

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Monday, December 11, 2017

*An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>*

### **1. CALL TO ORDER**

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 10:12 a.m.

#### **Roll Call:**

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman and Dr. Jane Long.  
Absent: Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Member Dr. Severin Borenstein.  
Also Present: Cupertino Councilman Rod Sinks, Board of Directors (Board) Liaison.

**Opening Remarks:** Chair Hayes explained that the Advisory Council is statutorily obligated to meet at a minimum of four times per year.

### **2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 6, 2017 AND APRIL 3, 2017 MEETINGS**

#### Council Comments:

None.

#### Council Action:

None, due to a lack of quorum.

### **3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public comments were made by Bob Brown of the Western States Petroleum Association.

### **4. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER (APCO) (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 7)**

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO reported that the District's Board of Directors adopted the District's 2017 Clean Air Plan in April of 2017 and Regulation 11, Rule 18: Reduction of Risk from Air Toxic Emissions at Existing Facilities in November 2017; discussed the progression of the development of Regulation 12, Rule 16 (numeric cap on greenhouse gas emissions at refineries) and how the Air District suspended further action on this rule due to the passing of Assembly Bill (AB) 398 in July of 2017; and announced that Ex-Officio Advisory Council member/Board Liaison, Rod Sinks, was appointed as incoming Board Secretary and that the Board retreat will take place on January 17, 2018 in San Ramon. Mr. Broadbent also reminded the Council that Council members'

two-year terms are ending, and that the resignations of Tam Doduc and Dr. Robert Harley have created vacancies that need to be filled.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed a desire for a presentation on AB 617; the recommendation that the members of Council and Board's Executive Committee meet early next year in a joint meeting; the recommendation that the Council report out to the Executive Committee on a regular (perhaps quarterly) basis; and the District's intention to open a public recruitment for Council vacancies, knowing that members of the regulated and environmental justice communities have expressed interest in applying.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

**5. UPDATE ON ADOPTED REGULATION 11: HAZARDOUS POLLUTANTS, RULE 18: REDUCTION OF RISK FROM AIR TOXIC EMISSIONS AT EXISTING FACILITIES (ITEM 4)**

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, announced that Greg Nudd, former Acting Rules and Strategic Policy Officer, was promoted to Policy Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer. Mr. Nudd gave the staff presentation *Regulation 11, Rule 18: Reduction of Risk from Air Toxic Emissions at Existing Facilities*, including: overview; background; what are Toxic Air Contaminants (TAC); example TACs and health impacts; exposure and toxicity determine health impacts; how do we measure impacts; Bay Area lifetime cancer risk from TAC exposure; overall air pollution down, but high risks in some communities remain; regulatory authority; TAC impact mitigation programs; Rule 11-18 key policy components; risk action thresholds; rule requirements; potential risk reduction measures; implementation overview and facility risk reduction; health protective standards; case studies (Richmond Community Air Risk Evaluation Area, oil refinery, and cement kiln) showing 25 in a million versus 10 in a million; flexible methods of compliance; comparing health impacts of air pollutants; and next steps.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed toxic exposure from home heating; the types of facilities that would be impacted at a risk action threshold of 10 in a million; the fact that mobile sources are a major component of air pollution in certain high-risk communities, and the District's role relative to mobile sources under new and upcoming legislation; and how much of cancer risk is attributed to TAC versus PM<sub>2.5</sub>.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

**6. UPDATE FROM THE OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT (OEHHA) ON STUDIES OF SHORT-TERM PARTICULATE MATTER (PM)<sub>2.5</sub> EXPOSURE (ITEM 5)**

Dr. McKay introduced John Faust, OEHHA Air, Community, and Environmental Research Branch Chief, who introduced Dr. Rupa Basu, OEHHA Air and Climate Epidemiology Section Chief, who

gave the presentation *A Summary of Short-Term PM<sub>2.5</sub> and Adverse Health Outcome Studies in California*, including: outline; common methodology; percent change in PM<sub>2.5</sub> and respiratory or cardiovascular mortality in California; short-term PM<sub>2.5</sub> exposure and respiratory hospital/Emergency Room (ER) visits in California; short-term PM<sub>2.5</sub> constituent exposure and cardiovascular mortality in California; short term PM<sub>2.5</sub> constituent exposure and respiratory ER visits; national studies including results from California; meta-analysis; summary; and acknowledgments.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed OEHHA's definition of an "exposure lag day"; the importance of looking at vulnerable subgroups; how the data from the cited studies is all based on place of residence, versus place of work; if and how the health effects of criteria pollutants and TACs can be compared; the importance of identifying source attribution at the point of emission; and adsorbates on elemental carbon as a significant part of health effects.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

**7. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT (ITEM 6)**

Chair Hayes reiterated his belief that there is much value in increasing opportunities for the Council to interact with the Board of Directors.

**8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

No requests received.

**9. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

**10. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the call of the Chair.

**11. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:46 a.m.

*/s/ Marcy Hiratzka*  
Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards