

Bay Area Air District
375 Beale Steet, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105

Stationary Source Committee Meeting
Wednesday, December 10, 2025

APPROVED MINUTES

This meeting was webcast, and a video recording is available on the website of the Bay Area Air District at www.baaqmd.gov/bodagendas

CALL TO ORDER

1. **Opening Comments:** Stationary Source Committee (Committee) Chairperson, Ken Carlson, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present, In-Person (Bay Area Metro Center, 1st Floor Yerba Buena Room, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105): Chairperson Ken Carlson; and Directors Brian Colbert and Rico E. Medina.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location: (Office of Contra Costa County Supervisor John Gioia Conference Room 11780 San Pablo Ave., Suite D El Cerrito, CA 94530): Directors John Gioia; Gabe Quinto; and Steve Young.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location: (Santa Rosa Junior College Campus Doyle Library, Room 148 1501 Mendocino Ave. Santa Rosa, CA 95401): Vice Chairperson Lynda Hopkins.

Present, In-Person Satellite Location: (Alameda County, Board of Supervisors District 3, 101 Callan Ave., Suite 103, San Leandro, CA 94577): Director Lena Tam.

Absent: Directors Dionne Adams.

2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

CONSENT CALENDAR

3. APPROVAL OF THE DRAFT MINUTES OF THE STATIONARY SOURCE COMMITTEE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 12, 2025

Public Comments

No requests received.

Committee Comments

None.

Committee Action

Director Medina made a motion, seconded by Director Quinto, to **approve** the Draft Minutes of the Stationary Source Committee meeting of November 12, 2025; and the motion **carried** by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Carlson, Gioia, Hopkins, Medina, Quinto, Tam, Young.
NOES: None.
ABSTAIN: None.
ABSENT: Adams, Colbert.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

4. UPDATE ON COMMENTS ON REGULATION 11, RULE 18 - REDUCTION OF RISK FROM AIR TOXIC EMISSIONS AT EXISTING FACILITIES

Gregory Nudd, Deputy Executive Officer of Policy, provided an update (no formal presentation) on public comments received by the Air District, regarding Regulation 11, Rule 18 - Reduction of Risk from Air Toxic Emissions at Existing Facilities. Mr. Nudd said that at the November 12, 2025, Stationary Source Committee meeting, Air District staff provided an update on Rule 11-18. Currently, staff is working on a streamlining package that is meant to accelerate implementation and installation of control devices. Air District staff had characterized comments that had been received, and found out, after November 12, 2025, that one of the comments was not seen in time because it was sitting in a spam folder in Microsoft. To complete the record, Mr. Nudd summarized those unseen comments for the Stationary Sources Committee's awareness.

The comments were from Communities for a Better Environment (CBE), and the comments explained the following:

- CBE opposes facility-prepared Health Risk Assessments (HRA) and instead recommends that the Air District hires third-party vendors to conduct the HRAs.
- CBE requests an additional comment period on the final HRA, if there are substantial changes after the comment period on the preliminary HRA.

- CBE requests additional details on limits to Risk Reduction Program submission extensions and the requirements for interim risk reduction goals in the risk reduction plans.
- CBE proposes the inclusion of non-routine emissions in emissions inventory for the HRA.
- With respect to the Dispute Resolution Panel (DRP), CBE requests that risk reduction measures not be delayed by the DRP proceedings, and that those proceedings be transparent and include the opportunity to provide public comments along with the Air District responses.

Mr. Nudd concluded by stating that Air District staff are reviewing these comments in consideration of a future Board action in 2026.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Kaitlin Alconitn, CBE; Kevin Buchan, Western States Petroleum Association (WSPA); and Kathy Kerridge, Benicia resident.

Committee Comments

The Committee and Air District staff discussed the importance of considering CBE’s comments prior to Board action, as CBE’s 2023 lawsuit alleged that the Air District did not provide sufficient community participation in the Rule 11-18’s implementation; and whether permitted facilities should be allowed to conduct their own Health Risk Assessments.

Committee Action

No action taken.

5. UPDATE ON REGULATION 9, RULE 6 - CONSIDERATION OF CONCEPTS FOR AFFORDABILITY AND AVAILABILITY AMENDMENTS

Jennifer Lam, Rules and Strategic Policy Division Manager, gave the staff presentation *Rule 9-6: Consideration of Concepts for Affordability and Availability Amendments*, including: outline; building Nitrogen Oxides (NOx) emissions overview; health benefits overview; upcoming implementation timelines; overview of the concept paper; flexibility concepts: smallest units; flexibility concepts: project constraints; flexibility concepts: emergencies; flexibility concepts: income qualification; potential impacts from the concepts; public comment summary; next steps; considerations for discussion; additional steps; questions & discussion.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Colbert was noted present at 10:21 a.m.

Public Comments

Public comments were given by Dr. Rachel Gottlieb, Climate Health Now; Dr. Robert Gould, San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility; Dr. Marjorie Chen, San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility; Dr. Ann Harvey; San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility; Sam Fishman, San Francisco Planning and Urban Research

Association; Bhima Sheridan, District Homes; Dr. Mary Williams, San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility; John McKenna, Menlo Park resident; Hon. Igor Tregub, City of Berkeley; Susan Green, San Francisco Climate Emergency Coalition; Bill Olsen, Alamo resident; Fariya Ali, Pacific Gas & Electric; Mary Dateo, Mountain View resident; Gerard Manning; Brian Schmidt, Menlo Spark; Nick Despota, Richmond resident; Fernando Gaytan, Earthjustice; Angela Evans, Menlo Spark; Heather Bromfield, Enterprise Community Partners; Bruce Hodge, Carbon Free Palo Alto; Jocelyn Anaya, Menlo Spark; Linh Dan Do, Menlo Park resident; Dr. Wendy Bernstein; Melissa Yu, Sierra Club; David Moller, Marin Electrification Council; Colleen Corrigan, Oakland resident; Mayna Yung, Business and Housing Network; Jed Holtzman, Rocky Mountain Institute; Tony Sirna, Evergreen Action; Dr. Julie Lindow, San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility; Heather McCloud, Oakland resident; Dr. Stephen Rosenblum, Climate Action California; Rod Sinks, Cupertino resident; David Stark, Bay East Association of Realtors; Lucinda Young, Albany resident; Alma; Alejandro; Kathy Battat; Peter Belden, San Francisco resident; Lisa Jackson, 350 Contra Costa Action; Connie Miller, Santa Clara County resident; Andy McNamara, Carbon Zero Buildings; Robert Mayo, Mountain View resident; Dr. Bret Andrews, San Francisco Bay Physicians for Social Responsibility; Wynn Tucker, Green and Healthy Homes Initiative; Ilona Clark, Richmond resident; Michael Corbett, Bradford White; Melvin Willis, Alliance of Californians for Community Empowerment Institute; Lynda Amen, Napa resident; Sven Thesen, National Charging Access Coalition; Lisa Badenfort, North Bay Association of Realtors; Kathy Kerridge, Benicia resident; Daniela Suarez, Local Clean Energy Alliance; Bruce Naegel, Mountain View resident; Charlie Boyd; Wendy Chou, San Mateo resident; Debbie Mytels; Tom Kabat, Menlo Park resident; Cherlyn W, 350 Silicon Valley; Joanna Falla, Palo Alto resident; Dennis Murphy, Acterra; Ann Brown, Tri-Valley Air Quality Climate Alliance; and Christina B, Richmond resident.

Committee Comments

The Committee and Air District staff discussed the dollar amounts for income-qualified property owners, and whether to establish different income level thresholds by county; the average cost of upgrading a home's electric panels; concerns regarding the potential misuse of exemptions; the maximum duration that emergency replacement stock may be temporarily installed; whether a socioeconomic impact analysis policy will have been created by February 2026 to ensure that equity is being considered; Marin Clean Energy's Heat Pump Water Heater Program; the average upfront incremental cost before incentives to install a new heat pump water heater, and the comparison of that estimate to costs estimated by the South Coast Air Quality Management District; total versus incremental costs; whether the Air District has received threats of federal legal action which may delay implementation; whether the Air District will offer a rebate program; the request for median income by the number of people in a household; whether the Air District plans to phase out the exemption process over time; the need for consistent implementation messaging for contractors (large and small businesses); whether the Air District will provide the public with an online landing page with Frequently Asked Questions; the importance of speaking with property owners, especially of multi-unit housing, who have completed electrical conversions, to discover friction points, prior to the next Board action on Rule 9-6; outreach efforts to all stakeholders; the suggestion of creating an entity to act as the sole clearinghouse where stakeholders can get assistance with resources, exemptions, and rebates within local jurisdictions; setting an end date by looking at technology development; the need to consider the current affordability crisis in the Bay

Area, with rising housing costs and foreclosures increasing in some high-risk areas, when developing this rule; concerns that some people may have oversimplified the process and overestimated the costs; the desire to elevate this conversation at the State level for incentives; the request for data on the top poverty level related to area median income to analyze how that overlies with Assembly Bill 617 and other overburdened communities; and the desire to see implementation begin within the next 12 months.

Committee Action

No action taken.

OTHER BUSINESS

6. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

7. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS

The Committee wished everyone Happy Holidays.

8. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

Wednesday, February 11, 2026, at 10:00 a.m. The meeting will be held in-person at the Bay Area Metro Center and at satellite locations as may be specified on the meeting agenda using a remote teleconferencing link. Members of the Stationary Source Committee and the public may attend at any of those in-person locations, and members of the public may also attend virtually via webcast.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 1:04 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Board