

Bay Area Air Quality Management District
375 Beale Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 749-5073

APPROVED MINUTES

Advisory Council Regular Meeting
Monday, October 29, 2018

An audio recording of the meeting is available on the website of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District at
<http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/advisory-council/agendasreports>

1. CALL TO ORDER

Advisory Council (Council) Chair, Stan Hayes, called the meeting to order at 10:18 a.m.

Roll Call:

Present: Council Chair Stan Hayes; Vice Chair Dr. Michael Kleinman; and Members Dr. Jane Long, and Dr. Linda Rudolph.

Absent: Members Prof. Severin Borenstein, Dr. Tim Lipman, and Dr. Gina Solomon.

Also Present: Ex-Officio Advisory Council Member, Rod Sinks, Board of Directors (Board) Liaison.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 19, 2018

Council Comments

None.

Council Action

Vice Chair Kleinman made a motion, seconded by Member Long, to approve the Minutes of July 19, 2018; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Council:

AYES: Hayes, Kleinman, Long, and Rudolph.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Borenstein, Lipman, and Solomon.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area; Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area; and Bob Brown, Western States Petroleum Association.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed complaints from the public regarding the Bay Area Air Quality Management District's (Air District) current practice of agendaizing Public Comment on Agenda Items before staff presents said items, as well as the Air District's current practice of consolidating the public's comments regarding multiple agenda items into one opportunity.

4. UPDATE ON AIR DISTRICT IMPLEMENTATION OF ASSEMBLY BILL 617

Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer of Policy, introduced Elizabeth Yura, Community Health Protection Officer, who gave the staff presentation *Assembly Bill (AB) 617: Community Health Protection Program*, including: AB 617 Program components; community identification and prioritization; Richmond Monitoring Plan; West Oakland Action Plan; build capacity; incentives; statewide inventory; control technology; and what's next.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the public's desire to be involved with the development of AB 617 processes created and implemented by the Air District, rather than being asked to merely give input on Air District processes that have been finalized internally, the suggestion that the Air District make a concentrated effort to strengthen its relationship with the public as early as the point of assessing the needs of a community, the suggestion that the Air District establish a streamlined relationship-building approach that can be applied to future communities, and the suggestion that Air District staff maintain an inventory of outcomes resulting from collaborations as a learning tool; how the existence of the coal terminal in Richmond could affect the potential coal terminal planned for Oakland, and the need for these two communities to remain in contact with each other regarding how to abate and prevent health impacts and ensure that the best monitoring practices are being implemented; the timelines for Richmond Monitoring Plan, West Oakland Plan, and Best Available Retrofit Control Technology requirement implementation; defining success metrics; whether the Air District tracks census-tract, health-outcome data across all nine Bay Area counties; and the suggestion that Air District staff explore ways in which to provide opportunities for the Council to engage with the public regarding air pollution and health outcomes, as a way to enhance building capacity.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

5. STRATEGIC TARGETS FOR ASSEMBLY BILL 617 IMPLEMENTATION (OUT OF ORDER, ITEM 6)

Dr. Jeff McKay, Chief Financial Officer, introduced Dr. Phil Martien, Director of Assessment, Inventory, and Modeling, who gave the staff presentation overview; metric/goal options: actions taken, incremental or absolute concentration, concentration, and exposure or health outcomes; air pollution is one of many factors that contribute to health inequities; health departments: indicators to consider; West Oakland approach, technical assessment, and pollutants included in the assessment; identify local sources; add regional contribution; West Oakland options; examples; questions; and resources.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the suggestion of comparing predicted outcomes of each stage of a process with actual results; the US Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA's) Environmental Benefits Mapping and Analysis Program's ability to simulate health outcomes, and the lack of information on the effects of black carbon; which health outcomes are anticipated to be immediate versus long-term; whether community capacity building could lead to the increase of youth coming to work at the Air District; ways to encourage polluting facilities to participate in building capacity within their communities and track participation; what defines 'acceptable Particulate Matter (PM)_{2.5} risk', whether the Air District is communicating those numbers to the impacted communities in a meaningful way that the public can understand, and the public's perception of risk; anticipated research on health outcomes that could be quantitated with respect to changes that may result from reductions in emissions; how the disbanding of the EPA's Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee's PM Review Panel may prompt the need for an independent review by the State of California in tandem with the National Ambient Air Quality Standards' five-year review of PM; and the difficulty in defining "health equity".

Council Action

None; receive and file.

The Council recessed at 12:33 p.m., and resumed at 1:18 p.m.

6. AIR SENSOR INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE UPDATE (ITEM 5)

Dr. McKay introduced Eric Stevenson, Director of Meteorology and Measurement, who gave the staff presentation *Update on the Air Sensor International Conference*, including: statistics; topics covered; adoption challenges; continued challenges; testing; continued growth; vendors and exhibitors; worldwide participation; big takeaways; and next steps.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed the suggestion for a routine monthly or quarterly opportunity in which members of the public monitor their local air quality with personal measuring devices and then compare their data to a central reliable source (such as the Air District's data), to increase awareness of how weather conditions affect their sensors; the Air District's upcoming collaboration with the South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD) and California Air Resources Board (CARB) regarding the creation of an inventory of air sensors and their measurement accuracy, and the creation of a publicly-accessible set of application program interfaces in which air sensor manufacturers are involved; the anticipation of inequity issues with the public's access to emerging sensor technology, and how this technology can help or hinder the Air District's Community Health Protection Program; how the Air District responds to communities and explains averaging time and health impacts when significant incidents (high readings) occur; and whether the conference included mobile monitoring of methane emissions, and older versus newer natural gas-detection technologies.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

7. DISCUSSION ON ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Dr. McKay explained that California's Health and Safety Code lacks guidance regarding the frequency of the election of Council Officers, and that Air District staff welcomed discussion of various policies, but not action, at today's meeting from the Council members that are present. He added that the current Council Officers were elected three years ago.

Council Comments

The Council and staff discussed whether three years is an appropriate amount of time for a Council Officer term; and the request that all Council members be present for the next discussion and subsequent recommendation.

Following the Council's discussion of this item, Dr. McKay announced that this item will be included on the Council's next meeting agenda for further discussion.

Council Action

None; receive and file.

8. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chair Hayes discussed an item that had been agendized at the Council's July 19, 2018 meeting, *Update on the Air District's Diesel Particulate Matter Emissions Reduction Strategy*. He summarized that the Council had authorized him to draft language for a statement to be presented to the Board of Directors on August 1, 2018, reflecting the Council's position on the reduction of diesel emissions, and displayed slides that explained the Council's position on the matter. Chair Hayes said that the Board seemed attentive when receiving his presentation, and that he was pleased to see so many people and jurisdictions sign up for the Air District's "Diesel-Free by '33" pledge.

Chair Hayes and Vice Chair Kleinman gave their reports on the Air & Waste Management Association's 111th Annual Conference and Exhibition that took place in June in Hartford, Connecticut.

9. REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE OFFICER/AIR POLLUTION CONTROL OFFICER

On behalf of Jack P. Broadbent, Executive Officer/Air Pollution Control Officer, who was absent, Dr. McKay reported that Air District staff will report back to the Council about the Air District's affiliate events with the 2018 Global Climate Action Summit in San Francisco in September, including United Cities Against Greenhouse Gasses: Diesel-Free by '33, and Climate Tech Marketplace.

10. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS

Public comments were given by Janet Stromberg and Jed Holtzman, 350 Bay Area.

11. COUNCIL MEMBER COMMENTS / OTHER BUSINESS

In response to the Air District's request for advisory input on long-term strategic targets for AB 617 implementation, Vice Chair Kleinman said that he would like the Council to create a sub-committee, or at least generate a collective report, to address the issue. He requested that this item be brought back for further consideration at the Council's next meeting. Air District staff said that it welcomes the Council's input, as it will inform the Air District's policies for AB 617 communities.

12. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING

At the call of the Chair.

13. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 2:36 p.m.

/s/ Marcy Hiratzka
Marcy Hiratzka
Clerk of the Boards