



BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT

## ADVISORY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING

WEDNESDAY  
FEBRUARY 3, 2016  
10:00 A.M.

ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
1111 BROADWAY, SUITE 800  
OAKLAND, CA 94607

### AGENDA

1. **CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL – PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

*The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council members. The Council Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.*

2. **WELCOME**

J. Broadbent/5052  
[jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov)

*The Executive Officer/APCO will address the Council.*

3. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS**

*Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, the public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Council meetings are posted at the Air District, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, California 94109 at least 72 hours before a meeting. Speakers are typically limited to (3) three minutes each.*

*This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit <http://www.baaqmd.gov/The-Air-District/Board-of-Directors/Agendas-and-Minutes.aspx> at the time of the meeting.*

4. **ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 32: CALIFORNIA GLOBAL WARMING SOLUTIONS ACT OF 2006 AND THE CAP-AND-TRADE PROGRAM**

J. Broadbent/5052  
[jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov)

*Richard Corey, Executive Officer of the California Air Resources Board, will address the Council.*

5. **REVIEW OF REFINERY REGULATION**

J. Broadbent/5052  
[jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov)

*Staff will review current regulatory methods.*

6. **COUNCIL DELIBERATION**

J. Broadbent/5052  
[jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov)

*Topics may include toxics co-benefits, leakage, opportunity costs, and the reduction of emissions from sources not covered by Cap-and-Trade.*

**OTHER BUSINESS**

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

*Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, an opportunity is provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's purview. Speakers are typically limited to three minutes each.*

8. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

*Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information or ask questions about subsequent meetings.*

9. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

*At the call of the Chair.*

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

*The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.*

## CONTACT:

**MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS**  
**939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109**  
**mmartinez@baaqmd.gov**

**(415) 749-5016**  
**FAX: (415) 928-8560**  
**BAAQMD homepage:**  
[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the “Members of the Advisory Council” and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Council meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Council at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- **Accessibility and Title VI:** The Air District provides services and accommodations upon request to persons with disabilities and individuals who are limited-English proficient who wish to address Board matters. For accommodations or translations assistance, please call 415-749-5016 at least three days in advance of a meeting, so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

**Accesibilidad y Título VI:** El Distrito del Aire ofrece servicios y realiza las adaptaciones necesarias para las personas con discapacidades y para las personas con un dominio limitado del inglés siempre que estos servicios se soliciten y se deseen tratar asuntos relacionados con la Junta. Si necesita ayuda con algún tipo de adaptación o traducción, llame al 415-749-5016 como mínimo tres días antes de la reunión de manera que puedan realizarse las adaptaciones necesarias.

**Magagamit na Tulong at Título VI:** Nagbibigay ang Air District ng mga serbisyo at mga akomodasyon, kapag hiniling, sa mga taong may kapansanan at mga taong limitado ang kakayahan sa Ingles na gustong magpahayag tungkol sa mga usapin sa harap ng Lupon. Para sa mga tulong sa akomodasyon o sa pagsasalín, mangyaring tumawag sa 415-749-5016 nang tatlong araw man lamang na una pa sa miting, para makapaghandá ayon sa pangangailangan.

**可及度及標題VI:** 空氣管理局根據申請為殘障人士和英語熟練程度有限但卻希望參與董事會事宜的人員提供服務和住宿。關於住宿或者翻譯幫助，請至少在會議之前三天致電 415-749-5016，以便作出相應安排。

**Tạo Khả Năng Truy Cập và Chương VI:** Đặc Khu cung cấp dịch vụ và phương tiện đáp ứng, khi có yêu cầu, cho những người bị khuyết tật và cho những cá nhân không thông thạo Anh ngữ muốn được tham gia các vấn đề của Hội Đồng. Để được phương tiện đáp ứng hoặc trợ giúp phiên dịch, xin gọi số 415-749-5016 ít nhất ba ngày trước khi có hội thảo, để tiện bố trí các phương tiện

Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**  
**939 ELLIS STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109**  
**FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-5016 or (415) 749-4941**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:**  
**MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS**

**FEBRUARY 2016**

<b><u>TYPE OF MEETING</u></b>	<b><u>DAY</u></b>	<b><u>DATE</u></b>	<b><u>TIME</u></b>	<b><u>ROOM</u></b>
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	1	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	3	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Advisory Council Meeting</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Wednesday	3	10:00 a.m.	1111 Broadway Ave, #800 Oakland, CA 94607
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED / RESCHEDULED TO MARCH 2, 2016	Monday	15	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	15	10:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	17	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> -CANCELLED	Wednesday	24	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	25	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	25	11:00 a.m.	Board Room

# MARCH 2016

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> <b>-CANCELLED</b>	Wednesday	2	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	2	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	16	9:45 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> <i>(Meets 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday of every other Month)</i>	Thursday	17	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> <b>-CANCELLED</b>	Monday	21	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> <b>-CANCELLED</b>	Monday	21	10:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	23	9:30 a.m.	Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i> <b>-CANCELLED</b>	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	Board Room

VJ – 1/28/16 (12:53 p.m.)

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members  
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer

Date: January 25, 2016

Re: Approval of the Minutes of December 3, 2015

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of December 3, 2015.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Council meeting of December 3, 2015.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Tom Flannigan  
Reviewed by: Maricela Martinez

Attachment: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of December 3, 2015

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of December 3, 2015

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
939 Ellis Street  
San Francisco, CA 94109  
(415) 749-5073

**DRAFT MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Wednesday, December 3, 2015

*Note: An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>.*

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Advisory Council (Council) Member Stan Hayes called the meeting to order at 9:15 a.m.

**Opening Comments:** Member Hayes provided a welcome address to the new Council and extended appreciation to the former Advisory Council.

**Roll Call:**

Present: Ms. Doduc, Dr. Harley, Professor Kleinman, Dr. Lipman, Dr. Long, and Mr. Hayes.

Absent: Dr. Borenstein.

Also Present: Mayor Rod Sinks, Member of the Board of Directors (Board).

Continued Comments: Member Hayes describes the transition from an Advisory Council to the current Council.

**2. WELCOME**

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer / Air Pollution Control Officer (APCO), addressed the Council and described the intent for the newly formed group and the goals of the Air District.

Oath of office administered to all present Council members.

Brian Bunger, District Counsel, addressed the Council with regards to Brown Act Requirements.

**3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS:** No requests received.

**4. COUNCIL INTRODUCTIONS:** Council members individually introduced themselves.

## 5. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Jeff McKay, Deputy APCO, introduced the role of the chairperson and vice-chairperson of the Council.

The Council further discussed the roles and duties.

### Council Action:

Member Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Member Long, to nominate Member Hayes as the Chairperson of the Council; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Doduc, Hayes, Harley, Kleinman, Lipman and Long.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Borenstein.

Member Lipman made a motion, seconded by Member Doduc, to nominate Member Kleinman as Vice-Chairperson of the Council; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Doduc, Hayes, Harley, Kleinman, Lipman and Long.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Borenstein.

## 6. Council Charter: Council members discussed key elements of a Council charter.

Mr. McKay described the proposed Council Charter; terms of the chair and vice-chair; how deliverables are to be created; and operational details of the Council.

The Council and staff discussed the proposed Council Charter; how additional questions to the group are to be proposed for deliberations; how to handle public comments on non-agenda and agenda items; document preparation and review Health and Safety Code requirements for appointments and reappointments.

Member Doduc made a motion, seconded by Member Kleinman, to adopt the proposed Charter of the Council; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Doduc, Hayes, Harley, Kleinman, Lipman and Long.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Borenstein.



## **7. Air District Overview**

Mr. McKay welcomed the Council by providing an overview of the Air District, including categories of pollutants; organization; emission trends; national and state standards; attainment status; risk from toxic air contaminants; impacted communities; regional modeling of toxic air contaminants; and climate change.

Mr. Bunger welcomed the Council by providing a legal overview of the District including air quality problems; regulatory framework; District authority; criteria pollutant control planning and regulations; District regulations; criteria pollutant control permits; air toxics control; and greenhouse gases (GHGs).

The Council and staff discussed GHGs; Assembly Bill 32; Board considerations; drafting policies to achieve District goals; and caps on pollutants.

## **8. Presentation and Discussion on First Key Question**

Mr. Broadbent presented the first key question to the Council: What is the efficacy of imposing numeric caps on GHGs from Bay Area refineries?

The Council recessed at 11:10 a.m. and resumed at 11:16 a.m.

Mr. McKay introduced Jim Karas, Director of Engineering, who gave the staff presentation *Overview of Petroleum Refining*, including an agenda; refinery overview; crude unit; light gases; light and heavy naphtha; kerosene; diesel; gas oil; residue; U.S. crude oil production; California crude oil supply sources; Bay Area refinery locations; crude oil processing capacity; major Bay Area refinery products; refinery emissions sources; current refinery projects; refinery information resources; trends in crude oil quality; crude oil supply sources; west coast refinery crude oil compared to the rest of the nation; and California refinery output by product types.

Mr. McKay introduced Henry Hilken, Director of Planning and Climate Protection, who gave the staff presentation *Air District Climate Protection Program*, including program goals and focus; climate protection initiatives; local government support; outcomes and results; collaboration efforts with Air Resources Board (ARB) and other air districts; ARB's cap-and-trade program; Bay Area GHG emissions; consumption-based GHGs and emissions inventory; Bay Area GHG forecasts; Bay Area refinery emissions trends; Climate Protection Resolution; 10-Point Climate Action Work Program; climate staffing and resources; regional climate protection strategy; climate rulemaking; and the pathway to 2050.

### Council comments:

The Council and staff discussed the low carbon fuel standard; regional regulatory environment; fossil fuel sources; target goals; market changes; performance measures; qualitative measures on climate protection plans; fugitive rules; cost of compliance; socioeconomic reports for new regulations; GHG measurement and concerns in South Coast Air Basin; emissions caps interfering with cap and trade rules; methane leaks; varied fuel sources; electrification as a long-term approach; interim goals on reducing emissions; technical solutions for reducing GHGs; storing carbon in the ground; looking beyond GHG emissions and seeking a multi-pollutant

approach for toxics and GHGs; considering full lifecycle analysis of oil and related emissions; seeking reasonable and feasible solutions to emissions concerns; requests for technical expertise from refinery experts; the refinery emissions strategy; and evaluation of proposals from community groups. The Council expressed interest in further information from ARB on Cap and Trade.

**9. Time and Place of Next Meeting:** At the call of the Chairperson.

**10. Adjournment:** The meeting adjourned at 1:06 p.m.

Tom Flannigan  
Acting Clerk of the Boards