

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

Stationary Source & Climate Impacts Committee
Wednesday, November 8, 2023

APROVED MINUTES

This meeting was webcast, and a video recording is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas

CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments:** Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Lynda Hopkins, called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present, In-Person (Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, Yerba Buena Room, San Francisco, California, 94105): Committee Chairperson Lynda Hopkins; Board Chairperson John J. Bauters; and Director Tyrone Jue.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (Office of Contra Costa County Supervisor, John Gioia, Conference Room, 11780 San Pablo Ave., Suite D, El Cerrito, CA 94530): Director John Gioia.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (Palo Alto City Hall, 250 Hamilton Ave., 7th Floor, Palo Alto, California, 94301): Director Vicki Veenker.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (Office of Santa Clara County Supervisor Otto Lee, 70 W Hedding St., East Wing, 10th Floor, San Jose, California, 95110): Director Otto Lee.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location (Office of Alameda County Supervisor David Haubert, 4501 Pleasanton Ave., Pleasanton, California, 94566): Vice Chairperson David Haubert.

Absent: Directors Director Ken Carlson, Noelia Corzo, Myrna Melgar, and Mark Ross.

2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

CONSENT CALENDAR

3. APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE STATIONARY SOURCE AND CLIMATE IMPACTS COMMITTEE MEETING OF OCTOBER 11, 2023

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Jue made a motion, seconded by Board Chair Bauters, to **approve** the Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee Meeting of October 11, 2023; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Bauters, Gioia, Haubert, Hopkins, Jue, Lee, Veenker.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Carlson, Corzo, Melgar, Ross.

INFORMATIONAL ITEM

4. ASSESSMENT AND MITIGATION OF WOODSMOKE IMPACTS

Stephen Reid, Senior Advanced Projects Advisor in the Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling Division, gave the staff presentation *Woodsmoke Impacts: Assessment and Mitigation*, including: outcomes; outline; assessing woodsmoke impacts; background on residential woodsmoke; emissions inventory updates and summary; emission trends; device population and activity trends; residential woodsmoke causes elevated black carbon levels; analysis of Particulate Matter (PM)_{2.5} composition by month; air quality modeling approach; preliminary modeling results; preliminary estimates of impacts; mitigating woodsmoke impacts; Air District sponsored woodsmoke reduction incentive programs; Woodsmoke Reduction Incentive Program; Regulation 6, Rule 3; scoping phase of the rule development process; white paper development; potential policy options to explore; and upcoming work.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County.

Committee Comments

The Committee and staff discussed the rate of participation of past woodsmoke reduction incentive programs offered by the Air District; the desire for additional education on the health impacts of woodsmoke; outreach methods and targeted audiences regarding wood smoke health impacts

messaging; the way in which priority communities are identified; the suggestion of incentivizing induction stoves; whether the \$2 million allocated to the Bay Area for the Clean Heating Efficiently with Electric Technology (HEET) program may be stretched to help more households than 270; when the levels of particular sources (ammonium nitrate and sea salt) of PM_{2.5} are highest; whether commercial pizza ovens are considered a significant source of PM_{2.5}; regarding device trends, whether the Air District can tell whether wood stove and fireplace population decreases are due to people converting to gas-burning appliances, or decommissioning their gas *and* wood burning devices altogether; the request for the percentage of the overall Bay Area households that have wood burning devices; whether the health of those *inside* the home is more impacted by woodsmoke generated from wood-burning devices inside of a home than those *outside* of the home; the type of electric heat pumps that are being incentivized in the 2023-2024 Clean HEET program, and whether duct systems are included in the program; the comparison of preliminary (modeled) mortality and asthma rates (residential woodsmoke vs. space and water heating appliances); the history of California's smoking bans, how they have changed behavior, and whether that is comparable to the banning of residential wood-burning; advantages and disadvantages of regulating wood-burning devices in designated Assembly Bill (AB) 617 and low-income communities; the suggestions of identifying entities with whom the Air District should engage as the white paper (that provides decision-making context about this source type and recommendations on potential policy responses) is being developed; whether the Air District plans to reattempt its previous rulemaking (which was withdrawn) which would require homeowners who wish to sell their home to replace their existing fireplace at point-of-sale in the transaction, or risk the home sale being stopped; vegetation/fuels management practices on private property, and whether burning trees from one's own property to heat the home (as the sole source of heat) can be addressed in the whitepaper; the role that population density plays in the development of woodsmoke regulation policy; the request that Bay Area topography needs to be addressed in the whitepaper; the desire for youth engagement and outreach, regarding this issue; the suggestion that the Air District partners its Spare the Air messaging with Walk and Roll to School, Ruby Bridges Walk to School Day, and Safe Routes to School programs that already encourage non-motor vehicle modes of transportation; the request for data on the ongoing costs (and economic impacts) of heating homes; and the need to consider people who may be disproportionately impacted, economically, by a new woodsmoke regulation.

Committee Action

None; receive and file.

OTHER BUSINESS

5. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Raymond Baltar, Sonoma Ecology Center.

6. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

Chair Hopkins announced that Ruby Bridges Walk to School Day is recognized by the State of California on November 14 of each year, commemorating 6-year old Ruby Bridge's activism to end racial segregation in public schools in 1960.

7. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Wednesday, December 13, 2023, at 10:00 a.m. at 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. The meeting will be in-person for the Stationary Source and Climate Impacts Committee members and members of the public will be able to either join in-person or via webcast.

8. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:38 a.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards