ADVISORY COUNCIL
REGULAR MEETING

WEDNESDAY
NOVEMBER 12, 2008
10:30 A.M.

AGENDA

CALL TO ORDER
Opening Comments
Roll Call
Louise Bedsworth, Chairperson
Clerk

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD
Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3. The public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council meetings and Committee meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council’s or Committee’s purview. Speakers are limited to five minutes each.

CONSENT CALENDAR
1. Approval of Minutes of September 10, 2008 and October 21, 2008

COMMITTEE REPORTS
2. Public Health Committee Meeting of October 8, 2008
   Brian Zamora, Chair
3. Technical Committee Meeting of October 22, 2008
   Kraig Kurucz, Chair

   The Council will consider a resolution developed by the Technical Committee to address climate change and regional air pollution.

DISCUSSION
4. Approval of Executive Committee Recommendation on 2009 Slate of Advisory Council Officers
   Louise Bedsworth, Chair

   The Council will consider approval of 2009 Slate of Advisory Council Officers.
PRESENTATION
5. Recognition of Outgoing Advisory Council Members
   Louise Bedsworth, Chair

   The Council will recognize outgoing Advisory Council members.

DISCUSSION
6. Discussion of Proposed Role of Advisory Council
   Jack P. Broadbent

   The Council will discuss the role of the Advisory Council.

OTHER BUSINESS
7. Council Member Comments/Other Business

   Council or staff members on their own initiative, or in response to questions posed by the public, may:
   ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on their own activities, provide
   a reference to staff about factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting
   concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda.

8. Time and Place of Next Meeting

   10:00 a.m., Wednesday, January 14, 2009, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA  94109.

9. Adjournment

CONTACT EXECUTIVE OFFICE - 939 ELLIS STREET SF, CA 94109

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk’s Office
  should be given in a timely manner, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all,
  members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 939
  Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all,
  members of that body. Such writing(s) may also be posted on the District’s website (www.baaqmd.gov) at
  that time.
**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:**

**MONTHLY CALENDAR OF DISTRICT MEETINGS**

### NOVEMBER 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE OF MEETING</th>
<th>DAY</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>ROOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Joint Policy Committee</td>
<td>Friday</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>10:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.</td>
<td>MTC 101 - 8th Street 8th Street 101 - 8th Street Oakland, CA 94607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Executive Committee Meeting</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10:00 a.m.</td>
<td>Room 716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Regular Meeting (Meets 2nd Wednesday Every Other Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10:30 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Personnel Committee (At the Call of the Chair)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10:45 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Ad Hoc Cme. on Port Emissions (At the Call of the Chair)</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee (Meets 4th Wednesday of each month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>Immediately Following Ad Hoc Cme. on Port Emissions</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee – (Meets 4th Thursday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Immediately Following Board Meeting</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee Meeting (Meets 3rd Thursday Every Other Month) – TO BE RESCHEDULED</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Legislative Committee (Meets 4th Monday of the Month)</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee (Meets 4th Wednesday of each month) - RESCHEDULED TO MONDAY, NOVEMBER 17, 2008</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### DECEMBER 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE OF MEETING</th>
<th>DAY</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>ROOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Technical Committee (Meets 1st Monday of every even Month) - CANCELLED</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee Meeting (Meets 3rd Thursday Every Other Month)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

December 2008 Calendar Continued on Next Page
### DECEMBER 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE OF MEETING</th>
<th>DAY</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>ROOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Air Quality Planning Committee (Meets 1st Thursday Even Month)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Public Health Committee – (Meets 2nd Wednesday Even Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1:30 p.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee (Meets 3rd Monday Quarterly)</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Legislative Committee (Meets 4th Monday of the Month)</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee (Meets 4th Wednesday of each month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AT THE CALL OF THE CHAIR</td>
<td><strong>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee – (Meets 4th Thursday of each Month)</strong></td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### JANUARY 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE OF MEETING</th>
<th>DAY</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>ROOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee (Meets 1st Thursday every other Month)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Executive Committee Meeting (Meets 2nd Wednesday Every Other Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9:00 a.m.</td>
<td>Room 716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Regular Meeting (Meets 2nd Wednesday Every Other Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10:00 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee – (Meets 4th Thursday of each Month)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Legislative Committee (Meets 4th Monday of the Month)</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee (Meets 4th Wednesday of each month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HL - 11/6/08 (11:15 a.m.)
P/Library/Forms/Calendar/Calendar/Moncal
Call To Order

Opening Comment: Chairperson Bedsworth called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m.


Absent: William Hanna and Steven T. Kmucha.

Public Comment Period – There were no public comments.

Consent Calendar

1. Approval of Minutes of July 9, 2008

   • Council Member Kurucz requested minor edits be made to the Technical Committee report.

Committee Action: Council Member Holtzclaw moved to approve the Minutes of July 9, 2008, as amended; seconded by Council Member Zamora; abstained by Mr. Dawid as he was not in attendance for the July 9th meeting; carried unanimously without objection.

Committee Reports

2. Technical Committee Meeting of August 4, 2008

Committee Chair Kurucz reported that the Committee had a discussion on presentations received from speakers over the past year. Speakers included Saffet Tanrikulu, David Fairley, both from the Air District, informing the Committee of the data analysis conducted on local pollution and particulate matter. In addition, Professor Rob Harley addressed the Committee on the consequences of changes in temperature, inflow boundary conditions, local emissions on air quality and a presentation from Dr. Phil Duffy on past and future temperature worldwide. Information from these presentations has been synthesized and the Committee is now working
towards a recommendation to the full Council. Mr. Kurucz reviewed the Committee’s discussion on climate change and regional pollution. Inter-related subjects discussed include: regional reactions to global climate change; implications of renewable energy involving energy conservation and health; and land use planning strategies. Mr. Kurucz continued stating that the Air District should include climate change issues in its multi-pollutant, multi-scale air quality management planning process, including implying and validating the best available multi-scale, multi-pollutant models to local linkages between air quality and climate change. It was also requested that the Air District stay current and get the best tools available for experts to use in their air quality planning efforts in proposing new regulations.

The Committee discussed whether the Air District should have a Climate Protection Officer, which will be revisited at a future meeting. Mr. Kurucz concluded his reported.

Chairperson Bedsworth stated that Ms. Drennen would provide the Air Quality Planning Committee report with recommendations to AB32 Draft Scoping Plan.

4. Air Quality Planning Committee Meeting of August 11, 2008

Committee Chair Drennen reported that for agenda planning purposes, October 2nd or October 16th will be considered as potential dates for the next Air Quality Planning Committee meeting. The topic will include High Occupancy Toll Lanes (HOT Lanes) and congestion pricing policies.

Chair Drennen continued with AB32, stating that at the August 11th meeting the Committee decided to tackle this issue due to time sensitivity. Ms. Drennen provided the Council with a brief overview of AB32, stating that the goal of AB 32 is to reduce greenhouse gas emission to 1990 levels by 2020. Ms. Drennen stated that transportation provides the largest amount of emissions of any sector. The California Air Resources Board (CARB) has put together a draft scoping plan. Chair Drennen stated that the plan leaves out some general ideas of measures that might be implemented in the future, to meet the goal of 1990 levels. Ms. Drennen noted that Air District staff provided the Committee with a presentation on AB32 and its implementation plan; in addition the Committee reviewed information materials from a group called Climate Plan. Chair Drennen continued that recommendations from the Air Quality Planning Committee would then to go the Board of Directors’ Executive Committee; and if approved would move to the Board of Directors and then to CARB for comment.

In addition, Chair Drennen noted that Air District staff worked on a comment letter. Chair Drennen requested that Ms. Roggenkamp provide the Committee with a summary. Ms. Roggenkamp stated the comment letter focuses primarily on two main aspects of the Scoping Plan; 1) how the Scoping Plan treats stationary sources, which is historically the Air District’s regulatory purview for greenhouse gases and climate protection; AB32 provides this authority to ARB, as there is a significant need for coordination on stationary source regulations; and 2) The cap and trade program that is being proposed, there is not much detail about the cap and trade program in the Scoping Plan, so there were several issues raised in particular, how the cap and trade program would be designed in order to make sure it is set up in a way that would not adversely affect the commercial industry. There are also measures that address stationary sources that were in a category that called for further evaluation. The Air District felt that those should be brought forward into the recommended strategies for refineries, cement plants, dock plants and others.
The other topics that the Advisory Council Air Quality Planning Committee addressed in its proposed comments were the linkage between land use, transportation, air quality and greenhouse gases.

Council Member Drennen commented that part of the reason for taking on this issue; is because many felt the Draft Scoping Plan does a pretty good job of looking at fuels and vehicle efficiency, but it leaves the other part nebulous and not completely fleshed out. Council Member Drennen thanked staff for implementing some of the Committee’s questions into the letter. Council Member Drennen continued, providing the Committee with an overview of the recommendations.

Council Member Weiner commented that the memo seems to focus on transportation land use, which is fine because the Air District deals with air quality, but was not sure it should be under the same category of cap and trade. In addition, Council Member Weiner stated that whatever measures are taken whether it be cap and trade, or regulatory that they do not increase HOT spots in those areas that include multiple sources of pollution; as that is an issue that all are concerned about.

Ms. Roggenkamp outlined the timeframe for document submittal to the Air Resources Board, as the next Executive Committee of the Board of Directors will be held on September 29, 2008. Assuming the Council agrees to move items to the Executive Committee, that would be September 29, 2008; Board of Directors meeting is October 1, 2008 and the Proposed Scoping Plan will be released on October 3, 2008. Ms. Roggenkamp continued stating that CARB is expected to take on this issue at their November 20, 2008 Board Meeting.

After a lengthy discussion Committee members provided their recommendations on the AB 32 Draft Scoping Plan comment letter.

**Committee Action:** Council Member Altshuler moved to approve the recommended changes to the proposed comments to CARB’s Draft AB 32 Scoping Plan and forwarding to the Executive Committee for Board of Director approval; seconded by Council Member Holtzclaw; carried unanimously without objection.

**PRESENTATION**

4. Transportation 2035: Change in Motion

Chairperson Bedsworth introduced Ms. Ursula Vogel.

Ursula Vogel, Metropolitan Transportation Commission Public Information Officer, provided an overview and update on MTC’s long-range regional transportation plan: Transportation 2035: Change in Motion.

Ms. Vogel presented MTC’s RTP Transportation 2035 and addressed the financially constrained investment plan. Ms. Vogel noted that the total Plan revenue amount over the next 25 years is $223 billion. Transportation funds equal about 90% or $191 billion. Ms. Vogel stated that MTC looked into revisiting its commitments as asked, but determined that since most of the projects
are mandates or have already had substantial investments made in them, MTC would not uncommit any funds as part of this plan.

Ms. Vogel continued that the revenue is dispersed with:

48% Local - funds come from sales taxes, transit fares, and county sales taxes.
14% Regional – funds come from bridge tolls.
20% State – funds come from gas taxes.
12% Federal 
6% Anticipated/Unspecified

Efficiency requests include:
- Lifeline - $0.4 million;
- Bike - $1.0 million;
- Climate - $0.4 million;
- Planning - $0.3 million;
- TLC - $2.2 million; and
- FPI - $1.6 million

MTC is in the process of working on eliminating shortfalls over the upcoming months.

Ms. Vogel continued the presentation showing existing, funded and proposed Freeway Performance Ramp Metering, which was launched in 2007. The Commission is eager to pursue HOT lanes and recognizes that goal can be better met by implement to the program regionally.

Ms. Vogel continued her presentation by describing HOT Network Principles that include:

1. **Collaboration and cooperation** – CMAs, Caltrans, CHP, BATA
2. **Corridor-based focus and implementation** – user orientation
3. **Reinvestment within the corridor** – capital and operating
4. **Corridor investment plans** – guide reinvestment
5. **Simple system** – consistent design, signage, marketing
6. **Toll collection** – BATA
7. **Financing** – could include BATA toll bridge enterprise

Council Member Bramlett requested clarification on whether or not existing HOV lanes are being converted to HOT lanes and asked about taking existing lanes from 101 northbound and converting them directly to a HOT lane. Council Member Bramlett stated that he is extremely surprised and opposed to the continuation of pouring billions of dollars of concrete for these types of projects.

Ms. Vogel continued with the presentation and noted the following:

- Plan Expenditures by Mode - 65% transit and 35% roads;
- Plan Expenditures by Function - 81% maintenance and operations and 19% expansion;
- Plan Expenditures Supporting Focused Growth – 81% maintenance and operations, 12% transit expansion and 7% road expansion;
• Plan Expenditures Supporting Lifeline – 52% transit maintenance and operations, 36% roads and 12% transit expansion; and
• Plan Expenditures Supporting Climate Protection – 81% maintenance and operations, 12% transit expansion and 7% road expansion

Next steps include:

• Identify “Future Actions”, and solicit input from partners and the public through Phase 3 outreach (October/November 2008)
• Conduct environmental assessment (EIR) and transportation/air quality conformity analysis (August-November 2008)
• Release Draft Transportation 2035 Plan & EIR (December 2008)
• Adopt Final Transportation 2035 Plan & EIR (March 2009)

Ms. Vogel concluded her presentation.

Chairperson Bedsworth thanked Ms. Vogel for her presentation.

AIR DISTRICT OVERVIEW

5. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO

Ms. Roggenkamp provided an update on pending and planned Air District activities, policies and initiatives.

Ms. Roggenkamp gave an overview of the Summer Ozone Season stating that there were 11 Spare the Air Public Health advisories; exceedances were above the national 8-hour ozone standard; 16 days over the California 8-hour ozone standard; and 9 days over the California one-hour standard. Ms. Roggenkamp continued stating that the season will run through the beginning of October.

Ms. Roggenkamp continued that the Air District is gearing up for the Wintertime STA season, which starts in early November and stated that the Wood Smoke rule was adopted and thanked the Council for its help. The Regulation 6; Rule 3: Wood Smoke Devices is effective November 1, 2008. When there is STA Alert announced the public will be informed that this is not a night when you can burn solid fuels in your fireplace or woodstoves, as there will be extensive outreach. In addition, Ms. Roggenkamp informed the Council that there will be another round of rebates for change-outs to inserts and stoves.

Ms. Roggenkamp said that the state has recommended to EPA that the Bay Area be a non-attainment area for the 35 micrograms per cubic meter Federal 24-hour PM 2.5 standard. EPA has indicated that they plan to accept the states’ recommendations that are currently out for public comment and EPA will make determinations of attainment and non-attainment areas by mid December, as the Air District is expected to be designated as a non-attainment area for PM 2.5, 24-hour standard.
Council Member Licavoli-Farnkopf inquired about the criteria for attainment/non attainment designations; Ms. Roggenkamp responded that it is based on a three year average; depending on the pollutant. As an example, Ms. Roggenkamp stated that for the 24-hour PM 2.5 standard, the last three year period indicates that the Air District will be non-attainment.

Ms. Roggenkamp continued that the Air District has conducted a truck count project in the West Oakland area, working with community members through Pacific Institute in the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project. Truck count data was collected somewhere between 15 and 20 sites in West Oakland. Community members assisted with this project, the collection is completed and being analyzed. This information is relevant to the work of the Air District, Port of Oakland and ARB’s work on health risks.

Ms. Roggenkamp concluded that the State Budget has not passed, and that it did not seem that things would particularly affect the Air District’s budget, but until the budget is passed the Air District is uncertain.

Council Member Holtzclaw thanked Ms. Roggenkamp for being well informed and for her report.

**OTHER BUSINESS:**

6. **Council Member Comments/Other Business**

Council Member Bornstein stated that he just returned from two days at the 5th Annual California Climate Change Conference, sponsored by the California Energy Commission and the conference evolved into a powerful conference with 400+ attendees and 500-600 people participating via webcast.

Dr. Bornstein continued that the images of melting ice caps were dramatic. Most attendees were research and policy individuals. Discussions included climate change and policy, a keynote on transportation, resiliency to climate change and another keynote on the health of ecological systems. That speaker believed we would have to move species so that they can continue to survive, as they are unable to move themselves to regions with the correct climate; in addition the speaker stated that 1/3 of all the species in the world will be extinct. Council Member Bornstein presented a paper on coastal cooling related to per capita energy consumption.

7. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, November 12, 2008, to be held at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:55 a.m.
Call To Order

Opening Comment: Chairperson Bedsworth called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m.

Roll Call: Chairperson Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D.; Council Members Cassandra Adams, Sam Altshuler, Vice Chair Harold Brazil, Ken Blonski, Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Jeffrey Bramlett, MPA, Emily Drennen, Fred Glueck, William Hanna, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Robert T.P. Huang, Ph.D., Kendal Oku, Linda Weiner and Brian Zamora.

Absent: Irwin Dawid, Steven T. Kmucha, Kraig Kurucz, Karen Licavoli-Farnkopf and Virginia Smyly

Public Comment Period – There were no public comments.

1. Discussion of Proposed Advisory Council Role: The Committee was provided information on the Board of Directors’ consideration of revising the role of the Advisory Council.

Mr. Broadbent provided a summary of the history of the Advisory Council, its purpose, membership, representation and standing committees, and said that staff has been considering ways to better utilize the talents and resources of the Advisory Council and had discussed concepts with the Board of Directors Executive Committee at its September 29, 2008 meeting. Specifically, the Executive Committee proposed that the Advisory Council meet four times a year and focus on the following topic areas: 1) current developments in health information related to air quality; 2) current developments in technologies and techniques for control of air emissions from stationary sources; 3) current developments in technologies and techniques for control of air emissions from mobile sources; and 4) current developments related to air quality in land use planning and transportation planning.

Mr. Broadbent further explained that the Air District staff includes scientists, engineers and planners capable of researching and developing policy and developing successful programs and principles relating to health impacts and air quality. The Air District’s vision for the Advisory Council is to serve as a forum for hearing and facilitating discussions from experts.

Mr. Broadbent further discussed burdens on staff and duplication of efforts and said the Air District is looking to streamline efforts of the Council. He proposed a process similar to a
symposium, where a call for papers would be issued ahead of the meeting and proceedings would be held on the four topic areas.

Discussion ensued and comments were received from the Council.

Mr. Broadbent discussed the Advisory Council’s comments, stating that he believed the Air District has an extensive public process where stakeholders are involved and cited the CARE Task Force as an example. Moreover, he felt the Advisory Council can serve a greater purpose as a convener of speakers; members could more efficiently provide their expertise to the Council and be able to determine findings that need to be taken into consideration.

Mr. Broadbent noted that the Chair of the Board of Directors serves as an ex-officio member of the Advisory Council and should attend future meetings. He agreed that staff could logistically arrange for speakers and for papers ahead of time. In conclusion, he said staff was open to feedback and the Board of Directors would ultimately adopt the legal framework to implement recommendations.

Vice Chairperson Harold Brazil, acting as Chairperson in the absence of Dr. Bedsworth, confirmed with Mr. Broadbent that next steps would be to have him meet with the Chairperson, Vice Chairperson and Secretary to develop a proposal, which would be presented and discussed with the full Advisory Council at a regular or special meeting.

Mr. Broadbent thanked the Advisory Council for their patience, reiterated their level of expertise and he is optimistic about developing an efficient working model for the Air District.

OTHER BUSINESS:

2. Council Member Comments/Other Business – None.

3. Time and Place of Next Meeting: The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, November 12, 2008 at 10:00 a.m., 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA  94109.

4. Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 11:28 a.m.

/s/ Lisa Harper
Clerk of the Boards
To: Chairperson Louise Wells Bedsworth, Ph.D. and Members of the Advisory Council  
From: Chairperson Kraig Kurucz,  
Technical Committee  
Date: October 27, 2008  
Re: Consideration of Recommended Resolution developed by the Technical Committee Regarding Climate Change and Regional Pollution

RECOMMENDED ACTION  
The Technical Committee recommends that the Advisory Council consider a resolution to address climate change, multi-scale and multi-pollutant modeling and regional pollution.

DISCUSSION  
Based on the following presentations to the Advisory Council Technical Committee:

1. Update on PM Inventory Development, Modeling and Data Analysis (presented on February 11, 2008 by Mr. Saffet Tanrikulu and Mr. David Fairley);
2. Consequences of Changes in Temperature, Inflow Boundary Conditions, and Local Emissions, on Air Quality in Central California (presented on April 7, 2008 by Professor Rob Harley);
3. Past and Future Temperature World-Wide, in California, and the Bay Area (presented on June 9, 2008 by Dr. Philip B. Duffy);

The Committee discussed at length the following phrases as input to a resolution for consideration by the Advisory Council and recommends that they be recommended to the full Advisory Council and thereafter, to the Executive Committee of the Board of Directors for approval.

Recommendation to Board of Directors from the Advisory Council Technical Committee:

Based on the following presentations to the Advisory Council Technical Committee:

1. Update on PM Inventory Development, Modeling and Data Analysis (presented on February 11, 2008 by Mr. Saffet Tanrikulu and Mr. David Fairley);
Introduction to Resolution:

WHEREAS, the problems and solutions of climate change and regional pollution are inter-related and can potentially be in conflict;

WHEREAS, climate change can overwhelm air quality planning gains and cause unintended consequences and trade-offs by its effects such as increased wild fires affecting air quality, summer daytime coastal cooling as a reaction to inland global warming, changing snowfall into rain and coastal flooding;

WHEREAS, regional reactions to global climate change are varied;

WHEREAS, land use planning (e.g., urbanization and irrigation) impact local climate and energy policies;

WHEREAS, the implications of air pollution mitigation and climate protection impact energy policy, ecosystems, water resources and public health;

WHEREAS, the Bay Area has extensive existing air quality and meteorological observational networks;

WHEREAS, EPA modeling is now becoming multi-scale and multi-pollutant;

WHEREAS, prediction models need validation against past changes;

WHEREAS, the Bay Area has an unique concentration of analytical capabilities, experts, and innovators; and

WHEREAS, the Bay Area has historically served as a model for the development of innovative air quality strategies.

THEREFORE, be it resolved that, the Advisory Council recommends that the Air District use multi pollutant, multi-scale air quality models and include climate change issues in air quality management. These models should include the following capabilities:

- A validation process against past observations for ozone, PM, toxics, and greenhouse gases at scales from regional to urban to street level;
o Downscaled IPCC global climate data for simulations of past and future regional and local climate change; and
o Models that link meteorology, ocean (i.e., coastal and bay), air quality, and climate change impacts (e.g. energy, ecosystems, water resources and health).

THEREFORE, BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Air District continue its interactions with the local multi-disciplinary experts to facilitate its transition to an integrated planning framework.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

No impact.

Respectfully submitted,

Kraig Kurucz
Chairperson, Technical Committee
BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Chairperson Louise Wells Bedsworth, Ph.D. and Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: November 3, 2008

Re: Discussion of Advisory Council Role

RECOMMENDED ACTION
Discussion of Advisory Council (Council) role, effective January 2009.

BACKGROUND
The Board of Directors Executive Committee at its September 29, 2008, meeting, discussed the role of the Council and considered how to utilize the knowledge and expertise of the Council more effectively. The Executive Committee proposed that the Advisory Council meet 4 times a year to hold symposia and invite leading experts in the field that focus on the following topic areas:
1) Current Developments in Health Information Related to Air Quality;
2) Current Developments in Technologies and Techniques for Control of Air Emissions from Stationary Sources;
3) Current Developments in Technologies and Techniques for Control of Air Emissions from Mobile Sources; and
4) Current Developments Related to Air Quality in Land Use and Transportation Planning.

The Council at its October 21, 2008 meeting, discussed the Executive Committee proposal and after much discussion requested that the Executive Officer/APCO meet with the Officers of the Council to consider Council member comments and to present an outline to the Council at its next meeting.

On Wednesday, November 3, 2008, the Executive Officer/APCO met with Advisory Council Officers to further consider the role of the Advisory Council.

DISCUSSION
At the November 3, 2008 meeting, the outline below of the role of the Council and conduct of Council meetings emerged:

The Advisory Council will have its January retreat and then meet 8 times per year; conducting 4 symposia to receive presentations from leading experts on defined topic...
areas and 1 meeting following each symposium (a total of 4 meetings) to summarize
materials presented at the symposium. The Council will assign lead member(s) to
prepare the reports from each symposium; members will be assigned based on their
familiarity with topic area(s) covered. The Council chair will make a presentation to the
Board of Directors after each summary meeting. Staff will develop a document template
for the reports.

Each meeting report will include:
1) Summary of symposium;
2) Key points;
3) Emerging issues; and
4) Future information needs.

Outline of Symposia/Meetings:

January 14, 2009 – Advisory Council Retreat
February 2009 – 1st Symposium
March 2009 - Discussion of Symposium
April 2009 – 2nd Symposium
May 2009 – Discussion of Symposium
July 2009 – 3rd Symposium
September 2009 – Discussion of Symposium
October 2009 – 4th Symposium
November 2009 – Discussion of Symposium

There will be no meetings held in June, August, and December. The Officers of the
Council will meet on an as needed basis to discuss scheduling and coordination issues.

Gary Kendall, Technical Services Division Director will be the liaison to the Council.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO