



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL RETREAT & REGULAR MEETING

WEDNESDAY
JANUARY 9, 2013
9:00 A.M.

7TH FLOOR BOARD ROOM
939 ELLIS STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109

AGENDA

CALL TO ORDER

Opening Comments	Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Chairperson
Roll Call	Clerk
Introduction of New Advisory Council Members	Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Chairperson
Oath of Office	Clerk

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items, Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3. The public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Advisory Council meetings are posted at the District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, at least 72 hours before a meeting. At the beginning of the meeting, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's purview. Speakers are limited to three minutes each.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of Minutes of the November 14, 2012 Advisory Council Meeting

RECOGNITION

2. Recognition of Outgoing Advisory Council Members **Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Chairperson**

The Council will recognize outgoing Advisory Council members.

3. Recognition of Outgoing Advisory Council Chairperson **Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Chairperson**

The Council will recognize outgoing Chairperson, Stan Hayes, for his dedicated leadership, and service to air quality in the Bay Area.

RETREAT

4. Discussion of the 2013 Advisory Council Meetings **Eric Stevenson, Advisory Council Liaison**

The Council will discuss the dates, topics and format for the 2013 Advisory Council meetings.

5. Review and Discussion of 2012 **Eric Stevenson, Advisory Council Liaison**

The Council will discuss the Advisory Council meetings, presentations and reports for 2012, including potential changes for 2013, with Air District staff.

PRESENTATION

6. Air District Activities Around Black Carbon **Eric Stevenson, Advisory Council Liaison**

Staff will present brief reports on Air District black carbon activities.

AIR DISTRICT OVERVIEW

7. Report of the Executive Officer/APCO **Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer**

Mr. Broadbent will provide an update on pending and planned Air District activities, policies and initiatives.

OTHER BUSINESS

8. Chairperson's Report **Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., Chairperson**

9. Council Member Comments/Other Business

Council Members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information, or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

10. Time and Place of Next Meeting

Wednesday, February 13, 2013, at 9:00 a.m., at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109.

11. Adjournment

CONTACT EXECUTIVE OFFICE - 939 ELLIS STREET SF, CA 94109

(415) 749-5016
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk's Office should be given in a timely manner, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body. Such writing(s) may also be posted on the District's website (www.baaqmd.gov) at that time.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109
(415) 771-4963

EXECUTIVE OFFICE:
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF DISTRICT MEETINGS

JANUARY 2013

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	2	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Advisory Council Regular Meeting/Retreat <i>(Meets 2nd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	9	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
Special Board of Directors Meeting/Retreat <i>(Meets 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	16	9:45 a.m.	San Jose City Hall 200 East Santa Clara Street San Jose, CA 95113
Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets 3rd Monday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	21	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee <i>(Meets the 3rd Monday of Every Other Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	21	10:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	23	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets 4th Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room

FEBRUARY 2013

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	6	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Advisory Council Regular Meeting <i>(Meets 2nd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	13	9:00 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets 3rd Monday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	18	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	20	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	27	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets 4th Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	28	9:30 a.m.	4 th Floor Conf. Room

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Robert Bornstein, Ph.D. and
Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 27, 2012

Re: Advisory Council's Draft Meeting Minutes of November 14, 2012

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve attached draft minutes of the Regular Advisory Council's meeting of November 14, 2012.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the November 14, 2012 Advisory Council meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Sean Gallagher
Reviewed by: Ana Sandoval

Attachment

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 749-5000

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Wednesday, November 14, 2012

CALL TO ORDER

Chairperson Stan Hayes called the meeting to order at 9:09 a.m. without an initial quorum or roll call.

CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Approval of Minutes of the October 10, 2012, Advisory Council Regular Meeting

Council Comments:

Member Lutzker suggested, regarding page 7, paragraph 3, the meaning of the second sentence is unclear. Member Vura-Weis suggested deleting the portion beginning with “Member Vura-Weis” and ending “Chairperson Hayes agreed.” The Council members present agreed.

ROLL CALL

Present: Chairperson Stan Hayes; Secretary Sam Altshuler, P.E.; and Council Members Benjamin Bolles, Harold Brazil, John Holtzclaw, Ph.D., Gary Lucks, J.D., C.P.E.A., Liza Lutzker, M.P.H., Rick Marshall, P.E., P.L.S., Jane Martin, Dr.P.H., Jessica Range, LEED A.P., Dorothy Vura-Weis, M.D., M.P.H., and Murray Wood.

Absent: Vice-Chairperson Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., and Council Members Jennifer Bard, Jeffrey Bramlett, M.S., C.S.P., Jonathan Cherry, A.I.A., LEED A.P., Caryl Hart, J.D., Ph.D., Kraig Kurucz, Kathryn Lyddan, J.D., and Estes Al Phillips.

Also Present: Board Director Brad Wagenknecht.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

OPENING COMMENTS

Chairperson Hayes made introductory comments regarding the agenda.

CONSENT CALENDAR (Continued)

2. Approval of Minutes of the October 10, 2012, Advisory Council Regular Meeting (Continued)

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: Member Holtzclaw made a motion to approve the minutes of October 10, 2012, as amended; Member Vura-Weis seconded; and the motion was unanimously approved without objection.

DISCUSSION

3. Approval of draft report of the Advisory Council's September 12, 2012 meeting

Chairperson Hayes made introductory comments regarding the report drafting process and invited input from the Members on the sections within the report as follows:

“SUMMARY”

None.

“KEY POINTS – Yifang Zhu, Ph.D. – “Exposure to Ultrafine Particles on and Near Roadways”

Member Vura-Weis asked, regarding the first #2, if autism was mentioned by Dr. Zhu and the Council discussed the same.

Member Vura-Weis asked, regarding the second #1, if the information relative to commute periods and hour ranges were reviewed by Dr. Zhu. Chairperson Hayes suggested deleting the parenthetical portion and the Council discussed the same, finally agreeing to strike the time range.

Member Lucks asked, regarding the second #4, if the last sentence is factually correct and the Council discussed the same among its members and with Eric Stevenson, Director of Technical Services, as well as the continued use of “easily.”

“KEY POINTS – Rajiv Bhatia, MD, MPH – “Policy Strategies to Reduce Health Impacts from Urban Particulate Pollution”

Member Lutzker suggested “SF” first be defined as “San Francisco” and that the “San Francisco Department of Public Health (SFPH)” and “SF” be added to the Glossary. Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Lucks asked, regarding #4, if the subject matter is broader in scope than fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}). Chairperson Hayes said “2.5” will be deleted.

Member Lutzker suggested, regarding #4.a, inserting “congestion” before “pricing,” the Council discussed the same, and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Range suggested, regarding #4, inserting “could” before “include” and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Bolles said, regarding #8, that he continues to doubt the connection between noise pollution and air quality and the Council discussed the same.

Member Lucks suggested, regarding #5, deleting “would” at the end of the fourth line.

Member Altshuler mentioned, regarding #8, his professional advocacy for noise to be considered an air pollutant and the Council discussed the same, after which Chairperson Hayes decided to replace “model” with “administrative example.”

Member Lutzker asked if the hierarchy of control concept should be added to this section of the report and the Council discussed the same.

“EMERGING ISSUES”

Member Holtzclaw asked, regarding #5, how many cities and counties are within the jurisdiction of the Air District, which question was answered by Mr. Stevenson and Brian Bunger, District Counsel. Chairperson Hayes decided to insert “approximately” before “100.”

Member Holtzclaw suggested, regarding #7, deleting “upon” and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Altshuler said, regarding #1, the level of detail is too fine to include without more work and Member Holtzclaw disagreed.

Member Range suggested, regarding #1, clarification about what is meant by “as well as their interaction” and the Council discussed the same, as well as the use of “e.g.,” the grammatical construction of the sub-bullets, whether sub-bullets should be used in this instance, the use of “control” versus “behavior” and the continued inclusion of “lower driving speeds” under the “personal control” category.

Member Range suggested, regarding #2, the last sentence be deleted and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Lutzker asked, regarding #1.d., about the meaning of the last example and suggested it be deleted.

Chairperson Hayes asked, regarding #9, whether it should be advanced in the list order, the Council discussed the same and decided to move it to #2.

Member Altshuler shared his surprise at the decision to delete the last sentence in #2 and the Council discussed the same amongst its members and with Mr. Stevenson.

Member Range said, regarding #4, that the last sentence is confusing and Chairperson Hayes decided to delete the last portion, beginning with “at the particle.”

“RECOMMENDATIONS”

Member Holtzclaw noted that a previous draft of the report included an item regarding Air District work with cities, counties and regional agencies on traffic reduction but that it is absent in this version and the Council discussed the same.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Brad Wagenknecht, Air District Board of Directors, was noted present at 10:30 a.m.

Member Lutzker said #4 does not read properly and the Council discussed among its members and with Mr. Stevenson the difference between modeling and inventory, as well as the state of work at the Air District relative to both, and Chairperson Hayes decided to amend the item to read, “Continue efforts to model UFP air quality impacts at a regional level.”

Member Altshuler suggested, regarding #5, deleting the last portion, beginning with “to provide local” and inserting the remaining portion at the end of #4, the Council discussed the same and Chairperson Hayes agreed.

Member Range said she agrees with #8, 9 and 10 but that they do not seem to flow from those items in Emerging Issues and the Council discussed the same and how best to format them with and among the other Recommendations.

Member Altshuler asked if an additional Recommendation should be added regarding the continued evaluation of the hierarchy of controls and the Council discussed the same and its placement in the list.

“GLOSSARY”

Member Holtzclaw asked if “HEPA” is properly defined and Chairperson Hayes and Mr. Stevenson said yes.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: Member Altshuler made a motion to approve the Report of the Advisory Council’s September 12, 2012, Meeting on Ultrafine Particles: Exposure Reduction, as amended; Member Holtzclaw seconded; and the motion was unanimously approved without objection.

4. Discussion, Recommendation and Selection of Slate of Officers for 2013

The Council discussed a Slate of Officers for 2013.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action:

Member Altshuler made a motion, seconded by Member Holtzclaw, and carried unanimously without objection to appoint Member Bornstein as Chairperson.

Member Holtzclaw made a motion, seconded by Member Lutzker, and carried unanimously without objection, with Member Altshuler abstaining, to appoint Member Altshuler as Vice Chairperson.

Member Altshuler made a motion, seconded by Member Bolles, and carried unanimously without objection, with Member Lutzker abstaining, to appoint Member Lutzker as Secretary.

5. Discussion of the Report to the Board of Directors on Ultrafine Particulate Matter Topics of 2012

The Council discussed, among its members and with Director Wagenknecht and Mr. Stevenson, the report summarizing information on ultrafine particulate matter topics addressed by the Council during 2012 and the selection of members to present the same to the Board of Directors on December 5 or 19, 2012.

Council Comments: None.

Public Comments: None.

Council Action: None; informational only.

OTHER BUSINESS

6. Council Member Comments/Other Business

Mr. Stevenson gave a summary of the status of the PM_{2.5} attainment standard and an overview of active projects and amendments to regulations being considered.

Chairperson Hayes provided a list of proposed topics for the upcoming year and invited member feedback and additional suggestions and the Council discussed.

Chairperson Hayes announced that the Personnel Committee of the Board of Directors interviewed applicants for appointments to the Council, Public Health and Conservation categories, and made recommendations to the Board of Directors for consideration on November 19, 2012.

Chairperson Hayes, on behalf of the Council, recognized Members Martin and Vura-Weis and presented each with a token of appreciation for their respective service. Members Martin and Vura-Weis addressed the Council in turn.

Member Lutzker announced that the California Breathing Asthma program of the California Department of Public Health is hosting its Asthma Summit on December 5th and 6th in San Francisco and the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment will soon be giving a presentation in Sacramento regarding cumulative impacts.

Member Lucks said that his annual legislative summary should be complete in February and that significant legislative action is expected in the coming year in light of the political climate in Sacramento.

Member Bolles shared his curiosity about the Air District's influence outside of the Bay Area.

7. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** Wednesday, January 9, 2013, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109 at 9:00 a.m.
8. **Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 12:12 p.m.

Sean Gallagher
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., and
Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 27, 2012

Re: Discussion of the 2013 Advisory Council Meetings

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve proposed 2013 Advisory Council meetings, including format of meetings, topics and dates.

BACKGROUND

In accordance with the provisions of the Air District's Administrative Code, Division I, Operating Policies and Procedures, Section 7 Advisory Council, the Advisory Council meets in a retreat format in January to consult with the Executive Officer to consider topics for no more than four symposium format meetings for the calendar year.

DISCUSSION

Staff will present a proposal for the 2013 Advisory Council Meetings. The Council and Air District staff will discuss the proposal for the 2013 Advisory Council meetings, including meeting format, topics and dates. A copy of the proposal is attached.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Eric Stevenson
Reviewed by: Jean Roggenkamp
Brian Bunger

Attachment 1: Proposal for 2013 Advisory Council Meetings

Proposal for 2013 Advisory Council Meetings

There will be a total of ten Advisory Council meetings held during calendar year 2013. The first meeting is a retreat held in January to discuss and establish the 2013 meetings agenda and topics. Research indicates that black carbon has potential health impacts as well as effects on climate. Black carbon is a complex, multi-faceted issue and staff propose the Council focus on black carbon for 2013. For 2013 staff propose to schedule the first symposium-like meeting in February, like 2012. This will allow the report on the 2nd symposium-like meeting to be completed in July and provide for two discussion meetings on the 3rd symposium-like meeting.

The second through tenth meetings will be held on the 2nd Wednesday of each month, alternating between a symposium-like meeting, and two discussion meetings to discuss the presentations and materials received and prepare a report for the Board of Directors. If time allows during the 2nd discussion meeting, staff will present recent Air District activities. No meetings will be held in August or December. Each symposium-like meeting will be three hours from 9:00 AM to noon, with presentation(s) on a single topic, or related topics, by experts in the field. Presentation(s) will be completed by approximately 11:00 AM to allow time for comments and questions by the members of the Advisory Council and staff. After the presentation(s), the speakers will form a panel to discuss their presentations and take additional questions. For each symposium-like meeting a work group will be appointed by the Chair. The work group will be responsible for taking notes and preparing a draft report to be discussed and finalized at the discussion meetings. These reports will be presented to the Executive Committee of the Board of Directors. A member of the Advisory Council or the Chair will present a summarization of the year's activities to the Board. The discussion meetings will be two hours from 9:00 AM to 11:00 AM. The Executive Office will continue to prepare agendas, record minutes, arrange for lunches, etc. for all ten meetings of the Advisory Council. Lunch will be provided for the members of the Advisory Council and presenters.

The ten meetings are tentatively scheduled as follows:

- | | |
|---|---------------------------------------|
| 1. Retreat | 9:00 AM–11:00 AM, Wed., Jan. 9, 2013 |
| 2. Meeting 1: Introduction to Black Carbon | 9:00 AM-noon, Wed., Feb. 13, 2013 |
| 3. Discussion & Report on Meeting 1 | 9:00 AM-11:00 AM, Wed., Mar. 13, 2013 |
| 4. Discussion & Report on Meeting 1, continued | 9:00 AM–11:00 AM, Wed., Apr. 10, 2013 |
| 5. Meeting 2: Black Carbon – Climate Change
And Exposure | 9:00 AM–noon, Wed., May 8, 2013 |
| 6. Discussion & Report on Meeting 2 | 9:00 AM–11:00 AM, Wed., June 12, 2013 |
| 7. Discussion & Report on Meeting 2, continued | 9:00 AM–11:00 AM, Wed., July 10, 2013 |
| 8. Meeting 3: Black Carbon – Emission Sources | 9:00 AM–noon AM, Wed., Sep. 11, 2013 |

AGENDA 4, Attachment 1

9. Discussion & Report on Meeting 3

9:00 AM–11:00 AM, Wed., Oct.9, 2013

10. Discussion & Report on Meeting 3, continued

9:00 AM–11:00 AM, Wed., Nov. 13, 2013

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Robert Bornstein, Ph.D., and
Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 27, 2012

Re: Review and Discussion of 2012

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

None.

DISCUSSION

The Council will discuss the meetings, presentations, reports, processes, etc. for 2012, and potential changes for 2013 with Air District staff.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Eric Stevenson
Reviewed by: Jean Roggenkamp
Brian Bunger

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Robert Bornstein, Ph.D. and
Members of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 31, 2012

Re: Air District Activities Around Black Carbon

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

None.

DISCUSSION

Staff will present brief reports on the Air District's activities regarding black carbon.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Eric Stevenson
Reviewed by: Jean Roggenkamp
Brian Bungler