AGENDA

CALL TO ORDER
Opening Comments
Roll Call

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD
Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3. The public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council meetings and Committee meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council’s or Committee’s purview. Speakers are limited to five minutes each.

ACTION
1. Proposed Change in Advisory Council Meetings Schedule

Staff recommends a change in the Advisory Council meetings schedule to provide for two meetings to discuss the February 11, 2009 meeting on Air Quality and Public Health with Air District Staff, and develop recommendations for the Air District Board of Directors.

DISCUSSION

The Advisory Council will discuss a proposed Draft Report on the February 11, 2009 meeting with Air District staff and develop recommendations.
OTHER BUSINESS

3. Council Member Comments/Other Business
   
   Council or staff members on their own initiative, or in response to questions posed by the public, may:
   ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on their own activities, provide
   a reference to staff about factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting
   concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda.

4. Time and Place of Next Meeting
   
   9:00 a.m., Wednesday, April 8, 2009, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

5. Adjournment

CONTACT EXECUTIVE OFFICE - 939 ELLIS STREET SF, CA 94109

(415) 749-5127
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
   www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk’s Office
  should be given in a timely manner, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all,
  members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 939
  Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all,
  members of that body. Such writing(s) may also be posted on the District’s website (www.baaqmd.gov) at
  that time.
# Monthly Calendar of District Meetings

## March 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Meeting</th>
<th>Day</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Personnel Committee (At the Call of the Chair)</td>
<td>Friday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9:00 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad Hoc Committee on Port Emissions (At the Call of the Chair)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Executive Committee (At the Call of the Chair)</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint Policy Committee</td>
<td>Friday</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>10:00 a.m.</td>
<td>MTC Auditorium 101 8th Street Oakland, CA 94607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Legislative Committee (Meets 4th Monday of the Month)</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee (Meets 2nd Thursday each Month)</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>Immediately Following Legislative Cmte. Meeting</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee (Meets 4th Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1:30 p.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee – (Meets 4th Thursday of each Month)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## April 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Meeting</th>
<th>Day</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Room</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9:00 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee (Meets 2nd Thursday each Month)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

April 2009 Calendar Continued on Next Page
### APRIL 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE OF MEETING</th>
<th>DAY</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>ROOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Meets 3rd Monday Quarterly)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1:30 p.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Meets 4th Wednesday of each month)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Meets 4th Thursday of each Month)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Legislative Committee</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Meets 4th Monday of the Month)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### MAY 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE OF MEETING</th>
<th>DAY</th>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>ROOM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9:00 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee (Meets 2nd Thursday each Month)</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint Policy Committee</td>
<td>Friday</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10:00 a.m.</td>
<td>MTC Auditorium 101 8th Street Oakland, CA 94607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets 1st &amp; 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Board Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Legislative Committee</td>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Meets 4th Monday of the Month)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</td>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>1:30 p.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Meets 4th Wednesday of each month)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</td>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9:30 a.m.</td>
<td>4th Floor Conf. Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Meets 4th Thursday of each Month)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HL – 3/3/09 (7:00 a.m.)
P/Library/Forms/Calendar/Calendar/Moncal
AGENDA: 1

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Chairperson Harold Brazil, and
Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 4, 2009

Re: Proposed Change in Advisory Council Meetings Schedule

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Recommend the Advisory Council approve the proposed change in the Advisory Council meetings schedule to provide for two (2) meetings to discuss the February 11, 2009 Meeting on Air Quality and Public Health with Air District Staff, and develop recommendations for the Report to the Air District Board of Directors. The first discussion meeting would be on March 11, 2009, as originally scheduled, and the second discussion meeting would be on April 8, 2009.

BACKGROUND

At the February 11, 2009 Meeting on Air Quality and Public Health there were five presentations: 1) Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) Program Overview, by Dr. Phil Martien, CARE Program Manager, 2) Public Health, Air Quality & Equity by Dr. Anthony Iton, Alameda County Health Officer, 3) Health Disparities in Contra Costa County by Dr. Wendel Brunner, Public Health Director, Contra Cost County, 4) Air Quality and Public Health Santa Clara County by Dr. Martin Fenstersheib, Santa Clara County Health Officer, and 5) Air Pollution Hot Spots: Unregulated Health and Environmental Justice Issues in the United States by Dr. Rajiv Bahtia, Director of Occupational and Environmental Health City and County of San Francisco.

DISCUSSION

Due to the complex nature of the topic “Air Quality and Public Health” for the February 11, 2009 Advisory Council Meeting and the policy and program implications for the Air District, staff believe that the Advisory Council should have additional time to fully discuss all of the presentations, materials and recommendations received at the February 11th meeting, and develop and finalize recommendations for the Report to the Air District Board of Directors. The Executive Officer, Jack Broadbent suggested that we allocate an additional meeting to allow for a full and interactive discussion with the Air District staff and the development of recommendations that will best serve the agency.

To implement this, the March 11, 2009 discussion meeting would focus on a discussion of the presentations, recommendations and materials received and the policy and program
implications, with Air District staff. The April 8, 2009 meeting which was originally scheduled for presentations on the topic of “California’s 2050 GHG Emission Reduction Target of 80% Below 1990 Levels – Transportation Sector” would focus on developing and finalizing recommendations for the Report to the Air District Board of Directors.

This change in the Advisory Council Meetings schedule would reduce the burden on the Advisory Council members who are preparing a draft report based on the February 11th meeting and provide for additional input by all Advisory Council members.

Staff recommends the Advisory Council approved the proposed change in the Advisory Council Meetings schedule.

The “2050 GHG Emission Reduction Target” topic would be rescheduled for the May 13, 2009 meeting. This change may require the Council to add one more meeting in late November or early December, and this issue will be discussed at the March 11th meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

杰克·布罗德本特
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Gary Kendall
BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Chairperson Harold Brazil and
Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer

Date: March 4, 2009

Re: Discussion of Draft Report Relative to the Advisory Council’s February 11, 2009 Advisory Meeting on Air Quality and Public Health


The draft report will be discussed by the Advisory Council at its March 11, 2009 meeting and finalized at its April 8, 2009 meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Gary Kendall
Reviewed by: Jean Roggenkamp
DRAFT REPORT ON THE FEBRUARY 11, 2009 ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING
ON AIR QUALITY AND PUBLIC HEALTH FOR DISCUSSION BY THE
ADVISORY COUNCIL

SUMMARY
The following presentations were made at the February 11, 2009 The Advisory Council
Meeting on Air Quality and Public Health:

1. Community Air Risk Evaluation Program (CARE) Overview by Phil Martien,
   PhD, CARE Program Manager, Bay Area Air Quality Management District.

2. Public Health, Air Quality, & Equity by Dr. Anthony Iton. Anthony Iton, M.D.,
   J.D., MPH is the Alameda County Health Officer. Dr. Iton received his training
   at Johns Hopkins Medical School, Cornell/New York Hospital, Yale, and UC
   Berkeley and is board certified in internal medicine and preventive medicine. Dr.
   Iton also has a law degree and a Master’s of Public Health from UC Berkeley and
   is a member of the California Bar. He has worked as an HIV disability rights
   attorney, a health care policy analyst with Consumers Union West Coast Regional
   Office, and as a physician and advocate for the homeless at the San Francisco
   Public Health Department. Dr. Iton primary interest is the health of
   disadvantaged populations and the contributions of race, class, wealth, education,
   geography, and employment to health status. He has asserted that the biggest
   single contributor to our country’s vulnerability to bioterrorism is the lack of a
   universal system of health insurance for all Americans. Dr. Iton collaborated with
   California Newsreel in the creation of Unnatural Causes ... Is Inequality Making
   Us Sick? This is currently being shown on public television stations across the
   country.

3. Health Disparities in Contra Costa by Dr. Wendel Brunner. Dr. Wendel Brunner
   is the Director of Public Health for the Contra Costa County Health Services
   Department. Contra Costa has a population of over one million people with 18
   cities in the San Francisco Bay Area. The Health Department has been working
   the City of Richmond to develop and implement a Health Element for the
   Richmond General Plan. Since he became public health director nearly 20 years
   ago, Dr. Brunner has stood boldly behind movements such as environmental
   justice, an effort to force government and industry to counter years of neglect
   suffered by poor minority neighborhoods. In 1984, with Brunner as director, the
   county became the first in the nation to adopt a strict anti-smoking ordinance. In
   2000, the county adopted a "zero tolerance" policy toward domestic violence.

4. Air Pollution Hot Spots: Unregulated Health and Environmental Justice Issues
   in the United States by Dr. Rajiv Bahtia. Dr. Bhatia received his Medical
Doctorate from Stanford and a Masters in Public Health from UC Berkeley. He has practiced medicine since 1989. Since 1998, he has served as the Director of Occupational and Environmental Health for the City and County of San Francisco’s Department of Public Health. Bhatia is also an Assistant Clinical Professor of Medicine at the University of California at San Francisco and teaches a course in the Health Impact Assessment of Public Policy at UC Berkeley.

5. **Air Quality and Public Health Santa Clara County** by Dr. Martin Fenstersheib. Dr. Marty Fenstersheib has been the Health Officer for Santa Clara County since 1994. He has been active at the local, state and national levels in the area of disaster preparedness since 1997. Dr. Fenstersheib has made various presentations about Pandemic Influenza to various community groups and organizations. Dr. Fenstersheib is the VP of the Santa Clara County Medical Association and the past President of the California Conference of Local Health Officials.

The speakers discussed health disparities related to air quality and potential mitigation measures in Alameda, Contra Costa, Santa Clara and San Francisco counties.

DISCUSSION MEETING

......
KEY POINTS – for discussion by Advisory Council

1. Ill health is concentrated in low-income communities of color. Health and Social inequities are positively correlated with exposure to sources of air pollution, such as freeways and industrial sources.

2. Communities need to be armed with information and tools to protect Public Health. Air Quality data is not presented in a form that is easily accessible or usable to either Public Health or the General Public. This concern applies both to the content of the data (e.g., quantitative data, geographies represented) and the language (reading level) of the data presented.

3. More detailed and localized data are needed to assist public health departments in assessing health impacts from air pollution sources. Data drives policy.

4. PM 2.5 has greater health impacts than ozone and toxic air contaminants (TACs), 10 times more than ozone and 20 times more than TACs in California. Federal and State programs geared towards criteria pollutants address regional targets and do not identify hotspots. This represents an important gap in monitoring.

5. Integration of Public Health into land use decision-making is critical, but the financial constraints of Public Health Departments necessitate BAAQMD cooperation and guidance in this process.

6. The Environmental Impact Report (EIR) process is one of the means that the air district has to require mitigation of health impacts from land use planning. Don’t limit what BAAQMD does, or what data it makes available, to what is within the regulatory jurisdiction. BAAQMD can foster greater improvement in Public Health, and in community relations, by expanding its leadership role beyond what it is legally required to do. If we have strong regional targets to reduce greenhouse gases (GHG), we get the co-benefits of reduction in all pollution.

7. BAAQMD must be more proactive in regulating mobile sources of pollution within the legal constraints. Indirect Source Review is important for this reason.

8. BAAQMD should recognize roadways as a source to be measured—much of the data made the connection between roadways and health outcomes in the bordering communities. Areas within 500 feet of roadways are generally the most impacted and there are reliable models of air dispersion to predict pollution accumulation.

9. BAAQMD is a fellow health agency whose charge is to improve air quality to protect public health. There was a theme of collaboration—Public Health has a strong relationship with the community and can facilitate linkages between BAAQMD and community groups.

10. One of the ways to create change is to shift the status quo imbalance of power (industry and policymakers vs. community). This imbalance is the root cause of health inequity. BAAQMD can play an important role in helping communities advocate for themselves.
EMERGING ISSUES – for discussion by Advisory Council

2. Noise pollution has negative health impacts, and is often present in the same locations as other pollutants.
3. Roadways are currently unregulated sources, falling outside the focus of both BAAQMD and CARB.
4. The use of Health Impacts Assessments is a promising part of the Environmental Review process.
5. The study of the health impacts of fine PM is a growing field in environmental health research.

RECOMMENDATIONS – for discussion by Advisory Council

1. Incorporate Fine PM into the CARE Program and require “hot spot” analysis of regional projects. Also, incorporate this hot spot analysis into updated CEQA guidelines. Consider establishing a PM 2.5 action level. Consider additional localized saturation monitoring studies along freeway corridors and in impacted areas, like the CARE Program West Oakland Measurement Study.
2. Collect data at the neighborhood level, through monitoring or modeling, and through community based participatory methods, like the CARE Program West Oakland On-road Diesel Truck Survey, to better assess localized impact. Data should be understandable enough that community residents can use it to push for change. Conduct monitoring to confirm modeling results (ambient concentrations) of PM emissions from major roadways.
3. Add a Health Officer (HO) position to the BAAQMD staff, similar to the position at the South Coast AQMD. The HO could provide guidance on decision making, help educate the public on health impacts of air pollution, and assist local governments with land use planning strategies that reduce air pollution and greenhouse gasses.
4. Set strong regional GHG reduction targets that will have co-benefits of reducing air pollution in impacted communities
5. Increase technical assistance to local jurisdictions for land use planning, such as establishing General Plan best practices and commenting on EIR’s.
6. Identify roadways as sources for TACs and criteria air pollutants. BAAQMD can provide technical assistance by preparing a methodology for measuring this source in Environmental Review processes and providing mitigation strategies.
7. Be more aggressive in requiring pollution reduction plans from major polluters, such as ports, and in monitoring implementation of those plans.
8. Support implementation of Container Fees at Ports to pay for air pollution mitigation and public health programs (rather than for congestion relief, which means an increase in PM and GHG), and support the anticipated state level resurrected Lowenthal bill. Investigate other strategies to fund emissions reduction and transit, such as gas taxes and increased vehicle license fees.
9. Implement Indirect Source Rules (ISR) and ensure protection for overburdened communities.
10. Incorporate appropriate recommendations from the health officer presentations into the public hearing process for the CEQA Guidelines update and the Clean Air Plan 2008. Present this full report to the Board of Directors.