

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Monday, March 26, 2018

*An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at*  
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

### **1. CALL TO ORDER**

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 12:17 p.m.

#### **Roll Call:**

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Prof. Severin Borenstein, Dr. Tim Lipman, and Dr. Jane Long.

Absent: None.

Also Present: Ex-Officio Advisory Council Member, Rod Sinks, Board of Directors (Board) Liaison.

**Opening Remarks:** Chair Hayes remarked that the Board of Directors' Executive Committee held a joint meeting that morning with the members of the Advisory Council, and that he hopes that this is the beginning of many more joint meetings and opportunities for the Board and Council members to interact. Ex-Officio member Sinks stated that he was grateful for a chance to improve connections between the Board and Council members, and that he believes that the Council's voice will become more effective in time.

NOTED PRESENT: Member Lipman was noted present at 12:19 p.m.

### **2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF DECEMBER 11, 2017**

#### Council Comments:

None.

#### Council Action:

Member Lipman made a motion, seconded by Member Long, to approve the Minutes of December 11, 2017; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Borenstein, Hayes, Kleinman, Lipman, Long.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

### 3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments on Item 4 were given by Charles Davidson, Sunflower Alliance.

### 4. PARTICULATE MATTER IN THE BAY AREA

Dr. Phil Martien, Engineering Manager, gave the staff presentation *Particulate Matter in the Bay Area*; including: overview; Particulate Matter (PM)<sub>2.5</sub> annual design value attains national standard since 2003; PM<sub>2.5</sub> 24-hour design value attains national standard since 2009; modeled primary and secondary PM<sub>2.5</sub> - about 1/3 of PM<sub>2.5</sub> is secondary; receptor modeling: chemical mass balance; PM<sub>2.5</sub> source apportionment: Bay Area and Central Valley; Bay Area source apportionment shifts during PM<sub>2.5</sub>-high periods; for community-scale source apportionment: intake fraction (IF); IF determinants and typical values; Ports of Los Angeles/Long Beach modeled exposures; modeled PM<sub>2.5</sub> contribution from multiple sources in San Francisco; West Oakland Google car monitoring study; West Oakland 100 x 100 black carbon study; PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions apportionment: on-road vehicles; apportionment to action: DPM reductions; greater health benefits, per PM<sub>2.5</sub> increment, below the U.S. National Ambient Air Quality Standards; methods needed for PM health risk assessment; and summary.

#### Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed whether the 2017 wildfire activity in the Bay Area would be considered “exceptional” events, and if the Bay Area remains in attainment despite such events; the importance, but difficulty, of distinguishing wood smoke and secondary organic compounds as sources of PM<sub>2.5</sub>; the importance of factoring in a vehicle’s age and the proportions of gas passenger cars to diesel trucks when analyzing emissions apportionment in on-road vehicles, and the need for comparative electric vehicle (EV) data; how vehicle tire wear and road are a leading cause of particle emissions; regenerative breaks; the suggestion of frequently washing down streets and roads to reduce dust; contributing factors to the decrease in overall PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions from on-road vehicles between 2008 and 2015 in California; and attributable cardiopulmonary deaths relative to ambient PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration.

#### Council Action:

None; receive and file.

### 5. ADVISORY COUNCIL NEXT AREA OF FOCUS; CONTINUATION OF DISCUSSIONS OF PARTICULATE MATTER

Dr. McKay introduced Damien Breen, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Technology, who gave the staff presentation *Advisory Council Next Area of Focus: Continuation of Discussions of Particulate Matter*, including: PM; proposed approach: initial focus on diesel PM (DPM); sources and impacts of DPM; current efforts to reduce DPM; Case study- Port of Oakland 2008-2017; trends in light and heavy-duty vehicle deployment - “cost-effectiveness schedule” for batteries, and Air District investment in Zero Emissions Technology; trends in stationary and off-road sources; commitments on DPM to reduce petroleum/diesel; and proposed strategy – DPM and PM.

Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the increased health risk per unit of exposure to DPM; a request for information on how other countries that ban diesel vehicles or strive for zero emissions manage/retire older vehicles; the levels of DPM exposure to passengers inside vehicles; the importance of monitoring acute (versus chronic) effects of DPM, and types of acute activities that can be accurately measured; and whether diesel particulates are a large proportion of PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions in the Bay Area, how other sources of PM<sub>2.5</sub> compare, and how those levels vary from place to place in the Bay Area.

Council Action:

None; receive and file.

**6. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT**

Chair Hayes announced the following:

- Council members have until March 30, 2018 to register (with Vanessa Johnson) for the Air and Waste Management Association's 111<sup>th</sup> Annual Conference in June, in Hartford.
- The District is still recruiting for the two vacant Council member seats, and Council members are encouraged to circulate the open recruitment. Dr. Kleinman suggested that the District contact the University of California's Office of the President, as that office maintains a list of skillsets for UC faculty. Dr. Long also suggested utilizing the list maintained by the California Council on Science and Technology.

**7. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER**

On behalf of Mr. Broadbent, Dr. McKay announced that the Council will be updated by District staff regarding Governor Brown's Global Climate Action Summit that is to be held in San Francisco from September 12-14, 2018. Dr. McKay also announced that a Personnel Committee meeting is scheduled for May 7, 2018 to interview and consider candidates to fill the two vacancies on the Council.

**8. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public comments were given by Charles Davidson, Sunflower Alliance.

**9. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Chair Hayes suggested that the Council meets twice by the end of August, so that the Council can offer its comments on the topics that will be discussed at the Global Climate Action Summit.

**10. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the call of the Chair.

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 2:06 p.m.

*/S/ Marcy Hiratzka*  
Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards