

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of December 3, 2015

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109  
(415) 749-5073

**APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, December 3, 2015

*Note: An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>.*

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Advisory Council (Council) Member Stan Hayes called the meeting to order at 9:15 a.m.

**Opening Comments:** Member Hayes provided a welcome address to the new Council and extended appreciation to the former Advisory Council.

**Roll Call:**

Present: Ms. Doduc, Dr. Harley, Professor Kleinman, Dr. Lipman, Dr. Long, and Mr. Hayes.

Absent: Dr. Borenstein.

Also Present: Mayor Rod Sinks, Member of the Board of Directors (Board).

Continued Comments: Member Hayes describes the transition from an Advisory Council to the current Council.

**2. WELCOME**

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), addressed the Council and described the intent for the newly formed group and the goals of the Air District.

Oath of office administered to all present Council members.

Brian Bunger, District Counsel, addressed the Council with regards to Brown Act Requirements.

**3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS:** No requests received.

**4. COUNCIL INTRODUCTIONS:** Council members individually introduced themselves.

## 5. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Jeff McKay, Deputy APCO, introduced the role of the chairperson and vice-chairperson of the Council.

The Council further discussed the roles and duties.

### Council Action:

Member Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Member Long, to nominate Member Hayes as the Chairperson of the Council; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Doduc, Hayes, Harley, Kleinman, Lipman and Long.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Borenstein.

Member Lipman made a motion, seconded by Member Doduc, to nominate Member Kleinman as Vice-Chairperson of the Council; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Doduc, Hayes, Harley, Kleinman, Lipman and Long.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Borenstein.

## 6. Council Charter: Council members discussed key elements of a Council charter.

Mr. McKay described the proposed Council Charter; terms of the chair and vice-chair; how deliverables are to be created; and operational details of the Council.

The Council and staff discussed the proposed Council Charter; how additional questions to the group are to be proposed for deliberations; how to handle public comments on non-agenda and agenda items; document preparation and review Health and Safety Code requirements for appointments and reappointments.

Member Doduc made a motion, seconded by Member Kleinman, to adopt the proposed Charter of the Council; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Doduc, Hayes, Harley, Kleinman, Lipman and Long.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Borenstein.

## **7. Air District Overview**

Mr. McKay welcomed the Council by providing an overview of the Air District, including categories of pollutants; organization; emission trends; national and state standards; attainment status; risk from toxic air contaminants; impacted communities; regional modeling of toxic air contaminants; and climate change.

Mr. Bunger welcomed the Council by providing a legal overview of the District including air quality problems; regulatory framework; District authority; criteria pollutant control planning and regulations; District regulations; criteria pollutant control permits; air toxics control; and greenhouse gases (GHGs).

The Council and staff discussed GHGs; Assembly Bill 32; Board considerations; drafting policies to achieve District goals; and caps on pollutants.

## **8. Presentation and Discussion on First Key Question**

Mr. Broadbent presented the first key question to the Council: What is the efficacy of imposing numeric caps on GHGs from Bay Area refineries?

The Council recessed at 11:10 a.m. and resumed at 11:25 a.m.

Mr. McKay introduced Jim Karas, Director of Engineering, who gave the staff presentation *Overview of Petroleum Refining*, including a refinery overview: crude units, light gases, light and heavy naphtha, kerosene, diesel, gas oil, residue, U.S. crude oil production, California crude oil supply sources, Bay Area refinery locations, crude oil processing capacity, major Bay Area refinery products, refinery emissions sources, current refinery projects, refinery information resources, trends in crude oil quality, crude oil supply sources, west coast refinery crude oil compared to the rest of the nation, and California refinery output by product types.

Mr. McKay introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning and Climate Protection, who gave the staff presentation *Air District Climate Protection Program*, including program goals and focus; climate protection initiatives; local government support; outcomes and results; collaboration efforts with Air Resources Board (ARB) and other air districts; ARB's cap-and-trade program; Bay Area GHG emissions; consumption-based GHGs and emissions inventory; Bay Area GHG forecasts; Bay Area refinery emissions trends; Climate Protection Resolution; 10-Point Climate Action Work Program; climate staffing and resources; regional climate protection strategy; climate rulemaking; and the pathway to 2050.

### Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the low carbon fuel standard; regional regulatory environment; fossil fuel sources; target goals; market changes; performance measures; qualitative measures on climate protection plans; fugitive rules; cost of compliance; socioeconomic reports for new regulations; GHG measurement and concerns in South Coast Air Basin; emissions caps interfering with cap and trade rules; methane leaks; varied fuel sources; electrification as a long-term approach; interim goals on reducing emissions; technical solutions for reducing GHGs; storing carbon in the ground; looking beyond GHG emissions and seeking a multi-pollutant

approach for toxics and GHGs; considering full lifecycle analysis of oil and related emissions; seeking reasonable and feasible solutions to emissions concerns; requests for technical expertise from refinery experts; the refinery emissions strategy; and evaluation of proposals from community groups. The Council expressed interest in further information from ARB on Cap and Trade.

**9. Time and Place of Next Meeting:** At the call of the Chairperson.

**10. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 1:06 p.m.

*/s/ Tom Flannigan*

Tom Flannigan  
Acting Clerk of the Boards