

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109  
(415) 749-5000

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, November 14, 2012

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairperson Stan Hayes called the meeting to order at 9:09 a.m. without an initial quorum or roll call.

### **CONSENT CALENDAR**

#### **1. Approval of Minutes of the October 10, 2012, Advisory Council Regular Meeting**

##### **Council Comments:**

Member Lutzker suggested, regarding page 7, paragraph 3, the meaning of the second sentence is unclear. Member Vura-Weis suggested deleting the portion beginning with “Member Vura-Weis” and ending “Chairperson Hayes agreed.” The Council members present agreed.

### **ROLL CALL**

Present: Chairperson Stan Hayes; Secretary Sam Altshuler, P.E.; and Council Members Benjamin Bolles, Harold Brazil, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Gary Lucks, J.D., C.P.E.A., Liza Lutzker, M.P.H., Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., Jane Martin, Dr.P.H., Jessica Range, LEED A.P., Dorothy Vura-Weis, M.D., M.P.H., and Murray Wood.

Absent: Vice-Chairperson Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., and Council Members Jennifer Bard, Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., LEED A.P., Caryl Hart, J.D., Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Kathryn Lyddan, J.D., and Estes Al Phillips.

Also Present: Board Director Brad Wagenknecht.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

## **OPENING COMMENTS**

Chairperson Hayes made introductory comments regarding the agenda.

## **CONSENT CALENDAR (Continued)**

### **2. Approval of Minutes of the October 10, 2012, Advisory Council Regular Meeting (Continued)**

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: Member Holtzclaw made a motion to approve the minutes of October 10, 2012, as amended; Member Vura-Weis seconded; and the motion was unanimously approved without objection.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **3. Approval of draft report of the Advisory Council's September 12, 2012 meeting**

Chairperson Hayes made introductory comments regarding the report drafting process and invited input from the Members on the sections within the report as follows:

“SUMMARY”

None.

“KEY POINTS – Yifang Zhu, Ph.D. – “Exposure to Ultrafine Particles on and Near Roadways”

Member Vura-Weis asked, regarding the first #2, if autism was mentioned by Dr. Zhu and the Council discussed the same.

Member Vura-Weis asked, regarding the second #1, if the information relative to commute periods and hour ranges were reviewed by Dr. Zhu. Chairperson Hayes suggested deleting the parenthetical portion and the Council discussed the same, finally agreeing to strike the time range.

Member Lucks asked, regarding the second #4, if the last sentence is factually correct and the Council discussed the same among its members and with Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, as well as the continued use of “easily.”

“KEY POINTS – Rajiv Bhatia, MD, MPH – “Policy Strategies to Reduce Health Impacts from Urban Particulate Pollution”

Member Lutzker suggested “SF” first be defined as “San Francisco” and that the “San Francisco Department of Public Health (SFPH)” and “SF” be added to the Glossary. Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Lucks asked, regarding #4, if the subject matter is broader in scope than fine particulate matter (PM<sub>2.5</sub>). Chairperson Hayes said “2.5” will be deleted.

Member Lutzker suggested, regarding #4.a, inserting “congestion” before “pricing,” the Council discussed the same, and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Range suggested, regarding #4, inserting “could” before “include” and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Bolles said, regarding #8, that he continues to doubt the connection between noise pollution and air quality and the Council discussed the same.

Member Lucks suggested, regarding #5, deleting “would” at the end of the fourth line.

Member Altshuler mentioned, regarding #8, his professional advocacy for noise to be considered an air pollutant and the Council discussed the same, after which Chairperson Hayes decided to replace “model” with “administrative example.”

Member Lutzker asked if the hierarchy of control concept should be added to this section of the report and the Council discussed the same.

#### “EMERGING ISSUES”

Member Holtzclaw asked, regarding #5, how many cities and counties are within the jurisdiction of the Air District, which question was answered by Mr. Stevenson and Brian Bunker, District Counsel. Chairperson Hayes decided to insert “approximately” before “100.”

Member Holtzclaw suggested, regarding #7, deleting “upon” and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Altshuler said, regarding #1, the level of detail is too fine to include without more work and Member Holtzclaw disagreed.

Member Range suggested, regarding #1, clarification about what is meant by “as well as their interaction” and the Council discussed the same, as well as the use of “e.g.,” the grammatical construction of the sub-bullets, whether sub-bullets should be used in this instance, the use of “control” versus “behavior” and the continued inclusion of “lower driving speeds” under the “personal control” category.

Member Range suggested, regarding #2, the last sentence be deleted and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Lutzker asked, regarding #1.d., about the meaning of the last example and suggested it be deleted.

Chairperson Hayes asked, regarding #9, whether it should be advanced in the list order, the Council discussed the same and decided to move it to #2.

Member Altshuler shared his surprise at the decision to delete the last sentence in #2 and the Council discussed the same amongst its members and with Mr. Stevenson.

Member Range said, regarding #4, that the last sentence is confusing and Chairperson Hayes decided to delete the last portion, beginning with “at the particle.”

#### “RECOMMENDATIONS”

Member Holtzclaw noted that a previous draft of the report included an item regarding Air District work with cities, counties and regional agencies on traffic reduction but that it is absent in this version and the Council discussed the same.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Brad Wagenknecht, Air District Board of Directors, was noted present at 10:30 a.m.

Member Lutzker said #4 does not read properly and the Council discussed among its members and with Mr. Stevenson the difference between modeling and inventory, as well as the state of work at the Air District relative to both, and Chairperson Hayes decided to amend the item to read, “Continue efforts to model UFP air quality impacts at a regional level.”

Member Altshuler suggested, regarding #5, deleting the last portion, beginning with “to provide local” and inserting the remaining portion at the end of #4, the Council discussed the same and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Range said she agrees with #8, 9 and 10 but that they do not seem to flow from those items in Emerging Issues and the Council discussed the same and how best to format them with and among the other Recommendations.

Member Altshuler asked if an additional Recommendation should be added regarding the continued evaluation of the hierarchy of controls and the Council discussed the same and its placement in the list.

#### “GLOSSARY”

Member Holtzclaw asked if “HEPA” is properly defined and Chairperson Hayes and Mr. Stevenson said yes.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: Member Altshuler made a motion to approve the Report of the Advisory Council’s September 12, 2012, Meeting on Ultrafine Particles: Exposure Reduction, as amended; Member Holtzclaw seconded; and the motion was unanimously approved without objection.

#### **4. Discussion, Recommendation and Selection of Slate of Officers for 2013**

The Council discussed a Slate of Officers for 2013.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action:

Member Altshuler made a motion, seconded by Member Holtzclaw, and carried unanimously without objection to appoint Member Bornstein as Chairperson.

Member Holtzclaw made a motion, seconded by Member Lutzker, and carried unanimously without objection, with Member Altshuler abstaining, to appoint Member Altshuler as Vice Chairperson.

Member Altshuler made a motion, seconded by Member Bolles, and carried unanimously without objection, with Member Lutzker abstaining, to appoint Member Lutzker as Secretary.

#### **5. Discussion of the Report to the Board of Directors on Ultrafine Particulate Matter Topics of 2012**

The Council discussed, among its members and with Director Wagenknecht and Mr. Stevenson, the report summarizing information on ultrafine particulate matter topics addressed by the Council during 2012 and the selection of members to present the same to the Board of Directors on December 5 or 19, 2012.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None; informational only.

#### **OTHER BUSINESS**

#### **6. Council Member Comments/Other Business**

Mr. Stevenson gave a summary of the status of the PM<sub>2.5</sub> attainment standard and an overview of active projects and amendments to regulations being considered.

Chairperson Hayes provided a list of proposed topics for the upcoming year and invited member feedback and additional suggestions and the Council discussed.

Chairperson Hayes announced that the Personnel Committee of the Board of Directors interviewed applicants for appointments to the Council, Public Health and Conservation categories, and made recommendations to the Board of Directors for consideration on November 19, 2012.

Chairperson Hayes, on behalf of the Council, recognized Members Martin and Vura-Weis and presented each with a token of appreciation for their respective service. Members Martin and Vura-Weis addressed the Council in turn.

Member Lutzker announced that the California Breathing Asthma program of the California Department of Public Health is hosting its Asthma Summit on December 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> in San Francisco and the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment will soon be giving a presentation in Sacramento regarding cumulative impacts.

Member Lucks said that his annual legislative summary should be complete in February and that significant legislative action is expected in the coming year in light of the political climate in Sacramento.

Member Bolles shared his curiosity about the Air District's influence outside of the Bay Area.

7. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** Wednesday, January 9, 2013, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.
8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 12:12 p.m.

*151 Sean Gallagher*

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards