and impacts on Atchison Village in Richmond and the need for enforcement from the Air District; and bringing back 12-16 as requested by environmental groups for quick implementation.

The Board and staff discussed developing a report on Atchison Village in Richmond.

Lisa Crowley, Valero, addressed the Board in regards to fugitive volatile organic compounds (VOCs) from a Sharpie marker including the scale of VOCs with regards to air quality rule limits.

NOTED PRESENT: Directors Haggarty and Miley were noted present at 10:28am.

Chairperson Groom paused public comment in the interest of time.

3. COMMENDATIONS / PROCLAMATIONS / AWARDS

Chairperson Groom, on behalf of the Board, recognized Tom Christofk, Placer County Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), for his leadership and dedication to protecting air quality. Chairperson Groom also acknowledged Robert Weygandt, Vice-Chair of the Placer County Board of Supervisors and member of the Placer County Air Pollution Control District Board of Directors.

Mr. Christofk and Supervisor Weygandt addressed the Board and expressed appreciation. Chairperson Groom gifted a framed proclamation.

Director Hudson expressed thanks for the service of Mr. Christofk and Supervisor Weygandt.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS (continued):

Rebecca Auerbach addressed the Board regarding regulation 12-16, asking for emission caps to be installed by March 2016, decreased GHGs, and to ensure refineries reduce emissions by supporting the new regulations and rule amendments.

Laura Galligan addressed the Board regarding climate change and reducing GHGs.

Paul Kangas addressed the Board regarding solar electricity expansion to reduce GHGs.

Lawrence Danos, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board regarding cap-and-trade goals, reducing GHGs, and asking the Air District to set stricter standards.

Glenn Turner addressed the Board regarding refinery emissions concerns, instating emission caps at the refineries and supporting the passing 12-16.

Chairperson Groom introduced Jack P. Broadbent, APCO, to discuss and clarify questions around 12-16. The Board and staff discussed the refinery strategy, including Phase 1 which includes rules and regulations 6-5, 8-18, and 11-10; Phase 2 which includes rules and regulations 12-15 and 9-14; Phase 3 which includes rules and regulations 12-16; and Phase 4 including continued development of refinery emission reduction rules such as rules and regulations 6-5, 9-1, 9-9, and 2-2.

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board regarding future rules and regulation and putting into place emissions caps.

Cate Leger addressed the Board regarding climate change and reducing GHGs as soon as possible.

Anne Donjacour, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board regarding 12-16 including putting in place a timeline to achieve emissions reductions and reducing GHGs.

Jane Thomason addressed the Board regarding the negative health effects of refinery emissions on public health.

Jack Fleck, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board regarding instating rules to reduce GHGs and installing emissions caps.

Jane Vosburg, 350 Sonoma County, addressed the Board to protect local air quality and public health by enacting numeric GHG emissions caps.

Bill Vosburg, 350 Sonoma County, addressed the Board regarding 12-16, asking the Board to protect public health and the global climate by setting enforceable limits on GHG emissions.

CONSENT CALENDAR (ITEMS 4 – 9)

- 4. Minutes of the Board Meeting of November 20, 2015;**
- 5. Board Communications Received from November 18, 2015 through December 15, 2015;**
- 6. Air District Personnel on Out-of-State Business Travel;**
- 7. Notices of Violation Issued and Settlements in Excess of \$10,000 in the Months of October and November 2015;**
- 8. Extension of Contracts for My Air Online Development Services;**
- 9. Proposed Regulatory Agenda for 2016;**

Board Comments: None.

Public Comments:

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board regarding Agenda Item #7 and discussed refinery failures, violations, and settlements, asking for greater refinery regulation.

Board Action:

Director Wagenknecht made a motion, seconded by Director Kniss, to approve Consent Calendar Items 4 through 9, inclusive; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Board:

- AYES: Avalos, Barrett, Bates, Canepa, Chavez, Fujioka, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Hudson, Kim, Kniss, Mar, Miley, Mitchoff, Pepper, Rice, Ross, Spring, Wagenknecht, and Zane.
- NOES: None.
- ABSTAIN: None.
- ABSENT: Sinks.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

10. Report of the Mobile Source Committee (MSC) Meeting of December 2, 2015

MSC Chairperson Haggerty read:

The MSC met on Wednesday, December 2, 2015, and approved the minutes of October 22, 2015.

The MSC then reviewed and discussed *Projects and Contracts with Proposed Grant Awards Over \$100,000*, and recommends the Board of Directors:

1. Approve Carl Moyer Program projects and Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) projects with proposed grant awards over \$100,000 as shown in Attachment 1 to the Committee staff memorandum; and
2. Authorize the Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer to enter into agreements for the recommended projects.

The MSC then reviewed and discussed an informational staff presentation *Air Resources Board and Department of Finance Audit*, including background, scope, and timeline of program review. As part of this item, Douglas Thompson, Manager of Incentives Oversight Section at ARB, gave a portion of the presentation regarding the ARB's audit results.

The MSC then reviewed and discussed an informational staff presentation *TFCA Audit Report Results and Report on TFCA Regional Fund Expenditures and Effectiveness*, including background; audit #16 process; findings and responses; performance trend for TFCA audits #13 through #16; summary of expenditures by project category; key findings; and the expenditures and cost-effectiveness of TFCA Regional Fund and Air District sponsored projects that closed in FYE 2015.

The next meeting of the Committee is on Thursday, January 28, 2016, at 9:30 a.m.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Board Comments: None.

Board Action:

Director Haggerty made a motion, seconded by Director Wagenknecht, to approve the recommendations of the MSC; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Board:

AYES: Avalos, Barrett, Bates, Canepa, Chavez, Fujioka, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Hudson, Kim, Kniss, Mar, Miley, Mitchoff, Pepper, Rice, Ross, Spering, Wagenknecht, and Zane.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Sinks.

Public Comments:

Andres Soto, CBE, addressed the Board regarding crude-by-rail, the City of Pittsburg's effort in rejecting crude-by-rail projects, and asking the Board to reject crude-by-rail projects in the Bay Area.

11. Report of the Budget and Finance Committee (BFC) Meeting of December 7, 2015

BFC Chairperson Hudson read:

The BFC met on Monday, December 7, 2015, and approved the minutes of April 22, 2015, upon establishing a quorum.

The BFC received and discussed the staff presentation Fourth Quarter Financial Report – Fiscal Year Ending (FYE) 2015, including an overview of general fund revenues and expenses; revenue and expense year-over-year comparisons; investments; general fund balance; purchasing reporting requirements; and cumulative vendor payments in excess of \$70,000 for Board of Directors review.

The BFC then received and discussed the staff presentation First Quarter Financial Report – FYE 2016, including an overview financial results; fund revenues and expenses; revenue and expense year-over-year comparisons; investments; general fund balance; purchasing reporting requirements; and cumulative vendor payments in excess of \$70,000 for Board review.

The next meeting of the Committee is Wednesday, January 27, 2016, at 9:30 a.m.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Board Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

12. Report of the Executive Committee (EC) Meeting of December 14, 2015

EC Vice-Chair Mar read:

The EC met on Monday, December 14, 2015, and approved the minutes of September 23, 2015.

The EC received from Terry Trumbull, Esq., Chairperson of the Hearing Board, the Quarterly Report of the Hearing Board for July through September 2015.

The EC was then to receive the presentation Bay Area Regional Collaborative Executive Director Report, but this item was postponed to a future meeting.

The EC then received and discussed the staff presentation Commuter Benefits Program Update and Evaluation, including background and purpose; program overview; four commuter benefit options; compliance assistance; program evaluation; employer and employee responses; region-wide and overall impacts; new benefits by employer size; environmental outcomes; next steps; program applicability; employer choice by county; Option 4: Alternative Commuter Benefit and menu of measures; and outreach to employers.

The EC then received the staff presentation Bay Area Climate Action Leadership Summit, including background and ideas for the summit; planning and research for the summit; structure for the summit; invitees; and a proposed location and estimated time period for the event.

The EC finally received and discussed the staff presentation Planning Healthy Places, including background; goals; detailed maps of local air pollution and disproportionately impacted areas; best practices to reduce exposure; feedback; and next steps.

The next meeting of the EC is Monday, February 15, 2016, at 9:30 a.m.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Board Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

13. Report of the Ad Hoc Building Oversight Committee (AHBOC) Meeting of December 14, 2015

AHBOC Vice-Chair Mar read:

The AHBOC met on Monday, December 14, 2015, and approved the minutes of September 23, 2015.

The AHBOC received and discussed the staff presentation Bay Area Metro Center (375 Beale Street) Project Status Report – November, 2015, including updates on and photographs of construction; artist renderings of the public space shared with neighbor Rincon Place; move coordinator update; and next steps.

The AHBOC then received and discussed the staff presentation Move-In Schedule for 375 Beale Street, including background; key factors; project planning; operations planning; monitoring, and the overall schedule for the move.

The next meeting of the AHBOC is at the call of the Chair.

Public Comments: No requests received.

Board Comments: None.

Board Action: None; receive and file.

PUBLIC HEARING

14. Public Hearing to Consider Proposed New Regulation 6, Rule 5: Particulate Emissions from Refinery Fluidized Catalytic Cracking Units and to Consider Proposed Amendments to Regulation 8: Organic Compounds, Rule 18: Equipment Leaks and Regulation 11: Hazardous Pollutants, Rule 10: Hexavalent Chromium and Total Hydrocarbon Emissions from Petroleum Refinery Cooling Towers, and adoption of a Negative Declaration pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA)

Gregg Nudd, Rule Development Manager of the Meteorology, Measurement and Rules Division, gave the staff presentation *Refinery Emissions Reduction Strategy*, including an overview of the strategy; estimated emission reductions and costs; the need for reductions; rule development process; Regulation 6, Rule 5 (6-5) including major provisions, costs and estimated reductions, cost-effectiveness, areas of controversy, and response to comments; Regulation 8, Rule 18 (8-18) including equipment leaks, major provisions, emission reductions, cost effectiveness, areas of controversy, amendments, and response to comments; Regulation 11, Rule 10 (11-10) including cooling towers design, major provisions, emission reductions, cost effectiveness, areas of controversy, amendments, and response to comments; total socioeconomic impacts; environmental impacts; conclusions; and staff recommendations.

Board Comments:

The Board and staff discussed the schedule for the remaining agenda.

The Board and staff discussed 6-5 regarding a five-year timeline for repairs, protocol and timeline for compliance; 11-10 regarding discrepancies in cost for capital costs and variability in cost-effectiveness of the regulation at different refineries, leak repairs and their impacts on improving efficiencies at the refineries, fiscal impacts, alternatives; terms and conditions of the timelines associated with rules, health and safety concerns for refinery workers associated with the new regulations, refinery operation implications, and socioeconomic impacts of the regulations.

Public Comments:

Greg Karras, CBE, submitted written material entitled *Response to Change in Agenda for Board Action on December 16, 2015; ADOPT Proposed Controls AND Deadline to 'Cap' Refinery Emissions*, addressed the Board providing a letter to the Board offering that projections suggest emissions will increase under proposed regulations.

Bill Quinn, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance, addressed the Board requesting additional time for facilities to comply.

Irene Suhami, Valero, addressed the Board opposing 11-10.

Heather MacLeod addressed the Board and urged meditation; continued air monitoring; and clean air initiatives.

Judith Sullivan addressed the Board asking for action regarding petroleum-coke and urging action from the Board to prevent harm to the public health.

Carla West, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board stating that regulatory agencies not being sued by the industry are not doing their jobs.

(Anonymous representative), NorCal Climate Mobilization, addressed the Board regarding concerns of industry strong-arming agencies.

Ratha Lai, Sierra Club, addressed the Board reminding staff of the socioeconomic study suggesting no jobs will be lost with the proposed rules and regulations in front of the Board today.

Janet Johnson, Richmond Progressive Alliance, addressed the Board stating that industry and refineries can afford all that is being asked of them in the proposed rules and regulations.

Edwardo Martinez, Richmond City Council, addressed the Board regarding the protection of public health, the refineries' tactics to stall and delay actions, and the need to support the proposed regulations.

Kathy Kerridge, addressed the Board in support of the rules, regulations, and timelines proposed by staff, requesting that other rules be passed soon.

Patoth Smith, addressed the Board in support of the proposed rules, asking for numeric limits to be approved soon, and independent monitoring be done near refineries.

Lippich addressed the Board stating that he is a 25 year Richmond resident and has attended many funerals for people of all ages with cancer in his community.

Mun Mulivoo addressed the Board stating that the Richmond community health needs improvement and that she has observed many people dying of cancer in her community.

Torm Norm Praseurt addressed the Board regarding chemicals in the air in the Richmond community, requesting for action now.

Janet Pygeorge, Rodeo Citizen's Association, addressed the Board asking that refineries operate properly and reduce pollution.

Tarnel Abbott, Richmond Progressive Alliance, addressed the Board regarding hazardous emissions from refineries and the cumulative impact on those that live in the community.

Andres Soto, CBE, addressed the Board in agreement with Greg Karras, to protect the public health and do the right thing to improve environmental conditions around the refineries.

Walter Pope, Sierra Club / CBE, addressed the Board in support of rules.

Sylvia Grey-White addressed the Board stating that air pollution has caused damage to her physical health.

Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance, addressed the Board regarding threats from oil industry.

David McCoard, Sierra Club, addressed the Board requesting protection of the public.

Marie Walceck, California Nurses Association, addressed the Board regarding deaths due to air pollution in the area and in support of the proposed regulations.

Ilene, California Nurses Association, addressed the Board requesting the Board take action to prevent additional illness due to air pollution.

Denny Larson, Community Science Institute, addressed the Board regarding air quality violations, stating support with CBE's proposals, real-time emissions around refineries, and urging that a cap on emissions be put into place.

Suejung Shin, Phillips 66, addressed the Board regarding 8-18 and suggested changes before adoption.

Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area, addressed the Board in support of the proposed regulations.

Eric Walker, Valero, addressed the Board regarding operations at Valero and the risk of increased air monitoring involved with the proposed regulations.

Kevin Buchan, Western States Petroleum Association, addressed the Board regarding the request for additional time for studies and implementation of regulations and rules.

Susan Gustofson, addressed the Board regarding 8-18 and the need for safety being prioritized ahead of implementation.

Board Comments (continued):

Director Miley addressed the Board, staff, and public, stating that he supports the staff report and that he must leave the meeting due to time conflicts.

Director Haggarty addressed the Board, staff, and public, stating that he echoes Director Miley's sentiments and that he must depart the meeting due to time conflicts, as well.

Public Comments (continued):

Michael Beer addressed the Board stating that refineries cannot be trusted and asked the Board to support the communities they serve.

Nick Despota addressed the Board stating that regulation and conditions have improved at the refineries.

Director Fujioka addressed the Board, staff, and public, stating that she must leave and supports adoption of the rules.

Sylvia Hopkins addressed the Board regarding pollution at her home due to the petroleum-coke pile near her home.

Bill Pinkham, Sunflower Alliance, addressed the Board regarding health concerns for area residents, comparing the costs to the community and to the refineries.

Melvin Willis addressed the Board stating that this issue is a big health concern for our region.

Quanah Brightman, United Native Americans, addressed the Board in support of the proposed rules and regulations, stating that more needs to be done to prevent climate change.

Laurie Mintzer, Chevron, addressed the Board against the proposed rules and regulations and asking for more consistency and clarity in the rules.

Steven Yang, Chevron, addressed the Board regarding 6-5 and the requirements therein, asking for more time for implementation at the refineries.

Roger Lin, CBE, addressed the Board in support of the proposed rules and regulations, stating that tar-sands will create future increases in pollution and that emissions limits must be put into place.

Valerie Love, Center for Biological Diversity, addressed the Board in support of the proposed rules and regulations, stating that more needs to be done to address global climate change concerns.

Andres Sheilch, Center for Biological Diversity, addressed the Board in support of the proposed rules and regulations and for implementing emissions limits as soon as possible.

Jeralyn Moran, Peninsula InterFaith Climate Action, addressed the Board in support of the proposed rules and regulations and asked for greater action by the Board.

Mary Klein, Peninsula InterFaith Climate Action, addressed the Board in support of emission caps and independent air monitoring.

Al Chase addressed the Board regarding the need to protect public health of Bay Area residents.

Ella Teevan addressed the Board regarding the need for enforceable numeric caps on emissions at refineries.

Lisa Crowley, Valero, addressed the Board regarding 8-18 and concerns about rule implementation.

Chris McDowell, Tesoro, addressed the Board regarding 8-18 and concerns about implementation, requesting greater cooperation between agency and industry to achieve greater rule clarity.

Steve Leshner, Shell, addressed the Board regarding GHG emissions reductions at the Shell refinery, asking that all parties work together to find the best solutions.

Adam Smith, Valero, addressed the Board regarding the difficulty of implementing rules at the refinery.

Kathy Wheeler, Shell, addressed the Board in opposition to the proposed rules and to ask for more time and cooperation from all parties.

Kristen Debler, United Native Americans, addressed the Board regarding poor air quality in the Bay Area, and to request a cap on emissions to protect regional public health.

Tim Laidman, Green Party of Contra Costa County, addressed the Board regarding delays to the proposed rules and to ask that rules be implemented soon.

Josh Huber, East Bay Leadership Council, addressed the Board regarding the need for accurate data and information in order to build proper rules and regulations, and to ask for additional time to consider the rules and regulations.

Claire Broome, addressed the Board in favor of the rules and to ask for enforceable numeric caps on emissions going forward.

Walt Gill, Chevron, addressed the Board against the proposed rules and to ask for more time and more accurate data.

Brent Eastep, Phillips 66, addressed the Board in opposition to the proposed rules and sited questions regarding accurate emissions data.

Don Bristol, Phillips 66, addressed the Board in opposition to the proposed rules.

Adam Zuckerman, Amazon Watch, addressed the Board regarding Chevron's environmental harms worldwide and to ask for support of the community proposal.

Anna Hirsh addressed the Board in favor of the proposed rules and greater regulation.

Anonymous addressed the Board in support of the proposed rules, discussing environmental justice communities.

Board Comments (continued):

The Board and the staff discussed a summary of the regulatory framework; the Refinery Strategy and the proposed regulations the staff has presented, including the three regulations up for a vote today; reports and updates on 12-15 and 12-16 to be provided to the Stationary Source Committee (SSC) and subsequently to the Board in the second quarter of 2016; security issues at the refineries; possibility of extension of time limits for implementation; long-term discussion of all topics presented with the SSC; ARB's history of being sued by industry; and staff ability to draft four rules in one year.

Board Action:

Director Gioia made a motion, seconded by Director Mitchoff, to approve staff recommendation as amended to modify the publicly-noticed regulatory languages to delay the compliance dates for certain ammonia optimization actions by replacing the date "December 31, 2016" with the date "June 30, 2017" in Section 6-5-403.3, and by replacing the date "February 28, 2017" with the date "August 31, 2017" in Section 6-5.403.4.

Board Comments:

The Board discussed the appropriateness of accepting the amended language distributed at the beginning of the meeting; the reasons for the change in staff recommendations; degree of enforcement discretion held by staff; importance of pushing back against industry and respecting the recommendations by staff; delaying the timelines for implementation; concerns about worker safety;

requests for evaluation and updates on the rules to the SSC and the Board; cooling tower technical issues; commitment to the Air District’s mission statement; need for constant improvement at refineries; concerns regarding study period and accuracy; summary of Air District achievements in air quality; and requests to reduce oil demands.

Board Action (continued):

Director Kniss made an alternate motion to approve the amendment to modify the publicly-noticed regulatory languages to delay the compliance dates for certain ammonia optimization actions by replacing the date “December 31, 2016” with the date “June 30, 2017” in Section 6-5-403.3, and by replacing the date “February 28, 2017” with the date “August 31, 2017” in Section 6-5.403.4; the motion carried by the following vote of the Board:

- AYES: Canepa, Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Hudson, Kniss, Mitchoff, Ross, Spering, Wagenknecht, and Zane.
- NOES: Avalos, Barret, Kim, Mar, and Rice.
- ABSTAIN: None.
- ABSENT: Bates, Fujioka, Haggerty, Miley, Pepper, and Sinks.

The motion to approve staff recommendation, amended to modify the publicly-noticed regulatory languages to delay the compliance dates for certain ammonia optimization actions by replacing the date “December 31, 2016” with the date “June 30, 2017” in Section 6-5-403.3, and by replacing the date “February 28, 2017” with the date “August 31, 2017” in Section 6-5.403.4 carried by the following vote of the Board:

- AYES: Avalos, Barret, Canepa, Chavez, Gioia, Groom, Hudson, Kim, Kniss, Mar, Mitchoff, Rice, Ross, Spering, Wagenknecht, and Zane.
- NOES: None.
- ABSTAIN: None.
- ABSENT: Bates, Fujioka, Haggerty, Miley, Pepper, and Sinks.

Board direction was given to staff to provide updates to SSC and Board on rule implementation.

15. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS: No requests received.

16. BOARD MEMBERS’ COMMENTS: None.

OTHER BUSINESS

17. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO:

Mr. Broadbent extended appreciation of all of those who were able to attend the 60th Anniversary party of the Air District and a wish for a happy holidays to all.

18. Chairperson’s Report: None.

19. Time and Place of Next Meeting

Wednesday, January 6, 2016 meeting has been canceled. Next meeting will be held on Wednesday, January 20, 2016, at The Port of San Francisco, Pier 1, Bayside Room, San Francisco, CA 94111 at 9:45 a.m.

20. Adjournment: The Board meeting adjourned at 2:05 p.m.

/s/ Tom Flannigan

Tom Flannigan
Acting Clerk of the Boards