

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, California 94105  
(415) 749-5073

**APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Mobile Source Committee Meeting  
Wednesday, December 18, 2019

**1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL**

Mobile Source Committee (Committee) Chairperson, David J. Canepa, called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Present: Chairperson David J. Canepa; and Directors Margaret Abe-Koga, David Hudson, Tyrone Jue, Liz Kniss, Karen Mitchoff, Katie Rice, and Rod Sinks.

Absent: Vice Chair Pauline Russo Cutter; and Director Scott Haggerty.

Also Present: None.

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS, PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54954.3**

No requests received.

**3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 24, 2019**

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Kniss made a motion, seconded by Director Hudson, to **approve** the Minutes of October 24, 2019; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Abe-Koga, Canepa, Hudson, Jue, Kniss, Rice, Sinks.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Cutter, Haggerty, Mitchoff.

**4. PROJECTS AND CONTRACTS WITH PROPOSED GRANT AWARDS OVER \$100,000**

Karen Schkolnick, Strategic Incentives Division Director, introduced Daniel Langmaid, Staff Specialist, who gave the staff presentation *Projects and Contracts with Proposed Grant Awards Over \$100,000*, including: overview; Carl Moyer Program (CMP) and Mobile Source Incentive Fund (MSIF); Community Health Protection Grant Program (CHP); CMP, MSIF, CHP project recommendations over \$100,000; Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) recommendations over \$100,000; status of incentive funding awarded since July 2019 by funding source, project category, and county; status of solicitations; and recommended action.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the award amount for Project #20R09; the average rate of eligibility of project applications submitted to the Carl Moyer and Community Health Protection Grant Programs; the breakdown of awarded funds by county; and the status of the San Jose State University Ridesharing and Trip Reduction project, and whether this project will expand into other areas.

Committee Action

Director Rice made a motion, seconded by Director Abe-Koga, to recommend that the Board **approve** staff recommendations; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Abe-Koga, Canepa, Hudson, Jue, Kniss, Rice, Sinks.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Cutter, Haggerty, Mitchoff.

**5. TRANSPORTATION FUND FOR CLEAN AIR PROGRAM AUDIT #20 RESULTS**

Ms. Schkolnick introduced Betty Kwan, Staff Specialist, who gave the staff presentation *Transportation Fund for Clean Air Program Audit #20 Results*, including: overview; background; Audit #20 scope and results; and next steps.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Mitchoff was noted present at 9:49 a.m.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed how a surcharge on the motor vehicle registration fee, collected by the Department of Motor Vehicles, serves as a continual funding source to the Air District, to fund projects that implement transportation control measures in accordance with the 1988 California Clean Air Act, and the Bay Area 2017 Clean Air Plan.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

**6. REPORT ON TRANSPORTATION FUND FOR CLEAN AIR PROJECT EXPENDITURES AND EFFECTIVENESS FOR FISCAL YEAR ENDING (FYE) 2019**

Ms. Schkolnick introduced Sean Newlin, Staff Specialist, who gave the staff presentation *Transportation Fund for Clean Air Expenditures and Effectiveness and Fiscal Year Ending 2019*, including: overview; background; FYE 2019 TFCA expenditures by project category; effectiveness regarding emissions reductions; cost-effectiveness and other key report findings; and next steps.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the estimated total vehicle fleet in the Bay Area; factors that contributed to the higher-than-expected cost-effectiveness value of the 511 Regional Carpool Program as a Regional Fund project, and the status of the 511 Regional Carpool Program as a candidate (applicant) for Air District funds; need to demonstrate how “failed” projects can be reconciled; how to evaluate the cost-effectiveness of Spare the Air activities and Air District-sponsored programs, whose success is based on behavioral change; how improvements made to the 511 Regional Carpool Program could affect the Air District’s Commuter Benefits Program; the need to identify effective ways to get people out of their vehicles and use different and cleaner modes of transportation instead; how often the Air District’s actions are informed by the actions of other air districts and similar agencies in other countries; the lack of awarded shuttle projects, and what type of shuttle projects the Air District would be willing to fund, based on ridership trends; and the suggestion of developing a model that collects on-demand data from subsidized ride share companies.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

**7. POLICY TO PROHIBIT USE OF AIR DISTRICT FUNDS ON VEHICLES MANUFACTURED BY COMPANIES THAT OPPOSE CALIFORNIA’S REGULATION OF LIGHT-DUTY VEHICLE EMISSIONS**

Damian Breen, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Technology, introduced Linda Hui, Senior Staff Specialist, who gave the staff presentation *Policy to Prohibit Use of Air District Funds on Vehicles Manufactured by Companies that Oppose California’s Regulations of Light-Duty Vehicle Emissions*, including: overview; background; proposed policy; potential impacts on Air District fleet and grant programs; next steps; and recommended action.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed Marin County’s recently-adopted resolution to adopt a vehicle purchasing policy that aligns with the State of California, and the County’s Fleet Conversion, that will help the County reach its Assembly Bill 32 & Senate Bill 375 climate change targets; concern about potentially reduced availability of clean vehicles, leading to higher costs for fleet purchases; the anticipated timeline of the implementation of the finalized draft of the Air District’s policy; concern that the public will continue to purchase their preferred choice of vehicles, unaware of, or, despite, the ongoing lawsuit between the federal government and California over fuel economy standards; the amount of Toyota vehicles within the Air District’s current fleet, and if/when those assets will be phased out and replaced with vehicles by manufacturers that support California’s authority to set emission vehicle standards; California’s Clean Vehicle Rebate program and anticipated impacts to vehicle sales in the Bay Area; the Air District’s predictions regarding the actions of the manufacturers that currently support the federal government; the history and current status of California’s waiver for specified emission standards, and how, until a new standard is created, a divergence from the California waiver does not exist; the need for local jurisdictions to support the state’s authority to set its own emission vehicle standards; opinions regarding the likelihood that the manufacturers that currently support the federal government will reconsider their current actions; and the suggestion of refraining from using the words “good” and “bad” manufacturers.

Committee Action

Director Rice made a motion, seconded by Director Mitchoff, to recommend that the Board **authorize** staff to develop policies that would prohibit Air District incentive and general funds from being used for the purchase of light duty vehicles manufactured by companies that oppose the State of California’s right to regulate light-duty vehicle emissions; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

- AYES: Abe-Koga, Canepa, Hudson, Jue, Kniss, Mitchoff, Rice, Sinks.
- NOES: None.
- ABSTAIN: None.
- ABSENT: Cutter, Haggerty.

**8. EXPANSION OF EXISTING CENTER FOR SUSTAINABLE ENERGY (CSE) CONTRACT**

Mr. Breen introduced Rebecca Fisher, Program Lead of Outreach and Partnerships, who gave the staff presentation *Contract for Electric Vehicles (EV) Market Research and Survey Services*, including: EV Market Research study; contract with CSE; and recommended action.

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed whether this contract pertains to only light-duty vehicles; and the contractor’s request for a larger survey sample size to provide better granularity.

Committee Action

Director Hudson made a motion, seconded by Director Sinks, to recommend that the Board **authorize** the Executive Officer/APCO to increase an existing contract with the Center for Sustainable Energy in an amount not to exceed \$5,000 for Electric Vehicle market research services; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Abe-Koga, Canepa, Hudson, Jue, Kniss, Mitchoff, Rice, Sinks.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Cutter, Haggerty.

**9. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

No requests received.

**10. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

Director Hudson announced that early-bird registration has been extended for the 33<sup>rd</sup> Annual World Electric Vehicle Symposium and Exposition, which will take place in Portland, Oregon, from June 14, 2020 – June 17, 2020. Vanessa Johnson, Manager of Executive Operations, added that any Committee (Board) members who wish to attend in their capacity as Air District Board members must obtain clearance from the current Board Chairperson. Director Rice encouraged Committee members to circulate this event to city and county staff, as battery storage will also be addressed.

**11. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Thursday, February 27, 2020, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 9:30 a.m.

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:21 a.m.

*/s/ Marcy Hiratzka*  
Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards