

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, California 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Climate Protection Committee Meeting
Monday, December 2, 2019

1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL

Climate Protection Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Teresa Barrett, called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Present: Chairperson Teresa Barrett; and Directors Scott Haggerty, Liz Kniss, Katie Rice, Mark Ross, and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Vice Chair John Gioia; and Directors David Hudson, Lori Wilson, and Shirlee Zane.

Also Present: None.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS, PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54954.3

No requests received.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JUNE 10, 2019

NOTED PRESENT: Director Ross was noted present at 9:32 a.m.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Kniss made a motion, seconded by Director Wagenknecht, to **approve** the Minutes of June 10, 2019; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Haggerty, Kniss, Rice, Wagenknecht.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Gioia, Hudson, Ross, Wilson, Zane.

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 19, 2019

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Kniss made a motion, seconded by Director Wagenknecht, to **approve** the Minutes of June 10, 2019; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Barrett, Haggerty, Kniss, Rice.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: Wagenknecht.
ABSENT: Gioia, Hudson, Ross, Wilson, Zane.

5. UPDATE ON AIR DISTRICT'S BUILDING DECARBONIZATION PROGRAM (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 7)

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, introduced Axum Teferra, Planner, who gave the staff presentation *Air District Building Decarbonization Program*, including: from a Clean Air Plan to a building decarbonization strategy; identifying Air District actions; building sector strategies; local government building decarbonization clearinghouse; incentive programs; regional collaboration; and building decarbonization program next steps.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the suggestion for a heat pump education and rebate program; the anticipated launch of the Local Government Building Decarbonization Clearinghouse; methods of outreach to jurisdictions and resulting attendance of energy storage forums that the Air District co-hosted with the Bay Area Regional Energy Network; concerns about the use of electric appliances and vehicles during power outages and the need for gas alternatives; the reliability of the electric grid and the need for improvements; the need to identify the total contribution of the

built environments to climate change; and the need for continual education and interaction with jurisdictions.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

6. MARIN COUNTY LOW-CARBON CONCRETE ORDINANCE (ITEM 5)

Abby Young, Planning and Climate Protection Manager, introduced Alice Zanmiller, Planner from County of Marin, who gave the presentation *Marin County Low-Carbon Concrete Ordinance*, including: local climate action context – what’s missing; embodied versus operational carbon emissions in buildings; Bay Area low-carbon concrete code; next steps; and barriers, opportunities, and questions.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Miya Kitahara, StopWaste.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the metric by which cumulative carbon emissions are measured; tradeoffs of locally-sourced cement; cement mixture qualities and carbon impacts; utilizing fly ash; what initiated this effort in Marin County, and how easily other jurisdictions might adopt this ordinance; integrity, cost, and feasibility of the alternative cement options; the probability that statewide legislation will be needed beyond jurisdictional adoption; how Marin County plans to track adoption success; the source of cement emissions and how carbon impacts during the cement-making process can be minimized; the comparison of emissions from cement production and air travel; and appreciation to the Air District for helping to fund this work.

Committee Actions

None; receive and file.

7. BUILDING ELECTRIFICATION TRENDS AND OPPORTUNITIES (ITEM 6)

Ms. Young introduced Panama Bartholomy, Director of the Building Decarbonization Coalition, who gave the presentation *Building Electrification Trends and Opportunities*, including: Berkeley bans natural gas in new buildings; 50+ California and local governments actively exploring zero-emissions reach codes; California’s greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions today (buildings 24%); electricity is getting cleaner, moving toward 100% carbon-free by 2045; transitioning to cleaner power sources; electric heat offers pathway to zero emissions; California is top state for new gas connections from 2013 to 2017; gas infrastructure costs and economic challenges for some residents; gas prices are increasing faster than electricity prices; rising gas costs lead to downward spiral of gas system; Nitrogen Oxide (NOx) in California and in Bay Area; stock turnover; electric buildings can be; California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) decarbonization plans; Title 24 2022 – time dependent source energy; California Restaurant Association sues Berkeley over

natural gas ban; food services is energy intensive; the Energy Use Intensity Challenge; the challenge for food service; how much energy does the food service industry buy; resiliency from wildfires and power shutoffs; about 20,000 Pacific Gas & Electric (PG&E) customers in Sonoma County still have no natural gas service; decarbonization targets within the building sector; and suggestions.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Miya Kitahara, StopWaste.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the adoption rate of local governments who are “exploring” zero-emissions reach codes; whether reach codes should allow the use of propane; the existing housing stock’s current energy efficiency and offset strategies; the concern about the lack of electrical storage capacity mentioned in the presentation; and the need to reach out to the food service industry and mitigate challenges regarding permit avoidance.

Committee Actions

None; receive and file.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS, PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54954.3

No requests received.

9. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

None.

10. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Thursday, February 20, 2020, at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:10 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards