



BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT

## ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

WEDNESDAY  
MAY 9, 2012  
9:00 A.M.

7<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR BOARD ROOM  
939 ELLIS STREET  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109

### AGENDA

#### CALL TO ORDER

Opening Comments  
Roll Call

Stan Hayes, Chairperson  
Clerk

#### PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

*Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3. The public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's purview. Speakers are limited to three minutes each.*

#### CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of Minutes of the April 11, 2012 Advisory Council meeting.

#### RECOGNITION

2. Recognition of Outgoing Advisory Council Member

Stan Hayes, Chairperson

*The Council will recognize outgoing Advisory Council member Ken Blonski.*

#### PRESENTATION: ULTRAFINE PARTICLES

3. Ultrafine Particles: Exposure Assessment

*Speakers from Stanford University and the University of California, Berkeley will present materials on ultrafine particles exposure assessment.*

**A. Indoor Exposure to Particles from Cooking, Cleaning and Smoking**

Lynn M. Hildemann, Ph.D.  
Associate Professor  
Civil and Environmental Engineering  
Stanford University

**B. Toward Understanding Ultrafine Exposures in Indoor Environments**

William W. Nazaroff, Ph.D.  
Daniel Tellep Distinguished Professor  
Energy, Civil Infrastructure and Climate  
Civil and Environmental Engineering  
University of California, Berkeley

**PANEL DISCUSSION**

4. Ultrafine Particles: Exposure Assessment

*The speakers will convene as a panel for a discussion with the Advisory Council and Air District staff on ultrafine particles – exposure assessment, and the implications for the Air District’s regulatory agenda, legislative agenda, and programs.*

**OTHER BUSINESS**

5. Council Member Comments/Other Business

*Council Members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.*

6. Time and Place of Next Meeting

*Wednesday, June 13, 2012, at 9:00 a.m. at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.*

7. Adjournment

**CONTACT EXECUTIVE OFFICE - 939 ELLIS STREET SF, CA 94109**

**(415) 749-5130**  
**FAX: (415) 928-8560**  
**BAAQMD homepage:**  
**[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)**

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk’s Office should be given in a timely manner, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body. Such writing(s) may also be posted on the District’s website ([www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)) at that time.

# BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109

(415) 771-6000

## EXECUTIVE OFFICE: MONTHLY CALENDAR OF DISTRICT MEETINGS

### MAY 2012

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 2<sup>nd</sup> Wednesday each Month)</i>	Wednesday	9	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Special Meeting of the Board of Directors</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	16	9:45 a.m.	<u>Meeting Location:</u> Board Room  <u>Tour Location:</u> Shell Gas Station 800 Turk Street San Francisco, CA 94102
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	21	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday Every Other Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	21	10:00 a.m.	<u>Meeting Location:</u> Creskide Park Building 10455 Miller Avenue Cupertino, CA 95014  <u>Tour Location:</u> Front Parking Lot Entrance Lehigh Southwest Cement Company - Permanente Plant 24001 Stevens Creek Boulevard Cupertino, CA 95014
<b>Special Meeting of the Board of Directors</b>	Monday	21	10:00 a.m.	<u>Meeting Location:</u> Creskide Park Building 10455 Miller Avenue Cupertino, CA 95014  <u>Tour Location:</u> Front Parking Lot Entrance Lehigh Southwest Cement Company - Permanente Plant 24001 Stevens Creek Boulevard Cupertino, CA 95014
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets the 4th Wednesday Each Month)</i>	Wednesday	23	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

May 2012 Calendar Continued on Next Page

## MAY 2012

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee</b> <i>(Meets Quarterly at the Call of the Chair)</i>	Thursday	31	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

## JUNE 2012

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	6	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 2<sup>nd</sup> Wednesday each Month)</i>	Wednesday	13	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> - STAFF RECOMMENDS CANCELLING, TO BE DETERMINED BY THE CHAIR	Monday	18	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - STAFF RECOMMENDS CANCELLING, TO BE DETERMINED BY THE CHAIR	Wednesday	20	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Public Outreach Committee</b> <i>(Meets Quarterly at the Call of the Chair)</i> - STAFF RECOMMENDS CANCELLING, TO BE DETERMINED BY THE CHAIR	Thursday	21	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets the 4th Wednesday Each Month)</i>	Wednesday	27	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	28	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room

## JULY 2012

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	4	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Advisory Council Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 2<sup>nd</sup> Wednesday each Month)</i>	Wednesday	11	9:00 a.m.	Board Room

## JULY 2012

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Special Meeting of the Board of Directors</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	11	9:45 a.m.	<b><u>Meeting Location:</u></b> Hercules, CA <b><u>Tour Location:</u></b> Hercules, CA
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	16	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday Every Other Month)</i>	Monday	16	10:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	18	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets the 4th Wednesday Each Month)</i>	Wednesday	25	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday each Month)</i>	Thursday	26	9:30 a.m.	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Conf. Room
MM – 5/2/12 (10:01 a.m.)				P/Library/Forms/Calendar/Calendar/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and  
Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: April 24, 2012

Re: Advisory Council's Draft Meeting Minutes of April 11, 2012

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve attached draft minutes of the Regular Advisory Council's meeting of April 11, 2012.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the April 11, 2012 Advisory Council meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sean Gallagher  
Reviewed by: Jennifer C. Cooper

Attachment

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109  
(415) 749-5000

**DRAFT MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
9:00 a.m., Wednesday, April 11, 2012

**CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL**

Chairperson Stan Hayes called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m., asked Gary Kendall, Advisory Council Liaison, to summarize the speakers and topics for the next Council meeting, and mentioned the need for volunteers to staff the working group tasked with preparing the Council report.

Present: Chairperson Stan Hayes; Vice Chairperson Robert Bornstein, Ph.D.; and Council Members Benjamin Bolles, Jeffrey Bramlett, Harold Brazil, Jonathan Cherry, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Jessica Range and Dorothy Vura-Weis, M.D., M.P.H.

Absent: Secretary Sam Altshuler, P.E.; and Council Members Jennifer Bard, Louise Bedsworth, Ph.D., Gary Lucks, J.D., Liza Lutzker, Jane Martin, Dr. P.H., Estes Al Phillips and Murray Wood.

Also Present: None.

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

Member Bramlett introduced Steven Williams, Intel, and explained that Mr. Williams is shadowing Mr. Bramlett in the course of a study for his employer regarding technology for commuters and asked for objections to Mr. Williams' photographing of the meeting, if any.

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

**1. Approval of Minutes of March 14, 2012, Advisory Council Regular Meeting**

Member Holtzclaw requested an amendment to the first paragraph at page 9, section 3, to read, "...~~San Jose~~Sacramento."

Member Holtzclaw made a motion to approve the minutes of March 14, 2012, as amended. Member Kurucz seconded; carried unanimously without objection.

Chairperson Hayes and Members Bornstein and Vura-Weis expressed their appreciation for the minutes as crafted.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **2. Discussion of revised draft report on the Advisory Council's February 8, 2012 meeting on Ultrafine Particles: Ambient Monitoring and Field Studies**

Chairperson Hayes made introductory comments regarding the report drafting and revision process.

Member Bolles suggested, regarding Emerging Issues #1.e., the use of “understanding” in place of “understand.”

Member Holtzclaw suggested, regarding Emerging Issues #1.e., the use of “but” instead of “and.”

Member Kurucz made introductory comments regarding the revised draft report, summarized the revisions to date and invited input from the Members as follows:

#### **Summary**

Member Vura-Weis suggested the addition of “AQMP” to the Glossary. Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, clarified the meaning of the acronym to be “Air Quality Management Plan.”

#### **Key Points – Dr. Philip M. Fine**

Member Range suggested the addition of “NBS” for “National Bureau of Standards” to the Glossary.

Member Bornstein asked, regarding #2, whether the first sentence should be expanded upon for the sake of clarification. Member Holtzclaw suggested merging the first and second sentences. Member Kurucz suggested the use of “receptors” instead of “samplers” and asked Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, about the accuracy of each term. Mr. Stevenson acknowledged that both terms are accurate relative to UFP. Member Bornstein asked if the first sentence shouldn't be deleted. Member Bramlett noted the value it adds in terms of capturing the reader's attention. Mr. Bornstein discussed the same with Chairperson Hayes. Member Kurucz asked if the changes being discussed will result in an improvement to which Member Vura-Weis responded in the affirmative, noting that the improved language will help to prime the reader. Chairperson Hayes asked if there is something special about ultrafine particles (UFP) that the Council is trying to say here. Member Vura-Weis responded in the affirmative, noting the aggregation and chemical changes. Member Bornstein agreed. Chairperson Hayes noted that there are two main points about UFP, that their dangerous effects dissipate very close to the source and that dissipation occurs via rapid changes. Member Kurucz asked if the proposed changes will accurately reflect Dr. Fine's presentation. Member Bornstein suggested it is consistent with the sentences that follow. Member Kurucz noted that Dr. Fine was talking about general rules of thumb and that various meteorological conditions may have an effect on the

norm. Chairperson Hayes said that the Council does not want to put words into the mouth of Dr. Fine. Mr. Stevenson suggested that Dr. Fine's point regarding this topic was that one must be within a specific zone in order for samples to be representative of the source. Member Range suggested the proposed changes to be redundant in light of the last sentence and suggested something be included consistent with Mr. Stevenson's comment. Member Kurucz suggested, in keeping with Mr. Stevenson's comment, the addition of "In order to be representative of the source, such as roadways, samplers should be located within the zone of influence."

Member Vura-Weis suggested the addition of language that clarifies there are significant drops in UFP at 50 and 150 meters from sources.

Member Vura-Weis suggested, regarding #4, inserting language to clarify that emissions from jet take-offs are high, not the aircraft themselves. Member Bornstein suggested that "from airports" may be unnecessary.

#### Key Points – Dr. Eric Fujita

Member Holtzclaw suggested the insertion of a close quotation mark after "emitters."

Member Vura-Weis suggested replacing "auto oil burners" with "automobiles that burn lube oil". Member Bornstein suggested that the same change be made throughout the report and noted that "gross emitters" is not a defined term. Chairperson Hayes and Members Bornstein, Kurucz and Vura-Weis discussed if staff or the Council has or should define the term, concluding that it is best left undefined by the Council at this juncture.

Chairperson Hayes, Members Kurucz and Bornstein and Mr. Kendall, discussed the appropriate use of "fresh," "aged" and "petroleum" in reference to oil. Chairperson Hayes suggested, regarding #1, the addition of "lube" before both instances of "oil" and the deletion of "(petroleum)."

#### Emerging Issues

Member Holtzclaw suggested, regarding #1.c., the addition of "smoking." Member Bramlett noted that there are a number of indoor sources that aren't listed. Member Holtzclaw noted the mortality rate attributed to smoking. Member Kurucz said that there are several indoor sources listed and if computer printers are included, smoking certainly should be. Member Vura-Weis said that smoking represents a significant health risk and should be added. Chairperson Hayes agreed with the suggestion and Member Kurucz confirmed that the revision should read, "...cooking, smoking and wood burning."

Member Vura-Weis suggested, regarding #1.a., the addition of "duration of exposure." Members Bornstein and Vura-Weis discussed the appropriate place for its addition. Chairperson Hayes suggested the revision to "number, mass and composition" and agreed with Member Vura-Weis' repeated suggestion to include, "as well as duration of exposure."

Chairperson Hayes and Members Bornstein and Holtzclaw discussed the language in #1.e. regarding HVAC systems in schools. Member Vura-Weis suggested inserting, "Closing windows and circulating air through the HVAC system filters can help reduce UFP at schools, especially

on high pollution days.” Member Kurucz questioned whether the revised language accurately captures the spirit of the speaker’s presentation on this topic. Member Cherry suggested the addition of “appropriately chosen” before “filters.” Member Bramlett objected to the assumption that school windows tend to be open. Member Kurucz expressed his concern about the changing meaning of the presentations at the hands of the Council. Members Vura-Weis and Kurucz reviewed the wording of the final revision. Member Bornstein suggested that the last portion, regarding high pollution days, is unnecessary. Member Vura-Weis suggested that it should stay, as it has a different emphasis. Members Bornstein and Vura-Weis and Chairperson Hayes agreed to delete the language.

Chairperson Hayes suggested, regarding #2.b., that it be renumbered as #2.a. Member Bornstein suggested shortening the phrase. Member Vura-Weis noted that it may be worth noting that fuel combustion may not be the primary source of indoor UFP. Chairperson Hayes said it is accurate as written. Member Bornstein asked if this is the proper location to provide clarification regarding “oil burners.” Member Kurucz suggested the addition of “significant” before “UFP source.”

Member Brazil inquired about the consistent use of the term “oil burners.” Member Kurucz and Mr. Kendall discussed the vaporization aspect of lubrication oil use. Member Bornstein suggested, regarding #2.a., the addition of “vaporization of” before “lubricating.”

Ms. Roggenkamp inquired, regarding #2.a., about the need for “in front.” Mr. Bornstein responded that it may not be the ideal choice of words. Mr. Kendall and Member Kurucz discussed the genesis of the inclusion of the words. Member Range suggested instead, “...by vehicles directly in front of the measurement device.” Member Bornstein noted that the intent is not devices but cars. Chairperson Hayes suggested that the sentence be deleted as it is not the main point. Member Bornstein agreed that it should either be deleted or moved to the end of #2.a. Member Kurucz suggested the continued importance of the sentence.

Mr. Kendall noted, regarding #2.c., the use of both “cycle” and “stroke” and urged term usage consistency. Member Bramlett stated that “cycle” is appropriate in all cases as “stroke” is vernacular.

Member Bornstein suggested, regarding #2.a., that “On-road measurements...” should instead read, “On-road concentrations...”

Chairperson Hayes suggested, regarding #2.a., that the second sentence be moved to the end and “measurements” be changed to “concentrations.” Mr. Kendall noted that it does not occur solely through vaporization, but also through combustion. Member Bornstein said the difference is an important point and suggested, “Vaporization and combustion.” Member Vura-Weis agreed with Member Bornstein’s suggestion and urged the use of “lubricating” in place of “lube” throughout the report.

Member Bramlett suggested that the Council may be getting too operational in the report and urged the Council to leave room for staff to draw their own conclusions. Member Vura-Weis responded that the report is speaking to the Board of Directors, not staff. Member Bornstein said that the added language is valuable in light of Mr. Kendall’s comment.

Member Bornstein reminded the Council that the Glossary was used as a tool for defining acronyms rather than doing so within the text of the report.

### Measurements

Member Holtzclaw suggested, regarding #3.a.i., that it read “Adoption” instead of “Adaptation.”

Member Range suggested, regarding #3.a.i., that “currently the best means for quantifying UFP” be inserted instead of “the best that we can do now to quantify UFP.”

Chairperson Hayes suggested, regarding #3.a.i., the insertion, “has not been proposed and may be some time off” in place of “is years in the future.”

Chairperson Hayes asked, regarding #3.a.iii., the purpose or goal of the first sentence. Member Bornstein proposed the deletion of the first sentence and “however” from the second sentence. Chairperson Hayes asked if it is a criticism of staff to include the last sentence and whether that was the intention. Member Kurucz suggested that something will be lost by deleting the first sentence; the point was cautionary. Mr. Kendall noted that the goal is to show the importance of being involved in monitoring at this stage, but also the desire to avoid overcommitting resources to monitoring when so much data already exists. Chairperson Hayes stated the importance of capturing the sense that technology is changing and the Air District is best served by being involved in the development process. Member Bramlett suggested inserting, “Select measurements of the effect.” Chairperson Hayes suggested inserting, “Measurement technology is evolving.” Member Bornstein suggested something needs to be included regarding the not yet reliable and continually evolving aspects. Member Vura-Weis noted that #3.a.iii. addresses the separate issue of the atmospheric conditions and their impact on concentrations, and questioned whether it should remain in its current location and form. Member Range said that it is an important point in light of #3.b. Member Bornstein attempted to restate the various proposed revisions left outstanding. Chairperson Hayes suggested the deletion of #3.a.iii. Member Kurucz expressed his agreement with the deletion of #3.a.iii and a revision of #3.a.ii. to include language about measurement methods evolving but not yet being as accurate as some more developed technology.

Member Bornstein suggested, regarding #3.b., the addition of “already” before “purchased.” Chairperson Hayes and Member Kurucz asked staff about the accuracy of this amended phrase to which Mr. Stevenson responded that only one device is in the Air District’s possession. Chairperson Hayes recommended leaving the language as it reads.

Mr. Stevenson requested, regarding #3.b., the deletion of “atmospheric.” Chairperson Hayes suggested instead, “... to study UFP concentrations and exposure.” Member Vura-Weis noted the earlier deletion of references to atmospheric conditions in response to the suggested deletion. Mr. Stevenson briefly explained the issue with including a reference to atmospheric impacts. Chairperson Hayes suggested instead, “This will enable them to study factors affecting UFP concentrations and exposure.” Member Bornstein proposed the change to be redundant in light of the first sentence.

## Recommendations

Member Holtzclaw asked, regarding #2, what is meant by “indoor appliances”? Member Cherry suggested that the term is in reference to those items with combustion engines. Chairperson Hayes and Members Holtzclaw and Vura-Weis discussed the use of, “... and other indoor sources.”

Member Bornstein suggested the addition of “smoking.”

Member Vura-Weis asked what is meant by “Prioritize” to which various members responded in the affirmative. Member Bornstein responded that there are a number of determinations to be made and asked how this would be best reflected in the report.

Chairperson Hayes asked, regarding #1, about the value and accuracy of the insertion of “... and its integration with the PM<sub>2.5</sub> program.” Mr. Stevenson recommended the inclusion of a statement along the suggested lines.

Member Kurucz questioned whether the report is beginning to speak to Air District management. Member Brazil asked if management isn’t doing these things already. Chairperson Hayes answered in the affirmative; clarifying that the Board of Directors is the target audience and this provides a reminder. Ms. Roggenkamp noted the use of “program” may not be entirely accurate but is not necessarily problematic. Chairperson Hayes, various Members of the Council, and Ms. Roggenkamp discussed the best terminology, deciding on “activities” and “efforts” in that order.

Member Range suggested, regarding #1, the deletion of “to” before “recommendations.” Member Bornstein responded that it was inserted purposefully during the revision process.

Chairperson Hayes suggested, regarding #6 and #6.b., the use of “UFP” in place of both instances of “UPC.”

Member Bramlett questioned, regarding #6.a., the use of “freeways” instead of “high traffic flow roadways” to which Mr. Bornstein replied that the substitution of the latter is a good one.

Chairperson Hayes asked if the Recommendations portion of the report is acceptable to staff and ready for Council consideration.

Member Holtzclaw suggested, regarding #2, the addition of “heavily used diesel rail terminals” and “ports.” Chairperson Hayes responded that the purpose is to provide conceptual examples not a comprehensive list and recommended they not be included. Member Vura-Weis noted that there are populations whose main issue may not be freeways and, in turn, urged the substitution of “other sources.” Chairperson Hayes stated that the Air District is still trying to figure out the issue and the Council should avoid vilifying trains in the course of a big picture look at solutions. Member Kurucz added that the purpose of the report is relaying concepts and examples, not focused conclusions.

Mr. Kendall noted, regarding #6.a., that the Council’s use of “Most people are not exposed” is a questionable choice of words. Chairperson Hayes and Members Kurucz and Vura-Weis discussed possible alternative language and the appropriate level of specificity in this report.

Member Bolles noted the conclusion at the last meeting was that the Council should be wary of putting too fine a point on its recommendations. Member Vura-Weis asked whether items “a” through “g” under #6 should be amended or deleted. Member Range said that best practices are being set forth and the Council does not seem to be overreaching. Member Bornstein suggested that #6 be developed and the subset be deleted to which Member Range agreed, provided the items in the subset are paired down. Member Bornstein said that the Council is doing the work of staff by providing too much detail. Mr. Kendall noted that the items in the subset came from Council questions to the speakers and significant efforts were made to cautiously revise them. Member Bolles noted that many of these may be talking points for Board of Director discussions with their constituents. Ms. Roggenkamp said that the list is helpful so long each item is left somewhat general and open.

Member Cherry agreed with Ms. Roggenkamp’s recommendation and suggested, regarding #6.b., that recommending the closure of windows and doors is pretty strong and may result in an outright rejection of the Council’s recommendations. Chairperson Hayes suggested, “If you live and work near a major outdoor UFP source, keep windows and doors closed when possible.”

Member Kurucz suggested, regarding #6.a., the deletion of “... or if they live near freeways,” and move #6.c. to be the second part of #6.a. Ms. Roggenkamp recommended, regarding #6.a., that the second sentence be deleted and #6.b. be revised in turn. Member Bornstein suggested substituting the current language at the end of #6 with, “Concepts for integration may include:” and consolidating #6.d.i. through iii.

Public comments: None.

Council action:

Member Vura-Weis made a motion to approve the report, as amended. Member Bramlett seconded; carried unanimously without objection.

Ms. Roggenkamp asked if the Council intends to present the report now or at a later date in conjunction with further reports of the Council.

Mr. Kendall noted the need for Council Member volunteers to work on the report drafting team for the next presentation topic.

Member Bramlett opined that consolidating the reports of the Council seems to help the development of a deeper connection between the various topics discussed. Ms. Roggenkamp agreed.

Member Vura-Weis suggested that the final report be made available to staff, that the Board of Directors be made aware of its being available, and then be held for presentation to the Board of Directors at year end with the other reports of the Council. Chairperson Hayes indicated that this process worked well last year and agreed that the report should not be presented for the time being. Member Bornstein asked by what mechanism the Council might ask the Board of Directors their preference. Ms. Roggenkamp replied that, from her perspective, it is a pleasure to watch the Council’s efforts evolve over the course of the year and become a unified piece of work over time.

Member Bornstein asked what the third speaker topic will be to which Mr. Kendall replied that it would be mitigation.

Chairperson Hayes asked for volunteers for the next work group. Members Bramlett, Cherry and Range volunteered. Mr. Kendall suggested that the Chairperson ask again at the next meeting. Member Kurucz noted that the lead member of the work group was selected after the last presentation.

Chairperson Hayes and Member Kurucz expressed their gratitude to the members of the work group that crafted the current report.

### **OTHER BUSINESS**

#### **3. Council Member Comments/Other Business**

Member Bramlett asked that a flyer of confirmed speaker presentation dates be prepared and sent via electronic mail to all members of the Council so they may pass it along to interested parties.

Member Range stated that the National Conference of the American Planning Association will convene in Los Angeles on Saturday, April 14, 2012, at 10:30 a.m.

Chairperson Hayes noted the resignation of Kenneth S. Blonski from the Council, effective April 3, 2012, and read Mr. Blonski's resignation letter.

Member Bornstein and Ms. Roggenkamp discussed the current constitution of the Council, the number of vacancies, and the subject matter areas in which the vacancies exist.

Member Bolles asked if the Air District has regulations regarding open burning.

Member Bornstein inquired about the court challenge on the Air District's new office building to which Ms. Roggenkamp clarified that there are no court challenges, that there is legislation pending on the topic, and the Air District is proceeding with the move in the meantime.

Chairperson Hayes noted the upcoming Air and Waste Management Association 2012 Annual Conference and Exhibition and the likely attendees from the Council.

**4. Time and Place of Next Meeting:** Wednesday, May 9, 2012, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.

**5. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 11:00 a.m.

Sean Gallagher  
Clerk of the Boards