

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

ADVISORY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING

MONDAY OCTOBER 29, 2018 10:00 A.M.

1ST FLOOR BOARD ROOM 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105

AGENDA

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Council Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Council members. The Council Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

Staff/Phone (415) 749-

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 19, 2018

Clerk of the Boards/5073

The Advisory Council will consider approving the draft minutes of the Advisory Council Regular Meeting of July 19, 2018.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, the public has the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for Council meetings are posted at the Air District, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at least 72 hours before a meeting.

This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit <u>www.baaqmd.gov/ADVagendas</u> at the time of the meeting. Closed captioning may contain error and omissions, and are not certified for their content or form.

4. UPDATE ON AIR DISTRICT IMPLEMENTATION OF ASSEMBLY BILL 617 (AB 617) J. McKay/4629 jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will receive an update on the Air District's ongoing work to implement AB 617.

5. AIR SENSOR INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE UPDATE

J. Broadbent/5052 jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

The Council will receive an update on the Air Sensors International Conference.

6. STRATEGIC TARGETS FOR ASSEMBLY BILL 617 (AB 617) IMPLEMENTATION J. McKay/4629 jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will continue discussion of appropriate air quality targets with a specific focus on AB 617 implementation.

7. DISCUSSION ON ELECTION OF OFFICERS

J. McKay/4629 jmckay@baaqmd.gov

The Council will discuss and consider the election of Council Chair and Vice Chair.

8. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

The Chairperson will provide the Advisory Council with a report of recent and upcoming activities.

9. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/APCO**

10. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Pursuant to Government Code Section 54954.3, an opportunity is provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Council's purview. Speakers are typically limited to three minutes each.

11. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Council members may make a brief announcement, provide a reference to staff about factual information or ask questions about subsequent meetings.

12. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the Call of the Chair.

13. ADJOURNMENT

The Council meeting shall be adjourned by the Chair.

CONTACT: MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105 vjohnson@baaqmd.gov

(415) 749-4941 FAX: (415) 928-8560 BAAQMD homepage: www.baaqmd.gov

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the "Advisory Council" and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Council meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Council at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District's offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District's policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at <u>www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility</u> to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District's Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at <u>rsanders@baaqmd.gov</u>.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-4941

EXECUTIVE OFFICE: MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS

OCTOBER 2018

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets on the 4 th Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	24	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 th Thursday of each Month)	Thursday	25	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Advisory Council Mtg. (At the Call of the Chair)	Monday	29	10:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
	NOVEM	<u>(BER 2(</u>	<u>)18</u>	
TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Executive Committee (At the Call of the Chair)	Friday	2	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Nominating Committee (At the Call of the Chair)	Wednesday	7	9:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	7	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Thursday of every other Month) - CANCELLED	Thursday	15	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee (Meets on the 3 rd Monday of every other Month) - CANCELLED	Monday	19	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Nominating Committee (At the Call of the Chair) – CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 7, 2018	Monday	19	9:00 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Special Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Monday	19	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	21	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 th Thursday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Thursday	22	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance	Wednesday	28	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109

Committee (Meets on the 4th Wednesday of each Month)

DECEMBER 2018

TYPE OF MEETING	DAY	DATE	TIME	ROOM
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	5	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 th Thursday of each Month)	Monday	17	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Regular Meeting (Meets on the 1 st & 3 rd Wednesday of each Month)	Wednesday	19	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room
Board of Directors Budget & Finance Committee (Meets on the 4 th Wednesday of each Month) - CANCELLED	Wednesday	26	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee (Meets on the 4 th Thursday of each Month) - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO MONDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2018 AT 9:30 A.M.	Thursday	27	9:30 a.m.	1 st Floor Board Room

HL - 10/22/18 - 2:55 p.m.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

AGENDA: 2

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT Memorandum

- To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members of the Advisory Council
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO
- Date: October 18, 2018

Re: <u>Approval of the Minutes of July 19, 2018</u>

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of July 19, 2018.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Advisory Council meeting of July 19, 2018.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by:Marcy HiratzkaReviewed by:Vanessa Johnson

Attachment 2A: Draft Minutes of the Advisory Council Meeting of July 19, 2018

Draft Minutes - Advisory Council Regular Meeting of July 19, 2018

Bay Area Air Quality Management District 375 Beale Street, Suite 600 San Francisco, CA 94105 (415) 749-5073

DRAFT MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting Thursday, July 19, 2018

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at <u>http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports</u>

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 10:08 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present:	Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and
	Members Dr. Jane Long, Dr. Linda Rudolph, and Dr. Gina Solomon.
Absent:	Members Prof. Severin Borenstein and Dr. Tim Lipman.
Also Present:	Ex-Officio Advisory Council Member, Rod Sinks, Board of Directors
	(Board) Liaison.

Opening Remarks: Chair Hayes acknowledged the Board for reappointing the five incumbent members to the Council on June 6, 2018, and welcomed new Council members, Dr. Linda Rudolph, and Dr. Gina Solomon, who were appointed on the same day. Ex-Officio Advisory Council Member, Rod Sinks, expressed his opinion that the Board will be interested in the new Advisory Council's discussions regarding methane and diesel emissions.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 30, 2017 AND MARCH 26, 2018

Council Comments:

None.

Council Action:

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Member Long, to approve the Minutes of October 30, 2017 and March 26, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES:	Hayes, Kleinman, and Long.
NOES:	None.
ABSTAIN:	Rudolph and Solomon.
ABSENT:	Borenstein and Lipman.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Janet Stromberg, Richard Gray, and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and Charles Davidson, Sunflower Alliance.

4. INTRODUCTION OF NEW MEMBERS TO THE AIR DISTRICT'S (DISTRICT'S) ADVISORY COUNCIL

Dr. Jeffrey McKay, Chief Financial Officer, gave the staff presentation *Advisory Council New Members*, during which, Dr. Rudolph and Dr. Solomon introduced themselves.

Council Comments:

None.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

5. UPDATE ON ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 617

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, gave the staff presentation *Update* on Assembly Bill 617: Improving Neighborhood Air Quality, including: program goals and components; community selection; criteria for selecting all AB 617 areas; all areas recommended; criteria to prioritize communities for action; community priorities; community recommendations; West Oakland; action plan components; Richmond; monitoring plans; emissions inventory; updated pollution control standards and technology; and what's next.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed how staff plans to address capacity building in prioritized communities, and funding sources of community engagement; strategies for increased monitoring, the need for clear monitoring objectives and apportionment of exposure to individual sources; the anticipated timeline for monitoring plans and emission reductions of West Oakland and Richmond; modeling analyses of communities whose emissions have yet to be monitored, what monitoring plans entail, and the type of source identification that staff is conducting; the need for uniformity among stationary source emissions reporting for AB 617 facilities; whether there are common sources that would best be controlled through a District regulation that applies to every similar source across the District, versus sub-regionally- tailored regulations; and the Council's request for more details on District Particulate Matter (PM) regulations that are currently under development.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

6. HEALTH IMPACTS AND ASSESSMENTS OF DIESEL PARTICULATE MATTER (DPM) IN THE BAY AREA

Dr. Judy Cutino and Virginia Lau, Advanced Projects Advisor, gave the staff presentation *Diesel Particulate Matter Health Impacts and Impacted Areas*, including: overview; Diesel PM and health effects; studies of PM; Diesel PM identified as a carcinogen; who is affected; impacted areas; Diesel PM contributes to PM_{2.5} and black carbon; Diesel PM is a regional pollutant; Diesel PM from mobile sources is a primary risk driver; regional and localized impacts; Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) program; overall air pollution down, but higher risks in some communities; vulnerable populations; sources of fine particles in SF; West Oakland studies; West Oakland Google car monitoring study; and key findings.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the District's utilization of data from all of its monitors, versus from just one or a few monitors, when estimating lifetime cancer risk; studies regarding how PM exposure affects cognitive development, major organs, and reproductive systems; contributors to West Oakland cancer risk by diesel sources; and the South Coast Air Quality Management District's Pilot Study of High Performance Air Filtration for Classrooms Applications, and whether this Bay Area is going to conduct a similar study.

The Council recessed at 12:05 p.m., and resumed at 12:44 p.m.

7. UPDATE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S DIESEL PARTICULATE MATTER EMISSIONS REDUCTION STRATEGY

Damian Breen, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Technology, gave the staff presentation *Update on Air District's Diesel Particulate Emissions Reduction Strategy*, including: Diesel PM Reduction Strategy; why Diesel PM; new California Air Resources Board (CARB) freight rules; Diesel PM Strategy - compliance and enforcement, regulation and permitting, monitoring, planning and California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), AB 617 Community Air Protection Program, grants, and voluntary emissions reductions; technology assessment – trends for batteries; commitments on Diesel PM to reduce petroleum/diesel; and request for input and support.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the anticipated longevity of incoming grants that will fund the District's Diesel PM Emissions Reduction Strategy; reparation allocation from the 2015 Volkswagen emissions scandal; the District's 'Diesel Free by '33' initiative, its dual purpose of removing Diesel PM as a global warming precursor and toxic risk, the District's correspondence with Governor Brown's office in anticipation of the Global Climate Action Summit, and the District's affiliate event in conjunction with the Summit; the lifecycles of various motorized vehicles and equipment; opinions from the Council members as to what should be included in the Council's input to the Board in support of voluntary diesel emissions reductions efforts; and

the concern that the District's focus on mobile sources, which are not within the District's regulatory authority, would eclipse the District's regulation of stationary sources, and/or encroach upon CARB's authority over mobile sources.

Council Action:

Dr. Long made a motion, seconded by Dr. Solomon, to authorize Chair Hayes to draft language for a statement to be presented to the Board of Directors, reflecting the Council's position on the reduction of voluntary diesel emissions; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES:	Hayes, Kleinman, Long, Rudolph, and Solomon.
NOES:	None.
ABSTAIN:	None.
ABSENT:	Borenstein and Lipman

8. ONGOING DISCUSSION OF DIESEL PARTICULATE MATTER: HOW LOW IS "LOW ENOUGH"?

In the interest of saving time, Dr. McKay requested that this item be tabled. At the Council's consensus, this item was tabled.

9. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chair Hayes announced that he enjoyed the joint meeting of the Council and Board's Executive Committee in March of this year; he will be reporting to the Board on August 1, 2018 regarding the discussions from this meeting; and said that he would postpone his report out of the annual Air and Waste Management Association's Conference that occurred in June 2018.

10. **REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER**

Mr. Broadbent welcomed Drs. Solomon and Rudolph to the Council, on behalf of District staff, and remarked that staff is currently engaged in implementing AB 617 requirements, anticipating the beginning of wildfire season and the assisting of first responders, and developing multiple PM rules for future consideration. Mr. Broadbent also addressed the Council's questions regarding the Council's participation at the District's affiliate event of the Governor's Global Climate Action Summit.

11. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area; and Wileen Ellen Sweet, West Marin Standing Together.

12. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

Dr. Solomon thanked the Board for appointing her to the Council and asked which issues have come before the Council in the past. She also said she was interested issues such as Draft Regulation 6, Rule 5: Particulate Emissions from Refinery Fluidized Catalytic Cracking Units,

emissions trading, and CARB's Airborne Toxic Control Measure for Chrome Plating and Chromic Acid Anodizing Operations.

13. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the call of the Chair.

14. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 2:09 p.m.

Marcy Hiratzka Clerk of the Boards

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT Memorandum

- To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members of the Advisory Council
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Date: October 18, 2018

Re: Update on Air District Implementation of Assembly Bill 617 (AB 617)

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

On September 27, 2018, the California Air Resources Board (CARB) approved the Bay Area Air Management District's (Air District) recommended communities for development of a community monitoring plan and a community emission reduction plan for the state's Community Air Protection Program. The Community Air Protection Program was established by the state to implement Assembly Bill 617 (AB 617).

West Oakland was approved for an emission reduction plan and the Richmond area was selected for a monitoring plan in year one of the state's program. The West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project (WOEIP) will be our co-lead in the West Oakland effort. WOEIP has a long history of community planning and advocacy to reduce residents' exposure to diesel particulate matter and toxic air contaminants. In Richmond, we have an opportunity to leverage many historic and current monitoring studies. There are a complex mix of emission sources in the Richmond area. Our primary goal of the Richmond monitoring effort will be to better characterize the area's mix of sources and to more fully understand the associated air quality and pollution impacts before initiating an emissions reduction plan for that community.

The Air District included in its recommendations to CARB a list of communities for years 2-5 of the state's program. These communities included East Oakland/San Leandro, Eastern San Francisco, the Pittsburg-Bay Point area, San Jose, the Tri-Valley area, and Vallejo. Like Richmond and West Oakland, current data shows that these communities have higher levels of environmental exposures and more significant health burdens compared to the rest of the Bay Area. These health burdens increase vulnerability to environmental exposures. The recommended list of high priority communities for monitoring and/or emission reduction plans will be revisited and re-submitted to CARB every year. The CARB board makes the final decision about which communities will be selected for community plans for that year.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared By: <u>Christianne Riviere</u> Reviewed By: <u>Greg Nudd and Jeff McKay</u>

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT Memorandum

- To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members of the Advisory Council
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO
- Date: October 18, 2018

Re: <u>Air Sensor International Conference Update</u>

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

The Air District sponsored the Air Sensor International Conference hosted by the University of California at Davis that occurred on September 12, 2018 to September 14, 2018 in Oakland, CA.

DISCUSSION

This conference gathered sensor and air quality experts from government, academia, industry advocacy groups and the general public where presentations and discussions ranged from the potential uses and further development of sensors to aid in the identification and quantification of air quality impacts, exposure and health, citizen science and data sharing and communication.

Staff will present a summary of this event, attendance, and outcomes.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by:Eric StevensonReviewed by:Wayne Kino and Jeff McKay

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT Memorandum

- To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members of the Advisory Council
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Date: October 18, 2018

Re: <u>Strategic Targets for Assembly Bill 617 (AB 617) Implementation</u>

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

BACKGROUND

As the Air District proceeds with initial implementation of AB 617, it is apparent that longer range planning for strategic targets is appropriate. The mandate associated with the legislation is broad and doesn't provide much guidance on "end points" in addressing air pollution or appropriate levels that constitute healthy air for communities. In addition, recent science indicates that Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) standards for fine particulate matter are not sufficiently health protective. This leaves the Air District with a need to set strategic targets for its programs with limited state or federal guidance.

DISCUSSION

While the Air District expects to have tactical, readily verifiable goals for its initial plans, long term goals for AB 617 implementation are needed. Therefore, the Air District seeks advisory input on strategic, longer term targets for implementation.

At the most fundamental level, the Air District should have targets for "local attainment" in local communities. This requires dealing with the difficult questions of "what is clean enough" and "what is equity in air quality?"

To answer these questions, other questions arise such as "what measurements of air quality are to be used," "how pollutants are apportioned to sources," and "what tools are to be used to improve air quality and health outcomes?" Community groups have expressed an interest in using health outcomes and health-related metrics to measure the success of the AB 617 program. However, attributing changes in health outcomes to specific interventions and mitigations poses challenges. The Air District seeks advisory input on exploring such challenges.

Staff will discuss current and anticipated monitoring and modeling methods. Staff will also provide a description of ongoing work to develop source by source apportionment in local communities.

Discussion will include consideration of tracking health outcomes and health metrics. Staff will discuss the timing of the ongoing AB 617 implementation work and when such goals are needed.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared By: <u>Phil Martien and Judith Cutino</u> Reviewed By: <u>Greg Nudd and Jeff McKay</u>

AGENDA: 7

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT Memorandum

- To: Chairperson Stan Hayes and Members of the Advisory Council
- From: Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO
- Date: October 18, 2018

Re: Discussion on Election of Officers

RECOMMENDED ACTION

None; receive and file.

DISCUSSION

Per Health and Safety Code Section 40267, the council shall select a chairman and vice chairman and such other officers as it deems necessary.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: <u>Justine Buenaflor</u> Reviewed by: <u>Jeff McKay</u>