

Bay Area Air Quality Management District  
375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 749-5073

## **APPROVED MINUTES**

Advisory Council Regular Meeting  
Thursday, July 19, 2018

*An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at*  
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

### **1. CALL TO ORDER**

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 10:08 a.m.

#### **Roll Call:**

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Jane Long, Dr. Linda Rudolph, and Dr. Gina Solomon.  
Absent: Members Prof. Severin Borenstein and Dr. Tim Lipman.  
Also Present: Ex-Officio Advisory Council Member, Rod Sinks, Board of Directors (Board) Liaison.

**Opening Remarks:** Chair Hayes acknowledged the Board for reappointing the five incumbent members to the Council on June 6, 2018, and welcomed new Council members, Dr. Linda Rudolph, and Dr. Gina Solomon, who were appointed on the same day. Ex-Officio Advisory Council Member, Rod Sinks, expressed his opinion that the Board will be interested in the new Advisory Council's discussions regarding methane and diesel emissions.

### **2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF OCTOBER 30, 2017 AND MARCH 26, 2018**

#### Council Comments:

None.

#### Council Action:

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Member Long, to approve the Minutes of October 30, 2017 and March 26, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, and Long.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: Rudolph and Solomon.  
ABSENT: Borenstein and Lipman.

### 3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Janet Stromberg, Richard Gray, and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and Charles Davidson, Sunflower Alliance.

### 4. INTRODUCTION OF NEW MEMBERS TO THE AIR DISTRICT'S (DISTRICT'S) ADVISORY COUNCIL

Dr. Jeffrey McKay, Chief Financial Officer, gave the staff presentation *Advisory Council New Members*, during which, Dr. Rudolph and Dr. Solomon introduced themselves.

#### Council Comments:

None.

#### Council Action:

None; receive and file.

### 5. UPDATE ON ASSEMBLY BILL (AB) 617

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, gave the staff presentation *Update on Assembly Bill 617: Improving Neighborhood Air Quality*, including: program goals and components; community selection; criteria for selecting all AB 617 areas; all areas recommended; criteria to prioritize communities for action; community priorities; community recommendations; West Oakland; action plan components; Richmond; monitoring plans; emissions inventory; updated pollution control standards and technology; and what's next.

#### Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed how staff plans to address capacity building in prioritized communities, and funding sources of community engagement; strategies for increased monitoring, the need for clear monitoring objectives and apportionment of exposure to individual sources; the anticipated timeline for monitoring plans and emission reductions of West Oakland and Richmond; modeling analyses of communities whose emissions have yet to be monitored, what monitoring plans entail, and the type of source identification that staff is conducting; the need for uniformity among stationary source emissions reporting for AB 617 facilities; whether there are common sources that would best be controlled through a District regulation that applies to every similar source across the District, versus sub-regionally- tailored regulations; and the Council's request for more details on District Particulate Matter (PM) regulations that are currently under development.

#### Council Action:

None; receive and file.

## 6. HEALTH IMPACTS AND ASSESSMENTS OF DIESEL PARTICULATE MATTER (DPM) IN THE BAY AREA

Dr. Judy Cutino and Virginia Lau, Advanced Projects Advisor, gave the staff presentation *Diesel Particulate Matter Health Impacts and Impacted Areas*, including: overview; Diesel PM and health effects; studies of PM; Diesel PM identified as a carcinogen; who is affected; impacted areas; Diesel PM contributes to PM<sub>2.5</sub> and black carbon; Diesel PM is a regional pollutant; Diesel PM from mobile sources is a primary risk driver; regional and localized impacts; Community Air Risk Evaluation (CARE) program; overall air pollution down, but higher risks in some communities; vulnerable populations; sources of fine particles in SF; West Oakland studies; West Oakland Google car monitoring study; and key findings.

### Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the District's utilization of data from all of its monitors, versus from just one or a few monitors, when estimating lifetime cancer risk; studies regarding how PM exposure affects cognitive development, major organs, and reproductive systems; contributors to West Oakland cancer risk by diesel sources; and the South Coast Air Quality Management District's Pilot Study of High Performance Air Filtration for Classrooms Applications, and whether this Bay Area is going to conduct a similar study.

The Council recessed at 12:05 p.m., and resumed at 12:44 p.m.

## 7. UPDATE ON THE AIR DISTRICT'S DIESEL PARTICULATE MATTER EMISSIONS REDUCTION STRATEGY

Damian Breen, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Technology, gave the staff presentation *Update on Air District's Diesel Particulate Emissions Reduction Strategy*, including: Diesel PM Reduction Strategy; why Diesel PM; new California Air Resources Board (CARB) freight rules; Diesel PM Strategy - compliance and enforcement, regulation and permitting, monitoring, planning and California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), AB 617 Community Air Protection Program, grants, and voluntary emissions reductions; technology assessment – trends for batteries; commitments on Diesel PM to reduce petroleum/diesel; and request for input and support.

### Council Comments:

The Council and staff discussed the anticipated longevity of incoming grants that will fund the District's Diesel PM Emissions Reduction Strategy; reparation allocation from the 2015 Volkswagen emissions scandal; the District's 'Diesel Free by '33' initiative, its dual purpose of removing Diesel PM as a global warming precursor and toxic risk, the District's correspondence with Governor Brown's office in anticipation of the Global Climate Action Summit, and the District's affiliate event in conjunction with the Summit; the lifecycles of various motorized vehicles and equipment; opinions from the Council members as to what should be included in the Council's input to the Board in support of voluntary diesel emissions reductions efforts; and the concern that the District's focus on mobile sources, which are not within the District's regulatory authority, would eclipse the District's regulation of stationary sources, and/or encroach upon CARB's authority over mobile sources.

Council Action:

Dr. Long made a motion, seconded by Dr. Solomon, to authorize Chair Hayes to draft language for a statement to be presented to the Board of Directors, reflecting the Council’s position on the reduction of voluntary diesel emissions; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Long, Rudolph, and Solomon.  
NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Borenstein and Lipman

**8. ONGOING DISCUSSION OF DIESEL PARTICULATE MATTER: HOW LOW IS “LOW ENOUGH”?**

In the interest of saving time, Dr. McKay requested that this item be tabled. At the Council’s consensus, this item was tabled.

**9. CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT**

Chair Hayes announced that he enjoyed the joint meeting of the Council and Board’s Executive Committee in March of this year; he will be reporting to the Board on August 1, 2018 regarding the discussions from this meeting; and said that he would postpone his report out of the annual Air and Waste Management Association’s Conference that occurred in June 2018.

**10. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER**

Mr. Broadbent welcomed Drs. Solomon and Rudolph to the Council, on behalf of District staff, and remarked that staff is currently engaged in implementing AB 617 requirements, anticipating the beginning of wildfire season and the assisting of first responders, and developing multiple PM rules for future consideration. Mr. Broadbent also addressed the Council’s questions regarding the Council’s participation at the District’s affiliate event of the Governor’s Global Climate Action Summit.

**11. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public comments were given by Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area; and Wileen Ellen Sweet, West Marin Standing Together.

**12. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS**

Dr. Solomon thanked the Board for appointing her to the Council and asked which issues have come before the Council in the past. She also said she was interested issues such as Draft Regulation 6, Rule 5: Particulate Emissions from Refinery Fluidized Catalytic Cracking Units, emissions trading, and CARB’s Airborne Toxic Control Measure for Chrome Plating and Chromic Acid Anodizing Operations.

13. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

At the call of the Chair.

14. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 2:09 p.m.

*/s/ Marcy Hiratzka*  
Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards