



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING

MONDAY
MARCH 26, 2018
12:00 P.M.

1ST FLOOR BOARD ROOM
375 BEALE STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

AGENDA

1. **CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL – PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council members. The Council Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 11, 2017**

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Advisory Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting of December 11, 2017.

3. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS**

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, the public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Council meetings are posted at the Air District, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at least 72 hours before a meeting.

This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit <http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports> at the time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain error and omissions, and are not certified for their content or form.

4. **PARTICULATE MATTER IN THE BAY AREA**

J. McKay/4629
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will discuss particulate matter in the Bay Area.

5. **ADVISORY COUNCIL NEXT AREA OF FOCUS: CONTINUATION OF DISCUSSIONS OF PARTICULATE MATTER**

J. McKay/4629
jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will continue their discussions regarding particulate matter.

6. **CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT**

The Chairperson will provide the Advisory Council with a report of recent and upcoming activities.

7. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO**

8. **PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, an opportunity is provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's purview. Speakers are typically limited to three minutes each.

9. **COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

10. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the call of the Chair.

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT:

ACTING MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105
vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the “Advisory Council” and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Council meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Council at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District’s policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District’s Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at rsanders@baaqmd.gov.

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105
FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS**

MARCH 2018

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Legislative Committee <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Thursday	22	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee & Advisory Council Joint Mtg. <i>(EC Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month) and (AC Meets At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Monday	26	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Advisory Council Mtg. <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Monday	26	12:00 p.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	28	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109

APRIL 2018

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Public Engagement Committee <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Monday	2	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	4	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Ad Hoc Refinery Oversight Committee <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Monday	9	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	16	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Mtg. <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	18	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	25	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	26	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

MAY 2018

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
Board of Directors Regular Meeting <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	2	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Personnel Committee <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	Monday	7	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Mtg. <i>(Meets on the 1st & 3rd Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	16	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Thursday of every other Month)</i>	Thursday	17	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Executive Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of each Month)</i>	Monday	21	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 3rd Monday of every other Month)</i>	Monday	21	10:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	23	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee <i>(Meets on the 4th Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	24	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
MV – 3/21/18 – 3:58 p.m.				G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 15, 2018

Re: Approval of the Minutes of December 11, 2017

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of December 11, 2017.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of December 11, 2017.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka
Reviewed by: Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of December 11, 2017

AGENDA: 2A – ATTACHMENT

Draft Minutes – Advisory Council Regular Meeting of December 11, 2017

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Monday, December 11, 2017

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 10:12 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; and Members Dr. Tim Lipman and Dr. Jane Long.
Absent: Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Member Dr. Severin Borenstein.
Also Present: Cupertino Councilman Rod Sinks, Board of Directors (Board) Liaison.

Opening Remarks: Chair Hayes explained that the Advisory Council is statutorily obligated to meet at a minimum of four times per year.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 6, 2017 AND APRIL 3, 2017 MEETINGS

Council Comments:

None.

Council Action:

None, due to a lack of quorum.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were made by Bob Brown of the Western States Petroleum Association.

4. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER (APCO) (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 7)

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO reported that the District's Board of Directors adopted the District's 2017 Clean Air Plan in April of 2017 and Regulation 11, Rule 18: Reduction of Risk from Air Toxic Emissions at Existing Facilities in November 2017; discussed the progression of the development of Regulation 12, Rule 16 (numeric cap on greenhouse gas emissions at refineries) and how the Air District suspended further action on this rule due to the passing of Assembly Bill (AB) 398 in July of 2017; and announced that Ex-Officio Advisory Council member/Board Liaison, Rod

Sinks, was appointed as incoming Board Secretary and that the Board retreat will take place on January 17, 2018 in San Ramon. Mr. Broadbent also reminded the Council that Council members' two-year terms are ending, and that the resignations of Tam Doduc and Dr. Robert Harley have created vacancies that need to be filled.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed a desire for a presentation on AB 617; the recommendation that the members of Council and Board's Executive Committee meet early next year in a joint meeting; the recommendation that the Council report out to the Executive Committee on a regular (perhaps quarterly) basis; and the District's intention to open a public recruitment for Council vacancies, knowing that members of the regulated and environmental justice communities have expressed interest in applying.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

5. UPDATE ON ADOPTED REGULATION 11: HAZARDOUS POLLUTANTS, RULE 18: REDUCTION OF RISK FROM AIR TOXIC EMISSIONS AT EXISTING FACILITIES (ITEM 4)

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, announced that Greg Nudd, former Acting Rules and Strategic Policy Officer, was promoted to Policy Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer. Mr. Nudd gave the staff presentation *Regulation 11, Rule 18: Reduction of Risk from Air Toxic Emissions at Existing Facilities*, including: overview; background; what are Toxic Air Contaminants (TAC); example TACs and health impacts; exposure and toxicity determine health impacts; how do we measure impacts; Bay Area lifetime cancer risk from TAC exposure; overall air pollution down, but high risks in some communities remain; regulatory authority; TAC impact mitigation programs; Rule 11-18 key policy components; risk action thresholds; rule requirements; potential risk reduction measures; implementation overview and facility risk reduction; health protective standards; case studies (Richmond Community Air Risk Evaluation Area, oil refinery, and cement kiln) showing 25 in a million versus 10 in a million; flexible methods of compliance; comparing health impacts of air pollutants; and next steps.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed toxic exposure from home heating; the types of facilities that would be impacted at a risk action threshold of 10 in a million; the fact that mobile sources are a major component of air pollution in certain high-risk communities, and the District's role relative to mobile sources under new and upcoming legislation; and how much of cancer risk is attributed to TAC versus PM_{2.5}.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

6. UPDATE FROM THE OFFICE OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT (OEHHA) ON STUDIES OF SHORT-TERM PARTICULATE MATTER (PM)_{2.5} EXPOSURE (ITEM 5)

Dr. McKay introduced John Faust, OEHHA Air, Community, and Environmental Research Branch Chief, who introduced Dr. Rupa Basu, OEHHA Air and Climate Epidemiology Section Chief, who gave the presentation *A Summary of Short-Term PM_{2.5} and Adverse Health Outcome Studies in California*, including: outline; common methodology; percent change in PM_{2.5} and respiratory or cardiovascular mortality in California; short-term PM_{2.5} exposure and respiratory hospital/Emergency Room (ER) visits in California; short-term PM_{2.5} constituent exposure and cardiovascular mortality in California; short term PM_{2.5} constituent exposure and respiratory ER visits; national studies including results from California; meta-analysis; summary; and acknowledgments.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed OEHHA’s definition of an “exposure lag day”; the importance of looking at vulnerable subgroups; how the data from the cited studies is all based on place of residence, versus place of work; if and how the health effects of criteria pollutants and TACs can be compared; the importance of identifying source attribution at the point of emission; and adsorbates on elemental carbon as a significant part of health effects.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

7. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT (ITEM 6)

Chair Hayes reiterated his belief that there is much value in increasing opportunities for the Council to interact with the Board of Directors.

8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

No requests received.

9. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

None.

10. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the call of the Chair.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 11:46 a.m.

Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 15, 2018

Re: Particulate Matter in the Bay Area

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Particulate Matter (PM) may be the pollutant with the largest air quality impact on public health in disadvantaged communities.

DISCUSSION

The Air District continually seeks to enhance its information on pollution sources. PM has both mobile and stationary sources. Staff will describe current understanding of PM in the Bay Area, and will also describe ongoing work to refine those attributions.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Jeff McKay

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members
of the Advisory Council

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 15, 2018

Re: Advisory Council Next Area of Focus: Continuation of Discussions of Particulate
Matter

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

Previous discussions with the Advisory Council have suggested a focus on the highest levels of pollution-related health impacts in targeted, high-risk communities. Important work remains to further characterize the nature and source of the impacts and to prioritize actions. However, Particulate Matter (PM) is clearly a primary, if not the primary, driver for health impacts in many of these communities

DISCUSSION

The cumulative effect of multiple pollutants is of importance, and any single location may have multiple sources of PM impact. As has been previously discussed, particulate matter exists in a wide variety of forms, may serve as a carrier for other compounds, and may evolve rapidly after emission. Therefore, particulate matter is an appropriate first topic for review of the Air District's prioritization of actions to reduce public health effects from air pollution.

However, PM provides not only a need for complex analysis of speciation and source, but also an opportunity for immediate action on the largest source affecting disadvantaged communities. That source is diesel transport.

Air District staff will discuss an initial focus on aggressively curbing diesel transport emissions in Bay Area Communities, and will seek concurrence on a process to evaluate and possibly implement a variety of strategies, including strategies that use incentives and other non-regulatory methods.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Jeff McKay